

MINUTES
Regular Meeting
HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION
October 07, 2009 - 2:00 p.m.
Municipal Building, City Council Chamber

The meeting of the Oklahoma City Historic Preservation Commission was called to order in the City Council Chamber, 3rd Floor of the Municipal Building, 200 N. Walker Avenue, Oklahoma City, Oklahoma. The meeting convened at 2:01 p.m. Notice of the meeting and agenda were filed with the City Clerk's office and posted on the Council bulletin board 24 hours prior to the meeting.

1. CALL TO ORDER AND ROLL CALL

Members Present: Roland Tague, Chairman
Karen Collier, Vice-Chair
Allen Brown, AIA
Heather A. Clemmer
Thomas J. Daniel IV (arrived at item 3)
Patrick Gaines
Nedra Jones
Karen Nelson
Thomas Small, AIA
Marnie Taylor
Karen Zimmer

Members Absent: None.

Staff Present: Catherine Montgomery, AIA, Planner III, Planning Department
Angela Yetter, Planner I, Planning Department
Paula Hurst, Planning Department
Rita Douglas-Talley, Assistant Municipal Counselor

- A. Meeting Process
- B. Standard Findings of Facts

APPROVED. Motion: Brown / Zimmer to **approve** waiving of the reading of the Standard Findings of Fact and incorporating them into the minutes.

Ayes: Tague, Collier, Brown, Clemmer, Gaines, Jones, Nelson, Small, Taylor, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Absent: Daniel.

2. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

APPROVED. Motion: Gaines / Collier to **approve** the minutes of the September 2, 2009, Historic Preservation Commission meeting.

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 2 of 17

Ayes: Tague, Collier, Brown, Clemmer, Gaines, Jones, Nelson, Small, Taylor, Zimmer.
Nays: None.
Absent: Daniel.

3. CITATION REPORT

Mr. Woods, Compliance Officer, was present for comment.

Move Item 7B. Motion: Taylor / Nelson to **move item 7B, National Register Nomination to the beginning of the docket.**

Ayes: Tague, Collier, Brown, Clemmer, Daniel, Gaines, Jones, Nelson, Small, Taylor, Zimmer.
Nays: None.
Absent: None.

7B. National Register Nomination at 2200 N Classen Boulevard, Ward 6. National Register of Historic Places, proposed nomination for Citizens Bank Tower aka The Classen, 2200 N Classen Boulevard. Consider a recommendation to the State Historic Preservation Office.

Lynda Schwan, State Historic Preservation Office was present.
Allison Marchhause, State Historic Preservation Office was present.
Brenda Stevens and Steve Morris of Gardner Tanenbaum were present.

APPROVE. Motion: Brown / Collier to **approve** resolution.

Ayes: Tague, Collier, Brown, Clemmer, Daniel, Gaines, Jones, Nelson, Small, Taylor, Zimmer.
Nays: None.
Absent: None.

4. CONTINUANCE REQUESTS

A. Staff request continuance of the following cases:

None.

B. Other continuance requests:

6F. HPCA-09-053 at 605 NW 16th St. (Mesta Park), Ward 6. Consideration and possible action on application of Jeremy Gardner for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1) Install new skylight; 2) Remove existing fence; and 3) Install new fence.

CONTINUED. Motion: Daniel / Nelson to move **continuance for 30-days** based upon the evidence that has been presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, that the Commission find that additional information is required from the applicant in order to determine whether the action requested is in compliance with Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Ayes: Tague, Collier, Brown, Clemmer, Daniel, Gaines, Jones, Nelson, Small, Taylor, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Absent: None.

5. CONSENT DOCKET CASES

6B. HPCA-09-100 at 311 NW 19th Street. (Heritage Hills), Ward 6. Consideration and possible action on application of Jane & Pete Holcombe for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1) Remove existing garage door; and 2) Install new wood garage door.

1. That the removal of the existing garage door is appropriate in that it is not an original feature or one that has gained historic significance;
2. That the proposed new wood garage door is appropriate in detail, form, and finish and will not distract from and is compatible with the architectural character and history of the house and garage;
3. That this action is consistent with the provisions of 4250.4 C and D of the Historic Preservation Ordinance contained in the *Zoning and Planning Code*;
4. That this action is consistent with the provisions of Subchapter 2.9 of the *Preservation Guidelines and Standards*; and

6C. HPCA-09-116 at 833 NW 15th Street. (Heritage Hills), Ward 6. Consideration and possible action on application of Suzette Baggerly Hatfield Revocable Trust for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1) Remove metal garage doors and 2) Install wood garage doors.

1. That the Guidelines encourage the removal of incompatible non-historic fabric;
2. That replacement doors are founded on documentation of the original garage door design as shown in the drawings; and
3. That this action is consistent with the provisions of 4250.4 C and D of the Historic Preservation Ordinance contained in the *Zoning and Planning Code*;
4. That this action is consistent with the provisions of Subchapters 2.1 and 2.9 of the *Preservation Guidelines and Standards*; and

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 4 of 17

6J. HPCA-09-102 at 1443 NW 37th Street. (Putnam Heights), Ward 2. Consideration and possible action on application of Richard and Shawn Thompson for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1) Remove front wooden double gate; 2) Install wrought iron front gate; 3) Remove east gate; 4) Install east gate; 5) Remove west gate; 6) Install west gate; 7) Remove double gate on driveway; 8) Install double gate on driveway; 9) Remove fence at driveway/back yard; and 10) Install fence at driveway/back yard.

1. That the existing gates are deteriorated beyond repair;
2. That the existing wood and plastic fence is deteriorated and the plastic material is inconsistent with the Guidelines;
3. That the proposed gates and fences do not obscure views of the property;
4. That all gates and fencing meet requirements of the Guidelines other than location of front gates;
5. That this proposal is unique in that new fences and gates are not permitted in the front yard or forward of the 50% mark of the side yards unless documentation exists substantiating their appropriateness to the development of the property and district over time;
6. That the proposed gates are important component parts of an existing front yard fence that will not be removed and has been in the current location since 1964;
7. That this action is consistent with the provisions of 4250.4 C, D, I, and J of the Historic Preservation Ordinance contained in the Zoning and Planning Code;
8. That this action is consistent with the provisions of Subchapter 1.9 of the Preservation Guidelines and Standards.

APPROVED. Motion: Collier / Nelson to move **approval** of Consent Docket items as stated that, based upon the evidence presented in the applications, Staff Report and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds the action requested is in compliance, and the proposed material change in appearance would not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical or architectural significance and value of the historic district historic property according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Ayes: Tague, Collier, Brown, Clemmer, Daniel, Gaines, Jones, Nelson, Small, Taylor, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Absent: None.

6. CASES FOR INDIVIDUAL CONSIDERATION

6A. HPCA-09-114 at 2301 NW 26th Street. (Shepherd), Ward 2. Consideration and possible action on application of Lester A. & Carol. P. Reinke for Certificate of

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 5 of 17

Appropriateness to 1) Remove steps and stoop at back (north) door; 2) Construct deck for entry at back door; 3) Remove stairs and deck to 2nd story entry; and 4) Construct stairs and deck to access 2nd story entry.

Carol. P. Reinke was present for comment.

APPROVED. Motion: Gaines / Collier to move **approval** that based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-09-114, Staff Report and during the public hearing that the Commission finds:

1. That the proposed work is limited to the back of the historic house at a non-historic addition to the house;
2. That the existing deck and stairs are deteriorated;
3. That the proposed work to the deck and stairs is necessary to continue use of the existing second story spaces;
4. That the existing stoop is deteriorated;
5. That the existing stoop, stairs, and deck are not original to the house, have not gained historic significance, and removal will not result in the loss of historic fabric;
6. That the back stoop, stairs, and decks are not character defining features;
7. That the existing access elements do not contribute to the essential historic character of the property as evidenced by the 1997 National Register Nomination description;
8. That the proposed work is reversible and can be replaced or removed leaving the essential form and integrity of the structure and site unimpaired;
9. That the proposed decks and stairs are clearly differentiated so that a false historical appearance is not created;
10. That the proposed design is compatible with the historic building and does not imitate historic features;
11. That this action is consistent with the provisions of 4250.4 C and D of the Historic Preservation Ordinance contained in the *Zoning and Planning Code*;
12. That this action is consistent with the provisions of Subchapters 2.1, 2.2, 3.1, and 3.2 of the *Preservation Guidelines and Standards*; and
13. That based upon the evidence presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds the action requested is in compliance, and the proposed material change in appearance would not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical or architectural significance and value of the historic property and district according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 6 of 17

Ayes: Tague, Collier, Brown, Clemmer, Daniel, Gaines, Jones, Nelson, Small, Taylor, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Absent: None.

- 6B. HPCA-09-100** at 311 NW 19th Street. (Heritage Hills), Ward 6. Consideration and possible action on application of Jane & Pete Holcombe for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1) Remove existing garage door; and 2) Install new wood garage door.

Approved on Consent Docket.

- 6C. HPCA-09-116** at 833 NW 15th Street. (Heritage Hills), Ward 6. Consideration and possible action on application of Suzette Baggerly Hatfield Revocable Trust for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1) Remove metal garage doors and 2) Install wood garage doors.

Approved on Consent Docket.

- 6D. HPCA-09-054** at 617 NW 16th St. (Mesta Park), Ward 6. Consideration and possible action on application of Hans & Torrey Butzer for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1) Construct new addition including: a) Remove 1-story porch at northeast corner of house, b) Remove two second floor windows on north elevation, c) Construct new addition including roof, walls, windows, doors and screened in porch on northeast corner of house, d) Construct new steps; 2) Relocate first floor window on east elevation; 3) Remove existing second floor window on east elevation; 4) Install two new second floor windows on east elevation; and 5) Install new removable first floor storm window on west elevation.

Move to the heal of the Docket: Motion: Zimmer / Nelson to **move this item to the heal of the docket.**

Ayes: Tague, Collier, Brown, Clemmer, Daniel, Gaines, Jones, Nelson, Small, Taylor, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Absent: None.

- 6E. HPCA-09-113** at 718 NW 22nd Street. (Mesta Park), Ward 6. Consideration and possible action on application of Karl Call for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1) Construct new 1-story house including; a) Composition shingle roof, b) HardyPlank/HardyShingle siding with exposed concrete foundation wall, c) Factory finished, aluminum-clad wood 1/1 windows, d) Wood, metal and glass doors, e) Brick, wood, and concrete porches; 2) Construct new 1-story garage including; a) Composition shingle roof, b) HardyPlank horizontal lap siding, c) fiberglass garage door, d) Fiberglass pedestrian door; 3) Construct new driveway

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 7 of 17

and sidewalk; and 4) Options for east elevation.

Karl Call was present for comment.

The Mesta Park Preservation Review Committee submitted written comments to staff prior to the meeting.

APPROVED with Modification. Motion: Small / Clemmer to move **approval with modification** that based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-09-113, Staff Report and during the public hearing that the Commission finds:

1. That the setback of the front (North) wall will align with the property to the West;
2. That the garage doors will be wood paneled;
3. That the exterior pedestrian doors will be wood;
4. That elevation option B is approved;
5. That the windows will have a low-E coating that meets specifications stated by staff or without low-E coating;
6. That the floor elevation, stem wall will be 18" to grade;
7. That the front door will be true divided lite;
8. That the proposed 1-story house maintains the architectural character of the district and does not imitate previous construction or present a false sense of historical development;
9. That the proposed 1-story garage is a secondary structure to the house, maintains the architectural character of the district, and does not imitate previous construction or present a false sense of historical development;
10. That the proposed roof materials are consistent with the Guidelines for detail, form, and finish;
11. That the proposed siding materials are consistent with the Guidelines in detail, form and finish;
12. That the proposed windows are consistent with the Guidelines in detail, form, and finish;
- ~~13. That the proposed Guidelines are silent on materials for doors at new construction;~~
- ~~14. That metal and fiberglass doors at the back of the property are not visible from the public right of way and are appropriate alternative materials for new construction which when painted resemble the appearance of painted wood;~~
15. That the proposed driveway and sidewalk are consistent with the Guidelines and will match adjacent sidewalk concrete in color, detail, form, and finish;
16. That this action is consistent with the provisions of 4250.4 C and D of the Historic Preservation Ordinance contained in the *Zoning and Planning Code*;
17. That this action is consistent with the provisions of Subchapters 1.3, 3.1, 3.3, and 3.5 of the *Preservation Guidelines and Standards*; and

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 8 of 17

18. That based upon the evidence presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds the action requested is in compliance, and the proposed material change in appearance would not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical or architectural significance and value of the historic property and district according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Ayes: Tague, Collier, Brown, Clemmer, Daniel, Gaines, Jones, Nelson, Small, Taylor, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Absent: None.

6F. HPCA-09-053 at 605 NW 16th St. (Mesta Park), Ward 6. Consideration and possible action on application of Jeremy Gardner for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1) Install new skylight; 2) Remove existing fence; and 3) Install new fence.

Continued on Continuance Docket.

6G. HPCA-09-117 at 2712 N Hudson Ave. (Jefferson Park), Ward 2. Consideration and possible action on application of Jefferson Park Neighbors Association by Loren Capron for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1) Construct new 1-story house including: a) Composition shingle roof, b) HardyPlank siding with exposed concrete foundation wall, c) Factory finished, aluminum-clad wood 1/1 windows, d) Wood and glass doors, e) Brick, wood, and concrete porches, and f) Porte-Cochere; and 2) Construct new driveway.

Loren Capron was present for comment.

APPROVED with Modification. Motion: Small / Brown to move **approval with modification** that, based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-09-117, Staff Report and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds:

1. That all exterior doors will be solid wood;
2. That the porch of the house will align with adjacent porches;
3. That the proposed 1-story house maintains the architectural character of the district and does not imitate previous construction or present a false sense of historical development;
4. That the proposed roof and siding materials are consistent with the Guidelines for detail, form, and finish;
5. That the proposed windows are consistent with the Guidelines in detail, form, and finish;
6. That the proposed driveway is consistent with the Guidelines and will match

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 9 of 17

adjacent sidewalk concrete in color, detail, form, and finish;

7. That this action is consistent with the provisions of 4250.4 C and D of the Historic Preservation Ordinance contained in the *Zoning and Planning Code*;
8. That this action is consistent with the provisions of Subchapters 1.3, 2.2, 3.1, and 3.5 of the *Preservation Guidelines and Standards*; and
9. That based upon the evidence presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds the action requested is in compliance, and the proposed material change in appearance would not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical or architectural significance and value of the historic property and district according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Ayes: Tague, Collier, Brown, Clemmer, Daniel, Gaines, Jones, Nelson, Small, Taylor, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Absent: None.

6H. HPCA-09-111 at 412 NW 34th Street. (Edgemere Park), Ward 2. Consideration and possible action on application of Greg & Robin McAlister for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1) Replace roof; 2) Replace siding; 3) Extend dormer at back of house including a.) cedar shingle siding and b.) composition roof; 4) Demolish garage; 5) Rebuild garage including a) brick front façade, b.) cedar shingle siding at north gable end, c.) cementitious siding on 3 façades, d.) double garage door, e.) wood pedestrian door, f.) vinyl clad window, g.) wood trim boards, h.) composition roof, i.) installation of gutters; and 6) Install gutters.

Greg & Robin McAlister were present for comment.

APPROVED. Motion: Brown / Taylor to move **approval of items 1) Replace roof; 2) Replace siding; 3) Extend dormer at back of house including a.) cedar shingle siding and b.) composition roof; and 6) Install gutters** that, based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-09-111, Staff Report and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds:

1. That the roof of the house is in need of repair in order to protect the structural integrity of the building;
2. That the original roof of this structure is reported to have been wood shingles that remain in place under two layers of composition shingles;
3. That the industry standard “weathered wood” color is the most appropriate color to replicate a weathered wood shingle appearance;

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 10 of 17

4. That flashing, metal edge, valleys, or other metal roof appurtenances will match adjacent material in color;
5. That the original siding of this structure is reported to have been wood shingles that remain in place under the lay of composition shingles;
6. That the Guidelines encourage the removal of incompatible non-historic materials in favor of a return to the original materials;
7. That the cedar shingle proposed for use as wall and gable end material will be compatible with the original detail, form, and finish of the historic cedar shingle material;
8. That the proposed dormer addition will be minimally visible from the street;
9. That the dormer addition will be located on a non-primary façade at the rear of the existing structure;
10. That the dormer addition will be compatible in size, texture, color, design, proportion and detail to the existing building;
11. That proposed exterior materials of the dormer addition are consistent with the Guidelines;
12. That gutters and downspouts are consistent with the Guidelines;
13. That the gutters and downspouts will be finished to match the color of adjacent material;
14. That this action is consistent with the provisions of 4250.4 C and D of the Historic Preservation Ordinance contained in the *Zoning and Planning Code*;
15. That this action is consistent with the provisions of Subchapters 2.1, 2.7, 3.2, and 3.5 of the *Preservation Guidelines and Standards*; and
16. That based upon the evidence presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds the action requested is in compliance, and the proposed material change in appearance would not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical or architectural significance and value of the historic property and district according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Ayes: Tague, Collier, Brown, Clemmer, Daniel, Gaines, Jones, Nelson, Small, Taylor, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Absent: None.

CONTINUED. Motion: Taylor / Collier to move **30-day continuance on items 4) Demolish garage; 5) Rebuild garage including a) brick front façade, b.) cedar shingle siding at north gable end, c.) cementitious siding on 3 façades, d.) double garage door, e.) wood pedestrian door, f.) vinyl clad window, g.) wood trim boards, h.) composition roof, i.) installation of gutters** that, based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-09-111, Staff Report and

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 11 of 17

during the public hearing, that the Commission finds:

17. That a structural engineers report is requested;
18. That the action requested cannot be approved at this time;
19. That additional information is required to establish, by a preponderance of evidence, the necessary facts to warrant demolition;
20. That the double garage door is not consistent with the Guidelines; and
21. That based upon the evidence that has been presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, additional information is required from the applicant in order to determine whether the action requested is in compliance with the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Ayes: Tague, Collier, Brown, Clemmer, Daniel, Gaines, Jones, Nelson, Small, Taylor, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Absent: None.

- 6I HPCA-09-118** at 205 NW 32nd Street. (Edgemere Park), Ward 2. Consideration and possible action on application of W. Shawn Jefferson by Eva Osborne, AIA for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1) Install new wood fence; 2) Install new recessed can lights at soffits; 3) Install new security cameras at soffits; 4) Install new french door at back of non-historic addition includes removal of single door; 5) Replace front and east side doors; and 6) Install new single door at back of garage.

W. Shawn Jefferson was present for comment.

CONTINUE. Motion: Collier / Clemmer to move **60-day continuance** that, based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-09-118, Staff Report and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds:

1. That based upon the evidence that has been presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, additional information is required from the applicant in order to determine whether the action requested is in compliance with the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

- 6J HPCA-09-102** at 1443 NW 37th Street. (Putnam Heights), Ward 2. Consideration and possible action on application of Richard and Shawn Thompson for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1) Remove front wooden double gate; 2) Install wrought iron front gate; 3) Remove east gate; 4) Install east gate;

5) Remove west gate; 6) Install west gate; 7) Remove double gate on driveway; 8) Install double gate on driveway; 9) Remove fence at driveway/back yard; and 10) Install fence at driveway/back yard.

Approved on Consent Docket.

- 6D. HPCA-09-054** at 617 NW 16th St. (Mesta Park), Ward 6. Consideration and possible action on application of Hans & Torrey Butzer for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1) Construct new addition including: a) Remove 1-story porch at northeast corner of house, b) Remove two second floor windows on north elevation, c) Construct new addition including roof, walls, windows, doors and screened in porch on northeast corner of house, d) Construct new steps; 2) Relocate first floor window on east elevation; 3) Remove existing second floor window on east elevation; 4) Install two new second floor windows on east elevation; and 5) Install new removable first floor storm window on west elevation.

Hans and Torrey Butzer were present for comment.

The Mesta Park Preservation Review Committee submitted written comments to staff prior to the meeting.

APPROVED. Motion: Brown / Collier to move approval that, based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-09-054, Staff Report and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds:

1. That the revised elevation will be used as presented as additional information at the meeting;
2. That the form and size of the proposed addition is compatible and differentiated from the existing historic house;
3. That the back porch, although in the historic location for the back porch as evidenced by the Sanborn maps has been modified and no longer retains its historic appearance;
4. That the two second story back windows to be removed in order to accommodate the new addition are on the back of the house and the guidelines allow modifications to the back of a building in order to accommodate additions;
5. That the materials, details, and finishes proposed for the new addition are consistent with the guidelines and compatible with the existing house;
6. That the new concrete steps with wood treads are consistent with the guidelines, and an integral part of the proposed addition;
7. That the relocation of the window on the north end of the east elevation, which is minimally visible from the public right-of-way and is located at the

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 13 of 17

rear half of the side elevation is consistent with the Guidelines;

8. That the reconfiguration of the second floor window into two windows on the north end of the east elevation, which is minimally visible from the public right-of-way and is located at the rear half of the side elevation is consistent with the Guidelines;
9. That the window modifications at the first and second floors of the rear half of the east side elevation are compatible with historic and existing windows in proportion, shape, location, pattern, size, materials and details.
10. That the proposed exterior painted, thin wood storm window is removable and consistent with the standards;
11. That this action is consistent with the provisions of 4250.4 C and D of the Historic Preservation Ordinance contained in the *Zoning and Planning Code*;
12. That this action is consistent with the provisions of Subchapters 1.2, 2.5, 3.2 and 3.5 of the *Preservation Guidelines and Standards*; and
13. That based upon the evidence presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds the action requested is in compliance, and the proposed material change in appearance would not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical or architectural significance and value of the historic property and district according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Ayes: Tague, Collier, Brown, Clemmer, Daniel, Gaines, Nelson, Small, Taylor, Zimmer.

Nays: Jones.

Absent: None.

7. OTHER BUSINESS

- 7A. HPCA-09-092** at 1000 NW 37th Street. (Crown Heights), Ward 2. To receive comments from the Historic Preservation Commission concerning the historic integrity of all structures for a future action by the City Council. This item will be referred to Development Services for dilapidated structure processing.

Gene Vonstein and William Comstock were present for comment.

Peter Fulmer was present for comment.

John Joyce, Crown Heights Neighborhood PRC was present for comment.

Crown Heights Preservation Review Committee submitted comments prior to the meeting.

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 14 of 17

FORWARD COMMENTS. Motion: Small / Nelson to **forward comments** that based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-09-092, Staff Report and during the public hearing that the Commission finds:

The structures retain historic integrity and are contributing resources to the Crown Heights Historic District. The Historic Preservation Commission regrets that the property owner has not been more attentive to the maintenance concerns of this property because of its heightened significance to the Crown Heights Historic District. Further, the Commission strongly encourages the owner to pursue corrective action and coordinate the same with the Development Services Department in order to preserve this important resource.

Ayes: Tague, Collier, Brown, Clemmer, Daniel, Gaines, Jones, Nelson, Small, Taylor, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Absent: None.

- 7B. National Register Nomination** at 2200 N Classen Boulevard, Ward 6. National Register of Historic Places, proposed nomination for Citizens Bank Tower aka The Classen, 2200 N Classen Boulevard. Consider a recommendation to the State Historic Preservation Office.

Heard out of order – prior to item 4.

- 7C. Ordinance Amendments:** To review and consider comments regarding an ordinance amendment by The City of Oklahoma City.

RECOMMEND. Motion: Collier / Nelson to **recommend approve of ordinance amendments as presented subject to the comments regarding item 4250.10 (D) (4)(c).**

Ayes: Tague, Collier, Brown, Clemmer, Daniel, Gaines, Jones, Nelson, Small, Taylor, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Absent: None.

8. CITIZENS TO BE HEARD

9. COMMUNICATIONS AND REPORTS

A. Commission Members

B. Municipal Counselor

C. Administrative Approvals

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 15 of 17

- 9C1. HPCA-09-109** at 1025 NW 18th Street. (Mesta Park), Ward 6. Staff is announcing the Administrative Approval of the item(s) on the application of Grace Light and Dru Andrus for Certificate of Appropriateness to: 1) Install satellite dish at northeast gable roof of house beyond side gable and not visible from the street.
- 9C2. HPCA-09-100** at 311 NW 19th Street. (Heritage Hills), Ward 6. Staff is announcing the Administrative Approval of the item(s) on the application of Jane & Pete Holcombe for Certificate of Appropriateness to: 1) Remove existing concrete driveway and sidealk, and 2) Install new concrete driveway and sidewalk.
- 9C3. HPCA-09-112** at 629 NW 17th Street. (Mesta Park), Ward 6. Staff is announcing the Administrative Approval of the item(s) on the application of William & Janet Young for Certificate of Appropriateness to: 1) remove chain link fencing; 2) install new fencing.
- 9C4. HPCA-09-110** at 508 NW 19th Street. (Mesta Park), Ward 6. Staff is announcing the Administrative Approval of the item(s) on the application of Bonnie Goodrich for Certificate of Appropriateness to: 1) Replace driveway to match existing driveway in size, dimension and color.
- 9C5. HPCA-09-094** at 2930 The Paseo. (Paseo), Ward 2. Staff is announcing the Administrative Approval of the item(s) on the application of The Paseo Arts District, Inc. by John Belt for Certificate of Appropriateness to: 1) Install landscaping; 2) Install plaza paving; and 3) Install sitting wall.
- 9C6. HPCA-09-115** at 315 NW 17th Street. (Heritage Hills), Ward 6. Staff is announcing the Administrative Approval of the item(s) on the application of Randy and Darcie Thomas for Certificate of Appropriateness to: 1) Install awnings over 2nd story front windows.

D. Withdrawals

None.

E. City Council

- 9E1. HPCA-PC10219** at Guernsey Park Place Lots 9-11, Block 17. (Paseo), Ward 2. Recommendation to rezone Neighborhood Conservation Lots 9-11, in block 17 of Tract-2 to Tract-5. **This item was heard by City Council on September 29, 2009. City Council remanded to Planning Commission.**
- 9E2. HPCA-PC10220** at Neighborhood Conservation Tract-5. (Paseo), Ward 2. Recommendation to rezone Neighborhood Conservation Tract-5 from

Historic Landmark/Historic Preservation to Urban Design. **This item was heard by City Council on September 29, 2009. City Council remanded to Planning Commission.**

- 9E3. Ordinance change relating to Tract Five of the Neighborhood Conservation Zoning District.** (Paseo), Ward 2. Recommendation regarding the ordinance amending regulations of the Neighborhood Conservation Zoning District for Tract 5 (Paseo Commercial District). **This item was heard by City Council on September 29, 2009 and was deferred to December 8, 2009.**

F. Board of Adjustment

- 9F1. BOA-13154** at 321 Park Avenue. Ward 6. Staff is announcing the appeal of the decision of the Downtown Design Review Committee regarding the requirement for a Certificate of Approval for the replacement of windows. **On October 1, 2009, this appeal was heard by the Board of Adjustment and continued to December 03, 2009.**
- 9F2. BOA-13145** at 609 NW 14th Street. (Heritage Hills), Ward 6. Staff is announcing the appeal of the decision of the Planning Director regarding the requirement for a Certificate of Appropriateness for the replacement of damaged vinyl siding in a Historic District. The appeal was filed by Eric Groves on behalf of Kurt Reiger. **On October 1, 2009, the Board of Adjustment denied this appeal.**
- 9F3. HPCA-06-098** at 2916 D Paseo Dr. (Paseo), Ward 6. Appeal of the Historic Preservation Commissions denial on the application of Paseo Village by John Belt for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) install mural and fountain. – **On September 28, 2009, the District Court in and for Oklahoma County, Oklahoma has reversed the decision of the Board of Adjustment which upheld the Historic Preservation Commission’s decision to deny this application.**

G. Planning Commission

None.

- H.** The next regularly scheduled meeting for the Historic Preservation Commission is Wednesday, November 4, 2009 at 2:00 p.m. at the Municipal Building, City Council Chamber. New applications and information on continued projects are to be submitted to staff by 5:00 p.m., Tuesday, October 13, 2009.
- I.** The next regularly scheduled workshop for the Historic Preservation Commission is Monday, October 12, 2009 at 4:00 p.m. at 420 W. Main Street, Suite 900.

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 17 of 17

10. ADJOURNMENT (4:53 p.m.)

Motion: Collier / Nelson to adjourn the October 7, 2009, meeting of the Historic Preservation Commission.

Ayes: Tague, Collier, Brown, Clemmer, Daniel, Gaines, Jones, Nelson, Small, Taylor, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Absent: None.

pjh