

**MINUTES**  
**Regular Meeting**  
**HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION**  
August 5, 2009 - 2:00 p.m.  
Municipal Building, City Council Chamber

The meeting of the Oklahoma City Historic Preservation Commission was called to order in the City Council Chamber, 3rd Floor of the Municipal Building, 200 N. Walker Avenue, Oklahoma City, Oklahoma. The meeting convened at 2:02 p.m. Notice of the meeting and agenda were filed with the City Clerk's office and posted on the Council bulletin board 24 hours prior to the meeting.

**1. CALL TO ORDER AND ROLL CALL**

Members Present: Roland Tague, Chairman  
Allen Brown, AIA  
Heather A. Clemmer  
Patrick Gaines  
Nedra Jones  
Karen Nelson  
Thomas Small, AIA  
Marnie Taylor  
Karen Zimmer

Members Absent: Karen Collier, Vice-Chair  
Thomas J. Daniel IV

Staff Present: Susan Miller, Planner IV, Planning Department  
Catherine Montgomery, AIA, Planner III, Planning Department  
Paul Ryckbost, Planner II, Planning Department  
Angela Yetter, Planner I, Planning Department  
Paula Hurst, Planning Department  
Rita Douglas-Talley, Assistant Municipal Counselor

- A. Meeting Process
- B. Standard Findings of Facts

**APPROVED.** Motion: Gaines / Small to **approve** waiving of the reading of the Standard Findings of Fact and incorporating them into the minutes.

Ayes: Tague, Brown, Clemmer, Gaines, Jones, Nelson, Small, Taylor, Zimmer.  
Nays: None.  
Absent: Collier, Daniel.

**2. APPROVAL OF MINUTES**

**APPROVED.** Motion: Taylor / Nelson to **approve** the minutes of the July 1, 2009, Historic Preservation Commission meeting.

**Historic Preservation Commission**

Minutes - Page 2 of 24

August 5, 2009

Ayes: Tague, Brown, Clemmer, Gaines, Jones, Nelson, Small, Taylor, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Absent: Collier, Daniel.

**3. CITATION REPORT**

Mr. Woods, Compliance Officer, was present for comment.

**4. CONTINUANCE REQUESTS**

**A.** Staff request continuance of the following cases:  
None.

**B.** Other continuance requests:  
None.

**5. CONSENT DOCKET CASES**

**6A. HPCA-09-047** at 829 NW 42nd Street. (Crown Heights), Ward 2. Consideration and possible action on application of Sean McCoy for Certificate of Appropriateness to: 1. (c.) Install wood door at approved rear addition and (d.) Install new wood windows at approved rear addition.

Findings of Fact:

1. That wood doors are consistent with the Guidelines;
2. That the windows will be constructed of wood;
3. That the window material, detail, form, and finish are consistent with the Guidelines;
4. That the window material, detail, form and finish are compatible with and differentiated from the existing original and historic fabric;
5. That the window trim detail is compatible with the character of the historic structure;
6. That the brick window sill is compatible with and differentiated from the existing original and historic fabric;
7. That this action is consistent with the provisions of 4250.4 C and D of the Historic Preservation Ordinance contained in the *Zoning and Planning Code*;
8. That this action is consistent with the provisions of Subchapters 2.4 and 3.5 of the *Preservation Guidelines and Standards*; and

**6D. HPCA-09-068** at 2208 NW 25th Street. (Shepherd), Ward 2. Consideration and possible action on application of Eric Mitts for Certificate of Appropriateness to:

## Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 3 of 24

August 5, 2009

1. Remove existing roof on house and garage; and 2. Install new roof on house and garage re-using existing gutters and downspouts.

### Findings of Fact:

1. That it is appropriate to remove the existing white composition shingles which are not historic and are deteriorated;
2. That the original roof of this structure is reported to have been wood shingles that remain in place under two layers of composition shingles;
3. That the industry standard “weathered wood” color is the most appropriate color to replicate a weathered wood shingle appearance;
4. That the existing gutters and downspouts will be reused in the completed project;
5. That if the existing gutters and downspouts cannot be reused, a new application for Certificate of Appropriateness will be submitted for administrative review of replacement;
6. That this action is consistent with the provisions of 4250.4 C and D of the Historic Preservation Ordinance contained in the *Zoning and Planning Code*;
7. That this action is consistent with the provisions of Subchapter 2.7 of the *Preservation Guidelines and Standards*; and

- 6E.** **HPCA-09-080** at 2205 NW 25th Street. (Shepherd), Ward 2. Consideration and possible action on application of Glen Hall by Dennis Riley for Certificate of Appropriateness to: 1. Remove roof at house and garage, 2. Install roof at house and garage, 3. Remove exterior window sills, 4. Install new exterior window sills, and 5. Install new guttering.

Pulled from Consent Docket.

- 6I.** **HPCA-09-073** at 326 NW 21st Street. (Heritage Hills), Ward 6. Consideration and possible action on application of Philip Walker Reid for Certificate of Appropriateness to: 1. Remove existing slab door at entry; and 2. Install new 15-lite, hardwood door at entry.

### Findings of Fact:

1. That the removal of the existing front door is appropriate in that it is not an original feature nor one that has gained historic significance;
2. That the proposed replacement door is appropriate in that it is compatible with the style and period of the building, it reflects the style of the existing historic sidelites, and is consistent with other primary entrance doors in the district;

## Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 4 of 24

August 5, 2009

3. That this action is consistent with the provisions of 4250.4 C and D of the Historic Preservation Ordinance contained in the *Zoning and Planning Code*;
4. That this action is consistent with the provisions of Subchapter 2.4 of the *Preservation Guidelines and Standards*; and

**6L. HPCA-09-085** at 616 NW 26th Street. (Paseo), Ward 2. Consideration and possible action on application of Oklahoma City Housing Services Redevelopment Corporation for Certificate of Appropriateness to: 1. Remove non-historic aluminum windows at 2nd floor; 2. Install 1/1 double hung, wood windows with insulated glazing at 2nd floor; 3. Remove front doors; 4. Install new front doors; 5. Remove back doors; 6. Install new back doors; 7. Remove existing concrete front steps; 8. Install new front steps; 9. Add railing to 1st floor porch; 10. Remove balcony divider; 11. Remove roof; 12. Install roof; 13. Remove existing stair with landing at rear; and 14. Install new stair with landing at rear.

### Findings of Fact:

1. That the existing aluminum windows are non-historic and inconsistent with the character of the building and the district;
2. That the proposed replacement windows are appropriate and consistent with the guidelines and will match the rest of the historic wood hung windows remaining in the building;
3. That the existing front and back doors are deteriorated, non-historic, and inconsistent with the character of the building and the district;
4. That the proposed replacement doors are appropriate and consistent with the guidelines and the visual historic character of the building and the district;
5. That the proposed concrete front steps have settled and can only be corrected through reconstruction;
6. That the proposed new concrete front steps will match the existing in detail, form, finish, and color which is consistent with the guidelines;
7. That the proposed installation of the railing for the 1<sup>st</sup> floor porch is appropriate and consistent with the guidelines in that the new railing will be consistent with the existing 2<sup>nd</sup> floor railing in detail, form, and finish;
8. That the existing roof is deteriorated beyond repair;
9. That the roof replacement as proposed is appropriate and consistent with the guidelines;
10. That the non-historic existing stair with landing at the rear is structurally unsound;
11. That proposed new rear stair with landing is not visible from the public right-of-way;
12. That the new rear stair with landing is required for a second means of egress from the building;

## Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 5 of 24

August 5, 2009

13. That the new rear stair with landing is consistent with the guidelines and the Secretary's Standards for Rehabilitation;
14. That this action is consistent with the provisions of 4250.4 C and D of the Historic Preservation Ordinance contained in the *Zoning and Planning Code*;
15. That this action is consistent with the provisions of Subchapters 2.2, 2.4, 2.5 and 2.7 of the *Preservation Guidelines and Standards*; and

**APPROVED.** Motion: Small / Zimmer to move **approval** of Consent Docket items as stated that, based upon the evidence presented in the applications, Staff Report and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds the action requested is in compliance, and the proposed material change in appearance would not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical or architectural significance and value of the historic district historic property according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Ayes: Tague, Brown, Clemmer, Gaines, Jones, Nelson, Small, Taylor, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Absent: Collier, Daniel.

- 6B. HPCA-09-079** at 821 NW 39th Street. (Crown Heights), Ward 2. Consideration and possible action on application of Larry J. & Marylyn T. Rowell for Certificate of Appropriateness to: 1. Construct 1-story addition at the back (North) elevation, including: (a) brick/stone walls to match the existing building, (b) two new wood window assemblies, (c) one relocated window, and (d) single-ply membrane roof.

**APPROVED.** Motion: Small / Clemmer to move **approval** of Consent Docket item HPCA-09-079 as stated that, based upon the evidence presented in the applications, Staff Report and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds:

1. That the addition is not visible from the public right-of-way;
2. That the proposed 1-story addition is compatible in size, design, proportion and detailing to the existing 2-story structure;
3. That the addition will be differentiated by the installation of a brick reveal at the connecting point between the old and new construction;
4. That the addition is compatible with the existing structure in massing, roof shape, cornice lines and building materials;
5. That the proposed roof material is not consistent with the guidelines and will be modified to match the detail, form, finish, and color of the existing roof of the house;
6. That this action is consistent with the provisions of 4250.4 C and D of the Historic Preservation Ordinance contained in the *Zoning and Planning Code*;
7. That this action is consistent with the provisions of Subchapters 3.2 and 3.5 of

## Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 6 of 24

August 5, 2009

the *Preservation Guidelines and Standards*; and

8. That based upon the evidence that has been presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, that although the action requested cannot be approved as presented, that in recognition of the applicant's willingness to accept the conditions of approval, that the amended action requested is in compliance, and the proposed material change in appearance would not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historic or architectural significance and value of the historic property and/or district according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Ayes: Brown, Clemmer, Gaines, Jones, Nelson, Small, Taylor, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Recused: Tague.

Absent: Collier, Daniel.

- 6C. HPCA-09-071** at 1532 NW 35th Street. (Putnam Heights), Ward 2. Consideration and possible action on application of Phillip and Karen Nelson for Certificate of Appropriateness to: 1. Remove rear storm door; and 2. Install rear storm door.

**APPROVED.** Motion: Small / Brown to move **approval** of Consent Docket item HPCA-09-071 as stated that, based upon the evidence presented in the applications, Staff Report and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds:

1. That the removal of the existing non-historic, mill finished, aluminum screen door is appropriate and consistent with the guidelines;
2. That the proposed new aluminum storm door with painted finish to match existing trim and full height glass lite is appropriate and consistent with the guidelines;
3. That this action is consistent with the provisions of 4250.4 C, D and H of the Historic Preservation Ordinance contained in the *Zoning and Planning Code*;
4. That this action is consistent with the provisions of Subchapter 2.4 of the *Preservation Guidelines and Standards*; and
5. That based upon the evidence presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds the action requested is in compliance, and the proposed material change in appearance would not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical or architectural significance and value of the historic property and district according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

## Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 7 of 24

August 5, 2009

Ayes: Tague, Brown, Clemmer, Gaines, Jones, Small, Taylor, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Recused: Nelson

Absent: Collier, Daniel.

### 6. CASES FOR INDIVIDUAL CONSIDERATION

- 6A. HPCA-09-047** at 829 NW 42nd Street. (Crown Heights), Ward 2. Consideration and possible action on application of Sean McCoy for Certificate of Appropriateness to: 1. (c.) Install wood door at approved rear addition and (d.) Install new wood windows at approved rear addition.

Approved on Consent Docket.

- 6B. HPCA-09-079** at 821 NW 39th Street. (Crown Heights), Ward 2. Consideration and possible action on application of Larry J. & Marylyn T. Rowell for Certificate of Appropriateness to: 1. Construct 1-story addition at the back (North) elevation, including: (a) brick/stone walls to match the existing building, (b) two new wood window assemblies, (c) one relocated window, and (d) single-ply membrane roof.

Approved on Consent Docket.

- 6C. HPCA-09-071** at 1532 NW 35th Street. (Putnam Heights), Ward 2. Consideration and possible action on application of Phillip and Karen Nelson for Certificate of Appropriateness to: 1. Remove rear storm door; and 2. Install rear storm door.

Approved on Consent Docket.

- 6D. HPCA-09-068** at 2208 NW 25th Street. (Shepherd), Ward 2. Consideration and possible action on application of Eric Mitts for Certificate of Appropriateness to: 1. Remove existing roof on house and garage; and 2. Install new roof on house and garage re-using existing gutters and downspouts.

Approved on Consent Docket.

- 6E. HPCA-09-080** at 2205 NW 25th Street. (Shepherd), Ward 2. Consideration and possible action on application of Glen Hall by Dennis Riley for Certificate of Appropriateness to: 1. Remove roof at house and garage, 2. Install roof at house and garage, 3. Remove exterior window sills, 4. Install new exterior window sills, and 5. Install new guttering.

Mr. Greg Dudley, Architect, was present for comment.

## Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 8 of 24

August 5, 2009

**APPROVED.** Motion: Small / Nelson to move **approval** that, based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-09-080, Staff Report and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds:

1. That the existing shape, line, pitch and overhang of historic roofs will be preserved;
2. That the proposed shingle is an acceptable replacement for the existing roof;
3. That all roofing accessories such as valley materials, metal edge, and flashing will be painted to match the shingles in color;
4. That all repairs necessary to woodwork around windows will be replication with wood materials;
5. That gutters will be painted to match adjacent materials such as fascia or trim;
6. That this action is consistent with the provisions of 4250.4 C and 4250.4 D of the Historic Preservation Ordinance contained in the *Zoning and Planning Code*;
7. That this action is consistent with the provisions of Subchapters 2.1, 2.5, 2.7, and 2.10 of the *Preservation Guidelines and Standards*; and
8. That based upon the evidence presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds the action requested is in compliance, and the proposed material change in appearance would not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical or architectural significance and value of the historic property and district according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Ayes: Tague, Brown, Clemmer, Gaines, Jones, Nelson, Small, Taylor, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Absent: Collier, Daniel.

- 6F. HPCA-09-009** at 100 NW 22nd Street. (Heritage Hills East), Ward 7. Consideration and possible action on application of Christopher Salyer for Certificate of Appropriateness to: 1. Demolish structure.

Mr. Salyer was present for comment.

Sherry L. Pemberton was present for comment.

Debbie Blackburn, Heritage Hills East Neighborhood Association was present for comment.

## Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 9 of 24

August 5, 2009

**DENIED.** Motion: Jones / Zimmer to move **denial with prejudice** that, based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-09-009, Staff Report and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds:

1. That the structure plays an important role in defining the Northeast corner of the Heritage Hills East Historic Preservation Zoning District;
2. That the building is a contributing resource to the historic integrity of the HP zoned district and that the demolition of the building will adversely affect the historic character of the property and district and the applicant has not demonstrated otherwise;
3. That the inability for the building and property to provide a viable economic use including reasonable adaptation for another use which would result in a reasonable economic return and the inability to find a developer, financier, purchaser, or tenant to realize a reasonable economic return on the property has not been demonstrated;
4. That the applicant has not maintained the building in such a manner so as to prevent a level of deterioration rendering it uninhabitable or dilapidated;
5. That the condition of the property as presented by the July 10, 2009 Gresham letter, while consistent with the Ordinance regarding the conditions required to exist in order to allow a Certificate of Appropriateness, is inconsistent with the finding of the Economic Review Board;
6. That this action is not consistent with the provisions of 4250.4 C, D, and L; 7250.3 and 7250.4 of the Historic Preservation Ordinance contained in the *Zoning and Planning Code*; and
7. That based upon the evidence presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds the action requested is not in compliance, that the proposed material change in appearance would have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historic or architectural significance and value of the historic district or historic property according to the *Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City*, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Ayes: Brown, Clemmer, Gaines, Jones, Nelson, Small, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Recused: Tague, Taylor.

Absent: Collier, Daniel.

- 6G. HPCA-09-051** at 137 NW 18th Street. (Heritage Hills East), Ward 7. Consideration and possible action on application of Patricia Presley and Tom Clements for Certificate of Appropriateness to: 1. Install wrought iron fence and gate forward of the 50% line of the primary structure.

## Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 10 of 24

August 5, 2009

Patricia Presley and Tom Clements were not present for comment.

**APPROVED.** Motion: Small / Brown to move **denial with prejudice** that, based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-09-051, Staff Report and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds:

1. That there is no compelling evidence that the fence needs to be forward of the 50% line of the structure; and
2. That based upon the evidence presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds the action requested is not in compliance, that the proposed material change in appearance would have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historic or architectural significance and value of the historic district or historic property according to the *Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City*, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Ayes: Tague, Brown, Clemmer, Gaines, Jones, Nelson, Small, Taylor, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Absent: Collier, Daniel.

- 6H. HPCA-09-018** at 200 NW 19th Street. (Heritage Hills), Ward 6. Consideration and possible action on application of Tassels Etc, LLC - Dorene Shadid for Certificate of Appropriateness to: 1. Reconsider item to reconstruct front porch including stuccoed pedestals, metal railing, and stuccoed pedestals flanking front steps described for the May 1, 2009 meeting.

Dorene Shadid was not present for comment.

**RECONSIDER.** Motion: Brown / Gaines to move **approval to reconsider** application HPCA-09-018.

Ayes: Tague, Brown, Clemmer, Gaines, Jones, Nelson, Taylor, Zimmer.

Nays: Small.

Absent: Collier, Daniel.

- 6H1. HPCA-09-018** at 200 NW 19th Street. (Heritage Hills), Ward 6. Consideration and possible action on application of Tassels Etc, LLC - Dorene Shadid for Certificate of Appropriateness to: 3. Reconstruct front porch including stuccoed pedestals, metal railing, and stuccoed pedestals flanking front entry steps.

Dorene Shadid was not present for comment.

## Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 11 of 24

August 5, 2009

**Motion Failed.** Motion: Gaines / Brown to move **approval** that, based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-09-018, Staff Report and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds:

Ayes: Brown, Gaines.

Nays: Tague, Clemmer, Jones, Nelson, Small, Taylor, Zimmer.

Absent: Collier, Daniel.

**DENIED.** Motion: Small / Jones to move **denial without prejudice** that, based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-09-018, Staff Report and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds:

1. That compelling evidence exists of the original condition;
2. That the application as originally approved should be retained and not changed to the metal railing; and
3. That based upon the evidence presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds the action requested is not in compliance, that the proposed material change in appearance would have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historic or architectural significance and value of the historic district or historic property according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Ayes: Tague, Brown, Clemmer, Gaines, Jones, Nelson, Small, Taylor, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Absent: Collier, Daniel.

- 6I. HPCA-09-073** at 326 NW 21st Street. (Heritage Hills), Ward 6. Consideration and possible action on application of Philip Walker Reid for Certificate of Appropriateness to: 1. Remove existing slab door at entry; and 2. Install new 15-lite, hardwood door at entry.

Approved on Consent Docket.

- 6J. HPCA-09-086** at 912 NW 15th Street. (Heritage Hills), Ward 6. Consideration and possible action on application of Marc and K. Nicholle Edwards for Certificate of Appropriateness to: 1. Install iron fence forward of the 50% line of the primary structure.

K. Nicholle Edwards was not present for comment.

## Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 12 of 24

August 5, 2009

**APPROVED.** Motion: Small / Nelson to move **approval** that, based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-09-086, Staff Report and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds:

1. That the proposed fence and gate meet all criteria of administrative approval other than location;
2. That circumstances of this proposal are unique in that the proposed location is forward of the 50% mark of the primary structure;
3. That circumstances of this proposal are unique in that the atypical corner lot is large permitting a significantly deep front yard front;
4. That the proposed location of the fence is forward of the 50% mark in the side yards by no more than five feet on the west side and no more than four feet on the east side which will be imperceptible on this large lot;
5. That the circumstances of this proposal are unique in that the front, west side, and back of the lot are adjacent to public streets;
6. That the proposed fence locations are supported by the architectural features of the building as logical termination points at both the east and west side yards
7. That the proposed fence is primarily transparent and largely screened by the architecture and vegetation;
8. That the east fence centerline will be located 24 inches south of the corner of the structure;
9. That this action is consistent with the provisions of 4250.4 C, D, I and J of the Historic Preservation Ordinance contained in the *Zoning and Planning Code*;
10. That this action is consistent with the provisions of Subchapter 1.9 of the Preservation Guidelines and Standards; and
11. That based upon the evidence presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, the Commission finds that although this application does not strictly comply with the standards set forth in the Preservation Guidelines, that a unique circumstance exists and the work proposed is nevertheless historically appropriate and in compliance with the intent of the Guidelines and the Secretary of the Interior's Standards and will not adversely affect the historic character of the property or the integrity of the historic district.

Ayes: Tague, Brown, Clemmer, Gaines, Jones, Nelson, Small, Taylor, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Absent: Collier, Daniel.

- 6K. HPCA-09-078** at 521, 521 1/2 & 523 NW 22nd Street. (Mesta Park), Ward 6. Consideration and possible action on application of Zeeck Realty Marketing by David Zeeck for Certificate of Appropriateness to: 1. Remove front storm doors;

## Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 13 of 24

August 5, 2009

2. Re-brick garage/apartment structure; 3. Demolish balcony at garage apartment; 4. Rebuild balcony at garage apartment; 5.) Restore garage door opening; 6. Install new garage door at alley; 7. Remove garage doors; 8. Install new garage doors; 9. Remove (2) pedestrian doors at garage; 10. Install (2) new pedestrian doors at garage; 11. Install new storm doors; 12. Remove existing driveway; 13. Install new driveway up to 10-foot 9-inches wide; and 14. Install 6-foot tall wood fence.

David and Andy Zeeck were present for comment.

**APPROVED.** Motion: Zimmer / Taylor to move approval of items 1. Remove front storm doors; 2. Re-brick garage/apartment structure; 3. Demolish balcony at garage apartment; 5.) Restore garage door opening; 6. Install new garage door at alley; 7. Remove garage doors; 8. Install new garage doors; 9. Remove (2) pedestrian doors at garage; 10. Install (2) new pedestrian doors at garage; 11. Install new storm doors; and 14. Install 6-foot tall wood fence that, based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-09-078, Staff Report and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds:

1. The front storm doors are not historic or character defining features and obscure the existing historic wood doors;
2. That the brick on the south and west façades of the garage apartment have separated from the structure and must be stabilized;
3. That the existing brick will be reused for reconstruction of south and west walls of the garage apartment;
4. That new brick will match existing in size, shape, color, pattern and texture for the garage apartment;
5. That the balcony at the garage apartment is significantly deteriorated;
6. That various components of the balcony are deteriorated beyond repair;
7. That removal of garage apartment balcony is necessary;
8. That the north garage door opening, now infilled with brick, appears to be and original opening;
9. That reopening the north garage door is consistent with the Guidelines;
10. That the proposed north garage door will fit the original opening size;
11. That the north garage door will duplicate the appearance of the existing, original garage doors on the south facade, which is consistent with the Guidelines and the historic character of the property and the district;
12. That the existing south garage doors are significantly deteriorated;
13. That the new south garage doors will match the size of the existing door openings;
14. That the new south garage doors will duplicate the appearance of the existing original garage doors, maintaining the historic character of this important façade;

## Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 14 of 24

August 5, 2009

15. That the new garage doors will be painted wood;
16. That the ground level, west pedestrian door of the garage is not be visible from the public right-of-way and is not located on a primary character defining façade;
17. That the south elevation of the garage/apartment building is a primary façade;
18. That the proposed new south pedestrian door of the garage is consistent with the character of the existing door;
19. That both new pedestrian doors of the garage/apartment building will be painted wood;
20. That the driveway is significantly deteriorated;
21. That the wood fence is consistent with all requirements of the Guidelines including location, height, material, and finished face direction;
22. That the construction of the wood fence will be completed within one year;
23. That this action is consistent with the provisions of 4250.4 C, D, F, G, J, and L of the Historic Preservation Ordinance contained in the *Zoning and Planning Code*;
24. That this action is consistent with the provisions of Subchapters 1.3, 1.9, 2.1, 2.2, 2.4, 2.9, 2.10, 3.3, and 4 of the *Preservation Guidelines and Standards*; and
25. That based upon the evidence presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds the action requested is in compliance, and the proposed material change in appearance would not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical or architectural significance and value of the historic property and district according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Ayes: Tague, Clemmer, Gaines, Jones, Nelson, Small, Taylor, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Absent: Collier, Brown, Daniel.

**APPROVED with Modification.** Motion: Zimmer / Clemmer to move approval with modification on items 4) Rebuild balcony at garage apartment; and 12) Install new storm doors; that, based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-09-078, Staff Report and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds:

26. That the balcony guard rail shall be modified to a height no more than 36 inches tall;
27. That the balcony guard rail will be reconstructed to match the current configuration;

## Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 15 of 24

August 5, 2009

28. That the balcony pier cap/trim will be reconstructed to match the current configuration;
29. That additional top rails and trim will be added above the pier cap/trim to meet the increased height requirement for the balcony guard rail;
30. That bead board ceiling will be installed at the balcony;
31. That the balcony floor will be reconstructed of like material;
32. That the balcony design is otherwise appropriate in that it replicates the size, materials, location, and design elements of the existing balcony;
33. That the storm doors at the back of the duplex shall be painted to match adjacent trim at each location;
34. That the full height glass lite storm doors at the back of the duplex are otherwise consistent with the Guidelines;
35. That this action is consistent with the provisions of 4250.4 C, D, F, G, J, and L of the Historic Preservation Ordinance contained in the Zoning and Planning Code;
36. That this action is consistent with the provisions of Subchapters 1.9, 2.1, 2.2, 2.4, 2.9, 2.10, 3.3, and 4 of the Preservation Guidelines and Standards; and
37. That based upon the evidence that has been presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, that although the action requested cannot be approved as presented, that in recognition of the applicant's willingness to accept the conditions of approval, that the amended action requested is in compliance, and the proposed material change in appearance would not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historic or architectural significance and value of the historic property and/or district according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Ayes: Tague, Clemmer, Gaines, Jones, Nelson, Small, Taylor, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Absent: Collier, Brown, Daniel.

**APPROVED with Unique Circumstance.** Motion: Zimmer / Small to move **approval with unique circumstance on items 13) Install new driveway** that, based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-09-078, Staff Report and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds:

38. That a unique circumstance exists because a 10 foot driveway would leave 9 inches between the structure and the driveway;
39. That the driveway will be construct to be 10 feet 9 inches wide;
40. That the driveway will be constructed of concrete pigmented to match the color of the existing driveway concrete;

## Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 16 of 24

August 5, 2009

41. That this action is consistent with the provisions of 4250.4 G and L of the Historic Preservation Ordinance contained in the Zoning and Planning Code;
42. That this action is consistent with the provisions of Subchapters 1.3, of the Preservation Guidelines and Standards; and
43. That based upon the evidence that has been presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, that although the action requested cannot be approved as presented, that a unique circumstance exists and the work proposed is nevertheless historically appropriate and in compliance with the intent of the Guidelines and the Secretary of the Interior's Standards and will not adversely affect the historic character of the property or the integrity of the historic district.

Ayes: Tague, Clemmer, Gaines, Jones, Nelson, Small, Taylor, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Absent: Collier, Brown, Daniel.

- 6L. HPCA-09-085** at 616 NW 26th Street. (Paseo), Ward 2. Consideration and possible action on application of Oklahoma City Housing Services Redevelopment Corporation for Certificate of Appropriateness to: 1. Remove non-historic aluminum windows at 2nd floor; 2. Install 1/1 double hung, wood windows with insulated glazing at 2nd floor; 3. Remove front doors; 4. Install new front doors; 5. Remove back doors; 6. Install new back doors; 7. Remove existing concrete front steps; 8. Install new front steps; 9. Add railing to 1st floor porch; 10. Remove balcony divider; 11. Remove roof; 12. Install roof; 13. Remove existing stair with landing at rear; and 14. Install new stair with landing at rear.

Approved on Consent Docket.

- 6M. HPCA-09-081** at 312 NW 26th Street. (Jefferson Park), Ward 2. Consideration and possible action on application of Oklahoma Mental Health Council dba Red Rock Behavioral Health Services for Certificate of Appropriateness to: 1. Extend concrete parking lot.

Doug Howard, Architect, was present for comment.

**APPROVED with Modification and Unique Circumstance.** Motion: Small / Nelson to move approval with modification and unique circumstance that, based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-09-081, Staff Report and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds:

1. That the proposed parking lot extension will match existing concrete in color, detail, form, and finish;
2. That the landscaping and other site work as proposed are appropriate and

## Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 17 of 24

August 5, 2009

consistent with the guidelines;

3. That the original proposal for a 24' driveway has been **modified** by the applicant to 12';
4. That a driveway width of 12' is required to meet City requirements for multi-family/apartment complex driveway width on a one-way approach;
5. That this action is consistent with the provisions of 4250.4 C, D and I of the Historic Preservation Ordinance contained in the *Zoning and Planning Code*;
6. That this action is consistent with the provisions of Subchapter 1.3 of the *Preservation Guidelines and Standards*; and
7. That based upon the evidence that has been presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, that although the action requested cannot be approved as presented, that in recognition of the applicant's willingness to accept the conditions of approval, that the amended action requested is in compliance, and the proposed material change in appearance would not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historic or architectural significance and value of the historic property and/or district according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.
8. That the standard findings of unique circumstance are applicable because the proposed driveway meets all other requirements of the ordinance and guidelines except driveway width being 10' or less;
9. That a minimum driveway width of 12' is required to meet City zoning and code requirements for multi-family/apartment complex driveway width on a one-way approach;
10. That this action is consistent with the provisions of 4250.4 C, D and I of the Historic Preservation Ordinance contained in the *Zoning and Planning Code*;
11. That this action is consistent with the provisions of Subchapter 1.3 of the *Preservation Guidelines and Standards*; and
12. That based upon the evidence presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, the Commission finds that although the action cannot be approved as presented, and this application does not strictly comply with the standards set forth in the Preservation Guidelines, that in recognition of the applicant's willingness to accept the conditions of the approval, and that a unique circumstance exists and that the amended work proposed is nevertheless historically appropriate and in compliance with the intent of the Guidelines and the Secretary of the Interior's Standards and will not adversely affect the historic character of the property or the integrity of the historic property and/or district according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007

Ayes: Tague, Clemmer, Gaines, Nelson, Small, Taylor, Zimmer.

## Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 18 of 24

August 5, 2009

Nays: None.

Absent: Collier, Brown, Jones, Daniel.

- 6N. HPCA-09-049** at 236 Edgemere Court. (Edgemere Park), Ward 2. Consideration and possible action on application of Scott Robertson by Jo Meacham, Urban Kitchens for Certificate of Appropriateness to: 2. Replace gutters with copper gutters and downspouts.

Scott Robertson was present for comment.

**APPROVED.** Motion: Zimmer / Nelson to move **approval** that, based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-09-049, Staff Report and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds:

1. That copper gutters are compatible with the style of this property;
2. That the gutter finish will match the color and shade of adjacent materials which is consistent with the Guidelines;
3. That the paint choice for the woodwork will not present as metallic which is prohibited by the Guidelines;
4. That unfinished copper retains the bright copper finish fairly briefly once exposed to the elements;
5. That this action is consistent with the provisions of 4250.4 C and D of the Historic Preservation Ordinance contained in the *Zoning and Planning Code*;
6. That this action is consistent with the provisions of Subchapters 2.7 and 2.11 of the *Preservation Guidelines and Standards*; and
7. That based upon the evidence presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds the action requested is in compliance, and the proposed material change in appearance would not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical or architectural significance and value of the historic property and district according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Ayes: Tague, Clemmer, Gaines, Jones, Nelson, Small, Taylor, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Absent: Collier, Brown, Daniel.

- 6O. HPCA-09-077** at 224 NW Eubanks. (Edgemere Park), Ward 2. Consideration and possible action on application of Zack Woods for Certificate of Appropriateness to: 1. Install wood fence and metal gate forward of the 50% line of the primary structure.

## Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 19 of 24

August 5, 2009

Zack Woods was present for comment.

**APPROVED.** Motion: Zimmer / Jones to move approval with unique circumstance that, based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-09-077, Staff Report and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds:

1. That the proposed fence and gate meet all criteria of administrative approval other than location;
2. That circumstances of this proposal are unique in that the proposed location of the fence is forward of the 50% mark in the side yard by one and one half feet;
3. That the proposed location of the fence and gate will be visually imperceptible having no adverse effect on the historic character of the property or the district;
4. That the proposed location of the fence is necessary to provide sufficient air flow for the existing mechanical equipment on the west side of the property while still screening the equipment;
5. That the proposed location of the fence on the east side will facilitate security of the side door by moving forward of the 50% mark in the side yard by one and one half feet;
6. That this action is consistent with the provisions of 4250.4 C, D, I and J of the Historic Preservation Ordinance contained in the *Zoning and Planning Code*;
7. That this action is consistent with the provisions of Subchapters 1.4 and 1.9 of the Preservation Guidelines and Standards; and
8. That based upon the evidence presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, the Commission finds that although this application does not strictly comply with the standards set forth in the Preservation Guidelines, that a unique circumstance exists and the work proposed is nevertheless historically appropriate and in compliance with the intent of the Guidelines and the Secretary of the Interior's Standards and will not adversely affect the historic character of the property or the integrity of the historic district.

Ayes: Tague, Clemmer, Gaines, Jones, Nelson, Small, Taylor, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Absent: Collier, Brown, Daniel.

## 7. OTHER BUSINESS

## Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 20 of 24

August 5, 2009

- A. **HPCA-09-088** at Western Avenue NW 37th to NW 41. (Crown Heights), Ward 2. To provide comments to the Public Works Department regarding the conceptual plans for the Western Avenue Streetscape in Ward 2.

Patty Butenhoff of City of Oklahoma City, Public Works Department was present for comment.

Emily Johnson, Coon Engineering, was present for comment.

The Crown Heights Preservation Review Committee submitted written comments to staff prior to the meeting stating concerns with item 2e installation of a new advertising kiosk. The committee recommends that the HP Commission request further detail/drawings/specifications of the “advertising kiosk” so this item can be properly reviewed.

The Historic Preservation Commission agrees with Crown Heights Preservation Review Committee and would like more information on the items especially the advertising kiosk as it is supposed to be compatible with Historic Preservation.

### 8. CITIZENS TO BE HEARD

### 9. COMMUNICATIONS AND REPORTS

#### A. Commission Members

Commissioner Tague would like the standard motions to be worked out.

#### B. Municipal Counselor

Rita Douglas-Talley, Municipal Counselor, introduced her son Barry Douglas Talley, who is attending the University of Michigan law school.

#### C. Administrative Approvals

**9C1. HPCA-09-084** at 2701 N Walker Ave. (Paseo), Ward 2. Staff is announcing the Administrative Approval of the item on the application of OKC Housing Services Redevelopment Corp for Certificate of Appropriateness to: Install 6-foot tall privacy fence.

**9C2. HPCA-09-078** at 521, 521 1/2 & 523 NW 22nd St. (Mesta Park), Ward 6. Staff is announcing the Administrative Approval of the item on the application of Zeeck Realty Marketing by David Zeeck for Certificate of Appropriateness to: Install gutters and downspouts at primary and secondary buildings.

## Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 21 of 24

August 5, 2009

- 9C3. HPCA-09-089** at 429 NW 16th Street. (Heritage Hills), Ward 6. Staff is announcing the Administrative Approval of the item on the application of Renee Pascale for Certificate of Appropriateness to: Replace driveway to match existing driveway in color and size.
- 9C4. HPCA-09-068** at 2208 NW 25th Street. (Shepherd), Ward 2. Staff is announcing the Administrative Approval of the items on the application of Eric Mitts for Certificate of Appropriateness to: Replace stockade fence on east property line from rear of the house to the middle of the garage. Replace chain link fence on the west property line from the rear of the house to the middle of the neighboring garage (similar distance as east fencing).
- 9C5. HPCA-09-091** at 248 NW 34th Street. (Edgemere Park), Ward 2. Staff is announcing the Administrative Approval of the item on the application of Henry Featherly by Mike Lee for Certificate of Appropriateness to: Install 6-foot tall fence.
- 9C6. HPCA-09-074** at 421 NW 26th Street. (Jefferson Park), Ward 2. Staff is announcing the Administrative Approval of the item on the application of Rosanne Cellini by Shawna Villines for Certificate of Appropriateness to: Replace driveway.
- 9C7. HPCA-09-075** at 425 NW 26th Street. (Jefferson Park), Ward 2. Staff is announcing the Administrative Approval of the item on the application of Mary Eng by Mark Hatcher for Certificate of Appropriateness to: Replace driveway.
- 9C8. HPCA-09-085** at 616 NW 26th Street. (Paseo), Ward 2. Staff is announcing the Administrative Approval of the items on the application of Oklahoma City Housing Services Redevelopment Corporation for Certificate of Appropriateness to: Replace front and back porch lights; install storm windows; and install gutters and downspouts.
- 9C9. HPCA-09-085** at 616 NW 26th Street. (Paseo), Ward 2. Staff is announcing the Administrative Approval of the items on the application of Oklahoma City Housing Services Redevelopment Corporation for Certificate of Appropriateness to: Replace existing walkway to sidewalk; install 6-foot tall wood privacy fence; and replace concrete driveway and parking pad at rear of house.
- 9C10. HPCA-09-073** at 326 NW 21st Street. (Heritage Hills), Ward 6. Staff is announcing the Administrative Approval of the item on the application of Philip Walker Reid for Certificate of Appropriateness to: Re-install

## Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 22 of 24

August 5, 2009

upstairs awnings on north, east and west elevations.

- 9C11 HPCA-09-062** at 2121 NW 29th Street. (Shepherd), Ward 2. Staff is announcing the Administrative Approval of the items on the application of David L. Cobble for Certificate of Appropriateness to: 1. Replace gutters and 2. Install two turbine vents on back roof slope.

### D. Withdrawals

None.

### E. Board of Adjustment

- 9E1. BOA-13145** at 609 NW 14th Street. (Jefferson Park), Ward 2. Staff is announcing the appeal of the decision of the Planning Director regarding the requirement for a Certificate of Appropriateness for the replacement of damaged vinyl siding in a Historic District. The appeal was filed by Eric Groves on behalf of Kurt Reiger. **The appeal is scheduled to be heard by the Board of Adjustment on September 17, 2009.**

### F. City Council

- 9F1. Zoning Change SPUD-518** at 312 NW 26th St. (Jefferson Park), Ward 2. (SPUD-518) Application by Oklahoma Mental Health Council doing business as Red Rock BHS to REZONE from R-2/Historic Landmark/Urban Conservation District to SPUD-518 at 312 NW 26th Street. **This item was heard by City Council for introduction on July 7, 2009 and is scheduled for final hearing on August 4, 2009.**
- 9F2. HPCA-PC10219** at Guernsey Park Place Lots 9-11, Block 17. (Paseo), Ward 2. Recommendation to rezone Neighborhood Conservation Lots 9-11, in block 17 of Tract-2 to Tract-5. **This item will be scheduled to be heard by City Council for Introduction on August 4, 2009 and Final hearing on September 1, 2009.**
- 9F3. HPCA-PC10220** at Neighborhood Conservation Tract-5. (Paseo), Ward 2. Recommendation to rezone Neighborhood Conservation Tract-5 from Historic Landmark/Historic Preservation to Urban Design. **This item will be scheduled to be heard by City Council for Introduction on August 4, 2009 and Final hearing on September 1, 2009.**
- 9F4. Ordinance change relating to Tract Five of the Neighborhood Conservation Zoning District.** (Paseo), Ward 2. Recommendation regarding the ordinance amending regulations of the Neighborhood Conservation Zoning District for Tract 5 (Paseo Commercial District).

**Historic Preservation Commission**

Minutes - Page 23 of 24

August 5, 2009

**This item will be scheduled to be heard by City Council for Introduction on August 4, 2009 and Final hearing on September 1, 2009.**

**G. Planning Commission**

**9G1. HPCA-PC10219** at Guernsey Park Place Lots 9-11, Block 17. (Paseo), Ward 2. Recommendation to rezone Neighborhood Conservation Lots 9-11, in block 17 of Tract-2 to Tract-5. **This item was heard by the Planning Commission on July 9, 2009 and received recommendation for approval.**

**9G2. HPCA-PC10220** at Neighborhood Conservation Tract-5. (Paseo), Ward 2. Recommendation to rezone Neighborhood Conservation Tract-5 from Historic Landmark/Historic Preservation to Urban Design. **This item was heard by the Planning Commission on July 9, 2009 and received recommendation for approval.**

**9G3. Ordinance change relating to Tract Five of the Neighborhood Conservation Zoning District.** (Paseo), Ward 2. Recommendation regarding the ordinance amending regulations of the Neighborhood Conservation Zoning District for Tract 5 (Paseo Commercial District). **This item was heard by the Planning Commission on July 9, 2009 and received recommendation for approval.**

**H.** The next regularly scheduled meeting for the Historic Preservation Commission is Wednesday, September 2, 2009 at 2:00 p.m. at the Municipal Building, City Council Chamber. New applications and information on continued projects are to be submitted to staff by 5:00 p.m., Tuesday, August 11, 2009.

**G.** The next regularly scheduled workshop for the Historic Preservation Commission is Monday, August 10, 2009 at 4:00 p.m. The location has changed from 420 W. Main Street, Suite 900 to be held at City Council Chambers, Municipal Building, 200 North Walker Avenue.

Catherine Montgomery noted that Kent Schell will be presenting at the next Historic Preservation Commission Workshop and the topic will be: The History of Historic Preservation.

**10. ADJOURNMENT (4:26 p.m.)**

Motion: Small / Zimmer to adjourn the August 5, 2009, meeting of the Historic Preservation Commission.

**Historic Preservation Commission**

Minutes - Page 24 of 24

August 5, 2009

Ayes: Tague, Clemmer, Gaines, Jones, Nelson, Small, Taylor, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Absent: Collier, Brown, Daniel.

pjh