

MINUTES
Regular Meeting
HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION
June 03, 2009 - 2:00 p.m.
Municipal Building, City Council Chamber

The meeting of the Oklahoma City Historic Preservation Commission was called to order in the City Council Chamber, 3rd Floor of the Municipal Building, 200 N. Walker Avenue, Oklahoma City, Oklahoma. The meeting convened at 2:03p.m. Notice of the meeting and agenda were filed with the City Clerk's office and posted on the Council bulletin board 24 hours prior to the meeting.

1. CALL TO ORDER AND ROLL CALL

Members Present: Roland Tague, Chairman
Heather A. Clemmer
Thomas J. Daniel IV (arrived at item 5)
Patrick Gaines
Nedra Jones
Karen Nelson
Thomas Small, AIA
Karen Zimmer

Members Absent: Karen Collier, Vice-Chair
Allen Brown, AIA
Marnie Taylor

Staff Present: Susan Miller, Planner IV, Planning Department
Catherine Montgomery, AIA, Planner III, Planning Department
Paul Ryckbost, Planner II, Planning Department
Angela Yetter, Planner I, Planning Department
Paula Hurst, Planning Department
Rita Douglas-Talley, Assistant Municipal Counselor

- A. Recognition of Jane Holcombe and Carolee Galbraith
- B. Introduction of new Commissioners: Patrick Gaines and Heather Clemmer
- C. Meeting Process
- D. Standard Findings of Facts

APPROVED. Motion: Small / Zimmer to **approve** waiving of the reading of the Standard Findings of Fact and incorporating them into the minutes.

Ayes: Tague, Clemmer, Gaines, Jones, Nelson, Small, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Absent: Collier, Brown, Daniel, Taylor.

2. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

APPROVED. Motion: Nelson / Zimmer to **approve** the minutes of the May 6, 2009, Historic Preservation Commission meeting.

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 2 of 20

June 3, 2009

Ayes: Jones, Nelson, Zimmer.
Nays: None.
Abstain: Small, Tague, Clemmer, Gaines.
Absent: Collier, Brown, Daniel, Taylor.

(Occurred after Agenda Item 5) RESCIND. Motion: Nelson / Zimmer to **rescind** the minutes of the May 6, 2009, Historic Preservation Commission meeting.

Ayes: Daniel, Jones, Nelson, Zimmer.
Nays: None.
Abstain: Small, Tague, Clemmer, Gaines.
Absent: Collier, Brown, Taylor.

RECEIVE. Motion: Daniel / Zimmer to **receive** the minutes of the May 6, 2009, Historic Preservation Commission meeting.

Ayes: Daniel, Jones, Nelson, Zimmer.
Nays: None.
Abstain: Small, Tague, Clemmer, Gaines.
Absent: Collier, Brown, Taylor.

3. CITATION REPORT

Mr. Woods, Compliance Officer, was present for comment.

4. CONTINUANCE REQUESTS

A. Staff request continuance of the following cases:

None.

B. Other continuance requests:

None.

5. CONSENT DOCKET CASES

Agenda items 6A, 6D, 6I, 6K, 6N, 6O and 6P have been pulled from the Consent Docket and will be heard in regular agenda order.

6B. HPCA-09-040 at 500 NW 30th Street (Paseo), Ward 2. Consideration and possible action on application of Fritz Robinson for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1) Install screen door.

Findings of Fact:

1. That, for this case, the most applicable portion of the Guidelines is in Chapter 2, "Alterations to the Building Fabric and Components of Historic Buildings;"
2. That this is not a Historic Building; it is stand-alone New Construction

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 3 of 20

June 3, 2009

(2003-2004);

3. That the proposed screen door is consistent with the most restrictive criteria used for historic structures;
4. That this action is consistent with the provisions of 4250.4 C and D of the Historic Preservation Ordinance contained in the *Zoning and Planning Code*; and
5. That this action is consistent with the provisions of Subchapters 2.4 of the *Preservation Guidelines and Standards*;

- 6H. HPCA-09-052** at 1012 NW 41st Street (Crown Heights), Ward 2. Consideration and possible action on application of Katherine Thurmond for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1) Replace garage door and overhead motor.

Findings of Fact:

1. That the proposed garage door is of a good quality and compatible with the historic visual character of the property and the district;
2. That this action is consistent with the provisions of 4250.4 C and D of the Historic Preservation Ordinance contained in the *Zoning and Planning Code*; and
3. That this action is consistent with the provisions of Subchapter 2.9 of the *Preservation Guidelines and Standards*;

- 6J. HPCA-09-043** at 1625 NW 38th Street (Putnam Heights), Ward 2. Consideration and possible action on application of Elizabeth Woodall for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1) Install wood wheelchair accessible ramp; and 2) Replace front door.

Findings of Fact:

1. That for this case, the most applicable portion of the Guidelines is in Chapter 3, "New Construction (Stand-Alone New Construction of Additions to Existing Buildings);"
2. That the ramp is necessary to provide accessibility to the residence for the owner who uses a wheelchair;
3. That the wood wheelchair ramp is located on a side elevation and is as unobtrusive as possible;
4. That this action is consistent with the provisions of 4250.4 C, D, and H of the Historic Preservation Ordinance contained in the *Zoning and Planning Code*; and
5. That this action is consistent with the provisions of Subchapter 3.2 of the

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 4 of 20

June 3, 2009

Preservation Guidelines and Standards;

- 6L. HPCA-09-045** at 204 NW 17th Street (Heritage Hills), Ward 6. Consideration and possible action on application of Gary Hicks for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1) Replace existing roof with high definition composition shingle at both house and garage.

Findings of Fact:

1. That the roofs of the house and garage are in need of repair in order to protect the structural integrity of the buildings;
2. That the existing shape, line, pitch, and overhang of historic roofs, as well as architectural features such as dormers and chimneys will be preserved;
3. That the proposed shingle is an acceptable replacement for existing and non-historic roof;
4. That this action is consistent with the provisions of 4250.4 C and D of the Historic Preservation Ordinance contained in the *Zoning and Planning Code*; and
5. That this action is consistent with the provisions of Subchapter 2.7 of the *Preservation Guidelines and Standards*;

- 6M. HPCA-09-046** at 438 NW 20th Street (Heritage Hills), Ward 6. Consideration and possible action on application of Karen Leis for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1) Replace existing roof at both house and garage with high definition composition shingle, and 2) Install one turbine on the back of the house and one turbine on the back of the garage.

Findings of Fact:

1. That the roofs of the house and garage are in need of repair in order to protect the structural integrity of the buildings;
2. That the original shape, line, pitch, and overhang of historic roofs, as well as architectural features, will be preserved;
3. That the proposed shingle is an acceptable replacement for the existing roofing;
4. That the turbines are located on the back roof slopes and are not visible from the public right-of-way;
5. That this action is consistent with the provisions of 4250.4 C and D of the Historic Preservation Ordinance contained in the *Zoning and Planning Code*; and
6. That this action is consistent with the provisions of Subchapter 2.7 of the *Preservation Guidelines and Standards*;

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 5 of 20

June 3, 2009

APPROVED. Motion: Small / Nelson to move **approval** of Consent Docket agenda items 6B, 6H, 6J, 6L and 6M and the standard findings for each application as set forth above, ~~as stated that~~, based upon the evidence presented in the applications, Staff Report, and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds the action requested is in compliance, and the proposed material change in appearance would not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical or architectural significance and value of the historic district or historic property according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Ayes: Tague, Clemmer, Daniel, Gaines, Jones, Nelson, Small, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Absent: Collier, Brown, Taylor.

2. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

RESCIND. Motion: Nelson / Zimmer to **rescind** the minutes of the May 6, 2009, Historic Preservation Commission meeting.

Ayes: Daniel, Jones, Nelson, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Abstain: Small, Tague, Clemmer, Gaines.

Absent: Collier, Brown, Taylor.

RECEIVE. Motion: Daniel / Zimmer to **receive** the minutes of the May 6, 2009, Historic Preservation Commission meeting.

Ayes: Daniel, Jones, Nelson, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Abstain: Small, Tague, Clemmer, Gaines.

Absent: Collier, Brown, Taylor.

6. CASES FOR INDIVIDUAL CONSIDERATION

- 6A. HPCA-09-036 at 2705 N Walker Ave. (Paseo), Ward 2. Consideration and possible action on the application of Oklahoma City Housing Services Redevelopment Corporation for a Certificate of Appropriateness to 1) Install fence forward of the 50% line on the primary structure.

Neila Crank-Clements of Positively Paseo was present for comment.

CONTINUED. Motion: Small / Jones to move **30-day continuance** that, based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-09-036, Staff Report, and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds that additional information is required from the applicant in order to determine whether the action requested is in compliance with Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 6 of 20

June 3, 2009

Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Ayes: Tague, Clemmer, Daniel, Gaines, Jones, Nelson, Small, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Absent: Collier, Brown, Taylor.

- 6B HPCA-09-040 at 500 NW 30th St. (Paseo), Ward 2. Consideration and possible action on the application of Fritz Robinson for a Certificate of Appropriateness to 1) Install screen door.

Approved on Consent Docket.

- 6C HPCA-09-048 at 714 NW 27th St. (Paseo), Ward 2. Consideration and possible action on the application of Lee Foster for a Certificate of Appropriateness to 1) Install new windows.

Brigett Foster was present for comment.

APPROVED with Modification. Motion: Small / Zimmer to move **approval with modification** that, based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-09-048, Staff Report, and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds:

1. That the existing windows are not the original windows;
2. That the proposed solution which is limited to the ground floor of the front (north) façade constitutes a complete and total resolution for all windows related to this property;
3. That all other windows in place shall remain, including some original windows and some replacement windows;
4. That the proposed replacement windows for the ground floor of the front (north) façade are appropriate and compatible for the property and with the district;
5. That the applicant's proposal be modified to also include a trim piece, equal in depth to the trim in place and surrounding the window unit on the second story north façade, to replicate an appropriate trim detail to surround the new window units. The trim shall be installed on top of, and cover, the existing trim, and the width shall match the current width of the trim piece underneath.
6. That this action is consistent with the provisions of 4250.4 C and D of the Historic Preservation Ordinance contained in the *Zoning and Planning Code*;
7. That this action is consistent with the provisions of Subchapter 2.5 of the

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 7 of 20

June 3, 2009

Preservation Guidelines and Standards; and

8. That based upon the evidence that has been presented in the application, Staff Report, and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds that although the action requested cannot be approved as presented, that in recognition of the applicant's willingness to accept the conditions of approval, that the amended action requested is in compliance, and the proposed material change in appearance would not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historic or architectural significance and value of the historic district or historic property according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Ayes: Tague, Clemmer, Daniel, Gaines, Nelson, Small, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Recused: Jones.

Absent: Collier, Brown, Taylor.

- 6D HPCA-09-038 at 221 NW 27th ST. (Jefferson Park), Ward 2. Consideration and possible action on the application of Jennifer L. Gooden for a Certificate of Appropriateness to 1) Remove existing chain link fence, and 2) Install 6-foot tall cedar fence forward of the 50% line of the primary structure.

Jennifer Gooden was present for comment.

APPROVED with Modification. Motion: Small / Daniel to move **approval with modification** that, based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-09-038, Staff Report, and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds:

Findings of Fact:

1. That the standard findings of unique circumstance are applicable because the proposed fence, meets most other requirements of the ordinance and guidelines except for the placement forward of the 50% line of the length of the side of the primary structure;
2. That the forward placement of the proposed fence on the east side is appropriate given the peculiar alignment of the buildings in relation to the curved street;
3. That the proposed fence is consistent with the spirit and intent of the Preservation Guidelines;
4. That the proposed fence will not adversely affect the historic character of the property or the integrity of the historic district.
5. That a modification to further define the west side as being allowed to be

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 8 of 20

June 3, 2009

forward of the 50% line and the east side to a point north not greater than the 50% mark of the overall length of the building on that side. (inserted)

6. That this action is consistent with the provisions of 4250.4 C, D, and I of the Historic Preservation Ordinance contained in the *Zoning and Planning Code*;
7. That this action is consistent with the provisions of Subchapter 1.9 of the *Preservation Guidelines and Standards*; and
8. That although the action requested cannot be approved as presented, that in recognition of the applicant's willingness to accept the conditions of approval, that the amended action requested is in compliance, and the proposed material change in appearance would not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historic or architectural significance and value of the historic district or historic property according to the *Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City*, and the provisions of the *Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007*.

Ayes: Tague, Clemmer, Daniel, Gaines, Jones, Nelson, Small, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Absent: Collier, Brown, Taylor.

- 6E HPCA-09-049 at 236 Edgemere Court. (Edgemere Park), Ward 2. Consideration and possible action on the application of Scott Robertson by Jo Meacham, Urban Kitchens for a Certificate of Appropriateness to 1) Remove chimney and flue; 2) Replace gutters with copper gutters and downspouts; and 3) Remove non-original casement window from 2nd floor gable and replace with arched vent window to match vent on front of house.

Jo Meacham was present for comment.

CONTINUED. Motion: Small / Zimmer to move **30-day continuance of item 2) Replace gutters with copper gutters and downspouts;** that, based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-09-049, Staff Report, and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds that additional information is required from the applicant in order to determine whether the action requested is in compliance with *Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City*, and according to the provisions of the *Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007*.

Ayes: Tague, Clemmer, Daniel, Gaines, Jones, Nelson, Small, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Absent: Collier, Brown, Taylor.

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 9 of 20

June 3, 2009

APPROVE. Motion: Small / Daniel to move approval of items 1) Remove chimney and flue; and 3) Remove non-original casement window from 2nd floor gable and replace with arched vent window to match vent on front of house that, based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-09-049, Staff Report, and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds:

1. That a remodel of the kitchen is an acceptable adaptation of the building for contemporary use;
2. That the removal of the kitchen chimney is needed in order to remodel the kitchen as proposed;
3. That the kitchen chimney is not visible from the public right-of-way;
4. That removal of the kitchen chimney will not radically change, obscure, or destroy a feature of the building that defines its historic character;
5. That the chimney is not a primary contributing feature to the historic integrity of the historic district and the demolition will not adversely affect the historic character of the property or district;
6. That the existing window is an incompatible window style for this building;
7. That the existing window is a result of a previous non-historic renovation of the house;
8. That incompatible non-historic alterations to a historic building should be reversed when possible;
9. That the exact previously existing condition at this wall location is unknown;
10. That where replication of original elements isn't possible, a compatible design may be used;
11. That replication of the existing vent is an acceptable and compatible alternative to the existing non-historic window;
12. That the new window design will be differentiated from the historic fabric visible by close inspection;
13. That this action is consistent with the provisions of 4250.4 C and D of the Historic Preservation Ordinance contained in the *Zoning and Planning Code*;
14. That this action is consistent with the provisions of Subchapters 2.1 and 2.5 of the *Preservation Guidelines and Standards*; and
15. That based upon the evidence presented in the application, Staff Report, and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds the action requested is in compliance, and the proposed material change in appearance would not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical, or architectural

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 10 of 20

June 3, 2009

significance and value of the historic property and district according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Ayes: Tague, Clemmer, Daniel, Gaines, Jones, Nelson, Small, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Absent: Collier, Brown, Taylor.

- 6F HPCA-09-047 at 829 NW 42nd St. (Crown Heights), Ward 2. Consideration and possible action on the application of Sean McCoy for a Certificate of Appropriateness to 1) Construct addition at back of house including: a) painted brick exterior, b) roof to match existing, c) new door, d) new windows, e) new steps, f) new sidewalk, and g) reinstall existing light fixture.

Sean McCoy was present for comment.

The Crown Heights Preservation Review Committee submitted written comments to staff prior to the meeting.

CONTINUED. Motion: Daniel / Clemmer to move 60-day continuance of items c) to install new door, and d) new windows that, based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-09-047, Staff Report, and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds that additional information is required from the applicant in order to determine whether the action requested is in compliance with Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

APPROVED. Motion: Daniel / Clemmer to move approval of items 1) Construct addition at back of house including: a) painted brick exterior, b) roof to match existing, e) new steps, f) new sidewalk, and g) reinstall existing light fixture that, based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-09-047, Staff Report, and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds:

1. That the addition is planned for construction at the rear of the building;
2. That the addition is clearly differentiated from the existing historic structure by the retention of the north brick wall and the northwest roof line of the existing back projection;
3. That the addition will be minimally visible from the public right-of-way;
4. That the wall, roof, and wood construction elements of the addition are compatible with elements of the existing structure;
5. That the proposed door and window materials are permitted, compatible and differentiated;

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 11 of 20

June 3, 2009

6. That this action is consistent with the provisions of 4250.4 C and D of the Historic Preservation Ordinance contained in the *Zoning and Planning Code*;
7. That this action is consistent with the provisions of Subchapters 3.2 and 3.5 of the *Preservation Guidelines and Standards*; and
8. That based upon the evidence presented in the application, Staff Report, and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds the action requested is in compliance, and the proposed material change in appearance would not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical or architectural significance and value of the historic property and district according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Ayes: Tague, Clemmer, Daniel, Gaines, Jones, Nelson, Small, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Absent: Collier, Brown, Taylor.

- 6G HPCA-09-050 at 812 NW 40th St. (Crown Heights), Ward 2. Consideration and possible action on the application of Rob & Cellina Abernathy by James Loftis, FAIA for a Certificate of Appropriateness to 1) Construct new addition at rear including: a) Install porch with stair; b) Repair masonry to match existing; c) Relocate door; d) Relocate windows; and e) Install new windows.

James Loftis was present for comment.

The Crown Heights Preservation Review Committee submitted written comments to staff prior to the meeting.

APPROVED. Motion: Small / Nelson to move **approval** that, based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-09-050, Staff Report, and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds:

1. That the proposed addition and other modifications that are visible from the public right-of-way are focused on already modified portions of the building;
2. That the majority of the proposed changes are not visible from the public-right-of-way;
3. That the proposed porch and steps are rear additions;
4. That the proposed reuse of the historic door and window will assure that the compatible materials are used;
5. That the proposed roof materials for the addition and the repair to the small

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 12 of 20

June 3, 2009

roof on the east elevation are appropriate in that they will match the existing;

6. That the proposed addition will not have an adverse effect on the character defining features of the building as enumerated in the NRHP nomination description;
7. That the proposed addition is adequately differentiated from the original and compatible with the existing structure;
8. That the proposed re-use of existing materials is appropriate and the proposed new materials are compatible;
9. That this action is consistent with the provisions of 4250.4 C and D of the Historic Preservation Ordinance contained in the *Zoning and Planning Code*;
10. That this action is consistent with the provisions of Subchapters 2.1, 2.2, 2.4, 2.5, 2.7, 3.0, 3.2, and 3.5 of the *Preservation Guidelines and Standards*; and
11. That based upon the evidence presented in the application, Staff Report, and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds the action requested is in compliance, and the proposed material change in appearance would not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical or architectural significance and value of the historic property and district according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Ayes: Clemmer, Daniel, Gaines, Jones, Nelson, Small, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Recused: Tague.

Absent: Collier, Brown, Taylor.

- 6H HPCA-09-052 at 1012 NW 41st St. (Crown Heights), Ward 2. Consideration and possible action on the application of Katherine Thurmond for a Certificate of Appropriateness to 1) Replace garage door and overhead motor.

Approved on Consent Docket.

- 6I HPCA-09-041 at 1417 NW 35th St. (Putnam Heights), Ward 2. Consideration and possible action on the application of William Williams for a Certificate of Appropriateness to 1) Install 6-foot tall wood stockade fence forward of the 50% line of the primary structure.

Bill Williams was present for comment.

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 13 of 20

June 3, 2009

APPROVED. Motion: Small / Zimmer to move **approval** that, based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-09-041, Staff Report, and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds:

1. That the standard findings of unique circumstance are applicable because the proposed fence meets all other requirements of the ordinance and guidelines except for the placement forward of the 50% line of the side yard length of the primary structure;
2. That the proposed fence is consistent with the spirit and intent of the Preservation Guidelines;
3. That the proposed fence will not adversely affect the historic character of the property or the integrity of the historic district;
4. That the geometry of the house is unique and moving the fence forward of the 50% mark of the primary structure is appropriate for this property; (inserted)
5. That this action is consistent with the provisions of 4250.4 C, D, H and I of the Historic Preservation Ordinance contained in the *Zoning and Planning Code*;
6. That this action is consistent with the provisions of Subchapter 1.9 of the *Preservation Guidelines and Standards*;
7. That based upon the evidence presented in the application, Staff Report, and during the public hearing, the action requested is not in compliance, but because of the unique circumstance the proposed material change in appearance would not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical or architectural significance and value of the historic property and district according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Specific Findings of Fact:

Ayes: Tague, Clemmer, Daniel, Gaines, Jones, Nelson, Small, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Absent: Collier, Brown, Taylor.

- 6J HPCA-09-043 at 1625 NW 38th St. (Putnam Heights), Ward 2. Consideration and possible action on the application of Elizabeth Woodall for a Certificate of Appropriateness to 1) Install wood wheelchair accessible ramp, and 2) Replace front door.

Approved on Consent Docket.

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 14 of 20

June 3, 2009

- 6K HPCA-09-044 at 600 NW 14TH St. (Heritage Hills), Ward 6. Consideration and possible action on the application of Phillip Washburn for a Certificate of Appropriateness to 1) Replace existing cedar shingle roof with high definition composition shingle at both house and garage.

Phillip Washburn was present for comment.

CONTINUED. Motion: Daniel / Nelson to move **30-day continuance** that, based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-09-044, Staff Report, and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds that additional information is required from the applicant in order to determine whether the action requested is in compliance with Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Ayes: Tague, Clemmer, Daniel, Gaines, Jones, Nelson, Small, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Absent: Collier, Brown, Taylor.

(Heard after Item 6P) **RESCIND**. Motion: Daniel / Nelson move to **rescind** previous motion.

Ayes: Tague, Clemmer, Daniel, Gaines, Jones, Nelson, Small, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Absent: Collier, Brown, Taylor.

- 6L HPCA-09-045 at 204 NW 17th St. (Heritage Hills), Ward 6. Consideration and possible action on the application of Gary Hicks for a Certificate of Appropriateness to 1) Replace existing roof with high definition composition shingle at both house and garage.

Approved on Consent Docket.

- 6M HPCA-09-046 at 438 NW 20th St. (Heritage Hills), Ward 6. Consideration and possible action on the application of Karen Leis for a Certificate of Appropriateness to 1) Replace existing roof at both house and garage with high definition composition shingle; and 2) Install one turbine on the back of the house and one turbine on the back of the garage.

Approved on Consent Docket.

- 6N HPCA-09-027 at 319 NW 18th St. (Heritage Hills), Ward 6. Consideration and possible action on the application of Neta and Ronald Wright by Stephanie Pettenger

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 15 of 20

June 3, 2009

for a Certificate of Appropriateness to 1) Replace chain link fence with 8-foot tall wooden fence.

There was no representative present for comment.

APPROVED. Motion: Daniel / Nelson to move **approval** that, based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-09-027, Staff Report, and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds:

1. That the proposed fence location is located entirely within the back yard and not visible from the public right of way;
2. That the building materials, structural appearance, and height and scale of the fence are compatible with the structure and other structures on the block;
3. That the fence does not impede any significant viewscales;
4. That this action is consistent with the provisions of 4250.4 C, D, H, and J of the Historic Preservation Ordinance contained in the *Zoning and Planning Code*;
5. That this action is consistent with the intent of Subchapter 1.9 of the *Preservation Guidelines and Standards*; and
6. That based upon the evidence presented in the application, Staff Report, and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds the action requested is in compliance, that the proposed material change in appearance would not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historic or architectural significance and value of the historic district or historic property according to the *Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City*, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Ayes: Clemmer, Daniel, Gaines, Jones, Nelson, Small, Zimmer.

Nays: Tague.

Absent: Collier, Brown, Taylor.

- 60 HPCA-09-037 at 930 NW 14th St. (Heritage Hills), Ward 6. Consideration and possible action on the application of J. Scott Champion for a Certificate of Appropriateness to 1) Install fence and gate forward of the 50% line of the primary structure.

J. Scott Champion was present for comment.

CONTINUED. Motion: Daniel / Gaines to move **30-day continuance** that, based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-09-037, Staff Report, and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds that additional information is required from the applicant in order to determine whether the action requested is in

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 16 of 20

June 3, 2009

compliance with Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Ayes: Tague, Clemmer, Daniel, Gaines, Jones, Nelson, Small, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Absent: Collier, Brown, Taylor.

- 6P HPCA-09-039 at 1009 NW 18th St. (Mesta Park), Ward 6. Consideration and possible action on the application of Carrie & Richard Evans for a Certificate of Appropriateness to 1) Replace sliding glass door with french style doors at the rear of the structure.

There was no representative present for comment.

The Mesta Park Preservation Review Committee submitted written comments to staff prior to the meeting.

CONTINUED. Motion: Daniel / Nelson to move **30-day continuance** that, based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-09-039, Staff Report, and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds that additional information is required from the applicant in order to determine whether the action requested is in compliance with Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Ayes: Tague, Clemmer, Daniel, Gaines, Jones, Nelson, Small, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Absent: Collier, Brown, Taylor.

- 6K HPCA-09-044 at 600 NW 14TH St. (Heritage Hills), Ward 6. Consideration and possible action on the application of Phillip Washburn for a Certificate of Appropriateness to 1) Replace existing cedar shingle roof with high definition composition shingle at both house and garage.

Phillip Washburn was present and supplied a green stained shingle.

RESCIND. Motion: Daniel / Nelson move to **rescind** previous motion.

Ayes: Tague, Clemmer, Daniel, Gaines, Jones, Nelson, Small, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Absent: Collier, Brown, Taylor.

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 17 of 20

June 3, 2009

APPROVE with Modification Motion: Daniel / Small to move **approval with modification** that, based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-09-044, Staff Report, and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds:

1. That the roofs of the house and garage are in need of repair in order to protect the structural integrity of the buildings;
2. That the original shape, line, pitch and overhang of historic roofs, as well as architectural features such as dormers, chimneys and turrets will be preserved;
3. That the proposed shingle is an acceptable replacement for cedar shingle contingent upon installation of the shingle in the color 'weathered wood';
4. Staff will determine the shingle color that most closely matches the color of the existing shingle. (Inserted)
5. That this action is consistent with the provisions of 4250.4 C and D of the Historic Preservation Ordinance contained in the *Zoning and Planning Code*;
6. That this action is consistent with the provisions of Subchapter 2.7 of the Preservation Guidelines and Standards; and
7. That based upon the evidence that has been presented in the application, Staff Report, and during the public hearing, that although the action requested cannot be approved as presented, that in recognition of the applicant's willingness to accept the conditions of approval, that the amended action requested is in compliance, and the proposed material change in appearance would not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historic or architectural significance and value of the historic property and/or district according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Ayes: Tague, Clemmer, Daniel, Gaines, Jones, Nelson, Small, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Absent: Collier, Brown, Taylor.

7. OTHER BUSINESS

- 7A. SPUD-518 at 312 NW 26th St. (Jefferson Park), Ward 2. Consideration and possible action on the application of Oklahoma Mental Health Council doing business as Red Rock BHS, for a Certificate of Appropriateness to receive a recommendation from the Historic Preservation Commission on an application set for hearing by the Planning Commission on June 11, 2009 to REZONE from R-2/Historic Landmark/Urban Conservation District to SPUD-518 at 312 NW 26th Street.

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 18 of 20

June 3, 2009

Douglas G. Howard was present for comment.

RECOMMENDATION: Motion: Small / Zimmer to move **recommend** that, the Planning Commission approve of the application of SPUD-518 as written with the additional provision that the existing R-2 uses and HL designation be allowed. Additionally, a provision that a review by the HP Commission for a CA would be required for for any modification to the site.

Ayes: Tague, Clemmer, Gaines, Jones, Nelson, Small, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Absent: Collier, Brown, Daniel, Taylor.

8. CITIZENS TO BE HEARD

None.

9. COMMUNICATIONS

A. Commission Members

B. Municipal Counselor

C. Administrative Approvals

- 9C1. HPCA-09-053 at 605 NW 16th Street (Mesta Park), Ward 6. Staff is announcing the Administrative Approval of the items on the application of Jeremy Gardner for Certificate of Appropriateness to: 1) Replace front sidewalk and steps, and 2) Install new west side yard wrought iron gate with fence.
- 9C2. HPCA-09-042 at 930 NW 17th Street (Mesta Park), Ward 6. Staff is announcing the Administrative Approval of the item on the application of Shavonda & Gina Pickett for Certificate of Appropriateness to: 1) Install fence.
- 9C3. HPCA-09-055 at 629 NW 26th Street (Paseo), Ward 2. Staff is announcing the Administrative Approval of the item on the application of Sara Kosted for Certificate of Appropriateness to: 1) Replace fence.
- 9C4. HPCA-09-036 at 2705 N Walker Ave. (Paseo), Ward 2. Staff is announcing the Administrative Approval of the item on the application of Oklahoma City Housing Services Redevelopment Corporation doing business as Positively Paseo for Certificate of Appropriateness to: 1) Revised sidewalk and front steps to accommodate existing tree.

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 19 of 20

June 3, 2009

- 9C5. HPCA-09-018 at 200 NW 19th Street (Heritage Hills), Ward 6. Staff is announcing the Administrative Approval of the item on the application of Tassels Etc, LLC - Dorene Shadid - for Certificate of Appropriateness to: 1) Install five pipe vents on the roof.
- 9C6. HPCA-09-040 at 500 NW 30th Street (Paseo), Ward 2. Staff is announcing the Administrative Approval of the items on the application of Fritz Robinson for Certificate of Appropriateness to: 1) Install fence.
- 9C7. HPCA-09-056 at 431 NW 20th Street (Heritage Hills), Ward 6. Staff is announcing the Administrative Approval of the item on the application by Shannon Rundell for Certificate of Appropriateness to: 1) Replace driveway.

D. Withdrawals

None.

E. Board of Adjustment

None.

F. City Council

- 9F5. Zoning Change SPUD-497 (Heritage Hills East), Ward 7. (SPUD-497) Application by Neighbors Holdings, LLC, to rezone 124 NW 15th Street from the R-4 General Residential/HL Historical Landmark/Heritage Hills East "UCD" Urban Conservation Overlay District to the SPUD-497 Simplified Planned Unit Development District. This item was deferred by the City Council on May 5, 2009 to be heard on June 2, 2009.

G. Planning Commission

- 9G1. HPCA-PC10219 at Guernsey Park Place, Lots 9-11, Block 17. (Paseo), Ward 2. Recommendation to rezone Neighborhood Conservation Lots 9-11, in block 17 of Tract-2 to Tract-5. This item will be scheduled for the July 9, 2009 Planning Commission meeting.
- 9G2. HPCA-PC10220 at Neighborhood Conservation Tract-5. (Paseo), Ward 2. Recommendation to rezone Neighborhood Conservation Tract-5 from Historic Landmark/Historic Preservation to Urban Design. This item will be scheduled for the July 9, 2009 Planning Commission meeting.

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 20 of 20

June 3, 2009

9G3. Ordinance change relating to Tract Five of the Neighborhood Conservation Zoning District. (Paseo), Ward 2. Recommendation regarding the ordinance amending regulations of the Neighborhood Conservation Zoning District for Tract 5 (Paseo Commercial District). This item will be scheduled for the July 9, 2009 Planning Commission meeting.

9G4. SPUD-518 at 312 NW 26th Street (Jefferson Park), Ward 2. Application by Oklahoma Mental Health Council doing business as Red Rock Behavioral Health Services to REZONE from R-2/Historic Landmark/Urban Conservation District to SPUD-518 at 312 NW 26th Street. This item is scheduled to be heard by the Planning Commission at the June 11, 2009 Planning Commission meeting.

H. The next regularly scheduled meeting for the Historic Preservation Commission is Wednesday, July 1, 2009 at 2:00 p.m. at the Municipal Building, City Council Chamber. New applications and information on continued projects are to be submitted to staff by 4:30 p.m., Tuesday, June 9, 2009.

I. The next regularly scheduled workshop for the Historic Preservation Commission is Monday, June 8, 2009 at 4:00 p.m. at 420 W. Main Street, Suite 900.

10. **ADJOURN** (4:43 pm)

Motion: Small / Zimmer to adjourn the 6/3/2009, meeting of the Historic Preservation Commission.

Ayes: Tague, Clemmer, Gaines, Jones, Nelson, Small, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Absent: Collier, Brown, Daniel, Taylor.

pjh