

MINUTES
Regular Meeting
HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION
May 06, 2009 - 2:00 p.m.
Municipal Building, City Council Chamber

The meeting of the Oklahoma City Historic Preservation Commission was called to order in the City Council Chamber, 3rd Floor of the Municipal Building, 200 N. Walker Avenue, Oklahoma City, Oklahoma. The meeting convened at 2:00 p.m. Notice of the meeting and agenda were filed with the City Clerk's office and posted on the Council bulletin board 24 hours prior to the meeting.

1. CALL TO ORDER AND ROLL CALL

Members Present: Karen Collier, Vice-Chair
Allen Brown, AIA
Carolee Galbraith
Jane Holcombe
Nedra Jones
Karen Nelson
Marnie Taylor (arrived at 2:12)
Karen Zimmer

Members Absent: Roland Tague, Chair
Tom Daniel
Thomas Small, AIA

Staff Present: Susan Miller, Planner IV, Planning Department
Catherine Montgomery, AIA, Planner III, Planning Department
Analinda Lane, Planning Department
Rita Douglas-Talley, Assistant Municipal Counselor

- A. Meeting Process
- B. Standard Findings of Facts

2. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

APPROVED. Motion: Galbraith / Brown to **approve** the minutes of the April 1, 2009, Historic Preservation Commission meeting.

Ayes: Collier, Brown, Galbraith, Holcombe, Jones, Nelson, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Absent: Tague, Daniel, Small, Taylor.

3. CITATION REPORT

Mr. Woods, Compliance Officer, was present for comment.

4. CONTINUANCE REQUESTS

- A. Staff requests continuance of the following cases:
None.
- B. Other continuance requests:
None.

5. CONSENT DOCKET CASES

- 1. B. (heard out of order) Standard Findings of Facts **APPROVED**. Motion: Holcombe / Zimmer to **approve** waiving of the reading of the Standard Findings of Fact and incorporating them into the minutes.

Ayes: Collier, Brown, Galbraith, Holcombe, Jones, Nelson, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Absent: Tague, Daniel, Small, Taylor.

- 6H. HPCA-09-029** at 708 NW 42nd St. (Crown Heights), Ward 2. Consideration and possible action on application of Paul Sechrist for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1) replace roof.

APPROVED. Motion: Holcombe / Nelson to **approve** based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-09-029 Staff Report, and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds:

Standard Findings of Fact for HPCA-09-029:

- 1. That the proposed composition roof shingle is a customary and satisfactory replacement for wood shingles;
- 2. That the proposed composition roof shingle installation in accordance with the manufacturer's product data will render a roof appearance acceptably similar to the existing wood shingles;
- 3. That this action is consistent with the provisions of 4250.4 C and D of the Historic Preservation Ordinance contained in the *Zoning and Planning Code*;
- 4. That this action is consistent with the provisions of Subchapter 2.7 of the *Preservation Guidelines and Standards*; and
- 5. That based upon the evidence presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds the action requested is in compliance, and the proposed material change in appearance would not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical or architectural significance and value of the historic property and district according to the *Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic*

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 3 of 21

Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Ayes: Collier, Brown, Galbraith, Holcombe, Jones, Nelson, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Absent: Tague, Daniel, Small, Taylor.

- 6L. HPCA-09-024** at 310 NW 19th St. (Heritage Hills), Ward 6. Consideration and possible action on application of John Kevin Mirjanich by Eric J. Stiner for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1) replace garage roof; and 2) replace veranda roof.

APPROVED. Motion: Holcombe / Galbraith to **approve** based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-09-024 Staff Report, and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds:

Standard Findings of Fact for HPCA-09-024:

1. That the visual character of the completed garage roof work is deemed appropriate;
2. That the visual character of the completed veranda roof work is deemed appropriate;
3. That this action is consistent with the provisions of 4250.4 C, D, and H of the Historic Preservation Ordinance contained in the *Zoning and Planning Code*;
4. That this action is consistent with the provisions of Subchapter(s) 2.7 of the *Preservation Guidelines and Standards*; and
5. That based upon the evidence presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, that the Commission find the action requested is in compliance, that the proposed material change in appearance would not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historic or architectural significance and value of the historic district or historic property according to the *Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts* for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Ayes: Collier, Brown, Galbraith, Holcombe, Jones, Nelson, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Absent: Tague, Daniel, Small, Taylor.

6. CASES FOR INDIVIDUAL CONSIDERATION

- 6A. HPCA-09-022** at 914 NW 20th St. (Mesta Park), Ward 6. Consideration and possible action on application of Ruth Demand by Paul Wellman of Mr. Fix It for

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 4 of 21

Certificate of Appropriateness to 1) repair front porch bricks and concrete; 2) construct brick railing at front porch; and 6) construct porch wood railing.

Ruth Demand was present for comment.

The Mesta Park Preservation Review Committee did not submit new comments prior to the meeting however they stated last months comments still apply.

APPROVED. Motion: Brown / Galbraith to move **approval of items 1) Repair front porch bricks and concrete; and 6) Construct side (east) porch metal railing** that, based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-09-022, Staff Report, and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds:

1. That the front porch brick walls and concrete floor are in need of repair and the proposed repair reuses the existing materials the greatest extent possible;
2. That a railing is required for the side (east) porch and the proposed modest wrought iron design is appropriate;
3. That this action is consistent with the provisions of 4250.4 C and D of the Historic Preservation Ordinance contained in the *Zoning and Planning Code*;
4. That this action is consistent with the provisions of Subchapter(s) 2.2 of the *Preservation Guidelines and Standards*; and
5. That based upon the evidence presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds the action requested is in compliance, that the proposed material change in appearance would not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historic or architectural significance and value of the historic district or historic property according to the *Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City*, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

APPROVED with Modification. Motion: Brown / Galbraith to move **approval subject to modification(s) of item 2) Construct brick railing at front porch**. that, based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-09-022, Staff Report, and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds:

Modifications are:

That Item 2) construct brick railing at front porch will have:

- A soldier course in the brick work at the floor line; and
- A rowlock course at the top of the masonry wall.

Standard Findings of Fact:

1. That the original porch railing and columns are missing and not represented

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 5 of 21

by photographic or physical evidence;

2. That the applicant lived in the house as a child and remembers a brick rail and concrete caps;
3. That the proposed design is compatible with the neighborhood;
4. That the design of the wood columns would be more appropriately constructed to be wider at the base than the top by a minimum of 3” on each side;
5. That the color of the concrete caps, shown as red in the applicants drawings, will actually be constructed to be a warm medium-grey color;
6. That this action is consistent with the provisions of 4250.4 C and D of the Historic Preservation Ordinance contained in the *Zoning and Planning Code*;
7. That this action is consistent with the provisions of Subchapter(s) 2.2 of the *Preservation Guidelines and Standards*; and
8. That based upon the evidence that has been presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds that although the action requested cannot be approved as presented, that in recognition of the applicant’s willingness to accept the conditions of approval, that the amended action requested is in compliance, and the proposed material change in appearance would not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historic or architectural significance and value of the historic district or historic property according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Ayes: Collier, Brown, Galbraith, Holcombe, Jones, Nelson, Taylor, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Absent: Tague, Daniel, Small.

- 6B. HPCA-09-025** at 507 NW 19th St. (Mesta Park), Ward 6. Consideration and possible action on application of J&B Properties, LLC by Jackie Morris for Certificate of Appropriateness to 2) remove existing non-original back door and install a new one; 3) remove existing screens at screened in porches at first and second floor levels on front (south) façade; and 4) install new steps/porch on back.

Jackie Morris was present for comment.

The Mesta Park Preservation Review Committee did not submit new comments prior to the meeting however they stated last months comments still apply.

APPROVED. Motion: Holcombe / Nelson to move approval of items 2) remove existing non-original back door and install a new one; 3) remove existing screens at screened in porches at first and second floor levels on front (south) façade; and 4) Install new steps/porch on back; that, based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-09-025, Staff Report, and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds:

Specific Findings:

Item 3) remove existing screens at screened in porches at first and second floor levels on front (south) façade;

- Wording correction is that the applicant will not only remove these screens but replace them; and
- Applicant may choose the design of the muntins from the four design options provided.

Standard Findings of Fact:

1. That the proposed back doors are possibly original to the property and are consistent with the character of the district;
2. That the proposed screen and wood detail designs as illustrated and including 4 options for the placement of vertical muntins: 1) match the current design, 2) match the design of the adjacent property (501/503 NW 19th Street), 3) as illustrated on “page 1 of 2,” and 4) as illustrated on “page 2 of 2; are appropriate with the applicant’s option to choose any 1 of the 4 options presented;
3. That the proposed wood steps, platform, and railing for the rear (north) entry are appropriate so long as all applicable building codes are met;
4. That should the design of the rear porch, platform, and railing have to change to meet applicable building codes, the applicant will return to the Commission for review of the design changes;
5. That this action is consistent with the provisions of 4250.4 C and D of the Historic Preservation Ordinance contained in the *Zoning and Planning Code*;
6. That this action is consistent with the provisions of Subchapters 2.2 and 2.4 of the *Preservation Guidelines and Standards*; and
7. That based upon the evidence presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds the action requested is in compliance, and the proposed material change in appearance would not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical or architectural significance and value of the historic property and district according to the *Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City*, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 7 of 21

Ayes: Collier, Brown, Galbraith, Holcombe, Jones, Nelson, Taylor, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Absent: Tague, Daniel, Small.

- 6C. HPCA-09-008** at 2701 N Walker Ave. (Paseo), Ward 2. Consideration and possible action on application of Oklahoma City Housing Services Redevelopment Corporation (Positively Paseo) for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1) construct new sidewalk with stair from front porch east to street and install wrought iron handrail; 2) build a porch coming off utility room at back of house; 3) remove existing concrete parking slab at back of house; and 4) install a new concrete parking slab at back of house.

Neila Crank-Clements was present for comment.

APPROVED. Motion: Taylor / Zimmer to move **approval** that, based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-09-008, Staff Report, and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds:

Standard Findings of Fact:

1. That the proposed installation of the front sidewalk, steps, and handrail is consistent with similar sidewalk, stair and rail features present in the district and is therefore appropriate;
2. That the construction of the back porch deck, steps, and handrail are modest in design, will be minimally visible from the public right-of-way, and is therefore appropriate;
3. That the proposed removal of the existing concrete parking slab will not irreversibly compromise any historic fabric and is therefore appropriate;
4. That the proposed new parking slab is basically consistent with the existing condition, affords an off street parking opportunity for this corner residence in lieu of an actual garage, and is therefore appropriate;
5. That this action is consistent with the provisions of 4250.4 C and D of the Historic Preservation Ordinance contained in the *Zoning and Planning Code*;
6. That this action is consistent with the provisions of Subchapter(s) 1.3 and 2.2 of the *Preservation Guidelines and Standards*; and
7. That based upon the evidence presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds the action requested is in compliance, that the proposed material change in appearance would not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historic or architectural significance and value of the historic district or historic property according to the *Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City*, and according to the provisions of the

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 8 of 21

Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Ayes: Collier, Brown, Galbraith, Holcombe, Jones, Nelson, Taylor, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Absent: Tague, Daniel, Small.

- 6D.** **HPCA-09-032** at 714 NW 27th St. (Paseo), Ward 2. Consideration and possible action on application of Lee Foster for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1) remove existing siding; 2) install new siding; 3) install new porch ceiling; 4) construct new porch floor of concrete or wood; 5) install new front porch railing; 6) install front porch; 7) remove existing front door; 8) install new front door; 9) remove existing back door; and 10) install new back door.

Lee Foster was present for comment.

The applicant has **withdrawn** items: 3) install new porch ceiling; 4) construct new porch floor of concrete or wood; 5) install new front porch railing.

APPROVED. Motion: Brown / Zimmer to move **approval 1) remove existing siding; 2) install new siding;** that, based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-09-032, Staff Report, and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds:

1. That the building had been previously modified from the original physical historic character, as documented by the Sanborn Fire Insurance maps, to such a degree that it was deemed non-contributing to the district at the time of documentation for listing the district on the National Register of Historic Places;
2. That the board and batten siding on the east end of the first level is likely not original nor likely to have been installed during the period of significance for the district (1905-1953);
3. That even though the narrower wood siding material that was removed was likely original and should have been repaired or replaced in kind, the “non-contributing” status of the structure may afford greater flexibility in interpreting appropriate preservation treatments therefore finding the 6” cedar wood siding to be appropriately used for all siding;
4. That this action is consistent with the provisions of 4250.4 C, D and H of the Historic Preservation Ordinance contained in the *Zoning and Planning Code*;
5. That this action is consistent with the provisions of Subchapters 2.2, 2.4 and 2.10 of the *Preservation Guidelines and Standards*; and
6. That based upon the evidence presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, that the Commission find the action requested is

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 9 of 21

in compliance, that the proposed material change in appearance would not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historic or architectural significance and value of the historic district or historic property according to the *Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City*, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Ayes: Collier, Brown, Galbraith, Holcombe, Jones, Nelson, Taylor, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Absent: Tague, Daniel, Small.

APPROVED with Modification. Motion: Brown / Zimmer to move **approval subject to modification(s) 6** ~~install front porch~~; that, based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-09-032, Staff Report, and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds:

Modification is:

- The siding for the porch roof pediment shall match the remainder of the house as agreed by the applicant.

Standard Findings:

1. That the building had been previously modified from the original physical historic character, as documented by the Sanborn Fire Insurance maps, to such a degree that it was deemed non-contributing to the district at the time of documentation for listing the district on the National Register of Historic Places;
2. That the board and batten siding on the east end of the first level is likely not original nor likely to have been installed during the period of significance for the district (1905-1953);
3. That even though the narrower wood siding material that was removed was likely original and should have been repaired or replace in kind, the “non-contributing” status of the structure may afford greater flexibility in interpreting appropriate preservation treatments therefore finding the 6” cedar wood siding to be appropriately used for all siding;
4. That the reconstruction of the front porch as it existed before the applicant began construction is appropriate and consistent with the Guidelines and Standards;
5. That this action is consistent with the provisions of 4250.4 C, D and H of the Historic Preservation Ordinance contained in the *Zoning and Planning Code*;
6. That this action is consistent with the provisions of Subchapters 2.2, 2.4 and 2.10 of the *Preservation Guidelines and Standards*; and
7. That based upon the evidence presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, that the Commission find the action requested is

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 10 of 21

in compliance, that the proposed material change in appearance would not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historic or architectural significance and value of the historic district or historic property according to the *Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City*, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Ayes: Collier, Brown, Galbraith, Holcombe, Jones, Nelson, Taylor, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Absent: Tague, Daniel, Small.

APPROVED with Modification. Motion: Brown / Nelson to move **approval subject to modification(s)** 7) remove existing front door; 8) install new front door; 9) remove existing back door; and 10) install new back door that, based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-09-032, Staff Report, and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds:

Modification is:

- The replacement front door will be a solid wood door with a single half-lite at upper portion and the applicant will work with staff; and
- The replacement back door will be a solid wood core door with 6 panels and the applicant will work with staff on final design.

Standard Findings of Fact for items: 7) remove existing front door; 8) install new front door:

Standard Findings:

1. That the building had been previously modified from the original physical historic character, as documented by the Sanborn Fire Insurance maps, to such a degree that it was deemed non-contributing to the district at the time of documentation for listing the district on the National Register of Historic Places;
2. That the removal of the existing non-original front door is appropriate;
3. That this action is consistent with the provisions of 4250.4 C, D and H of the Historic Preservation Ordinance contained in the *Zoning and Planning Code*;
4. That this action is consistent with the provisions of Subchapters 2.2, 2.4 and 2.10 of the *Preservation Guidelines and Standards*; and
5. That based upon the evidence presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, that the Commission find the action requested is in compliance, that the proposed material change in appearance would not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historic or architectural significance and value of the historic district or historic property according to the *Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City*, and according to the provisions of the

Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Ayes: Collier, Brown, Galbraith, Holcombe, Nelson, Taylor, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Recused: Jones.

Absent: Tague, Daniel, Small.

- 6E. HPCA-09-034** at 631 NW 26th St. (Paseo), Ward 2. Consideration and possible action on application of Lucretia Smith for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1) install patio door; 2) pour concrete pad; and 3) construct wood pergola.

Lucretia Smith was present for comment.

APPROVED. Motion: Holcombe / Galbraith to move **approval** that, based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-09-034, Staff Report, and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds:

Standard Findings of Fact:

1. That the proposed door and sidelites replaces non-historic windows to the rear wall of a non-historic rear addition therefore not adversely affecting the historic building or the district;
2. That the design of the proposed doors is compatible and differentiated from the historic portions of the building and the district;
3. That the proposed steps and concrete patio slab are consistent with those permitted without a Certificate of Appropriateness and considered in this application for Commission review only in as much as they are a part of an overall project proposal;
4. That the proposed pergola is located in a rear yard, is not physically attached to the historic building, and is taller than 6' which would not be subject to review or would be permitted for administrative review;
5. That the proposed pergola on this corner property would not be visible from the front public right of way and be only be minimally visible from the side yard public right of way;
6. That the proposed pergola is consistent with Subchapter 2.3, specifically, "*Pergolas were a popular feature in historic bungalow and craftsman houses; they provided shelter from rain and much needed shade in the Oklahoma summers.*" As such the proposed pergola would not have an adverse effect on the historic building or the district;
7. That this action is consistent with the provisions of 4250.4 C and D of the Historic Preservation Ordinance contained in the *Zoning and Planning Code*;
8. That this action is consistent with the provisions of Subchapter(s) 1.6, 1.7,

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 12 of 21

2.3, and 2.4 of the *Preservation Guidelines and Standards*; and

9. That based upon the evidence presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds the action requested is in compliance, that the proposed material change in appearance would not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historic or architectural significance and value of the historic district or historic property according to the *Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City*, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Ayes: Collier, Brown, Galbraith, Holcombe, Jones, Nelson, Taylor, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Absent: Tague, Daniel, Small.

- 6F.** **HPCA-09-035** at 819 NW 25th St. (Paseo), Ward 2. Consideration and possible action on application of Fairlawn Cemetery Association by Jeff Reese for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1) demolish structure.

Jeff Resse was present for comment.

CONTINUED. Motion: Holcombe / Jones to move **continuance for 60-days**, that, based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-09-035, Staff Report, and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds:

Standard Findings of Fact:

- That additional information is required from the applicant in order to determine whether the action requested is in compliance with Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Note: That Planning Staff will meet with the Cemetery board.

Ayes: Collier, Brown, Galbraith, Holcombe, Jones, Nelson, Taylor, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Absent: Tague, Daniel, Small.

- 6G.** **HPCA-09-036** at 2705 N Walker Ave. (Paseo), Ward 2. Consideration and possible action on application of Oklahoma City Housing Services Redevelopment Corporation (Positively Paseo) for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1) construct new sidewalk with for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1) build a new driveway; and 2) build a new one-car garage.

Neila Crank-Clements was present for comment.

APPROVED. Motion: Holcombe / Brown to move **approval** that, based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-09-008, Staff Report, and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds:

Standard Findings of Fact:

1. That the proposed garage is of a design compatible with historic garages and new garages that typically found in the district including the proposed exterior finish materials, paneled garage (vehicle) door, flush wood (pedestrian) door, and light fixture;
2. That the proposed driveway will use an existing curb cut;
3. That the existing concrete pad/driveway establishes the appropriateness for the new driveway location;
4. That this action is consistent with the provisions of 4250.4 C and D of the Historic Preservation Ordinance contained in the *Zoning and Planning Code*;
5. That this action is consistent with the provisions of Subchapters 1.3 and 3.3 of the *Preservation Guidelines and Standards*; and
6. That based upon the evidence presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds the action requested is in compliance, and the proposed material change in appearance would not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historic or architectural significance and value of the historic district or historic property according to the *Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City*, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Ayes: Collier, Brown, Galbraith, Holcombe, Jones, Nelson, Taylor, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Absent: Tague, Daniel, Small.

- 6H. HPCA-09-029** at 708 NW 42nd St. (Crown Heights), Ward 2. Consideration and possible action on application of Paul Sechrist for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1) replace roof.

Approved on Consent Docket.

- 6I. HPCA-09-033** at 913 NW 37th St. (Crown Heights), Ward 2. Consideration and possible action on application of James E. & Teri L. Hunter for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1) install brick on front walk; and 2) balcony repair.

James E. & Teri L. Hunter were not present for comment.

Crown Heights Preservation Review Committee did not submit comments prior to

the meeting.

DENIED. Motion: Holcombe / Galbraith to move deny without prejudice of item 1) install brick on front walk, that, based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-09-033, Staff Report, and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds:

Standard Findings of Fact:

1. That the brick finish is inconsistent with the guidelines and should be brushed-finished concrete in a color matching the older, existing concrete sidewalks in the vicinity;
2. That this action is consistent with the provisions of 4250.4 C and D of the Historic Preservation Ordinance contained in the *Zoning and Planning Code*;
3. That this action is consistent with the provisions of Subchapter 1.3 of the *Preservation Guidelines and Standards*; and
4. That based upon the evidence presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds the action requested is not in compliance, and the proposed material change in appearance would have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical or architectural significance and value of the historic property and district according to the *Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City*, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

APPROVE. Motion: Holcombe / Galbraith to move approval of item 2) balcony repair, that, based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-09-033, Staff Report, and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds:

Standard Findings of Fact:

1. That the proposed repair project will retain all historic materials that are not deteriorated beyond repair and that those that are an advanced state of deterioration will be replace in kind;
2. That this action is consistent with the provisions of 4250.4 C and D of the Historic Preservation Ordinance contained in the *Zoning and Planning Code*;
3. That this action is consistent with the provisions of Subchapters 2.1 and 2.2 of the *Preservation Guidelines and Standards*; and
4. That based upon the evidence presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds the action requested is in compliance, and the proposed material change in appearance would not

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 15 of 21

have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical or architectural significance and value of the historic property and district according to the *Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City*, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Ayes: Collier, Brown, Galbraith, Holcombe, Jones, Nelson, Taylor, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Absent: Tague, Daniel, Small.

- 6J. HPCA-09-009** at 100 NW 22nd St. (Heritage Hills East), Ward 7. Consideration and possible action on application of Christopher Salyer for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1) demolish structure.

Christopher Salyer and Sam Gresham were present for comment.

Randy Ice, Heritage Hills East Neighborhood Association, was present for comment.

Sherry Pemberton, neighbor, was present for comment.

DENIED. Motion: Brown / Galbraith to move **deny without prejudice**, that, based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-09-009, Staff Report, and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds:

MOTION WITHDRAWN. Motion: Brown / Galbraith to move withdrawal of motion to **deny without prejudice**.

At the Applicant's request, this item is being referred to the Economic Review Board per 4250.4.L (3).

- 6K. HPCA-09-018** at 200 NW 19th St. (Heritage Hills), Ward 6. Consideration and possible action on application of Tassels Etc, LLC by Dorene Shadid for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1) put back as steps; 2) reconstruct front porch including stuccoed railing and pedestals flanking front entry steps; and 3) install exterior doors at rear of house.

Dorene Shadid was not present for comment.

APPROVE with Modification. Motion: Brown / Zimmer to move **approval with modification(s)** that, based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-09-018, Staff Report, and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds:

Modifications are:

- That the front pedestals are symmetrical around the front entrance;

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 16 of 21

- That the pedestals and the low wall have a cap as was recommended by staff;
- That a moulding that aligns with the moulding along the east side of the house continue around the porch;
- That the top of the lower pedestal by the front entry align with the aforesaid moulding;
- That a single pedestal to be included at the northeast corner to match the upper pedestal at the porch as it appears to have been original to the house in the historic photograph; and
- That the doors must be painted solid wood.

Standard Findings of Fact:

1. That the proposed installation of the front sidewalk, steps, and handrail is consistent with similar sidewalk, stair and rail features present in the district and is therefore appropriate;
2. That the construction of the back porch deck, steps, and handrail are modest in design, will be minimally visible from the public right-of-way, and is therefore appropriate;
3. That the proposed removal of the existing concrete parking slab will not irreversibly compromise any historic fabric and is therefore appropriate;
4. That the proposed new parking slab is basically consistent with the existing condition, affords an off street parking opportunity for this corner residence in lieu of an actual garage, and is therefore appropriate;
5. That this action is consistent with the provisions of 4250.4 C and D of the Historic Preservation Ordinance contained in the *Zoning and Planning Code*;
6. That this action is consistent with the provisions of Subchapter(s) 1.3 and 2.2 of the *Preservation Guidelines and Standards*; and
7. That based upon the evidence presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds the action requested is in compliance, that the proposed material change in appearance would not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historic or architectural significance and value of the historic district or historic property according to the *Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City*, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Ayes: Collier, Brown, Galbraith, Holcombe, Jones, Nelson, Taylor, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Absent: Tague, Daniel, Small.

6L. HPCA-09-024 at 310 NW 19th St. (Heritage Hills), Ward 6. Consideration and

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 17 of 21

possible action on application of John Kevin Mirjanich by Eric J. Stiner for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1) replace garage roof; and 2) replace veranda roof.

Approved on Consent Docket.

- 6M. HPCA-09-027** at 319 NW 18th St. (Heritage Hills), Ward 6. Consideration and possible action on application of Neta and Ronald Wright by Stephanie Pettenger for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1) replace chain link fence with 8' tall wooden fence.

Neta and Ronald Wright were not present for comment.

CONTINUE. Motion: Galbraith / Taylor to move **continuance for 30-days** that, based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-09-027, Staff Report, and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds additional information is required.

Standard Finding of Fact:

- That additional information is required from the applicant in order to determine whether the action requested is in compliance with Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Ayes: Collier, Brown, Galbraith, Holcombe, Jones, Nelson, Taylor, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Absent: Tague, Daniel, Small.

- 6N. HPCA-09-028** at 200 NW 18th St.. (Heritage Hills), Ward 6. Consideration and possible action on application of Gary Driskill by Jerry Dickson for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1) install 6-foot tall fence and gate forward of the 50% mark of the house; 2) reconstruct concrete block retaining wall; and 3) construct a continuation of the concrete block retaining wall.

Jerry Dickson was present for comment.

APPROVE. Motion: Holcombe / Nelson to move **approval** that, based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-09-028, Staff Report, and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds:

Standard Findings of Fact:

1. That the proposed fence will be forward of the 50% mark and constitutes a

unique circumstance in that the architecture has been taken into consideration over the 50% rule. The fence will remain behind the front porch and any other significant side elevation architectural features;

2. That the reconstruction of the existing concrete block retaining wall will be reconstructed with the existing blocks and constitutes a unique circumstance because the existing aged concrete block wall is likely a historic condition for this property;
3. That the construction of the new portion of concrete wall constitutes a unique circumstance in that the new wall will be constructed to match the existing aged concrete block retaining wall in order to provide a visual continuity of materials;
4. Although this application does not strictly comply with the standards set forth in the Preservation Guidelines and Standards or makes a request for approval of work which is not addressed by the Guidelines and Standards, the work proposed is nevertheless historically appropriate and in compliance with the intent of the Guidelines and Secretary of the Interior's Standards, and will not adversely affect the historic character of the property or the integrity of the historic district.
5. That this action is consistent with the provisions of 4250.4 C, D, I and J of the Historic Preservation Ordinance contained in the *Zoning and Planning Code*;
6. That this action is consistent with the intent of Subchapter 1.9 of the *Preservation Guidelines and Standards*; and
7. That based upon the evidence presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds the action requested is in compliance, that the proposed material change in appearance would not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historic or architectural significance and value of the historic district or historic property according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Ayes: Collier, Brown, Galbraith, Holcombe, Jones, Nelson, Taylor, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Absent: Tague, Daniel, Small.

7. OTHER BUSINESS

- A. Resolution approving the submittal of the grant application to the Oklahoma Historical Society, State Historic Preservation Office, and authorizing the Mayor to execute any necessary documents. **Consider and discuss resolution.**

APPROVE. Motion: Galbraith / Brown to move **approval of the 2009-2010 Certified Local Governments Application.**

Ayes: Collier, Brown, Galbraith, Holcombe, Jones, Nelson, Small, Taylor, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Absent: Tague, Daniel, None.

8. CITIZENS TO BE HEARD

9. COMMUNICATIONS AND REPORTS

A. Commission Members

B. Municipal Counselor

C. Administrative Approvals

9C1. HPCA-09-012 at 2507 N Hudson Ave. (Jefferson Park), Ward 2. Staff is announcing the Administrative Approval of the item(s) on the application of Loren Capron for Certificate of Appropriateness to: 1) new storm windows; and 2) install air conditioning unit in back yard.

9C2. HPCA-09-030 at 432 NW 26th St. (Jefferson Park), Ward 2. Staff is announcing the Administrative Approval of the item(s) on the application of Parrott Family Limited Partnership by Bill Elliott for Certificate of Appropriateness to: 1) replace fence at rear property line.

9C3. HPCA-09-026 at 620 NW 41st St. (Crown Heights), Ward 2. Staff is announcing the Administrative Approval of the item(s) on the application of Leland & Deborah Dennis for Certificate of Appropriateness to: 1) install fence (previously approved but expired) 3) replace walkway/sidewalk in rear to match front.

9C4. HPCA-09-018 at 200 NW 19th St. (Heritage Hills), Ward 6. Staff is announcing the Administrative Approval of the item(s) on the application of Tassels Etc, LLC by Dorene Shadid for Certificate of Appropriateness to: 5) replace front sidewalk in kind; 9) replace east gutters in kind; 11) replace driveway in kind; 13) install new lamp at front yard lamp post; 14) remove chain-link fence and install new side yard and back yard 6-foot tall wood fence; 15) install new air conditioning condenser units inside of newly fenced area; and 16) install twelve recessed soffit lights.

9C5. HPCA-09-023 at 624 NW 15th St. (Heritage Hills), Ward 6. Staff is announcing the Administrative Approval of the item(s) on the application

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 20 of 21

of Patrick Gaines for Certificate of Appropriateness to: 2) replace chain link fencing with dog-eared stockade fence.

- 9C6. HPCA-09-031** at 224 NW 21st St.. (Heritage Hills), Ward 6. Staff is announcing the Administrative Approval of the item(s) on the application of John and Arlene Leonard for Certificate of Appropriateness to: 1) replace existing fence with new six-foot tall wood fence with cap and trim. The fence will move back slightly from the existing location so that the fence does not move forward of the 50% mark on the house. The balls located on the existing fence will not be placed on the new fence.

D. Withdrawals

None.

E. Board of Adjustment

None.

F. Planning Commission

None.

G. City Council

- 9G1. Zoning Change SPUD-497** (Heritage Hills East), Ward 7. (SPUD-497) Application by Neighbors Holdings, LLC, to rezone 124 NW 15th Street from the R-4 General Residential/HL Historical Landmark/Heritage Hills East "UCD" Urban Conservation Overlay District to the SPUD-497 Simplified Planned Unit Development District. **On April 21, 2009 the City Council deferred this item until May 5, 2009.**

- H.** The next regularly scheduled meeting for the Historic Preservation Commission is Wednesday, June 3, 2009 at 2:00 p.m. at the Municipal Building, City Council Chamber. New applications and information on continued projects are to be submitted to staff by 4:00 p.m., Tuesday, May 12, 2009.

- I.** The next regularly scheduled workshop for the Historic Preservation Commission is Monday, May 11, 2009 at 4:00 p.m. at 420 W. Main Street, Suite 900.

10. ADJOURNMENT (5:10 p.m.)

Motion: Galbraith / Holcombe to adjourn the 5/6/2009, meeting of the Historic Preservation Commission.

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 21 of 21

Ayes: Collier, Brown, Galbraith, Holcombe, Jones, Nelson, Taylor, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Absent: Tague, Daniel, Small.

ph/al