

MINUTES
Regular Meeting
HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION
April 01, 2009 - 2:00 p.m.
Municipal Building, City Council Chamber

The meeting of the Oklahoma City Historic Preservation Commission was called to order in the City Council Chamber, 3rd Floor of the Municipal Building, 200 N. Walker Avenue, Oklahoma City, Oklahoma. The meeting convened at 2:02 p.m. Notice of the meeting and agenda were filed with the City Clerk's office and posted on the Council bulletin board 24 hours prior to the meeting.

1. CALL TO ORDER AND ROLL CALL

Members Present: Roland Tague, Chairman
Karen Collier, Vice-Chair
Allen Brown, AIA
Thomas J. Daniel IV (arrived at Item 2)
Carolee Galbraith
Jane Holcombe
Nedra Jones
Karen Nelson
Thomas Small, AIA
Marnie Taylor
Karen Zimmer

Members Absent: None.

Staff Present: Susan Miller, Planner IV, Planning Department
Catherine Montgomery, AIA, Planner III, Planning Department
Paula Hurst, Planning Department
Rita Douglas-Talley, Assistant Municipal Counselor

Welcome Thomas Small, AIA

- A. Meeting Process
- B. Standard Findings of Facts

APPROVED. Motion: Collier / Nelson to **approve** waiving of the reading of the Standard Findings of Fact and incorporating them into the minutes.

Ayes: Tague, Collier, Brown, Daniel, Galbraith, Holcombe, Jones, Nelson, Small, Taylor, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Absent: Daniel.

2. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

APPROVED with Modification. Motion: Holcombe / Zimmer to **approve with modification** the minutes of the March 4, 2009, Historic Preservation Commission meeting with the following modifications and noting a recommendation to revisit the numbering of the standard findings when translated to the minutes.

Modifications include:

1. Agenda Item 6C, HPCA-09-012, to change the specific finding of fact from “the applicant will install a metal garage door and a wood pedestrian door” to “the applicant amended the application at the meeting to install a metal garage door and a wood pedestrian door”.
2. Agenda Item 6D, HPCA-09-013, to change the specific finding of fact from “the applicant will install a metal garage door and a wood pedestrian door” to “the applicant amended the application at the meeting to install a metal garage door and a wood pedestrian door”.

Ayes: Tague, Brown, Holcombe, Jones, Nelson, Taylor, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Absent: None.

Abstain: Collier, Daniel, Galbraith, Small.

3. CITATION REPORT

Mr. Woods, Compliance Officer, was present for comment.

4. CONTINUANCE REQUESTS

A. Staff request continuance of the following cases:

None.

B. Other continuance requests:

6C. HPCA-09-024 at 310 NW 19th St. (Heritage Hills), Ward 6. The applicant has requested a **30-day continuance** on the application of John Kevin Mirjanich by Eric J. Stiner for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1) replace garage roof; and 2) replace veranda roof.

CONTINUED. Motion: Holcombe / Taylor to move **approval of continuance requests as stated** based upon the evidence that has been presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, that the Commission find that additional information is required from the applicant in order to determine whether the action requested is in compliance with Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Ayes: Tague, Collier, Brown, Daniel, Galbraith, Holcombe, Jones, Nelson, Small, Taylor, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Absent: None.

5. CONSENT DOCKET CASES

- 6B. HPCA-09-023** at 624 NW 15th St. (Heritage Hills), Ward 6. Consideration and possible action on application of Patrick Gaines for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1) remove existing temporary wood back porch and steps; and 2) install new back deck and steps.

Patrick Gaines was present for comment.

- 6G. HPCA-09-012** at 2507 N Hudson Ave. (Jefferson Park), Ward 2. Consideration and possible action on application of Loren Capron for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1) renovate duplex into a 2-story house: 1a) replace front door; 1b) install new front storm door; 1c) replace back door; and 1d) install new back storm door.

Loren Capron was present for comment.

- 6H. HPCA-09-019** at 125 & 127 NW 28th St. (Jefferson Park), Ward 7. Consideration and possible action on application of Ski Ltd. Co. by Rita Goode for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1) construct deck at back of building; and 2) construct partition (separation wall) on deck to divide deck in half between the two duplex units.

Rita Goode was present for comment.

APPROVED. Motion: Collier / Brown to move **approval of the consent docket items** that, based upon the evidence presented in the applications, Staff Reports and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds:

HPCA-09-023 Standard Findings:

1. the proposed deck is not visible from the public right of way;
2. although possibly visible from the adjacent properties, the proposed construction does not impede any viewscales;
3. some manner of improvement is needed in order for egress from the back door of the building and would require the same height of structure including hand rails and guardrails;
4. the proposed construction does not alter the residential character of the district or significantly reduce the proportion of built area to open space on

the site;

5. that this action is consistent with the provisions of 4250.4 D of the Historic Preservation Ordinance contained in the Zoning and Planning Code;
6. that this action is consistent with the provisions of Subchapters 1.5 and 1.6 of the Preservation Guidelines and Standards; and
7. that based upon the evidence presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, the action requested is in compliance, and the proposed material change in appearance would not have an adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical or architectural significance and value of the historic property and district according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

HPCA-09-012 Standard Findings:

1. that the proposed replacement for the front door is warranted due to the condition of the door and the proposed replacement door is compatible with the original door being replaced;
2. that the proposed replacement door for the back door is acceptable being that the existing door is not original or historic and the selected door is consistent with and appropriate for the historic district;
3. that the historic screen door (if any) is no longer extant and the proposed storm door for the front entry is full lite glass in a factory painted aluminum frame;
4. that the historic screen door (if any) is no longer extant and the proposed storm door for the back entry is full lite glass in a factory painted aluminum frame;
5. that this action is consistent with the provisions of 4250.4 D of the Historic Preservation Ordinance contained in the Zoning and Planning Code;
6. that this action is consistent with the provisions of Subchapter(s) 2.4 of the Preservation Guidelines and Standards; and
7. that based upon the evidence presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, the action requested is in compliance, and the proposed change in appearance would not have an adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical or architectural significance of the historic property and district according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

HPCA-09-019 Standard Findings:

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 5 of 17

1. that the proposed deck, visible from the alley, is not visible from the street public right of way;
2. that although visible from the adjacent properties, the proposed construction does not impede any viewscapes;
3. that some provision is needed in order for rear egress from the building;
4. the proposed construction does not alter the residential character of the district or significantly reduce the proportion of built area to open space on the site especially in consideration that the original garage is no longer extant;
5. that this action is consistent with the provisions of 4250.4 D (1)-(7) and 4250.4 H of the Historic Preservation Ordinance contained in the *Zoning and Planning Code*;
6. that this action is consistent with the provisions of Subchapter 1.5 of the *Preservation Guidelines and Standards*; and
7. that based upon the evidence presented in the application, Staff Report, and during the public hearing, the action requested is in compliance, and the proposed material change in appearance would not have an adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical or architectural significance and value of the historic property and district according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Ayes: Tague, Collier, Brown, Daniel, Galbraith, Holcombe, Jones, Nelson, Small, Taylor, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Absent: None.

6. CASES FOR INDIVIDUAL CONSIDERATION

- 6A. HPCA-09-018** at 200 NW 19th St. (Heritage Hills), Ward 6. Consideration and possible action on application of Tassels Etc, LLC - Dorene Shadid for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1) remove front door cove; 2) remove front ramp and put back to steps; 3) reconstruct front porch including stuccoed railing and pedestals flanking front entry steps; 4) install three (3) new pedestrian doors at garage; and 5) install 2 exterior doors at rear of house.

Dorene Shadid was present for comment.

CONTINUED. Motion: Small / Collier to move continuance for 30-days item(s) 2nd half of item 2) put back to steps; and 3) reconstruct front porch including stuccoed railing and pedestals flanking front entry steps that based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-09-018, Staff Report and during the public

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 6 of 17

hearing, that the Commission finds that additional information is required from the applicant in order to determine whether the action requested is in compliance with Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Ayes: Tague, Collier, Brown, Daniel, Galbraith, Holcombe, Jones, Nelson, Small, Taylor, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Absent: None.

APPROVED. Motion: Collier / Nelson to move **approval** of items 1) remove front door cove; first half of item 2) remove front ramp.....; and 4) install three (3) new pedestrian doors at garage that, based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-09-018, Staff Report and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds:

1. that the removal of the existing front door cove (entry) is appropriate in that it is not an original feature or one that has gained historic significance and the subsequent restoration of the front entry door, sidelites, and metal canopy with brackets and chains is an appropriate preservation action;
2. that the removal of the front ramp and reconstruction of the concrete stairs in place of the ramp is appropriate in that the ramp is not an original feature or one that has gained historic significance and that the reconstruction of the original and full width of the concrete steps is consistent with the historic appearance of the property;
3. that the replacement of the three pedestrian garage doors with wood doors: on the east with a full height wood panel door and on the north with two half solid panel and half glazed door is appropriate;
4. that this action is consistent with the provisions of 4250.4 D and 4250.4 L (2) of the Historic Preservation Ordinance contained in the *Zoning and Planning Code*;
5. that this action is consistent with the provisions of Subchapter(s) 2.2 of the *Preservation Guidelines and Standards*; and
6. that based upon the evidence presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds the action requested is in compliance, and the proposed material change in appearance would not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical or architectural significance and value of the historic property and district according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 7 of 17

Ayes: Tague, Collier, Brown, Daniel, Galbraith, Holcombe, Jones, Nelson, Small, Taylor, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Absent: None.

CONTINUED. Motion: Small / Holcombe to move continuance for 30-days item 5) install 2 exterior doors at rear of house that based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-09-018, Staff Report and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds:

1. that the action requested cannot be approved at this time;
2. that additional information is required from the applicant in order to determine whether the action requested is in compliance, specifically further information is required to evaluate the appropriateness of the proposed exterior doors leading from the building to the screened porch on the southeast corner of the building; and
3. that based upon the evidence that has been presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, additional information is required from the applicant in order to determine whether the action requested is in compliance with the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Ayes: Tague, Collier, Brown, Daniel, Galbraith, Holcombe, Jones, Nelson, Small, Taylor, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Absent: None.

- 6B. HPCA-09-023** at 624 NW 15th St. (Heritage Hills), Ward 6. Consideration and possible action on application of Patrick Gaines for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1) remove existing temporary wood back porch and steps; and 2) install new back deck and steps.

Approved on Consent Docket.

- 6C. HPCA-09-024** at 310 NW 19th St. (Heritage Hills), Ward 6. Consideration and possible action on application of John Kevin Mirjanich by Eric J. Stiner for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1) replace garage roof; and 2) replace veranda roof.

Continued on Continuance Docket.

Staff received comments prior to the meeting.

- 6D. HPCA-09-010** at 601 NW 17th St. (Mesta Park), Ward 6. Consideration and possible action on application of Jonathan Stormont for Certificate of

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 8 of 17

Appropriateness to 1) remove existing front porch; 2) construct new front porch; 3) install new front entry door with sidelites; 4) replace existing entry door lighting; and 5) install new guttering.

Jonathan Storment was present for comment.

The Mesta Park Preservation Review Committee submitted written comments to staff prior to the meeting.

APPROVED with Modification. Motion: Collier / Small to move **approval with modification** that, based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-09-010, Staff Report and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds:

Specific Findings:

1. that the approximate dimensions of the top and bottom exposed fascia boards will be 6" for the top and 6" for the bottom;
2. that vertical alignment will align the top fascia board with the belt board;
3. that the glass will be clear;
4. that the soffit is actually bead board;
5. that the guttering will be painted to match the existing trim; and

Standard Findings:

1. that the existing porch is not compatible with the neighborhood or the specific structure;
2. that the proposed porch is appropriately reminiscent of the historic porch, compatible in design with the existing primary building façade and the neighborhood, and appropriately differentiated from the original since the exact appearance of the original is not completely known;
3. that the installed entrance door and sidelights are consistent in configuration with the neighborhood, the historic appearance being not exactly known because the original opening had been previously modified;
4. that the ~~stained~~ beveled glass used for the entry components glass, while not normally encouraged or appropriate, in this case is minimally considered compatible since the new entrance will be shaded by the new porch construction and will not be misrepresented as historic; [inaccurate information]
5. that the entry door lighting is compatible with the historic resource and the overall work proposed;
6. that the guttering is an integral component of the porch reconstruction project and will blend with the new roofline of the new porch construction;

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 9 of 17

7. that this action is consistent with the provisions of 4250.4 D of the Historic Preservation Ordinance contained in the Zoning and Planning Code;
8. that this action is consistent with the provisions of Subchapter(s) 2.4 of the Preservation Guidelines and Standards; and
9. that based upon the evidence presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, the action requested is in compliance, and the proposed change in appearance would not have an adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical or architectural significance of the historic property and district according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Ayes: Tague, Collier, Brown, Daniel, Galbraith, Holcombe, Jones, Nelson, Small, Taylor, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Absent: None.

- 6E. HPCA-09-022** at 914 NW 20th St. (Mesta Park), Ward 6. Consideration and possible action on application of Ruth Demand by Paul Wellman of Mr. Fix It for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1) repair front porch bricks and concrete; 2) construct brick railing at front porch; 3) remove dark blue modern siding; 4) restore newly exposed original wood siding; 5) repair east porch concrete and foundation; and 6) construct porch wood railing.

Ruth Demand was present for comment.

The Mesta Park Preservation Review Committee submitted written comments to staff prior to the meeting.

CONTINUED. Motion: Taylor / Collier to move continuance for 60-days on item(s) 1) repair front porch bricks and concrete; 2) construct brick railing at front porch; and 6) construct porch wood railing that, based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-09-022, Staff Report and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds:

1. that the action requested cannot be approved at this time;
2. that additional information is required from the applicant in order to determine whether the action requested is in compliance, specifically more detail for the construction of the columns and railings proposed for the existing concrete porch; and
3. that based upon the evidence that has been presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, additional information is required from the applicant in order to determine whether the action

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 10 of 17

requested is in compliance with the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

APPROVED Motion: Taylor / Collier to move ~~approval of items 3) remove dark blue modern siding; 4) restore newly exposed original wood siding; and 5) repair east porch concrete and foundation;~~ that, based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-09-022 and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds:

1. That the removal of the non-original, arguably inappropriate, siding is consistent with the recommendations of the *Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts*;
2. That the restoration of the original wood siding is consistent with the recommendations of the *Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts*;
3. That the repair of the east porch concrete and foundation is appropriate;
4. that this action is consistent with the provisions of 4250.4 C (4)(a), 4250.4 D, and 4250.4 L of the Historic Preservation Ordinance contained in the *Zoning and Planning Code*;
5. that this action is consistent with the provisions of Subchapter(s) 2.2 of the *Preservation Guidelines and Standards*; and
6. that based upon the evidence presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, the action requested is in compliance, and the proposed material change in appearance would not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical or architectural significance and value of the historic property and district according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Ayes: Tague, Collier, Brown, Daniel, Galbraith, Holcombe, Jones, Nelson, Small, Taylor, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Absent: None.

- 6F. HPCA-09-025** at 507 NW 19th St. (Mesta Park), Ward 6. Consideration and possible action on application of J&B Properties, LLC by Jackie Morris for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1) remove existing original and historic front door and install new; 2) remove existing non-original back door and install a new one; 3) remove existing screens at screened in porches at first and second floor levels on

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 11 of 17

front (south) façade; 4) install new steps/porch on back; 5) install new windows; 6) install new awning; and 7) install tile for front entrance.

Jackie Morris was present for comment.

The Mesta Park Preservation Review Committee submitted written comments to staff prior to the meeting.

CONTINUED. Motion: Small / Galbraith to move continuance for 30-days items 2) remove existing non-original back door and install a new one; and 4) install new steps/porch on back that, based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-09-025, Staff Report and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds:

12. that the action requested cannot be approved at this time, and
13. that additional information is required from the applicant in order to determine whether the action requested is in compliance, and
14. that based upon the evidence that has been presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, additional information is required from the applicant in order to determine whether the action requested is in compliance with the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Ayes: Tague, Collier, Brown, Daniel, Galbraith, Holcombe, Jones, Nelson, Small, Taylor, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Absent: None.

Applicant **withdrew** item 1) remove existing original and historic front door and install new.

CONTINUED. Motion: Collier / Zimmer to move continuance for 30-days item 3) remove existing screens at screened in porches at first and second floor levels on front (south) façade that, based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-09-025 and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds:

1. that based upon the evidence that has been presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, additional information is required from the applicant in order to determine whether the action requested is in compliance with the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

APPROVED. Motion: Small / Galbraith to move approval of item 5) install new windows that, based upon the evidence presented in the application of

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 12 of 17

HPCA-09-022, Staff Report and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds:

1. the proposed windows will match in all aspects the existing original windows in place at the property including but not limited to the size, detail, form, and finish;
2. that this action is consistent with the provisions of 4250.4 D of the Historic Preservation Ordinance contained in the Zoning and Planning Code;
3. that this action is consistent with the provisions of Subchapters 2.5, ~~and 2.6~~ of the Preservation Guidelines and Standards; and [not applicable]
4. that based upon the evidence presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, the action requested is in compliance, and the proposed material change in appearance would not have an adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical or architectural significance and value of the historic property and district according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Ayes: Tague, Collier, Brown, Daniel, Galbraith, Holcombe, Jones, Nelson, Small, Taylor, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Absent: None.

Applicant **withdrew** items 6) install new awning; and 7) install tile for front entrance.

- 6G. HPCA-09-012** at 2507 N Hudson Ave. (Jefferson Park), Ward 2. Consideration and possible action on application of Loren Capron for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1) renovate duplex into a 2-story house: 1a) replace front door; 1b) install new front storm door; 1c) replace back door; and 1d) install new back storm door.

Approved on Consent Docket.

- 6H. HPCA-09-019** at 125 & 127 NW 28th St. (Jefferson Park), Ward 7. Consideration and possible action on application of Ski Ltd. Co. by Rita Goode for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1) construct deck at back of building; and 2) construct partition (separation wall) on deck to divide deck in half between the two duplex units.

Approved on Consent Docket.

- 6I. HPCA-09-021** at 505 NW 42nd St. (Crown Heights), Ward 2. Consideration and possible action on application of Barbara Charlet for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1) construct overhang to east side of rear addition; 2) resurface rear patio deck; and 3) construct trellis on rear patio deck.

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 13 of 17

Barbara Charlet was present for comment.

Staff received comments prior to the meeting.

APPROVED. Motion: Daniel / Zimmer to move **approval** that, based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-09-021, Staff Report and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds:

1. that the construction of the overhang to east side of rear addition is not visible from the public right of way and does not interfere with any viewscales;
2. That the resurfacing of the rear patio deck and new stone steps are not visible from the public right of way, do not permanently alter significant character defining elements of the building, and do not interfere with any viewscales;
3. that the constructed trellis on rear patio deck, while not consistent with the visual architectural vocabulary of the primary structure, it is not visible from the public right of way, does not interfere with any viewscales, does not permanently damage any character defining components associated with the historic resource and is reversible;
4. that this action is consistent with the provisions of 4250.4 D and 4250.4 L (2) of the Historic Preservation Ordinance contained in the *Zoning and Planning Code*;
5. that this action is consistent with the provisions of Subchapter(s) 2.9 of the *Preservation Guidelines and Standards*; and
6. that based upon the evidence presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, the action requested is in compliance, and the proposed material change in appearance would not have an adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical or architectural significance and value of the historic property and district according to the *Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts*, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Ayes: Tague, Brown, Daniel, Small, Taylor, Zimmer.

Nays: Collier, Galbraith, Holcombe, Jones, Nelson.

Absent: None.

- 6J. HPCA-09-026** at 620 NW 41st St. (Crown Heights), Ward 2. Consideration and possible action on application of Leland & Deborah Dennis for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1) replace roof.

Deborah Dennis was present for comment.

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 14 of 17

APPROVED. Motion: Collier / Galbraith to move **approval** with condition that Option A not be chosen and Option B is acceptable in a weathered wood color, that, based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-09-026, Staff Report and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds:

1. that asphaltic shingles have long been an acceptable substitute for wood shingles, even though they are not an ideal visual representation of the same;
2. that creative solutions using new products available on the market are encouraged, there is not enough information available on the OPTION A product to warrant approval at this time;
3. that this action is consistent with the provisions of 4250.4 (C) (4), 4250.4 D and 4250.4 I of the Historic Preservation Ordinance contained in the *Zoning and Planning Code*;
4. that this action is consistent with the provisions of Subchapter(s) 2.7 of the *Preservation Guidelines and Standards*; and
5. that based upon the evidence presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds the action requested cannot be approved as presented, that in recognition of the applicant's willingness to accept the conditions of approval, that the amended action requested is in compliance, and the proposed material change in appearance would not have an adverse effect on the aesthetic, historic or architectural significance and value of the historic property and/or district according to the *Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts*, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Ayes: Tague, Collier, Brown, Galbraith, Holcombe, Jones, Nelson, Small, Taylor, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Absent: Daniel.

RESCIND. Motion. Collier / Galbraith to move **rescind** of motion.

Ayes: Tague, Collier, Brown, Galbraith, Holcombe, Jones, Nelson, Small, Taylor, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Absent: Daniel.

APPROVED and DENIED. Motion: Collier / Galbraith to move **approval** with Option B in a weathered wood color and **denial** with option A that, based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-09-026, Staff Report and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds:

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 15 of 17

6. that asphaltic shingles have long been an acceptable substitute for wood shingles, even though they are not an ideal visual representation of the same;
7. that creative solutions using new products available on the market are encouraged, there is not enough information available on the OPTION A product to warrant approval at this time;
8. that this action is consistent with the provisions of 4250.4 (C) (4), 4250.4 D and 4250.4 I of the Historic Preservation Ordinance contained in the *Zoning and Planning Code*;
9. that this action is consistent with the provisions of Subchapter(s) 2.7 of the *Preservation Guidelines and Standards*; and
10. that based upon the evidence presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds the action requested cannot be approved as presented, that in recognition of the applicant's willingness to accept the conditions of approval, that the amended action requested is in compliance, and the proposed material change in appearance would not have an adverse effect on the aesthetic, historic or architectural significance and value of the historic property and/or district according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Ayes: Tague, Collier, Brown, Galbraith, Holcombe, Jones, Nelson, Small, Taylor, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Absent: Daniel.

7. OTHER BUSINESS

- 7A. Zoning Change SPUD-497** (Heritage Hills East), Ward 7. Requesting recommendation from the Historic Preservation Commission to City Council on an application set for hearing on April 21, 2009 to REZONE from R4/General Residential/Historic Landmark/Urban Conservation District to SPUD-497 at 124 NW 15th Street.

The Preservation Review Committee submitted written comments to staff prior to the meeting.

RECOMMENDATION: Zimmer / Collier move recommendation of denial because the Historic Preservation Commission opposes rezoning of the property at 124 N.W. 14th Street from R-4 / General Residential / Historic Landmark / Urban Conservation District to SPUD-497, which SPUD would allow all of the existing uses and / or any

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 16 of 17

redevelopment within this SPUD to be in accordance with the zoning regulations of the Neighborhood Business District. Specifically, the SPUD would allow mixed residential and commercial use, subject to the design review criteria and procedures applicable to Historic Landmark and Urban Conservation District classifications as applicable. It is the view of the Historic Preservation Commission, however, that current zoning of the Subject Property reflects appropriate boundaries and uses between R-1, R-4 and commercial designations, and recognizes the need to preserve the existing residential character and integrity of this historic neighborhood.

Ayes: Tague, Collier, Brown, Galbraith, Holcombe, Jones, Nelson, Taylor, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Absent: Daniel, Small.

7B. Election of Officers.

APPROVED. Motion: Holcombe / Brown to nominate Roland Tague as Chairman and Karen Collier as Vice-Chairman.

Ayes: Tague, Collier, Brown, Galbraith, Holcombe, Jones, Nelson, Taylor, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Absent: Daniel, Small.

8. CITIZENS TO BE HEARD

9. COMMUNICATIONS AND REPORTS

A. Commission Members

B. Municipal Counselor

C. Administrative Approvals

9C1. HPCA-09-020 at 708 NW 40th St. (Crown Heights), Ward 2. Staff is announcing the Administrative Approval of the items on the application Bill Cowley Jr. and Nicole Cossaart for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1) install decorative iron gate across driveway.

D. Withdrawals

None..

E. Board of Adjustment

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 17 of 17

- 9E1. HPCA-06-098** at 2916 D Paseo Dr. (Paseo), Ward 6. Appeal of the Historic Preservation Commissions denial on the application of Paseo Village by John Belt for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) install mural and fountain. – **This appeal was denied by the Board of Adjustment at the March 5, 2009 meeting. The applicant filed an appeal of this decision in District Court on March 13, 2009.**
- 9E2. HPCA-08-176** at 726 NW 28th St. (Paseo), Ward 2. Request for a variance on application of OKC Housing Services Redevelopment Corp by Ron Walters Construction Services, Inc. for Certificate of Appropriateness. **This variance was approved by the Board of Adjustment at the March 19, 2009 meeting.**

F. Planning Commission

- 9F1. Zoning Change SPUD-497** (Heritage Hills East), Ward 7. (SPUD-497) Application by Neighbors Holdings, LLC, to rezone 124 NW 15th Street from the R-4 General Residential/HL Historical Landmark/Heritage Hills East "UCD" Urban Conservation Overlay District to the SPUD-497 Simplified Planned Unit Development District. **Planning Commission recommended denial at the March 12, 2009 meeting.**

- G.** The next regularly scheduled meeting for the Historic Preservation Commission is Wednesday, May 6, 2009 at 2:00 p.m. at the Municipal Building, City Council Chamber. New applications and information on continued projects are to be submitted to staff by 5:00 p.m., Tuesday, April 7, 2009.
- H.** The next regularly scheduled workshop for the Historic Preservation Commission is Monday, April 6, 2009 at 4:00 p.m. at 420 W. Main Street, Suite 900.

10. ADJOURNMENT (5:04 p.m.)

Motion: Zimmer / Nelson to adjourn the April 1, 2009, meeting of the Historic Preservation Commission.

Ayes: Tague, Collier, Brown, Galbraith, Holcombe, Jones, Nelson, Taylor, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Absent: Daniel, Small.

pjh