

MINUTES
Regular Meeting
HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION
March 04, 2009 - 2:00 p.m.
Municipal Building, City Council Chamber

The meeting of the Oklahoma City Historic Preservation Commission was called to order in the City Council Chamber, 3rd Floor of the Municipal Building, 200 N. Walker Avenue, Oklahoma City, Oklahoma. The meeting convened at 2:03 p.m. Notice of the meeting and agenda were filed with the City Clerk's office and posted on the Council bulletin board 24 hours prior to the meeting.

1. CALL TO ORDER AND ROLL CALL

Members Present: Roland Tague, Chairman
Allen Brown, AIA
Jane Holcombe
Nedra Jones
Karen Nelson
Marnie Taylor
Karen Zimmer

Members Absent: Karen Collier, Vice-Chair
Thomas J. Daniel, IV
Carolee Galbraith

Staff Present: Susan Miller, Planner IV, Planning Department
Catherine Montgomery, AIA, Planner III, Planning Department
Paula Hurst, Planning Department
Rita Douglas-Talley, Assistant Municipal Counselor

- A. Meeting Process
- B. Standard Findings of Facts

APPROVED. Motion: Holcombe / Zimmer to **approve** waiving of the reading of the Standard Findings of Fact and incorporating them into the minutes.

Ayes: Tague, Brown, Holcombe, Jones, Nelson, Taylor, Zimmer.
Nays: None.
Absent: Collier, Daniel, Galbraith.

2. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

APPROVED. Motion: Holcombe / Taylor to **approve** the minutes of the February 4, 2009, Historic Preservation Commission meeting.

Ayes: Tague, Brown, Holcombe, Jones, Nelson, Taylor, Zimmer.
Nays: None.

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 2 of 12

3/4/2009

Absent: Collier, Daniel, Galbraith.

3. CITATION REPORT

Mr. Woods, Compliance Officer, was present for comment.

4. CONTINUANCE REQUESTS

A. Staff request continuance of the following cases:

None.

B. Other continuance requests:

6A. HPCA-09-009 at 100 NW 22nd St. (Heritage Hills East), Ward 7. The applicant is requesting a 60-day continuance on the application of Christopher Salyer for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1) demolish primary structure.

Christopher Salyer was not present for comment.

The Heritage Hills East Preservation Review Committee submitted written comments to staff prior to the meeting.

CONTINUED. Motion: Holcombe / Nelson to move **continuance for 60-days** based upon the evidence that has been presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds that additional information is required from the applicant in order to determine whether the action requested is in compliance with Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Ayes: Tague, Brown, Holcombe, Jones, Nelson, Taylor, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Absent: Collier, Daniel, Galbraith.

5. CONSENT DOCKET CASES

6B. HPCA-09-017 at 435 NW 21st St. (Heritage Hills), Ward 6. Consideration and possible action on application of Lisa Holliday by Brett Johnson for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1) replace existing rotting doors at non-historic rear addition, and 2) replace rotting walls at non-historic rear addition.

Lisa Holliday was present for comment.

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 3 of 12

3/4/2009

APPROVED. Motion: Zimmer / Holcombe to move **approval** based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-09-017, Staff Report and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds:

Specific finding:

1. that the applicant will use the drawings noted as “alternate option” for the windows and the glass will not be LowE; and

Standard findings:

1. that the proposed project affects only the existing and non-historic rear addition thereby causing no physical harm to existing historic fabric;
2. that the proposed new doors are compatible with the visual character of the addition and the original and historic portions of the building;
3. that the new components will not affect the visual character of the property in that the pre-existing addition with the proposed new components are compatible and differentiated from the original historic components;
4. that this action is consistent with the provisions of 4250.4 D (3), (5) and (6) and 4250.4 L (2)of the Historic Preservation Ordinance contained in the *Zoning and Planning Code*;
5. that this action is consistent with the provisions of Subchapters “Introduction” Fourth Paragraph; 2.4; 2.9; and 3.2 of the *Preservation Guidelines and Standards*; and
6. that based upon the evidence presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds the action requested is in compliance, that the proposed material change in appearance would not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historic or architectural significance and value of the historic district according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Ayes: Tague, Brown, Holcombe, Jones, Nelson, Taylor, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Absent: Collier, Daniel, Galbraith.

6. CASES FOR INDIVIDUAL CONSIDERATION

- 6A. **HPCA-09-009** at 100 NW 22nd St. (Heritage Hills East), Ward 7. Consideration and possible action on application of Christopher Salyer for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1) demolish primary structure.

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 4 of 12

3/4/2009

Continued on Continuance Docket.

- 6B. HPCA-09-017** at 435 NW 21st St. (Heritage Hills), Ward 6. Consideration and possible action on application of Lisa Holliday by Brett Johnson for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1) replace existing rotting doors at non-historic rear addition, and 2) replace rotting walls at non-historic rear addition.

Approved on Consent Docket.

- 6C. HPCA-09-012** at 2507 N Hudson Ave. (Jefferson Park), Ward 2. Consideration and possible action on application of Loren Capron for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1) renovate duplex into a 2-story house; 2) build a new wood patio; 3) build a new driveway; 4) build a new garage; 5) replace an existing 8' tall fence on the south property line extending from a point parallel with the front of the existing building west to a point on the rear property line; and 6) install a new 6' tall fence on the south property line extending from a point parallel with the front of the existing building east to a point on the front property line.

Loren Capron was present for comment.

CONTINUED. Motion: Holcombe / Zimmer to move **continuance for 30-days on items 1) renovate duplex into a 2-story house** that, based upon the evidence that has been presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds that additional information is required from the applicant in order to determine whether the action requested is in compliance with Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Ayes: Tague, Brown, Holcombe, Jones, Nelson, Taylor, Zimmer.
Nays: None.
Absent: Collier, Daniel, Galbraith.

APPROVED. Motion: Holcombe / Nelson to move **approval of item 2) build a new wood patio** that based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-09-012, Staff Report and during the public hearing that the Commission finds:

4. that the proposed rear patio is modest in size, unobtrusive in location, low-profile, reversible and generally consistent with the intent of the Preservation Guidelines and Standards;
7. that this action is consistent with the provisions of 4250.4 D (3), (4), and (5) of the Historic Preservation Ordinance contained in the Zoning and Planning Code;
8. that this action is consistent with the provisions of Subchapter(s) 2.9 of the Preservation Guidelines and Standards; and

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 5 of 12

3/4/2009

9. that based upon the evidence presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds the action requested is in compliance, that the proposed material change in appearance would not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historic or architectural significance and value of the historic district according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Ayes: Tague, Brown, Holcombe, Jones, Nelson, Taylor, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Absent: Collier, Daniel, Galbraith.

APPROVED. Motion: Holcombe / Nelson to move **approval of item 3) build a new driveway** that based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-09-012, Staff Report and during the public hearing that the Commission finds:

5. that the proposed driveway and sidewalk work will constitute a replacement in kind and is consistent with Subchapter 1.3, "Sidewalks, Driveways, Parking Lot, Curbs, and Vacant Sites." It should further be emphasized that the new concrete shall match the existing adjacent concrete in color, detail, and texture;
7. that this action is consistent with the provisions of 4250.4 D (3), (4), and (5) of the Historic Preservation Ordinance contained in the Zoning and Planning Code;
8. that this action is consistent with the provisions of Subchapter(s) 2.9 of the Preservation Guidelines and Standards; and
9. that based upon the evidence presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds the action requested is in compliance, that the proposed material change in appearance would not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historic or architectural significance and value of the historic district according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Ayes: Tague, Brown, Holcombe, Jones, Nelson, Taylor, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 6 of 12

3/4/2009

Absent: Collier, Daniel, Galbraith.

APPROVED. Motion: Holcombe / Zimmer to move **approval of item 4) build a new garage** that based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-09-012, Staff Report and during the public hearing that the Commission finds:

Specific finding:

1. that the applicant amended the application at the meeting to install a metal garage door and a wood pedestrian door; and

Standard findings:

6. that the proposed garage is consistent in location, size, scale, fenestration, materials, and finishes of the historic district and meets the requirements of Subchapter 3.3, "Garages;"
7. that this action is consistent with the provisions of 4250.4 D (3), (4), and (5) of the Historic Preservation Ordinance contained in the Zoning and Planning Code;
8. that this action is consistent with the provisions of Subchapter(s) 2.9 of the Preservation Guidelines and Standards; and
9. that based upon the evidence presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds the action requested is in compliance, that the proposed material change in appearance would not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historic or architectural significance and value of the historic district according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Ayes: Tague, Brown, Holcombe, Jones, Nelson, Taylor, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Absent: Collier, Daniel, Galbraith.

APPROVED. Motion: Holcombe / Zimmer to move **approval of item 5) replace an existing 8' tall fence on the south property line extending from a point parallel with the front of the existing building west to a point on the rear property line** that based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-09-012, Staff Report and during the public hearing, that the Commission

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 7 of 12

3/4/2009

finds:

10. that the proposed replacement of the 8' tall section of fencing on the south property line extending from a point parallel with the front of the existing building west to a point on the rear property line is appropriate under Subchapter 1.9, "Fences and Walls," in that this is a unique circumstance because 1) the applicant's south side property line is the rear property line of the adjacent development, a multi-family residential building, where an 8' foot tall fence would normally be permitted; 2) the existing fence is 8' tall; 3) the design of the new fence differs from the existing fence; and 4) the design of the new fence is appropriate;
11. that this action is consistent with the provisions of 4250.4 D (3), (4), (5) and (6) and 4250.4 L (2) of the Historic Preservation Ordinance contained in the Zoning and Planning Code;
12. that this action is consistent with the provisions of Subchapter(s) 1.9 of the *Preservation Guidelines and Standards*; and
13. that based upon the evidence presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, the action requested is not in compliance, but because of the unique circumstances the proposed material change in appearance would not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical or architectural significance and value of the historic property and district according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Ayes: Tague, Brown, Holcombe, Jones, Nelson, Taylor, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Absent: Collier, Daniel, Galbraith.

At the meeting, the applicant **withdrew** item 6) install a new 6' tall fence on the south property line extending from a point parallel with the front of the existing building east to a point on the front property line.

- 6D. **HPCA-09-013** at 2812 N Robinson Ave. (Jefferson Park), Ward 2. Consideration and possible action on application of Jefferson Park Neighborhood Association by Loren Capron for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1) construct new house; 2) construct new garage; and 3) construct new fence.

Loren Capron was present for comment.

APPROVED. Motion: Brown / Nelson to move **approval** that, based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-09-013, Staff Report and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds:

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 8 of 12

3/4/2009

Specific finding:

1. that the applicant amended the application at the meeting to install wood pedestrian door; and

Standard findings:

1. that the proposed infill construction consisting of a single-family residence, 2-car garage, and wood fencing as indicated on the site plan is compatible with, yet differentiated from, the historic structures located in the Jefferson Park Neighborhood Historic District and specifically the block of Robinson Avenue in which it will be located;
2. that the proposed infill construction including a residence, a garage, and wood fencing is consistent with the size, scale, materials, and features of the other character-defining structures located in the Jefferson Park Neighborhood Historic District and specifically the block of Robinson Avenue in which it will be located;
3. that the setback for the primary structure, the residence, intends to match other setbacks on the block. As a more precise way of locating the new construction staff recommends that the front of the proposed porch of the new house align with the front building line of 2816-2818 Robinson Avenue;
4. that this action is consistent with the provisions of 4250.4 (C) (4) (a) and 4250.4 D (3), (4), and (5) of the Historic Preservation Ordinance contained in the *Zoning and Planning Code*;
5. that this action is consistent with the provisions of Subchapter(s) 3.1 and 3.3 of the *Preservation Guidelines and Standards*; and
6. that based upon the evidence presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds the action requested is in compliance, that the proposed material change in appearance would not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historic or architectural significance and value of the historic district according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Ayes: Tague, Brown, Holcombe, Jones, Nelson, Taylor, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Absent: Collier, Daniel, Galbraith.

7. OTHER BUSINESS

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 9 of 12

3/4/2009

- 7A. HPCA-09-014** at 705 NW 25th St. (Paseo), Ward 2. To receive comments from the Historic Preservation Commission regarding a structure in preparation for a future action by the City Council. This item will be referred to the Neighborhood Services Department for dilapidated structure processing for the garage.

FORWARD COMMENTS. Motion: Jones / Taylor to **forward the comments** to City Council that the structure is a contributing resource to the Paseo Neighborhood Historic District.

Ayes: Tague, Brown, Holcombe, Jones, Nelson, Taylor, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Absent: Collier, Daniel, Galbraith.

RESCIND. Motion: Jones / Taylor to move to **rescind** the motion to forward the comments to City Council that the structure is a contributing resource to the Paseo Neighborhood Historic District.

Ayes: Tague, Brown, Holcombe, Jones, Nelson, Taylor, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Absent: Collier, Daniel, Galbraith.

FORWARD COMMENTS. Motion: Jones / Taylor to **forward the comments** to City Council that Historic Preservation Commissions finding is that the garage is historic, retains sufficient historic integrity and that the loss of the structure due to demolition would diminish the historic integrity of the Historic District.

Ayes: Tague, Brown, Holcombe, Jones, Nelson, Taylor, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Absent: Collier, Daniel, Galbraith.

- 7B. HPCA-09-011** at 124 NW 29th St. (Jefferson Park), Ward 7. To receive comments from the Historic Preservation Commission regarding a structure in preparation for a future action by the City Council. This item will be referred to the Neighborhood Services Department for dilapidated structure processing for the detached garage/dwelling building.

FORWARD COMMENTS. Motion: Taylor / Holcombe to **forward the comments** to City Council that Historic Preservation Commissions finding is that the garage/dwelling is historic, retains sufficient historic integrity and that the loss of the structure due to demolition would diminish the historic integrity of the Historic District.

Ayes: Brown, Holcombe, Jones, Nelson, Taylor, Zimmer.

Nays: Tague.

Absent: Collier, Daniel, Galbraith.

8. CITIZENS TO BE HEARD

9. COMMUNICATIONS AND REPORTS

A. Commission Members

Commissioner Jones raised concerns of concrete color for Positively Paseo projects that have approval but have not completed the work.

B. Municipal Counselor

C. Administrative Approvals

9C1. HPCA-09-007 at 615 NW 15th St. (Heritage Hills), Ward 6. Staff is announcing the Administrative Approval of the items on the application of George Keeney for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) repair and relocate fence panel and gate. Relocated fencing will not move forward of the 50% mark on the house. Fence and gate are six feet tall with typical four-inch wide dog-ear wood pickets.

9C2. HPCA-09-006 at 217 NW 22nd St. (Mesta Park), Ward 6. Staff is announcing the Administrative Approval of the items on the application of John Bullard for a Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) remove existing chain-link fencing, 2.) install standard 6-foot tall dog-eared wood stockade fence and gate, and 3.) replace driveway from the sidewalk to the garage with brushed concrete in medium grey tones to the same dimensions as existing.

9C3. HPCA-09-016 at 509 NW 15th St. (Heritage Hills), Ward 6. Staff is announcing the Administrative Approval of the items on the application of Michael Mize for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1) replacement of wood fence. Proposal includes the installation of a wood fence with cap and trim and ornamental top rail. No part of the fence will exceed 8-feet tall along the north property line. No part of the fence will exceed 6-feet tall on the west property line.

9C4. HPCA-09-015 at 2215 N Shartel Ave. (Mesta Park), Ward 6. Staff is announcing the Administrative Approval of the items on the application of B&F Realty, LLC for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1) replacement of existing fence with 6-foot tall stockade fence from the back west property line 100 feet to the east. Fence will be constructed in location of existing fence. No portion of the new fencing will move forward of the 50% mark on the house.

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 11 of 12

3/4/2009

D. Withdrawals

9D1. HPCA-09-005 at 609 NW 14th St. (Heritage Hills), Ward 6. Staff is announcing the withdrawal on February 25, 2009, of the items remaining on the application of Kurt & Cristi Reiger by Eva Osborne, AIA for Certificate of Appropriateness to 3) remove vinyl siding at second floor, south (front) façade; and 4) repair/paint original wood siding; or 5) replace vinyl siding in-kind.

E. Board of Adjustment

9E1. HPCA-06-098 at 2916 D Paseo Dr. (Paseo), Ward 6. Staff is announcing the appeal of the Historic Preservation Commissions denial of the application of Paseo Village by John Belt for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) install mural and fountain. – **This appeal was continued to the March 5, 2009 Board of Adjustment meeting.**

9E2. HPCA-08-176 at 726 NW 28th St. (Paseo), Ward 2. Staff is announcing the request for a variance on application of OKC Housing Services Redevelopment Corp by Ron Walters Construction Services, Inc. for Certificate of Appropriateness. **This variance is scheduled to be heard at the March 19, 2009 Board of Adjustment meeting.**

F. Planning Commission

9F1. Zoning Change SPUD-497 (Heritage Hills East), Ward 7. (SPUD-497) Application by Neighbors Holdings, LLC, to rezone 124 NW 15th Street from the R-4 General Residential/HL Historical Landmark/Heritage Hills East "UCD" Urban Conservation Overlay District to the SPUD-497 Simplified Planned Unit Development District. **This item is scheduled to be heard by the Planning Commission on February 26, 2009. This item was continued to the March 12, 2009 Planning Commission meeting.**

G. The next regularly scheduled meeting for the Historic Preservation Commission is Wednesday, April 1, 2009 at 2:00 p.m. at the Municipal Building, City Council Chamber. New applications and information on continued projects are to be submitted to staff by 4:00 p.m., Tuesday, March 10, 2009.

H. The next regularly scheduled workshop for the Historic Preservation Commission is Monday, March 9, 2009 at 4:00 p.m. at 420 W. Main Street, Suite 900.

10. ADJOURNMENT (2:56 p.m.)

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 12 of 12

3/4/2009

AJDOURN. Motion: Holcombe / Nelson to adjourn the 3/4/2009, meeting of the Historic Preservation Commission.

Ayes: Tague, Brown, Holcombe, Jones, Nelson, Taylor, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Absent: Collier, Daniel, Galbraith.

pjh