

MINUTES
Regular Meeting
HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION
February 4, 2009 - 2:00 p.m.
Municipal Building, City Council Chamber

The meeting of the Oklahoma City Historic Preservation Commission was called to order in the City Council Chamber, 3rd Floor of the Municipal Building, 200 N. Walker Avenue, Oklahoma City, Oklahoma. The meeting convened at 2:05 p.m. Notice of the meeting and agenda were filed with the City Clerk's office and posted on the Council bulletin board 24 hours prior to the meeting.

1. CALL TO ORDER AND ROLL CALL

Members Present: Roland Tague, Chairman
Karen Collier, Vice-Chair
Carolee Galbraith
Jane Holcombe
Thomas J. Daniel IV
Marnie Taylor
Nedra Jones
Karen Zimmer

Members Absent: Karen Nelson

Staff Present: Susan Miller, Planner IV, Planning Department
Catherine Montgomery, AIA, Planning Department
Scottye Montgomery, Planner II, Planning Department
Angela Yetter, Planner I, Planning Department
Bob Mier, Planning Department
Paula Hurst, Planning Department
Rita Douglas-Talley, Assistant Municipal Counselor

2. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

APPROVED. Motion: Galbraith/ Holcombe to **approve** the minutes of the January 7, 2009, Historic Preservation Commission meeting.

Ayes: Tague, Collier, Daniel, Holcombe, Galbraith, Taylor, Jones, Zimmer.
Nays: None.
Absent: Nelson.

3. CITATION REPORT

Mr. Woods, Compliance Officer, was present for comment.

4. CONTINUANCE REQUESTS

A. Staff requests continuance of the following cases:

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 2 of 19

February 4, 2009

None.

- B. Other continuance requests:
None.

Contested Continuance requests will be heard in regular Agenda order.

5. CONSENT DOCKET CASES

- 6A.** **HPCA-08-174** at 2808 N Robinson Ave. (Jefferson Park), Ward 7. Consent for approval on application of Carl C. Smith for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) replace balcony railing.

- 6C. (Heard in agenda order) HPCA-08-178** at 233 NW 31st St. (Edgemere Park), Ward 2. Consent for approval on application of Monica Reid by Eric Guyer, Quality Construction for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) replace the front glass door.

Eric Guyer was present for comment.

- 6H.** **HPCA-09-003** at 2215 N Walker Ave. (Mesta Park), Ward 6. Consent for approval on application of Independent School District No. 89 by Kendra Boeckman of Studio Architecture for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) extend HPCA-08-020 for one-year.

Kendra Boeckman was present for comment.

- 6I.** **HPCA-08-157** at 817 NW 19th St.. (Mesta Park), Ward 6. Consent for approval on application of Sammie L. Flippo - Rev. Trust for Certificate of Appropriateness to 2c.) install a solid wood paneled overhead door in recently approved two-car garage, and 3.) install deck, steps, railing, and skirting at rear façade.

APPROVED. Motion: Collier / Zimmer to move **approval of consent docket items 6A, 6H and 6I** based upon the evidence presented in the applications, Staff Reports and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds:

HPCA-08-174

- that the proposed railing and post details appear to match the previously existing design elements of the balcony;
- that the proposed railing height is adequate to meet current code;
- that this action is consistent with the provisions of *4250.4 D (3), (4), (5) and (6), 4250.4 H and 4250.4 L (2) of the Historic Preservation Ordinance*

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 3 of 19

February 4, 2009

and Subchapter(s) 2.2 of the Preservation Guidelines and Standards; and

- that based upon the evidence presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, the action requested is in compliance, and the proposed material change in appearance would not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical or architectural significance and value of the historic property and district according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

HPCA-09-003

- that applicant has demonstrated continuous progress toward completion of the approved work and has not abandoned the work for a period exceeding one-hundred eighty (180) days with consideration of the unique circumstances;
- that this action is consistent with the provisions of 4250.4.G.(3) and 4250.4.I of the Preservation Guidelines and Standards; and
- that based upon the evidence presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, the action requested is in compliance, and the proposed material change in appearance would not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical or architectural significance and value of the historic property and district according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

HPCA-08-157

- that this action would not destroy or alter all, or part, of a resource;
- that the building materials proposed for this project are compatible with the aesthetic and structural appearance of the resource including, but not limited to, the consideration of texture, style, color or the components, and the combination of elements, such as brick, stone, concrete, shingle, wood or stucco;
- that the design of the proposed garage door, and deck is compatible to the significant characteristics of the resource including, but not limited to, a consideration of a harmony of materials, details, height, mass, proportion, rhythm, scale, setback, shape, street accessories and workmanship;
- that the Sanborn Map shows a detached garage of a similar size and that no historic evidence has been presented as to the style or details of the original structure;
- that the spacing and size of the proposed overhead door in the garage are similar to the historic counterparts and to the proportion of window to wall

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 4 of 19

February 4, 2009

space as well as shape, location, pattern, size, materials and details within the district;

- that the design of the proposed overhead garage door will represent the appearance of two hinged garage doors and will be constructed of solid wood panels;
- that the lattice skirting on the rear deck is compatible with the character of the historic residence and district;
- that this action is consistent with the provisions of *4250.4 D (3), (5,) and (6) and the Historic Preservation Ordinance and Subchapter(s) 1.5 and 3.3 of the Preservation Guidelines and Standards*; and
- that based upon the evidence presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, the action requested is in compliance, and the proposed material change in appearance would not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical or architectural significance and value of the historic property and district according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Ayes: Tague, Collier, Daniel, Holcombe, Galbraith, Taylor, Jones, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Absent: Nelson.

6. CASES FOR INDIVIDUAL CONSIDERATION

- 6A. HPCA-08-174** at 2808 N Robinson Ave. (Jefferson Park), Ward 7. Consideration and possible action on application of Carl C. Smith for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) replace balcony railing.

Approved on Consent Docket.

- 6B. HPCA-08-180** at 119 NW 25th St. (Jefferson Park), Ward 7. Consideration and possible action on application of Sheveron Glover for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) demolish garage, 2.) remove and infill two window openings and 3.) install wood siding at infilled window openings.

Applicant was not present.

DENIED. Motion: Collier / Galbraith to move **denial without prejudice on item 1.) demolish garage** that, based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-08-180 and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds:

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 5 of 19

February 4, 2009

- that removal of a historic structure constitutes an irreplaceable loss to historic character of the district;
- that there is no evidence that the structure was non-contributing to the historic integrity of the district;
- that there is no documentation provided that indicates the structure posed an imminent threat to public health or safety prior to demolition;
- that this action is consistent with the provisions of *4250.4 D (3), (4), (5) and (6), 4250.4 H, and 4250.4 L (2) of the Historic Preservation Ordinance and Subchapter(s) 2.9 of the Preservation Guidelines and Standards*; and
- that based upon the evidence presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, the action requested is not in compliance, and the proposed material change in appearance would have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical or architectural significance and value of the historic property and district according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Ayes: Tague, Collier, Daniel, Holcombe, Galbraith, Taylor, Jones, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Absent: Nelson.

APPROVED with Condition. Motion: Holcombe / Galbraith to move **approval with condition on items 2.) remove and infill two window openings and 3.) install wood siding at infilled window openings** that, based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-08-180 and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds:

- that the window locations are not historic nor original to the historic structure, thus do not contribute to the historic integrity of the house;
- that the windows are located in the rear of the non-historic addition, therefore, not visible from the street;
- that removal will not damage the original design of the building, any historic character defining feature, or any historic fabric;
- that the proposed infill will not damage any historic fabric;
- that this action is consistent with the provisions of *4250.4 D (3), (4), (5) and (6), 4250.4 H, and 4250.4 L (2)of the Historic Preservation Ordinance and Subchapter(s) 2.5 of the Preservation Guidelines and Standards*; and
- that based upon the evidence presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, the action requested is in compliance, and the proposed material change in appearance would not have a substantial adverse

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 6 of 19

February 4, 2009

effect on the aesthetic, historical or architectural significance and value of the historic property and district according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Condition of approval is:

- The materials used to infill the window openings will match the existing siding and the infill materials will be blended with the surrounding siding to disguise the infill of the window openings.

Ayes: Tague, Collier, Daniel, Holcombe, Galbraith, Taylor, Jones, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Absent: Nelson.

- 6C. HPCA-08-178** at 233 NW 31st St. (Edgemere Park), Ward 2. Consideration and possible action on application of Monica Reid by Eric Guyer, Quality Construction for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) replace the front glass door.

Eric Guyer was present for comment.

APPROVED with Condition. Motion: Collier / Zimmer to move **approval with condition** that, based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-08-178 and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds:

- that documentation of the historic door cannot be located;
- that the existing door is not historic;
- that the proposed door will not further compromise the historic integrity of the house;
- that this action is consistent with the provisions of *4250.4 D (3), (4), (5) and (6), 4250.4 H and 4250.4 L (2) of the Historic Preservation Ordinance and Subchapter(s) 2.2 of the Preservation Guidelines and Standards*; and
- that based upon the evidence presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, the action requested is in compliance, and the proposed material change in appearance would not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical or architectural significance and value of the historic property and district according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Condition of approval is:

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 7 of 19

February 4, 2009

- The door will be constructed of solid oak.

Ayes: Tague, Collier, Daniel, Holcombe, Galbraith, Taylor, Jones, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Absent: Nelson.

- 6D. HPCA-09-002** at 720 NW 42nd St. (Crown Heights), Ward 2. Consideration and possible action on application of Jill Anne Malone for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) remove chain link fence 2.) install wooden stockade fence and 3.) install section of decorative wrought iron fencing.

Applicant was not present for comment.

The Crown Heights Preservation Review Committee submitted written comments to staff prior to the meeting.

APPROVED with Condition. Motion: Collier / Zimmer to move **approval with condition** that, based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-09-002 and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds:

- that unique circumstances are present in that the proposed fence although forward of the 50% mark, will be transparent and will not block the side of the historic house;
- that unique circumstances are present in that the relocation of the proposed fence to the 50% mark will make the neighboring fence and gate unusable;
- that unique circumstances are present in that the proposal is historically appropriate and consistent with the spirit and intent of the Preservation Guidelines by maintaining the original fence location, the original alignment with neighboring fence and gate, and the original fence transparency;
- that the proposed iron fencing is less disruptive to the rhythm of the neighborhood than a wood fence located five feet further south would be;
- that the proposed fence does not block the view of significant architectural features of the house;
- that this action is consistent with the provisions of *4250.4 D (3), (4), (5) and (6), 4250.4 C, 4250.4 J and 4250.4 I of the Historic Preservation Ordinance and Subchapter(s) 1.9 of the Preservation Guidelines and Standards*; and
- that based upon the evidence presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, the action requested is not in compliance, however the proposed material change in appearance would not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical or architectural significance and value of the historic property and district according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 8 of 19

February 4, 2009

City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

- that this action is historically appropriate and in compliance with the intent of the Guidelines and the Secretary of the Interior's Standards, and will not adversely affect the historic character of the property or the integrity of the historic district; and

Condition of Approval:

- The design of the wrought iron fence design will be submitted to staff for administrative approval.

Ayes: Tague, Collier, Daniel, Holcombe, Galbraith, Taylor, Jones, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Absent: Nelson.

- 6E.** **HPCA-09-004** at 532 NW 40th St. (Crown Heights), Ward 2. Consideration and possible action on application of Mark & Denise Hole for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) amend the previously approved application HPCA-08-080 by changing from two garage doors to one double garage door.

Mark Hole was present for comment.

The Crown Heights Preservation Review Committee submitted written comments to staff prior to the meeting.

APPROVED. Motion: Daniel / Collier to move **approval** that, based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-09-004 and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds:

- that the garage door will be minimally visible from the street;
- that the proposed garage door is very similar in appearance to the design of the previously approved doors;
- that the previously existing garage door was a double-car garage door;
- that consideration was given to the use of two single garage doors rather than one larger, double door but the size of the garage cannot support the hardware for two separate doors;
- that this action is consistent with the provisions of *4250.4 D (3), (4), (5) and (6) and 4250.4 C of the Historic Preservation Ordinance and Subchapter(s) 3.3 of the Preservation Guidelines and Standards*; and
- that based upon the evidence presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, the action requested is in compliance, and the proposed material change in appearance would not have a substantial adverse

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 9 of 19

February 4, 2009

effect on the aesthetic, historical or architectural significance and value of the historic property and district according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Ayes: Tague, Collier, Daniel, Holcombe, Galbraith, Taylor, Jones, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Absent: Nelson.

- 6F. HPCA-09-005** at 609 NW 14th St. (Heritage Hills), Ward 6. Consideration and possible action on application of Kurt & Cristi Reiger by Eva Osborne, AIA for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) remove existing plywood soffit and 2.) replace plywood soffit with tongue and groove soffit at east façade and 3.) remove vinyl siding at second floor, south (front) façade and 4.) repair/paint original wood siding, or 5.) replace vinyl siding in-kind.

Eva Osborne was present for comment.

APPROVED. Motion: Taylor / Collier to move **approval of items 1.) remove existing plywood soffit and 2.) replace plywood soffit with tongue and groove soffit at east façade** that, based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-09-005 and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds:

- that the proposed work will not alter or destroy all or a part of the resource
- that the materials specified to replace the existing plywood of the soffits are compatible with the aesthetic and structural appearance of the resource including, but not limited to, the consideration of texture, style, color or the components, and the combination of elements, such as brick, stone, concrete, shingle, wood or stucco and the significant characteristics of the resource including, but not limited to, a consideration of a harmony of materials, details, height, mass, proportion, rhythm, scale, setback, shape, street accessories and workmanship;
- that this action is consistent with the provisions of *4250.4 D (3),(5), and (6) and 4250.4 L (2)of the Historic Preservation Ordinance and Subchapter(s) 2.1, 2.10 of the Preservation Guidelines and Standards*; and
- that based upon the evidence presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, the action requested is in compliance, and the proposed material change in appearance would not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical or architectural significance and value of the historic property and district according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 10 of 19

February 4, 2009

Ayes: Tague, Collier, Daniel, Holcombe, Galbraith, Taylor, Jones, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Absent: Nelson.

CONTINUED. Motion: Collier / Zimmer to move **continuance for 30-days on items 3.) remove vinyl siding at second floor, south (front) façade and 4.) repair/paint original wood siding, or 5.) replace vinyl siding in-kind** that, based upon the evidence that has been presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, the Commission finds that additional information is required from the applicant in order to determine whether the action requested is in compliance with the *Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts*, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Ayes: Tague, Collier, Daniel, Holcombe, Galbraith, Taylor, Jones, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Absent: Nelson.

In addition to the motion, the Historic Preservation Commission advised the applicant that the removal of the vinyl siding on the remaining three sides of the building (east, north, and west) would require a Certificate of Appropriateness. The applicant was advised to consult the ordinance including the Guidelines and Standards.

- 6G. HPCA-09-001** at 310 NW 16th St. (Heritage Hills), Ward 6. Consideration and possible action on application of Jeff Witt for Certificate of Appropriateness to:
- 1.) renovate and restore the existing front porch of residence to include: 1a.) remove existing non-original porch railings, 1b.) install wood porch railing as shown in pictures if required by building code 1c.) remove existing vinyl siding on soffit and fascia boards, 1d.) repair or replace original wood soffit and fascia boards as needed,
 - 2.) renovate and restore the existing side (east) porch of existing residence to include: 2a.) remove existing non-original porch railings, 2b.) remove existing vinyl siding on soffit and fascia boards, 2c.) remove existing non-original wrought iron post, 2d.) install new porch post to match original front porch post, 2e.) install porch railings and install screening as shown in historic photographs,
 - 3.) renovate and restore the existing east elevation to include: 3a.) remove existing vinyl siding covering the original window and restore opening,
 - 4.) remodel the south elevation of the existing non-original rear addition to include: infill existing non-original aluminum window at west elevation, and 4a.) remove existing door, aluminum windows, and vinyl siding, 4b.) install a new solid wood insulated french door of clear glass in true divided lites, 4c.) install a new sash window with clear glass in true divided lites to match pattern of existing windows, 4d.) apply lap siding or stucco finish to exterior walls to match existing residence,

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 11 of 19

February 4, 2009

- 5.) remove existing layers of asphalt and wood roofing on residence,
- 6.) install new Timberline 30 shingles in Weatherwood color on roof of residence,
- 7.) remove existing vinyl clad crawlspace covers and install new solid wood covers as originally built,
- 8.) remove existing vinyl cladding on exterior trim and restore to original wood on all elevations,
- 9.) demolish existing non-historic detached garage and non-original addition to east elevation,
- 10.) construct new single-story two-car garage to include: 10a.) install one 16' solid wood overhead garage door to resemble the design of original garage doors, 10b.) apply stucco exterior, 10c.) install two original sash windows of clear glass in true divided lites pattern from existing garage, 10d.) install solid wood pedestrian door with lower wood panel and clear glass in true divided lite upper, 10e.) install shingled roof to match residence, 10f.) install soffits and trim to match residence, and 10g.) install three exterior wall light fixtures,
- 11.) replace broken and uneven front concrete walk with a new concrete walk of specified tint in medium grey brush finish concrete of the same width, and
- 12.) remove existing gas yard pole light with replace with an electric yard light of like fixture and pole design and height

Jeff Witt was present for comment.

APPROVED. Motion: Collier / Galbraith to move **approval of items 1.) renovate and restore the existing front porch of residence to include: 1a.) remove existing non-original porch railings, 1b.) install wood porch railing as shown in pictures if required by building code 1c.) remove existing vinyl siding on soffit and fascia boards, 1d.) repair or replace original wood soffit and fascia boards as needed, 2.) renovate and restore the existing side (east) porch of existing residence to include: 2a.) remove existing non-original porch railings, 2b.) remove existing vinyl siding on soffit and fascia boards, 2c.) remove existing non-original wrought iron post, 2d.) install new porch post to match original front porch post, 2e.) install porch railings and install screening as shown in historic photographs, 3.) renovate and restore the existing east elevation to include: 3a.) remove existing vinyl siding covering the original window and restore opening, 4.) remodel the south elevation of the existing non-original rear addition to include infill existing non-original aluminum window at west elevation, 4a.) remove existing door, aluminum windows, and vinyl siding, 4b.) install a new solid wood insulated french door of clear glass in true divided lites, 4c.) install a new sash window with clear glass in true divided lites to match pattern of existing windows, 4d.) install new wood 1/2" X 6" lapped bevel wood siding or apply stucco finish to match existing residence, 5.) remove existing layers of asphalt and wood roofing on residence, 6.) install new Timberline 30 shingles in Weatherwood color on roof of residence, 7.) remove existing vinyl clad crawlspace covers**

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 12 of 19

February 4, 2009

and install new solid wood covers as originally built, 8.) remove existing vinyl cladding on exterior trim and restore to original wood on all elevations, that, based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-09-001 and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds:

- that the proposed work will not destroy or alter all, or part, of a resource;
- that the building materials of the proposal are compatible with the aesthetic and structural appearance of the resource including, but not limited to, the consideration of texture, style, color or the components, and the combination of elements, such as brick, stone, concrete, shingle, wood or stucco;
- that the proposed design of the project is compatible to the significant characteristics of the resource including, but not limited to, a consideration of a harmony of materials, details, height, mass, proportion, rhythm, scale, setback, shape, street accessories and workmanship;
- that the proposal will remove incompatible non-historic alterations and the design elements will be restored to the original design or a design compatible with the character of the historic building;
- that the renovation of the non-historic rear addition will include replacement of features that are compatible with the character of the historic structure and that the proposed lap siding will clearly differentiate the cladding material so that a false historic appearance is not created;
- that the proposed replacement window and French door will replace non-historic window and door and will be solid wood, true divided lite, and clear glass;
- that while there is an uncovered concrete pad connecting the front porch to the side porch, the actual roof line of the front porch does not connect to the side porch;
- that the proposed enclosure of the side porch is sensitive and with the character of the historic structure;
- that the existing vinyl cladding of the second story of the residence is non-original and the replacement with lap siding or stucco finish is compatible with the character of the historic structure;
- that the roof details will be retained;
- that this action is consistent with the provisions of *4250.4 D (3), (5) and (6) and 4250.4 L (2) of the Historic Preservation Ordinance and Subchapters 2.1, 2.2, 2.4, 2.5, and 2.7 of the Preservation Guidelines and Standards;* and
- that based upon the evidence presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, the action requested is in compliance, and the proposed material change in appearance would not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical or architectural significance and value of the

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 13 of 19

February 4, 2009

historic property and district according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Ayes: Tague, Collier, Daniel, Holcombe, Galbraith, Taylor, Jones, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Absent: Nelson.

CLARIFICATION. Motion: Collier / Galbraith to move **clarification that item 4c.) will be constructed of wood and item 4d.) exterior finish will be stucco at the first floor.**

Ayes: Tague, Collier, Daniel, Holcombe, Galbraith, Taylor, Jones, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Absent: Nelson.

APPROVED. Motion: Daniel / Collier to move **approval of item 9.) demolish existing original detached garage and non-original addition to east elevation,** that, based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-09-001 and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds:

- that this is not the historic garage;
- that the garage, although it has aged, it does not retain historic character;
- that the demolition of the garage would not have an adverse affect on the historic character of neighborhood or district;
- that this action is consistent with the provisions of *4250.4 D (3), (5) and (6) and 4250.4 L (2) of the Historic Preservation Ordinance and Subchapters 2.9 and 3.3 of the Preservation Guidelines and Standards;* and
- that based upon the evidence presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, the action requested is in compliance, and the proposed material change in appearance would not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical or architectural significance and value of the historic property and district according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Ayes: Tague, Collier, Daniel, Holcombe, Galbraith, Taylor, Jones, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Absent: Nelson.

APPROVED with Condition. Motion: Collier / Galbraith to move **approval with condition of item 10.) construct new single-story two-car garage to include:**

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 14 of 19

February 4, 2009

10a.) install two overhead garage doors to match design of original hinged garage doors, 10b.) apply stucco exterior, 10c.) install two original sash windows of clear glass in true divided lites pattern from existing garage, 10d.) install solid wood pedestrian door with lower wood panel and clear glass in true divided lite upper, 10e.) install shingled roof to match residence, 10f.) install soffits and trim to match residence, and 10g.) install four exterior wall light fixtures that, based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-09-001 and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds:

- that this action is consistent with the provisions of *4250.4 D (3), (5) and (6) and 4250.4 L (2) of the Historic Preservation Ordinance and Subchapter(s) 2.9, 2.13, and 3.3 of the Preservation Guidelines and Standards*; and
- that based upon the evidence presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, the action requested is in compliance, and the proposed material change in appearance would not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical or architectural significance and value of the historic property and district according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Conditions of approval are:

- Item 10a.) will have one, sixteen-foot overhead garage door as drawn in floor plan and the east (overhead garage) door will move four feet to the east (off center); and
- Item 10g.) will have three light fixtures.

Ayes: Tague, Collier, Daniel, Holcombe, Galbraith, Taylor, Jones, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Absent: Nelson.

APPROVED. Motion: Holcombe / Zimmer to move **approval of item 11.) replace broken and uneven front concrete walk with a new concrete walk of medium grey brush finish concrete of the same width,** that, based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-09-001 and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds:

- that the proposed sidewalk will be constructed of medium grey brush-finished concrete;
- that the specific color information for the medium grey brush finish concrete be obtained from the Planning Department;

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 15 of 19

February 4, 2009

- that this action is consistent with the provisions of *4250.4 D (3), (5) and (6) and 4250.4 L (2) of the Historic Preservation Ordinance and Subchapter 1.3 of the Preservation Guidelines and Standards*; and
- that based upon the evidence presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, the action requested is in compliance, and the proposed material change in appearance would not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical or architectural significance and value of the historic property and district according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Ayes: Tague, Collier, Daniel, Holcombe, Galbraith, Taylor, Jones, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Absent: Nelson.

APPROVED. Motion: Collier / Holcombe to move **approval of item 12.) remove and replace existing gas yard pole light with an electric yard light of like design** that, based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-09-001 and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds:

- that the proposed exterior lighting fixtures are compatible to the period and character of the district;
- that this action is consistent with the provisions of *4250.4 D (3), (5) and (6) and 4250.4 L (2) of the Historic Preservation Ordinance and Subchapter 2.13 of the Preservation Guidelines and Standards*; and
- that based upon the evidence presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, the action requested is in compliance, and the proposed material change in appearance would not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical or architectural significance and value of the historic property and district according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Ayes: Tague, Collier, Daniel, Holcombe, Galbraith, Taylor, Jones, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Absent: Nelson.

- 6H. HPCA-09-003** at 2215 N Walker Ave. (Mesta Park), Ward 6. Consideration and possible action on application of Independent School District No. 89 by Kendra Boeckman of Studio Architecture for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) extend HPCA-08-020 for one-year.

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 16 of 19

February 4, 2009

Approved on Consent Docket.

- 6I. **HPCA-08-157** at 817 NW 19th St.. (Mesta Park), Ward 6. Consideration and possible action on application of Sammie L. Flippo - Rev. Trust for Certificate of Appropriateness to 2c.) install a solid wood paneled overhead door in recently approved two-car garage, and 3.) install deck, steps, railing, and skirting at rear façade.

Approved on Consent Docket.

7. OTHER BUSINESS

- 7A. **Proposed ordinance creating Paseo Tract 6** – Paseo (Ward 2) Requesting recommendation from the Historic Preservation Commission on a proposed ordinance regarding Tracts 5 and 6 of the Neighborhood Conservation Zoning District; amending Section 7300.2 and adding Section 7300.9 of Article VII of Chapter 59 of the Oklahoma City Municipal Planning and Zoning Code, 2007, as amended; creating Tract 6 of the Neighborhood Conservation District relating to use regulation and development regulations. A change to rezone the area proposed as “Tract 6” out of the HL overlay is proposed concurrently with this ordinance amendment.

At the January 15, 2009 meeting, the Planning Commission directed staff to draft an ordinance creating Tract 6, composed of properties fronting the Paseo Drive. Design review for Tract 6 would be under the responsibility of the Urban Design Commission. All the other requirements of Tract 6 would be the same as those for Tract 5. The balance of the existing Tract 5 would have design review handled by the Historic Preservation Commission.

Bob Mier, Planning Department, was present for comment.

Winnie Hawkins was present for comment.

RECOMMENDATION. Daniel / Jones to move recommendation that the Historic Preservation Commission opposes the creation of the proposed tract 6 to the extent that it transfers review of historic structures from the Historic Preservation Commission to the Urban Design Commission. It is the further view of the Historic Preservation Commission that historical properties, whether residential or commercial, are most properly under the review of the Historic Preservation Commission, the body charged by ordinance with promoting the preservation of historic or architectural resources and maintaining the integrity of these important resources.

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 17 of 19

February 4, 2009

Ayes: Tague, Collier, Daniel, Holcombe, Taylor, Jones, Zimmer.

Nays: Galbraith.

Absent: Nelson.

Caroloe Galbraith requested to change her vote.

Ayes: Tague, Collier, Daniel, Holcombe, Galbraith, Taylor, Jones, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Absent: Nelson.

8. CITIZENS TO BE HEARD

9. COMMUNICATIONS AND REPORTS

A. Commission Members

B. Municipal Counselor

C. Administrative Approvals

9C1. HPCA-09-006 at 217 NW 22nd St. (Mesta Park), Ward 6. Staff is announcing the Administrative Approval of the items on the application John Bullard for a Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) remove existing chain-link fencing, 2.) install standard 6'-foot tall dog-eared wood stockade fence and gate, and 3.) replace driveway from the sidewalk to the garage with brushed concrete in medium grey tones to the same dimensions as existing.

D. Withdrawals

9D1. HPCA-08-137 at 2215 N Broadway Ave. (Heritage Hills East), Ward 7. Staff is announcing the withdrawal of an application by the Planning Department to receive comments from the Historic Preservation Commission in preparation for a future action by the City Council. At the December 3, 2008 meeting, this item was continued for 60 days. Since that time, the property owner has stated that they are moving forward to address issues associated with the property and the Planning Department has withdrawn the application.

9D2. HPCA-08-136 at 108 NW 22nd St.. (Heritage Hills East), Ward 7. Staff is announcing the withdrawal of an application by the Planning Department to receive comments from the Historic Preservation Commission in preparation for a future action by the City Council. At the December 3, 2008 meeting, this item was continued for 60 days. Since

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 18 of 19

February 4, 2009

that time, the property owner has stated that they are moving forward to address issues associated with the property and the Planning Department has withdrawn the application.

- 9D3. HPCA-08-135** at 100 NW 22nd St.. (Heritage Hills East), Ward 7. Staff is announcing the withdrawal of an application by the Planning Department to receive comments from the Historic Preservation Commission in preparation for a future action by the City Council. At the December 3, 2008 meeting, this item was continued for 60 days. Since that time, the property owner has stated that they are moving forward to address issues associated with the property and the Planning Department has withdrawn the application.

E. Board of Adjustment

- 9E1. HPCA-08-049** at 3015 N Harvey Pkwy. (Jefferson Park), Ward 2. Staff is announcing the appeal of the Historic Preservation Commissions denial of the application of Greta Stromberg for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) replace windows. **The appeal was denied at the January 8, 2009 Board Of Adjustment meeting.**
- 9E2. HPCA-08-160** at 610 NW 14th St. (Heritage Hills), Ward 6. Appeal of W. Jeff Jenkins, Architect LLC, of the decision of the Historic Preservation Commission regarding the denial of a Certificate of Appropriateness to demolish a garage. **The appeal was denied at the January 22, 2009 Board Of Adjustment meeting.**
- 9E3. HPCA-06-098** at 2916 D Paseo Dr. (Paseo), Ward 6. Staff is announcing the appeal of the Historic Preservation Commissions denial of the application of Paseo Village by John Belt for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) install mural and fountain. – **This appeal was continued to the March 5, 2009 Board of Adjustment meeting.**

F. Planning Commission

- 9F1. Zoning Change SPUD-497** (Heritage Hills East), Ward 7. (SPUD-497) Application by Neighbors Holdings, LLC, to rezone 124 NW 15th Street from the R-4 General Residential/HL Historical Landmark/Heritage Hills East "UCD" Urban Conservation Overlay District to the SPUD-497 Simplified Planned Unit Development District. **This item was deferred by the Planning Commission on January 15, 2009 to be heard on January 29, 2009.**
- 9F2. CE-757 Easement Closing** (Mesta Park), Ward 6, Application by

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 19 of 19

February 4, 2009

Independent School District No. 89 of Oklahoma County, to close the platted east/west alley located in Block 28, University Addition, located south of NW 22nd Street between Dewey Avenue and Walker Avenue. **This item was heard by the Planning Commission on January 15, 2009 and recommended for approval.**

- 9F3. Ordinance change relating to Tract Five of the Neighborhood Conservation Zoning District.** (Paseo), Ward 2. Ordinance on public hearing, relating to Tract Five of the Neighborhood Conservation Zoning District; amending Section 7300.2 and Section 7300.8 of Article VII of Chapter 59 of the Oklahoma City Municipal Planning and Zoning Code, 2007, as amended; relating to general regulations, parking of vehicles, landscaping and screening, accessory structures and uses; screening, outside storage, lawn or porch furniture; use regulations, development regulations; design **This item was heard by the Planning Commission on January 15, 2009 and recommended for approval subject to the following conditions: 1. No review of paint colors required, 2. Murals will be conditional, and 3. Rezoning will be initiated.**

- G.** The next regularly scheduled meeting for the Historic Preservation Commission is Wednesday, March 4, 2009 at 2:00 p.m. at the Municipal Building, City Council Chamber. New applications and information on continued projects are to be submitted to staff by 5:00 p.m., Tuesday, February 10, 2009.
- H.** The next regularly scheduled workshop for the Historic Preservation Commission is Monday, February 9, 2009 at 4:00 p.m. at 420 W. Main Street, Suite 900.

10. ADJOURNMENT (4:23 p.m.)

Motion: Daniel / Zimmer to adjourn the 2/4/2009, meeting of the Historic Preservation Commission.

Ayes: Tague, Collier, Daniel, Holcombe, Galbraith, Taylor, Jones, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Absent: Nelson.

pjh