

MINUTES
Regular Meeting
HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION
December 03, 2008 - 2:00 p.m.
Municipal Building, City Council Chamber

The meeting of the Oklahoma City Historic Preservation Commission was called to order in the City Council Chamber, 3rd Floor of the Municipal Building, 200 N. Walker Avenue, Oklahoma City, Oklahoma. The meeting convened at 2:03 p.m. Notice of the meeting and agenda were filed with the City Clerk's office and posted on the Council bulletin board 48 hours prior to the meeting.

1. CALL TO ORDER AND ROLL CALL

Members Present: Roland Tague, Chairman
Karen Collier, Vice-Chair
Carolee Galbraith
Marnie Taylor
Jane Holcombe
Karen Nelson
Nedra Jones
Karen Zimmer

Members Absent: Thomas J. Daniel IV

Staff Present: Susan Miller, Planner IV, Planning Department
John Calhoun, AICP, Planner II, Planning Department
Scottye Montgomery, Planner II, Planning Department
Angela Yetter, Planner I, Planning Department
Paula Hurst, Planning Department
Bob Mier, Planning Department
Rita Douglas-Talley, Assistant Municipal Counselor

2. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

APPROVED. Motion: Galbraith / Taylor to **approve** the minutes of the November 5, 2008, Historic Preservation Commission meeting.

Ayes: Tague, Collier, Holcombe, Galbraith, Taylor, Nelson, Jones, Zimmer.
Nays: None.
Absent: Daniel.

APPROVED. Motion: Collier / Zimmer to **approve to waive the reading of the Standard Findings of Fact and incorporate them into the minutes.**

Ayes: Tague, Collier, Holcombe, Galbraith, Taylor, Nelson, Jones, Zimmer.
Nays: None.
Absent: Daniel.

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 2 of 19

December 03, 2008

3. CITATION REPORT

Mr. Woods, Compliance Officer, was present for comment.

4. CONTINUANCE REQUESTS

A. Staff request continuance of the following cases:

None.

B. Other continuance requests:

- 7C. HPCA-08-135 at 100 NW 22nd St. (Heritage Hills East), Ward 7. The property owner requests a **60-day continuance** on this item to receive comments from the Historic Preservation Commission in preparation for a future action by the City Council.

Staff received comments from Heritage Hills East Neighborhood Association.

- 7D. HPCA-08-136 at 108 NW 22nd St. (Heritage Hills East), Ward 7. The property owner requests a **60-day continuance** on this item to receive comments from the Historic Preservation Commission in preparation for a future action by the City Council.

Sherry Pemberton, neighbor, offered comments.

Staff received comments from Heritage Hills East Neighborhood Association.

- 7E. HPCA-08-137 at 2215 N Broadway Ave. (Heritage Hills East), Ward 7. The property owner requests a **60-day continuance** on this item to receive comments from the Historic Preservation Commission in preparation for a future action by the City Council.

Staff received comments from Heritage Hills East Neighborhood Association.

CONTINUED. Motion: Collier / Galbraith to move **approval of continuance requests**, based upon the evidence that has been presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, that the Commission find that additional information is required from the applicant in order to determine whether the action requested is in compliance with

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 3 of 19

December 03, 2008

Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Ayes: Tague, Collier, Holcombe, Galbraith, Taylor, Nelson, Jones, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Absent: Daniel.

5. CONSENT DOCKET CASES

- 6C. HPCA-08-168 at 536 NW 41st St. (Crown Heights), Ward 2. Consideration and possible action on application of Charles McLawhorn for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) replace roof including 1a.) remove one layer of composition shingles, 1b.) remove one layer of wood shingles, 1c.) install new decking over slats, and 4.) install new fiberglass asphalt composition shingles.

Applicant was not present for comment.

- 6E. HPCA-08-163 at 108 NW 17th St. (Heritage Hills East), Ward 7. Consideration and possible action on application of Sean Jones (Property for Fitness LLC) by Alisa Weatherman-Bailey, Contractor for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) to demolish CMU (North) wall at parking lot and replace with landscaping.

Slim Weatherman, Contractor, was present for comment.

- 6F. HPCA-08-167 at 315 NW 19th St. (Heritage Hills), Ward 6. Consideration and possible action on application of Phil & Genia Stenseth for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) relocate current walkway and 2.) add small adjacent walkway.

Genia Stenseth was present for comment.

- 6H. HPCA-08-164 at 600 NW 18th St. (Mesta Park), Ward 6. Consideration and possible action on application of Greg and Angela Krempl for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) change the width of the previously approved garage doors from 8 feet to 9 feet wide.

Greg Krempl was present for comment.

APPROVED. Motion: Holcombe / Collier to move approval of consent docket items based upon the evidence presented in the applications, Staff Reports and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds:

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 4 of 19

December 03, 2008

Specific findings of fact for HPCA-08-168:

- that the original wood shingle roofing materials have been covered with composition shingles for an extended period of time and are significantly deteriorated;
- that the proposal to install new composition roof will not destroy or alter all, or part, of a resource;
- that the proposed installation of a new roof will not isolate the resource from its historical or architectural surroundings, or would not introduce visual, audible, vibratory or polluting elements that are out of character with the resource and its setting, or that adversely affect the physical integrity of the resource;
- that the proposed new roof shows compatibility of the building materials with the aesthetic and structural appearance of the resource including, but not limited to, the consideration of texture, style, color or the components, and the combination of elements, such as brick, stone, concrete, shingle, wood or stucco;
- that the design of the proposed roof and material specified shows compatibility to the significant characteristics of the resource including, but not limited to, a consideration of a harmony of materials, details, height, mass, proportion, rhythm, scale, setback, shape, street accessories and workmanship;
- that the installation of the new roofing material will not alter the original shape, line, pitch or overhang of the roof or its architectural feature;
- that the replacement materials are dimensional composition shingles in weathered wood color;
- that roof details will be retained;
- that the proposal will preserve the original shape, line, pitch and overhang of the historic roof, as well as architectural features and details and any distinctive roof details;
- that this action is consistent with the provisions of *4250.4D(3)(4)(5)and(6) and 4250.4L(2)of the HP Historic Preservation Ordinance and Subchapter 2.7 of the Preservation Guidelines and Standards*; and
- that based upon the evidence presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, the action requested is in compliance, and the proposed material change in appearance would not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical or architectural significance and value of the historic property and district according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Specific findings of fact for HPCA-08-163:

- that the proposed amendment to delete the approved portion of the CMU wall will not destroy or alter all, or part, of a resource.
- that deletion of the wall would not isolate the resource from its historical or

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 5 of 19

December 03, 2008

architectural surroundings, and screening of visual, audible, vibratory or polluting elements that are out of character with the resource and its setting is to be provided by the landscaping, and would not adversely affect the physical integrity of the resource.”

- that the replacement of the concrete wall with a landscape design of grouped evergreen shrubs is compatible to the significant characteristics of the historic district including, but not limited to, a consideration of a harmony of materials, details, height, mass, proportion, rhythm, scale, setback, and shape;
- that the previously approved split face CMU wall would not be considered historic and the deletion would not adversely affect the historic character of the property or district;
- that the replacement of the concrete block wall with plant material is more indicative of the historic fabric of the district and would better reflect the character of the historic properties and areas as well as separating the private space from the public walkways;
- that the plant material (in excess of three feet) would serve to screen the existing commercial parking areas from adjacent streets and sidewalks and would also provide a level of security by allowing views to and from the sidewalks which the originally proposed and approved concrete wall would not;
- that the property to the north across NW 11th Street is not zoned for residential use and that approved screening is in place where the overall property abuts residential to the west;
- that this action is consistent with the provisions of *4250.4D(3), (4), and (6), and 4250.4H of the HP Historic Preservation Ordinance and Subchapters 1, 1.3, and 1.9 of the Preservation Guidelines and Standards*;
- that based upon the evidence presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, the action requested is in compliance, and the proposed material change in appearance would not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical or architectural significance and value of the historic property and district according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Specific findings of fact for HPCA-08-167:

- that the proposed work will not destroy or alter all, or part of a resource;
- that the proposed building materials are compatible with the aesthetic and structural appearance of the resource including, but not limited to, the consideration of texture, style, color or the components, and the combination of elements, such as brick, stone, concrete, shingle, wood or stucco;
- that the design of the proposed concrete walkways are compatible with the significant characteristics of the resource including, but not limited to, a consideration of a harmony of materials, details, height, mass, proportion, rhythm, scale, setback, shape, street accessories and workmanship;

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 6 of 19

December 03, 2008

- that the existing sidewalk is not historic and the demolition will not adversely affect the historic character of the property or district;
- that the parallel configuration of the existing sidewalk will not be altered except for the proposed relocation forward
- that the proposed sidewalks will be constructed of medium grey brush finish concrete;
- that the existing plant material will be preserved and protected during and after the proposed construction of the new sidewalks;
- that this action is consistent with the provisions of *4250.4D(3),(5) and (6) and 4250.4L(2) of the HP Historic Preservation Ordinance and Subchapters 1.3 and 1.6 of the Preservation Guidelines and Standards;*
- that based upon the evidence presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, the action requested is in compliance, and the proposed material change in appearance would not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical or architectural significance and value of the historic property and district according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Specific findings of fact for HPCA-08-164:

- that the design of the doors will not change from the previously approved proposal;
- that the change in door size remains appropriate for the scale of the garage;
- that two sets of carriage doors will be constructed of wood;
- that this action is consistent with the provisions of *4250.4D(4) (5) and (6) of the HP Historic Preservation Ordinance and Subchapter 3.3 of the Preservation Guidelines and Standards;*
- that based upon the evidence presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, the action requested is in compliance, and the proposed material change in appearance would not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical or architectural significance and value of the historic property and district according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Ayes: Tague, Collier, Holcombe, Galbraith, Taylor, Nelson, Jones, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Absent: Daniel.

6. CASES FOR INDIVIDUAL CONSIDERATION

- 6A. HPCA-08-087 at 704 NW 42nd St. (Crown Heights), Ward 2. Consideration and possible action on the application of Monte S. Turrentine for a Certificate of

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 7 of 19

December 03, 2008

Appropriateness to 1.) reconsider the decision to deny with prejudice the application to replace all windows except window B.

Monte S. Turrentine was present for comment.

Eva Osborne offered comments.

The Crown Heights Preservation Review Committee submitted written comments to staff prior to the meeting.

DENIED. Motion: Collier / Nelson to move **denial to reconsider the decision of November 5, 2008**, based upon new information in the application of HPCA-08-087.

Ayes: Collier, Holcombe, Galbraith, Taylor, Nelson, Jones.

Nays: Zimmer.

Absent: Daniel.

6A1. HPCA-08-087 at 704 NW 42nd St. (Crown Heights), Ward 2. Consideration and possible action on the application of Monte S. Turrentine for a Certificate of Appropriateness to 2.) replace most windows with single-pane units.

Not heard.

6B. HPCA-08-159 at 505 NW 42nd St. (Crown Heights), Ward 2. Consideration and possible action on the application of Barbara Charlet for a Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) remove wood deck, 2.) install concrete deck, and 3.) install stone fireplace.

Barbara Charlet was not present for comment.

The Crown Heights Preservation Review Committee submitted written comments to staff prior to the meeting.

CONTINUED. Motion: Collier / Zimmer to move **continuance for 30-days** that, based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-08-159 and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds that additional information is required from the applicant in order to determine whether the action requested is in compliance with Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Ayes: Tague, Collier, Holcombe, Galbraith, Taylor, Nelson, Jones, Zimmer.

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 8 of 19

December 03, 2008

Nays: None.
Absent: Daniel.

- 6C. HPCA-08-168 at 536 NW 41st St. (Crown Heights), Ward 2. Consideration and possible action on the application of Charles McLawhorn for a Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) replace roof including 1a.) remove one layer of composition shingles, 1b.) remove one layer of wood shingles, 1c.) install new decking over slats, and 4.) install new fiberglass asphalt composition shingles.

Approved on Consent Docket.

- 6D. HPCA-08-170 at 704 NW 42nd St. (Crown Heights), Ward 2. Consideration and possible action on the application of Monte Turrentine for a Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) replace sidewalk along west side of house, and 2.) replace all paving at driveway location.

Monte S. Turrentine was present for comment.

Eva Osborne offered comments.

The Crown Heights Preservation Review Committee submitted written comments to staff prior to the meeting.

APPROVED and DENIED. Motion: Taylor / Collier to move **approval of item to 1.)** replace sidewalk along west side of house and **approval in part of item to 2.)** replace all paving at driveway location, pertaining to driveway dimensions; and **denial in part** pertaining to the concrete color that, based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-08-170 and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds:

- that the color of proposed driveway will not be compliant with the Design Guidelines;
- that the sidewalk is a necessary accessory to the side door;
- that a sidewalk previously existed at this location;
- that the sidewalk will be a medium gray brush finish concrete to match historic pavement;
- that the elevated paving previously existing at this location was possibly raised as barrier to water;
- that the new driveway provides for direction of water away from the houses;
- that there is unique circumstance in that there is no increase in the amount of paving provided and the previous amount of paving did not adversely affect the property;
- that the proposed paving maintains the rolling topography of the property which is characteristic of the block;

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 9 of 19

December 03, 2008

- that this action is consistent with the provisions of *4250.4D(3)(4)(5)and(6) and 4250.4L(2)of the HP Historic Preservation Ordinance and Subchapter 2.7 of the Preservation Guidelines and Standards;*
- that based upon the evidence presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, the actions requested, excluding the color of concrete, is in compliance, and the proposed material change in appearance as related to the amount of paving would not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical or architectural significance and value of the historic property and district according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007; and
- that based upon the evidence presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, the action requested as related to the color of concrete is not in compliance, and the proposed material change in appearance would have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical or architectural significance and value of the historic property and district according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Ayes: Tague, Collier, Holcombe, Galbraith, Taylor, Nelson, Jones, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Absent: Daniel.

- 6E. HPCA-08-163 at 108 NW 17th St. (Heritage Hills East), Ward 7. Consideration and possible action on the application of Sean Jones (Property for Fitness LLC) Alisa Weatherman-Bailey, Contractor for a Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) to demolish CMU (North) wall at parking lot and replace with landscaping.

Approved on Consent Docket.

- 6F. HPCA-08-167 at 315 NW 19th St. (Heritage Hills), Ward 6. Consideration and possible action on the application of Phil & Genia Stenseth for a Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) relocate current walkway and 2.) add small adjacent walkway.

Approved on Consent Docket.

- 6G. HPCA-08-160 at 610 NW 14th St. (Heritage Hills), Ward 6. Consideration and possible action on the application of Douglas & Sandy Beall, by W. Jeff Jenkins, Architect, LLC for a Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) demolish garage.

Jeff Jenkins, Architect, was present for comment.

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 10 of 19

December 03, 2008

FAILED. Motion: Zimmer / to move **approval** that, based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-08-160 and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds:

- that the demolition of this structure may destroy or alter all, or part, of a resource, however, the threat to public safety must overshadow this guideline;
- that there is a certification from a licensed Structural Engineer certifying that, in his opinion, the structure poses an imminent threat to public health and safety
- that this action is consistent with the provisions of *4250.4D(3) and 4250.4L(2) of the HP Historic Preservation Ordinance and Subchapters 2.1 and 3.3 of the Preservation Guidelines and Standards*; and
- that based upon the evidence presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, the action requested is in compliance, and the proposed material change in appearance would not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical or architectural significance and value of the historic property and district according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

DENIED. Motion: Collier / Galbraith to move **denial without prejudice** that, based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-08-160 and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds:

- that the demolition of this structure may destroy or alter all, or part, of a resource, however, the threat to public safety must overshadow this guideline;
- that there is a certification from a licensed Structural Engineer certifying that, in his opinion, the structure poses an imminent threat to public health and safety
- that this action is consistent with the provisions of *4250.4D(3) and 4250.4L(2) of the HP Historic Preservation Ordinance and Subchapters 2.1 and 3.3 of the Preservation Guidelines and Standards*; and
- that based upon the evidence presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, the action requested is in compliance, and the proposed material change in appearance would not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical or architectural significance and value of the historic property and district according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Ayes: Tague, Collier, Holcombe, Galbraith, Jones.

Nays: Nelson, Taylor, Zimmer.

Absent: Daniel.

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 11 of 19

December 03, 2008

APPROVED. Motion: Collier / Zimmer to move **reconsideration** of application HPCA-08-160.

Ayes: Tague, Collier, Holcombe, Galbraith, Taylor, Nelson, Jones, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Absent: Daniel.

DENIED. Motion: Collier / Galbraith to move **denial without prejudice** that, based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-08-160 and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds:

- that the structure does not pose an imminent threat to public health or safety and the demolition of said structure is not required to alleviate said threat;
- that the demolition of this structure may destroy or alter all, or part, of a resource;
- that, although the structure has been altered by the presumed demolition of the south portion of the structure, the structure is contributing to the historic district and the demolition will adversely affect the historic character of the property or district;
- that this action is consistent with the provisions of *4250.4D(3) and 4250.4L(2) of the HP Historic Preservation Ordinance and Subchapters 2.1 and 3.3 of the Preservation Guidelines and Standards*; and
- that based upon the evidence presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, the action requested is not in compliance, and the proposed material change in appearance would have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical or architectural significance and value of the historic property and district according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Ayes: Tague, Collier, Holcombe, Galbraith, Jones.

Nays: Nelson, Taylor, Zimmer.

Absent: Daniel.

- 6H. HPCA-08-164 at 600 NW 18th St. (Mesta Park), Ward 6. Consideration and possible action on the application of Greg and Angela Krempf for a Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) change the width of the previously approved garage doors from 8 feet to 9 feet wide.

Approved on Consent Docket.

- 6I. HPCA-08-145 at 724 NW 18th St. (Mesta Park), Ward 6. Consideration and possible action on the application of Paul Wilkes, for Stephen M. and Deborah E.

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 12 of 19

December 03, 2008

Wilkes by Matt Parsons for a Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) remove iron columns and railings, and 2.) add columns and railings.

Applicant was not present for comment.

DENIED. Motion: Holcombe / Nelson to move **denial without prejudice** that, based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-08-145 and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds:

- that the application has been continued two times, and no more continuances are available;
- that the action requested cannot be approved at this time;
- that additional information is required from the applicant in order to determine whether the action requested is in compliance;
- that this action is consistent with the provisions of *4250.4 E(4) of the Historic Preservation Ordinance*; and
- that based upon the evidence presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, the action requested is not in compliance, and the proposed material change in appearance would have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical or architectural significance and value of the historic property and district according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Ayes: Tague, Collier, Holcombe, Galbraith, Taylor, Nelson, Jones, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Absent: Daniel.

- 6J. HPCA-08-111 at 2701 N Walker Ave. (Paseo), Ward 2. Consideration and possible action on the application of OKC Housing Services Redevelopment Corporation dba Positively Paseo for a Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) construct new garage, 2.) construct new sidewalk with stair from front porch east to street and install handrails, and 10.) replace back porch.

Applicant was not present for comment.

DENIED. Motion: Holcombe / Collier to move **denial without prejudice** that, based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-08-111 and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds:

- that the remaining items of the application have been continued two times, and no more continuances are available, and
- that the action requested cannot be approved at this time, and
- that additional information is required from the applicant in order to

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 13 of 19

December 03, 2008

- determine whether the action requested is in compliance, and
- that this action is consistent with the provisions of *4250.4 E(4) of the Historic Preservation Ordinance*; and
- that based upon the evidence presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, the action requested is not in compliance, and the proposed material change in appearance would have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical or architectural significance and value of the historic property and district according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007

Ayes: Tague, Collier, Holcombe, Galbraith, Taylor, Nelson, Jones, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Absent: Daniel.

- 6K. HPCA-06-098 at 2916-D Paseo. (Paseo), Ward 2. Consideration and possible action on application of John L. Belt, Paseo Village for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) install mural and fountain.

John L. Belt, Paseo Village, was present for comment.

Ed Baldwin, Craig Travis, and Kathy Jacobson, neighbors, offered comments.

Staff received written comments and a petition from, from a neighbor(s), prior to the meeting.

DENIED. Motion: Collier / Holcombe to move **denial without prejudice** that, based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-06-098 and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds:

- that the design of the mural is not compatible with the area and other buildings on the street;
- that this action is consistent with the provisions of *4250.4 D(3)(4)(5) and (6) and 4250.4 J of the Historic Preservation Ordinance, 7300.8 C and 7300.8 F of the Zoning Codes for Neighborhood Conservation Tract 5, 9360.6 of other Zoning Codes, and Subchapter 2.11 of the Preservation Guidelines and Standards*; and
- that based upon the evidence presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, the action requested is not in compliance, and the proposed material change in appearance would have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical or architectural significance and value of the historic property and district according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 14 of 19

December 03, 2008

Ayes: Collier, Holcombe, Galbraith, Taylor, Nelson, Jones, Zimmer.

Nays: Tague.

Absent: Daniel.

7. OTHER BUSINESS

- 7A. Ordinance change relating to Tract Five of the Neighborhood Conservation Zoning District. (Paseo), Ward 2. Review and consideration regarding the ordinance amending regulations of the Neighborhood Conservation Zoning District for Tract 5 (Paseo Commercial District).

Kelly McCord, property owner, offered comments.

Winnie Hawkins, property owner, offered comments.

Historic Preservation Commission Comments: Ordinance change relating to Tract Five should not allow murals and should keep existing provision to require a CA for paint color. It was requested that a paint color palette, appropriate for Tract 5, will be discussed in the next workshop.

- 7B. Zoning Change SPUD-497 (Heritage Hills East), Ward 7. Consideration and possible non-binding comment on the proposed zoning change.

Sherry Pemberton, neighbor, offered comments.

Staff received comments from Heritage Hills East Neighborhood Association.

RECOMMEND DENIAL. Motion: Holcombe / Zimmer to **recommend denial** of the zoning change request in order to preserve the historic residential character of the existing neighborhood. In addition, the Commission thought it was important to note that the neighborhood opposes the zoning change and that it is important to maintain the historic integrity of this residential neighborhood.

Ayes: Tague, Collier, Holcombe, Galbraith, Taylor, Nelson, Jones, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Absent: Daniel

- 7C. HPCA-08-135 at 100 NW 22nd St. (Heritage Hills East), Ward 7. To receive comments from the Historic Preservation Commission in preparation for a future action by the City Council. This item will be referred to Neighborhood Services for dilapidated structure processing.

Continued on Continuance Docket.

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 15 of 19

December 03, 2008

- 7D. HPCA-08-136 at 108 NW 22nd St. (Heritage Hills East), Ward 7. To receive comments from the Historic Preservation Commission in preparation for a future action by the City Council. This item will be referred to Neighborhood Services for dilapidated structure(s) processing.

Continued on Continuance Docket.

- 7E. HPCA-08-137 at 2215 N Broadway Ave. (Heritage Hills East), Ward 7. To receive comments from the Historic Preservation Commission in preparation for a future action by the City Council. This item will be referred to Neighborhood Services for dilapidated structure(s) processing.

Continued on Continuance Docket.

- 7F. HPCA-08-139 at 105 NW 24th St. (Jefferson Park), Ward 7. To receive comments from the Historic Preservation Commission in preparation for a future action by the City Council. This item will be referred to Neighborhood Services for dilapidated structure(s) processing.

Staff received written comments from the owner.

FORWARD COMMENTS. Motion: Holcombe / Taylor to **forward the comments** to City Council that the property is historically appropriate and is still a contributing resource to the district and has many, many contributing features.

Ayes: Tague, Holcombe, Galbraith, Taylor, Nelson, Jones, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Absent: Collier, Daniel

8. COMMUNICATIONS AND REPORTS

A. Commissioner Comments

Commissioners mentioned they would like to discuss the Public Notice information at the next Workshop..

B. Municipal Counselor Comments

None.

C. Administrative Approvals

- 8C1. HPCA-08-169 at 519 NW 25th St. (Paseo), Ward 2. Staff is announcing the Administrative Approval of the items on the application of Sharon and Kevin Davis for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) install driveway not to exceed 10 feet in width, 2.) replace public sidewalk and 3.) replace residential front

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 16 of 19

December 03, 2008

sidewalk from front porch.

- 8C2. HPCA-08-059 at 224 W Eubanks St. (Edgemere Park), Ward 2. Staff is announcing the Administrative Approval of the item on the application of Zack and Jen Woods for Certificate of Appropriateness to to receive 6-month extension of the Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) install fence.
- 8C3. HPCA-08-164 at 600 NW 18th St. (Mesta Park), Ward 6. Staff is announcing the Administrative Approval of the item on the application of Greg and Angela Krempl for Certificate of Appropriateness to 2.) installation of an air conditioning unit at the north exterior wall of the garage.
- 8C4. HPCA-08-166 at 829 NW 39th St. (Crown Heights), Ward 2. Staff is announcing the Administrative Approval of the items on the application of Linda C. Resnick Revocable Trust for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) remove chain-link fencing that crosses the driveway and 2.) install 6-foot tall decorative iron gate that will not move forward of the 50% mark on the house.
- 8C5. HPCA-08-170 at 704 NW 42nd St. (Crown Heights), Ward 2. Staff is announcing the Administrative Approval of the items on the application of Monte Turrentine for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) replace pedestrian gate (west of house), and 2.) replace driveway gate.
- 8C6. HPCA-08-165 at 249 NW 35th St. (Edgemere Park), Ward 2. Staff is announcing the Administrative Approval of the items on the application of George A. & Elvira D. Waters for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) replace existing wood and chain link fencing with decorative iron fencing, 2.) replace existing chain link gates with decorative iron gates and 3.) relocate driveway gate 16" back to the north-west corner of the house.
- 8C7. HPCA-08-018 at 801 NW 41st St. (Crown Heights), Ward 2. Staff is announcing the Administrative Approval of the items on the application of Todd Corn by Jeremy Hume for Certificate of Appropriateness to 3.) install fence.
- 8C8. HPCA-08-171 at 400-404 NW 22nd St. (Mesta Park), Ward 6. Staff is announcing the Administrative Approval of the items on the application of James W. Schuelein for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) replace public and private sidewalks with medium grey brushed concrete, and 2.) widen driveway to garage by 2 feet as it approaches the garage door opening, and 3.) install handicap accessible ramp at southwest corner of N Hudson Ave and NW 22nd St.
- 8C9. HPCA-08-041 at 611 NW 15th St. (Heritage Hills), Ward 6. Staff is

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 17 of 19

December 03, 2008

announcing the Administrative Approval of the item on the application of Brad & Elizabeth Gawey by Tim Zajac for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) install at 2' wide by 6' tall gate of dog eared 1" x 4" cedar pickets at rear of property, and 2.) install one 6' wide by 8' tall fence panel of 1" x 4" dog eared pickets at the rear property line.

- 8C10. HPCA-08-173 at 828 NW 16th St. (Mesta Park), Ward 6. Staff is announcing the Administrative Approval of the items on the application of Anne E. Zachritz and Jane Ann Norris for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) remove existing fencing and 2.) install 6 foot tall Western Red Cedar capped wood fence including double-sided matching gates, double-sided fence on east side, and single-sided matching fence on west side.

D. Withdrawals

- 8D1. HPCA-08-041 at 611 NW 15th St. (Heritage Hills), Ward 6. Staff is announcing the applicant's request on November 3, 2008 to withdraw the item on the application of Brad & Elizabeth Gawey by Tim Zajac for Certificate of Appropriateness to 4.) amend the previously approved proposal to delete the eave overhang and finish edge of roof with wood trim flush with north wall.
- 8D2. HPCA-08-098 at 912 NW 14th St. (Heritage Hills), Ward 6. Staff is announcing the applicant's request on November 21, 2008 to withdraw the item on the application of Patrick & Linn Moore for Certificate of Appropriateness to 2.) erect an arbor in backyard.

E. Board of Adjustment

- 8E1. HPCA-06-098 at 2916 D Paseo Dr. (Paseo), Ward 6. Staff is announcing the appeal of the Historic Preservation Commissions denial of the application of Paseo Village by John Belt for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) install mural and fountain. On October 2, 2008 the Board of Adjustment remanded this item back to the Historic Preservation Commission for consideration.
- 8E2. HPCA-08-133 at 415 NW 22nd St. (Mesta Park), Ward 6. Staff is announcing the appeal of the Historic Preservation Commissions denial of the application of Timothy J. Lyons for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) demolish and replace original brick chimney. This appeal is scheduled for the December 4, 2008 Board Of Adjustment meeting.
- 8E3. HPCA-08-049 at 3015 N Harvey Pkwy. (Jefferson Park), Ward 2. Staff is announcing the appeal of the Historic Preservation Commissions denial of the application of Greta Stromberg for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.)

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 18 of 19

December 03, 2008

replace windows. This appeal is scheduled for the January 8, 2009 Board Of Adjustment meeting.

F. Preserve America Community. The City of Oklahoma City has received designation as a Preserve America Community. The program is initiated by the First Lady, Laura Bush, and facilitated by the Advisory Council on Historic Preservation. Preserve America Communities have received this special designation for their dedication to historic preservation in all areas of community development.

G. State Historic Preservation Office's December Workshops Schedule (See attached schedule - registration is required by December 5, 2008).

9. CITIZENS TO BE HEARD

John Belt voiced invitation for all to visit the Paseo on Friday, December 5, 2008.

10. OTHER BUSINESS

A. The next regularly scheduled meeting for the Historic Preservation Commission is Wednesday, January 7, 2009 at 2:00 p.m. at the Municipal Building, City Council Chamber. New applications and information on continued projects are to be submitted to staff by 4:00 p.m., Wednesday, December 9, 2008.

B. The next regularly scheduled workshop for the Historic Preservation Commission is Monday, December 8, 2008 at 4:00 p.m. at 420 W. Main Street, Suite 900.

11. ADJOURNMENT (5:12 p.m.)

Motion: Galbraith / Nelson to adjourn the 12/3/2008, meeting of the Historic Preservation Commission.

Ayes: Tague, Collier, Holcombe, Galbraith, Taylor, Nelson, Jones, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Absent: Daniel

pjh

ATTACHMENT I

STANDARD FINDINGS OF FACT
FOR OKLAHOMA CITY
HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION

Approval or Denial:

I move, based upon the evidence presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, that the Commission find the action requested is in compliance (not in compliance), that the proposed material change in appearance would (or would not) have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historic or architectural significance and value of the historic district (or historic property) according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007, as set forth in the Staff Report for this item and direct that these findings will be reflected in the minutes recording the action taken on this item.

Or, as an alternative:

Continuance:

I move, based upon the evidence that has been presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, that the Commission find that additional information is required from the applicant in order to determine whether the action requested is in compliance with Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Or,

Modification:

I move, based upon the evidence that has been presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, that the Commission find that although the action requested cannot be approved as presented, that in recognition of the applicant's willingness to accept the conditions of approval, that the amended action requested is in compliance, and the proposed material change in appearance would not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historic or architectural significance and value of the historic district (or historic property) according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007, as set forth in the Staff Report for this item and direct that these specific findings be reflected in the minutes recording the action taken on this item.

The Staff Report will list the specific Guidelines, and on approval of the appropriate motion, the minutes will incorporate those guidelines as the Commission's specific findings of fact.