

**MINUTES**  
**Regular Meeting**  
**HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION**  
November 05, 2008 - 2:00 p.m.  
Municipal Building, City Council Chamber

The meeting of the Oklahoma City Historic Preservation Commission was called to order in the City Council Chamber, 3rd Floor of the Municipal Building, 200 N. Walker Avenue, Oklahoma City, Oklahoma. The meeting convened at 2:01 p.m. Notice of the meeting and agenda were filed with the City Clerk's office and posted on the Council bulletin board 48 hours prior to the meeting.

**1. CALL TO ORDER AND ROLL CALL**

Members Present: Karen Collier, Vice-Chair  
Carolee Galbraith  
Marnie Taylor  
Jane Holcombe  
Thomas J. Daniel IV (arrived at item 1A and left at item 6R)  
Karen Nelson  
Nedra Jones  
Karen Zimmer

Members Absent: Roland Tague, Chairman

Staff Present: Susan Miller, Planner IV, Planning Department  
John Calhoun, AIA, Planner II, Planning Department  
Scottye Montgomery, Planner II, Planning Department  
Angela Yetter, Planner I, Planning Department  
Paula Hurst, Office Specialist II, Planning Department  
Rita Douglas-Talley, Assistant Municipal Counselor

A. Special Presentation "Historic Window Restoration for the Overholser Mansion" by Catherine Montgomery, AIA, Director of Construction and Maintenance, Oklahoma Historical Society.

Dr. Sheila Barnes, Preservation Oklahoma, Lisa Escalon, and Mike Kertok.

**2. APPROVAL OF MINUTES**

APPROVED. Motion: Holcombe / Galbraith to **approve** the minutes of the October 1, 2008, Historic Preservation Commission meeting.

Ayes: Collier, Daniel, Holcombe, Galbraith, Taylor, Nelson, Zimmer, Jones.

Nays: None.

Absent: Tague.

**3. CITATION REPORT**

**Historic Preservation Commission**

Minutes - Page 2 of 33

11/5/2008

Mr. Woods, Compliance Officer, was present for comment.

**4. CONTINUANCE REQUESTS**

**A.** Staff request continuance of the following cases:

**6BB. HPCA-08-098** at 912 NW 14th St. (Heritage Hills), Ward 6. Staff requests a **30-day continuance** on application of Patrick & Linn Moore for Certificate of Appropriateness to 2.) erect an arbor in backyard.

**B.** Other continuance requests:

**6F. HPCA-08-145** at 724 NW 18th St. (Mesta Park), Ward 6. The applicant requests a **30-day continuance** to submit more design information on the application of Paul Wilkes, for Stephen M. and Deborah E. Wilkes by Matt Parsons for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) remove iron columns and railings, and 2.) add columns and railings.

**CONTINUED.** Motion: Holcombe / Galbraith to move **approval of continuance requests**, based upon the evidence that has been presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, that the Commission find that additional information is required from the applicant in order to determine whether the action requested is in compliance with Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Ayes: Collier, Daniel, Holcombe, Galbraith, Taylor, Nelson, Zimmer, Jones.

Nays: None.

Absent: Tague.

**5. CONSENT DOCKET CASES**

**6D. HPCA-08-154** at 525 NW 17th St. (Mesta Park), Ward 6. Consideration and possible action on application of Kimberly Long for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) remove two layers of composition and one layer of wood shingles and 2.) install new composition shingles.

**6E. HPCA-08-077** at 525 NW 17th St. (Mesta Park), Ward 6. Consideration and possible action on application of Kimberly Long for Certificate of Appropriateness to 4.) remove back porch enclosure and steps.

**6O. HPCA-08-148** at 124 NW 26th St. (Jefferson Park), Ward 7. Consideration and

## Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 3 of 33

11/5/2008

possible action on application of Carmen Dickerson for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) demolish garage.

- 6P.** **HPCA-08-155** at 222 NW 24th St. (Jefferson Park), Ward 2. Consideration and possible action on application of Ricky D. Glass by Katherine Reynolds for Certificate of Appropriateness to 2.) install storm door.
- 6X.** **HPCA-08-158** at 115 and 117 NW 20th St. (Heritage Hills East), Ward 7. Consideration and possible action on application of David Wilson and Peter Dolese for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) demolish shared garage.
- 6Y.** **HPCA-08-150** at 427 NW 21st St. (Heritage Hills), Ward 6. Consideration and possible action on application of Julia Ehrhardt for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) replace roof including 1a.) remove existing composition roofing, 1b.) remove original layer of wood shingles, 1c.) install plywood decking, 1d.) install 3-tab fiberglass shingle, and 1e.) change color of roof shingles from white to gray.

**APPROVED.** Motion: Taylor / Nelson to move **approval of consent docket items** based upon the evidence presented in the applications, Staff Reports and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds:

### Specific Findings for HPCA-08-154:

- that the original wood shingle roofing materials have been covered with composition shingles for an extended period of time and are significantly deteriorated;
- that the proposal to install new composition roof will not destroy or alter all, or part, of a resource;
- that the proposed installation of a new roof will not isolate the resource from its historical or architectural surroundings, or would not introduce visual, audible, vibratory or polluting elements that are out of character with the resource and its setting, or that adversely affect the physical integrity of the resource;
- that the proposed new roof shows compatibility of the building materials with the aesthetic and structural appearance of the resource including, but not limited to, the consideration of texture, style, color or the components, and the combination of elements, such as brick, stone, concrete, shingle, wood or stucco;
- that the design of the proposed roof and material specified shows compatibility to the significant characteristics of the resource including, but not limited to, a consideration of a harmony of materials, details, height, mass, proportion, rhythm, scale, setback, shape, street accessories and workmanship;
- that the proposal will preserve the original shape, line, pitch and overhang of

## Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 4 of 33

11/5/2008

the historic roof, as well as architectural features and details and any distinctive roof details;

- that this action is consistent with the provisions of *4250.4D(3)(4)(5)and(6) and 4250.4L(2)of the HP Historic Preservation Ordinance and Subchapter 2.7 of the Preservation Guidelines and Standards;*and
- that based upon the evidence presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, the action requested is in compliance, and the proposed material change in appearance would not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical or architectural significance and value of the historic property and district according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

### Specific Findings for HPCA-08-077:

- that the proposed alterations are not visible from the street and not at a primary façade of the house;
- that this action is consistent with the provisions of *4250.4D(3)(4)(5)and(6) and 4250.4L(2)of the HP Historic Preservation Ordinance and Subchapter 2.4 of the Preservation Guidelines and Standards;* and
- that based upon the evidence presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, the action requested is in compliance, and the proposed material changes in appearance would not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical or architectural significance and value of the historic property and district according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

### Specific Findings for HPCA-08-148:

- that the structure poses an imminent threat to public health or safety and the demolition of said structure is required to alleviate said threat;
- that this action is consistent with the provisions of *4250.4D(3)(4)(5)and(6) and 4250.4L(2)of the HP Historic Preservation Ordinance and Subchapter 2.9 of the Preservation Guidelines and Standards;*
- that based upon the evidence presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, the action requested is in compliance, and the proposed material change in appearance would not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical or architectural significance and value of the historic property and district according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

### Specific Findings for HPCA-08-155:

## Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 5 of 33

11/5/2008

- that the frame of the storm door will be painted to match the trim of the house;
- that the storm door will have a full clear glazed panel;
- that this action is consistent with the provisions of *4250.4D(3)(4)(5)and(6) and Subchapter 2.4 of the Preservation Guidelines and Standards; and*
- that based upon the evidence presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, the action requested is in compliance, and the proposed material change in appearance would not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical or architectural significance and value of the historic property and district according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

### Specific Findings for HPCA-08-158:

- that the garage poses an imminent threat to public safety and the demolition of said structure is required to alleviate said threat;
- that this action is consistent with the provisions of *4250.4D(3) and 4250.4L(2)of the HP Historic Preservation Ordinance;*
- that based upon the evidence presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, the action requested is in compliance, and the proposed material change in appearance would not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical or architectural significance and value of the historic property and district according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

### Specific Findings for HPCA-08-150:

- that the original wood shingle roofing materials have been covered with composition shingles for an extended period of time and are significantly deteriorated;
- that the proposal to install new roofing material will not destroy or alter all, or part, of a resource;
- that the proposed installation of a new roof will not isolate the resource from its historical or architectural surroundings, or would not introduce visual, audible, vibratory or polluting elements that are out of character with the resource and its setting, or that adversely affect the physical integrity of the resource;
- that the proposed new roof shows compatibility of the building materials with the aesthetic and structural appearance of the resource including, but not limited to, the consideration of texture, style, color or the components, and the combination of elements, such as brick, stone, concrete, shingle, wood or stucco;

## Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 6 of 33

11/5/2008

- that the design of the proposed roof and material specified shows compatibility to the significant characteristics of the resource including, but not limited to, a consideration of a harmony of materials, details, height, mass, proportion, rhythm, scale, setback, shape, street accessories and workmanship;
- that the proposal will preserve the original shape, line, pitch and overhang of the historic roof, as well as architectural features and details and any distinctive roof details;
- that this action is consistent with the provisions of *4250.4D(3)(4)(5) and (6) and 4250.4L(2) of the HP Historic Preservation Ordinance and Subchapter 2.7 of the Preservation Guidelines and Standards*; and
- that based upon the evidence presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, the action requested is in compliance, and the proposed material change in appearance would not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical or architectural significance and value of the historic property and district according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Ayes: Collier, Daniel, Holcombe, Galbraith, Taylor, Nelson, Zimmer, Jones.

Nays: None.

Absent: Tague.

### 6. CASES FOR INDIVIDUAL CONSIDERATION

- 6A. HPCA-08-143 at 927 NW 20th St. (Mesta Park), Ward 6. Consideration and possible action on the application of Kristin and Christopher Liles for a Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) remove existing front door, 2.) install new front door, Options A and/or B, and 3.) install storm door at front entry.

Kristin and Christopher Liles were present for comment.

The Mesta Park Preservation Review Committee submitted written comments to staff prior to the meeting.

APPROVED. Motion: Holcombe / Zimmer to move **approval of items to 1.) remove existing front door, 2.) install new front door, Option B, and 3.) install storm door at front entry** that, based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-08-143 staff report and during the public hearing, the Commission finds:

- that the existing door is not original to the property and its removal will not adversely affect the historic character of the property or district;
- that the existing sidelites will be preserved and protected;
- that the existing door opening will not be enlarged or diminished;

## Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 7 of 33

11/5/2008

- that the existing frame and trim work will be preserved and protected;
- that the design of Option B of the replacement door reflects the style and period of the building;
- that storm door frame will be painted to match the building or trim;
- that the storm door will have full glazed panel (clear glass) to maximize the view of the door, while not damaging or obscuring the door and frame;
- that this action is consistent with the provisions of *4250.4D(3)(4)(5) and (6) and 4250.4L(2) of the HP Historic Preservation Ordinance and Subchapter 2.9 of the Preservation Guidelines and Standards*; and
- that based upon the evidence presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, the action requested is in compliance, and the proposed material change in appearance would not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical or architectural significance and value of the historic property and district according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Ayes: Collier, Holcombe, Galbraith, Taylor, Nelson, Zimmer, Jones.

Nays: None.

Absent: Tague. Daniel.

- 6B. HPCA-08-120 at 912 NW 16th St. (Mesta Park), Ward 6. Consideration and possible action on the application of Don E. Steel for a Certificate of Appropriateness to 1a.) remove existing overhead garage door at north elevation, 1b.) replace the existing overhead garage door with solid wood paneled overhead door as illustrated, 2a.) remove existing windows and door and cut additional opening in east façade of existing garage, 2b.) install two sets of painted exterior operable solid wood french doors with clear glass, 3a.) remove existing sliding door at north façade of garage, 3b.) install new sliding door at north façade of garage, and 4.) install new railing at porch.

Mr. Steel was not present for comment.

The Mesta Park Preservation Review Committee submitted written comments to staff prior to the meeting.

APPROVED. Motion: Holcombe / Nelson to move **approval of all items** that, based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-08-120 staff report and during the public hearing, the Commission finds:

- that the proposed work at the garage would not destroy or alter all, or part of a resource;
- that the building materials of the proposed work are compatible with the aesthetic and structural appearance of the resource;

## Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 8 of 33

11/5/2008

- that the proposed work is consistent with the historic character of the property and district in consideration of details, mass, proportion, rhythm and shape as required by the Ordinance;
- that the proposed overhead, sliding garage doors, and french doors are to be solid wood;
- that the proposed work at the east façade of the garage is not visible from the street;
- that the proposed french doors would be consistent with the ratio of openings to wall space in the district and would contain clear glass in true divided lites;
- that the proposed painted wood handrail section will replace (in-kind) a missing painted wood handrail section at the front porch;
- that this action is consistent with the provisions of *4250.4D(3)(4)(5)and(6) and 4250.4L(2)of the HP Historic Preservation Ordinance and Subchapters 2.2, 2.5, and 2.9 of the Preservation Guidelines and Standards*;and
- that based upon the evidence presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, the action requested is in compliance, and the proposed material change in appearance would not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical or architectural significance and value of the historic property and district according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007

Ayes: Collier, Holcombe, Galbraith, Taylor, Nelson, Zimmer, Jones.

Nays: None.

Absent: Tague, Daniel.

- 6C. HPCA-08-142 at 931 NW 19th St. (Mesta Park), Ward 6. Consideration and possible action on the application of Mark Reeser by Mike Spoonemore for a Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) construct a new addition to rear of house, 2.) construct a new landing and steps from new addition to grade.

Mr. Spoonemore was present for comment.

Raina Pelofsky, Mesta Park Preservation Review Committee, appeared.

The Mesta Park Preservation Review Committee submitted written comments to staff prior to the meeting.

**APPROVED with CONDITION.** Motion: Holcombe / Nelson to move **approval with condition of all items** that, based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-08-142 staff report and during the public hearing, the Commission finds:

- that the proposal will not destroy or alter all, or part, of a resource;

## Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 9 of 33

11/5/2008

- that the proposed work will not introduce visual elements that are out of character with the resource and its setting, or that will adversely affect the physical integrity of the resource;
- that the building materials proposed and the design are compatible with the aesthetic and structural appearance and the significant characteristics of the resource;
- that the one-story form to which this new addition will attach is not original to the house and the partial demolition will not adversely affect the historic character of the property or district;
- that the proposed addition is compatible in size, texture, color, or design proportion and detail to the adjacent residential buildings and streetscapes and is appropriate to the architectural style of the existing building;
- that the proposed work is designed so that it is clear that it is an addition and not part of the original structure;
- that the connection between the new addition and original structure is clearly discernable;
- that the proposed work reflects the use of different but compatible materials or different (simplified) detailing also appropriate to differentiate new from old;
- that the new addition will reflect and respect the massing, roof shape, bay spacing, cornice lines and building materials of the primary structure;
- that the materials of the new addition are typical of common building materials in the district, or typical of structures of this type, age and location;
- that the proposed stem wall brick facing will reflect the bonding patterns, sizes and color found in historic residential buildings in the historic district, or typical of structures of this type, age and location;
- that the design of the proposed windows will complement the proportion, shape, pattern, size, details and profile of the windows in the historic house;
- that the proposed windows will be wood casement windows with true divided lites with clear glass;
- that the roofing material of the proposed addition will be composition shingles;
- that this action is consistent with the provisions of 4250.4D(3), (4), (5), and (6), 4250.4H, and 4250.4L(2) of the *HP Historic Preservation Ordinance and Subchapters 3.2, 3.5 of the Preservation Guidelines and Standards*; and
- that based upon the evidence presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, the action requested is in compliance, and the proposed material change in appearance would not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical or architectural significance and value of the historic property and district according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

**The condition of approval is that casement windows will be used as identified on page 14 of 32 of the staff report.**

## Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 10 of 33

11/5/2008

Ayes: Collier, Daniel, Holcombe, Galbraith, Taylor, Nelson, Zimmer, Jones.

Nays: None.

Absent: Tague.

- 6D. HPCA-08-154 at 525 NW 17th St. (Mesta Park), Ward 6. Consideration and possible action on the application of Kimberly Long for a Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) remove two layers of composition and one layer of wood shingles and 2.) install new composition shingles.

The Mesta Park Preservation Review Committee submitted written comments to staff prior to the meeting.

**Approved** on Consent Docket.

- 6E. HPCA-08-077 at 525 NW 17th St. (Mesta Park), Ward 6. Consideration and possible action on the application of Kimberly Long for a Certificate of Appropriateness to 4.) remove back porch enclosure and steps.

The Mesta Park Preservation Review Committee submitted written comments to staff prior to the meeting.

**Approved** on Consent Docket.

- 6F. HPCA-08-145 at 724 NW 18th St. (Mesta Park), Ward 6. Consideration and possible action on the application of Paul Wilkes, for Stephen M. and Deborah E. Wilkes by Matt Parsons for a Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) remove iron columns and railings, and 2.) add columns and railings.

**Continued** on Continuance Docket.

- 6G. HPCA-08-131 at 2604 N Shartel Ave. (Paseo), Ward 2. Consideration and possible action on the application of Mike Assef Living Trust for a Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) replace driveway and 2.) add parking area.

Mr. Assef was present for comment.

APPROVED. Motion: Holcombe / Zimmer to move **approval of all items** that, based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-08-131 staff report and during the public hearing, the Commission finds:

- that the proposed changes are consistent with the NC Neighborhood Conservation zoning applicable to this property;
- that the proposed parking area is forward of the building at 2608 N Shartel

## Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 11 of 33

11/5/2008

- Ave; however, that building is located at the back of the property;
- that the proposed parking area does not extend into the area forward of the main building line of other properties on the blockface;
- that the proposed paving material of brushed concrete, tinted gray, is consistent with the guidelines;
- that this action is consistent with the provisions of *4250.4D(3)(4)(5) and (6) and 4250.4H and 4250.J of the HP Historic Preservation Ordinance and Subchapter 1.3 of the Preservation Guidelines and Standards*; and
- that based upon the evidence presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, the action requested is in compliance, and the proposed material changes in appearance would not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical or architectural significance and value of the historic property and district according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Ayes: Collier, Daniel, Holcombe, Galbraith, Taylor, Nelson, Zimmer, Jones.

Nays: None.

Absent: Tague.

- 6H. HPCA-08-025 at 615 NW 27th St. (Paseo), Ward 2. Consideration and possible action on the application of Scot Sidwell and Lori Downs for a Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) remove plywood from garage door opening, and 2.) install two garage doors.

Scot Sidwell and Lori Downs were not present for comment.

DENIED. Motion: Daniel / Galbraith to move **denial with prejudice of all items** that, based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-08-025, staff report and during the public hearing, the Commission finds:

- that the proposed vinyl door is contrary to the Guidelines;
- that this action is consistent with the provisions of *4250.4 D(5) and (6) and 4250.4 J of the Historic Preservation Ordinance and Subchapter 4.1 of the Preservation Guidelines and Standards*;
- that, based upon the evidence presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, the action requested is not in compliance, and the proposed material change in appearance would have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical or architectural significance and value of the historic property and district according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Ayes: Collier, Daniel, Holcombe, Galbraith, Taylor, Nelson, Zimmer, Jones.

## Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 12 of 33

11/5/2008

Nays: None.

Absent: Tague.

- 6I. HPCA-08-124 at 812 NW 25th St. (Paseo), Ward 2. Consideration and possible action on the application of Billy Gray for Restoration Properties by A. J. Gray for a Certificate of Appropriateness to 5.) construct wood deck.

A. J. Gray was not present for comment.

APPROVED. Motion: Taylor / Nelson to move **approval of all items** that, based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-08-124 staff report and during the public hearing, the Commission finds:

- that the back steps to be removed are not historic;
- that the proposed deck is constructed of wood;
- that the proposed deck is not attached to the house;
- that the proposed deck does not substantially reduce the proportion of built area to open space;
- that this action is consistent with the provisions of *4250.4 D(3)(5) and (6) of the HP Historic Preservation Ordinance and Subchapter 1.5 of the Preservation Guidelines and Standards*; and
- that based upon the evidence presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, the action requested is in compliance, and the proposed material change in appearance would not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical or architectural significance and value of the historic property and district according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Ayes: Collier, Daniel, Holcombe, Taylor, Nelson, Zimmer, Jones.

Nays: Galbraith.

Absent: Tague.

- 6J. HPCA-08-112 at 2705 N Walker Ave. (Paseo), Ward 2. Consideration and possible action on the application of OKC Housing Services Redevelopment Corporation dba Positively Paseo for a Certificate of Appropriateness to construct a single-family dwelling, with 1.) multi-gable composition roof, 2.) smooth finish HardiPlank horizontal lap siding, 3.) wood rafter tails, soffits, cornerboards and trim, 4.) stucco foundation, stucco partial height wall at porch and stucco/wood columns with cast stone trim, 5.) wood rails, 6.) vinyl clad, insulated, 1/1 wood windows with clear glass, 7.) wood doors with clear glass, 8.) light fixtures and 9.) medium grey brushed-concrete sidewalks and driveway.

## Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 13 of 33

11/5/2008

OKC Housing Services Redevelopment Corporation dba Positively Paseo was not present for comment.

APPROVED. Motion: Daniel / Zimmer to move **approval of all items** that, based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-08-112 staff report and during the public hearing, the Commission finds:

- that item 4.) project description was revised at the meeting identifying project items as concrete foundation, brick partial height wall at porch and brick/wood columns with cast stone trim;
- that the proposed construction of this infill residence is compatible in size, scale, proportion, spacing, texture, setbacks, height, materials, color, and detail to adjacent and nearby buildings and streetscapes;
- that the design of this new construction is compatible with historic styles within the district yet does not imitate them;
- that the use of smooth-finish cementitious siding is appropriate for this new construction;
- that the proposed driveway is of brush-finished concrete in medium grey tones;
- that this action is consistent with the provisions of *4250.4 D(3)(4)(5) and (6) of the Historic Preservation Ordinance and Subchapters 1.3, 3.1, and 3.5 of the Preservation Guidelines and Standards*; and
- that based upon the evidence that has been presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, that although the action requested cannot be approved as previously stated, that in recognition of the applicant's willingness to accept the condition of approval, that the amended action requested is in compliance, and the proposed material change in appearance would not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historic or architectural significance and value of the historic property and/or district according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Ayes: Collier, Daniel, Holcombe, Galbraith, Taylor, Nelson, Zimmer, Jones.

Nays: None.

Absent: Tague.

- 6K. HPCA-08-141 at 2920, 2924, 2928A and 2928B Paseo. (Paseo), Ward 2. Consideration and possible action on the application of Paseo Village by John Belt for a Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) on 2928A Paseo, 1a.) replace west and south façade wall material, and add parapet on the west side - remove pressed-wood boards; add a level-top parapet above the roofline; edges and corners have smooth, stained 4-inch x 4-inch wood; walls have rough wood covered with genuine stucco, 1b.) change windows - on the west side add two, single-pane units with no dividers;

## Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 14 of 33

11/5/2008

the panes will be set-in 1 inch to 2 inches from the face of the frames; the frames are of 1-inch x 4-inch wood, smooth and stained, 1c.) install one wood and glass door - single large pane, on the west side, 1d.) re-cover the existing west side garage door - as constructed, rough wood simulating a side-hinged door, 1e.) add porch on the west side - round columns of wood hand-scraped, smooth, and stained; corbels as shown of smooth, stained wood; single railing 42-inch tall of smooth stained wood; canopy with metal roof, as constructed; ceiling underside as constructed plus stained, 1f.) add door and steps and canopy on the east side - door flush wood or metal; canopy with metal roof; 2.) on 2928B Paseo, 2a.) add windows - on the west side add two, single-pane units with no dividers; the panes will be set-in 1 inch to 2 inches from the face of the frames, frames of 1-inch x 4-inch wood, 2b.) install wood and glass door - single large pane, on the west side, 2c.) add cover at west side - canopy with metal roof, 2d.) install a roofless utility enclosure next to 2920 Paseo - match the existing pressed-wood siding on 2928B, with doorway of matching material;3.) on 2920 Paseo, 3a.) install wood and glass door on the north side - single large pane, 3b.) install deck behind 2920 and 2924 Paseo - height above ground to be at the floor level of 2920, where it meets the building edges (no railings), 3c.) install filler panel between the back corners of 2920 and 2924 Paseo - stuccoed wood;4.) other property features 4a.) install walkways of wood, including a bridge over water feature, as constructed, 4b.) enhance landscaping - rock-lined waterway, large stones crossing, other vegetation, 4c.) install platform - on north side, as constructed, 4d.) remove parking lot fence at northwest corner - add 2-foot to 3-foot high shrubbery, and 4e.) add rail fence along north side - as constructed, with the option to use smooth, stained wood.

John Belt was present for comment.

DENIED. Motion: Taylor / Zimmer to move **denial without prejudice of all items** that, based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-08-141 staff report and during the public hearing, the Commission finds:

- that the proposed work is not historically appropriate;
- that the proposed work is not consistent with the spirit and intent of the guidelines;
- that this action is consistent with the provisions of §4250.4 D (3)(4)(5) and (6), §4250.4 H, §4250.4 J, and §4250.4 L(2) of the *Historic Preservation Ordinance*; §7300.8 B, §7300.8 E, and §7300.8 F of the *Paseo NC Zoning Ordinance*; and *Subchapters 1.6, 1.9, 2.2, 2.4, 2.5, 2.6, 2.9, 2.10, 3.2, 3.4, and 3.5 of the Preservation Guidelines and Standards*, and
- that, based upon the evidence presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, the action requested is **not in compliance**, and the proposed material change in appearance would have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical or architectural significance and value of the historic property and district according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for

## Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 15 of 33

11/5/2008

Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Ayes: Collier, Daniel, Holcombe, Galbraith, Taylor, Nelson, Zimmer, Jones.

Nays: None.

Absent: Tague.

- 6L. HPCA-08-140 at 424 NW 30th St. (Jefferson Park), Ward 2. Consideration and possible action on the application of John and Jeniffer Bullard for a Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) enclose exterior basement door and stairwell, including 1a.) remove existing wood panel siding, 1b.) install new lap siding to exterior, 1c.) install three-tab composition roofing, 1d.) install new solid wood pedestrian door, 2.) remove existing upper level deck from one-story addition at rear of house, 3.) remove and replace existing siding from rear one-story addition, 4.) remove existing deck, stairs, and railing at lower level, and 5.) install french doors on south façade of rear addition.

**Withdrawn** by applicant on November 5, 2008.

- 6M. HPCA-08-144 at 2919 N Robinson Ave. (Jefferson Park), Ward 2. Consideration and possible action on the application of Laurie Claus by Kenneth Fitzsimmons of TASK Design, Inc. for a Certificate of Appropriateness to 1c.) install new window at north rear façade, 2a.) remove existing aluminum storm door and windows on north, south, and west side of existing porch attached to rear of house, 2b.) install new painted solid core wood doors in center of west façade of porch, 2c.) infill and restore or replace in kind original lap siding at south, north, and west facades of porch 2d.) remove existing brick piers at rear porch 2e.) construct new concrete foundation for porch, and 3a.) remove existing concrete steps from porch to grade at west elevation, 3b.) construct new concrete landing and steps from porch to grade at west elevation.

Kenneth Fitzsimmons was present for comment.

APPROVED with Condition. Motion: Holcombe / Galbraith to move **approval with condition of all items** that, based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-08-144 staff report and during the public hearing, the Commission finds:

- that the proposed renovations will not destroy or alter the historic resource;
- that the proposed renovations display compatibility of the building materials with the aesthetic and structural appearance of the resource including, but not limited to, the consideration of texture, style, color or the components, and the combination of elements, such as brick, stone, concrete, shingle, wood or stucco;

## Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 16 of 33

11/5/2008

- that the proposal shows compatibility of the proposed design to the significant characteristics of the resource including, but not limited to, a consideration of a harmony of materials, details, height, mass, proportion, rhythm, scale, setback, shape, street accessories and workmanship;
- that the proposed doors will be solid core wood with clear glass;
- that the windows of this proposal that will be replaced or removed were not historic in nature and therefore, the demolition will not adversely affect the historic character of the property or district;
- that the new window proposed to be installed will be a one-over-one window with clear glass and single pane;
- that the foundation to be removed and replaced was severely deteriorated;
- that the existing siding to be removed is non-historic and original lap-siding will be repaired and repainted or replaced in-kind;
- that this action is consistent with the provisions of *4250.4D(3),(5) and (6) and 4250.4L(2) of the HP Historic Preservation Ordinance and Subchapter 2.1, 2.4, 2.5, 2.10 of the Preservation Guidelines and Standards*; and
- that based upon the evidence presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, the action requested is in compliance, and the proposed material change in appearance would not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical or architectural significance and value of the historic property and district according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

**The condition of approval is that item 1c.) install new window at north rear façade, will be a single pane, clear glass one-over-one wood window.**

Ayes: Collier, Daniel, Holcombe, Galbraith, Taylor, Nelson, Zimmer, Jones.

Nays: None.

Absent: Tague.

- 6N. HPCA-08-049 at 3015 N Harvey Pkwy. (Jefferson Park), Ward 2. Consideration and possible action on the application of Greta Stromberg for a Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) remove existing aluminum windows and replace with architectural series Pella windows to match existing windows and to 2.) remove original steel casement windows and replace with architectural series Pella windows to match existing windows as closely as possible.

Greta Stromberg was not present for comment.

DENIED. Motion: Holcombe / Jones to move denial without prejudice of all items that, based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-08-049, staff report and during the public hearing, the Commission finds:

## Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 17 of 33

11/5/2008

- that windows are character defining features;
- that the method of installation and setting depth of new windows significantly alters the character of the building;
- that proposed windows do not comply with Guidelines in Subchapter 2.5 Replacement Windows;
- that this action is consistent with the provisions of *4250.4D(3)(4)(5) and (6), 4250.4E(4), 4250.4H, and 4250.4L(2) of the Historic Preservation Ordinance and Subchapters 2.1 and 2.5 of the Preservation Guidelines and Standards;* and
- that based upon the evidence presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, the action requested is not in compliance, and the proposed material change in appearance would have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical or architectural significance and value of the historic property and district according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Ayes: Collier, Daniel, Holcombe, Galbraith, Taylor, Nelson, Zimmer, Jones.

Nays: None.

Absent: Tague.

- 6O. HPCA-08-148 at 124 NW 26th St. (Jefferson Park), Ward 7. Consideration and possible action on the application of Carmen Dickerson for a Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) demolish garage.

**Approved** on Consent Docket.

- 6P. HPCA-08-155 at 222 NW 24th St. (Jefferson Park), Ward 2. Consideration and possible action on the application of Ricky D. Glass by Katherine Reynolds for a Certificate of Appropriateness to 2.) install storm door.

**Approved** on Consent Docket.

- 6Q. HPCA-08-161 at 2515-19 N Robinson Ave. (Jefferson Park), Ward 2. Consideration and possible action on the application of David Silver - Mor-Jen Properties LLC for a Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) remove tile roof on the primary building and 3.) install composition shingle roof for the primary building.

David Silver was present for comment.

The Jefferson Park Preservation Review Committee submitted written comments to staff prior to the meeting.

## Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 18 of 33

11/5/2008

DENIED. Motion: Daniel / Galbraith to move **denial with prejudice of all items** that, based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-08-161, staff report and during the public hearing, the Commission finds:

- that that new roof materials should be as close in appearance, style and composition to the original materials as possible;
- that the proposed roof materials are not close in appearance, style or composition to the original materials;
- that the existing tile roof retains its historic integrity;
- that where large-scale replacement of roof materials other than asphalt shingles is required, the historic fabric (existing tile roof) should be salvaged, and installed, if possible, on prominent areas of the house, facing the public right-of-way and the use of new, appropriate materials should be focused on roof areas that are unobtrusive, preferably rear elevation locations;
- that this action is consistent with the provisions of *4250.4D(3)(4)(5) and (6), 4250.4E(4), 4250.4J and 4250.4L(2) of the Historic Preservation Ordinance and Subchapter 2.7 of the Preservation Guidelines and Standards*; and
- that based upon the evidence presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, the action requested is not in compliance, and the proposed material change in appearance would have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical or architectural significance and value of the historic property and district according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Ayes: Collier, Daniel, Holcombe, Galbraith, Taylor, Nelson, Zimmer, Jones.

Nays: None.

Absent: Tague.

- 6R. HPCA-08-125 at 517 NW 37th St. (Crown Heights), Ward 2. Consideration and possible action on the application of Shaun Parrish by Sam Moore for a Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) remove previously existing windows, which include 1a.) three sets of steel casement windows, 1b.) five aluminum windows, 1c.) two wood windows in front dormers, 1d.) one wood window on east side, 2.) enlarge one window opening on the east side to accommodate french doors, 3.) remove existing vinyl windows, 4.) install wood windows where wood windows previously existed, 5.) install wood windows where steel casement windows previously existed, 6.) install wood windows where aluminum windows previously existed, 7.) remove existing metal clad french doors from enlarged window area, and 8.) install wood french doors.

Sam Moore was present for comment.

## Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 19 of 33

11/5/2008

The Crown Heights Preservation Review Committee submitted written comments to staff prior to the meeting.

APPROVED. Motion: Taylor / Holcombe to move **approval of item 1b.) removal of five aluminum windows** that, based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-08-125, staff report and during the public hearing, the Commission finds:

- that replacement of non-historic incompatible windows with windows that are more historically appropriate, (appropriate materials and lite configuration) is encouraged;
- that this action is consistent with the provisions of *4250.4D(3)(4)(5) and (6) and 4250.4L(2) of the Historic Preservation Ordinance and Subchapters 2.5 of the Preservation Guidelines and Standards;*
- that based upon the evidence presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, the action requested is in compliance, and the proposed material change in appearance will not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical or architectural significance and value of the historic property and district according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Ayes: Collier, Holcombe, Galbraith, Taylor, Nelson, Zimmer, Jones.

Nays: None.

Absent: Tague, Daniel.

APPROVED. Motion: Taylor / Galbraith to move **approval of item to 3.) remove existing vinyl windows** that, based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-08-125, staff report and during the public hearing, the Commission finds:

- that replacement of non-historic incompatible windows with windows that are more historically appropriate, (appropriate materials and lite configuration) is encouraged;
- that this action is consistent with the provisions of *4250.4D(3)(4)(5) and (6) and 4250.4L(2) of the Historic Preservation Ordinance and Subchapters 2.5 of the Preservation Guidelines and Standards;*
- that based upon the evidence presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, the action requested is in compliance, and the proposed material change in appearance will not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical or architectural significance and value of the historic property and district according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

## Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 20 of 33

11/5/2008

Ayes: Collier, Holcombe, Galbraith, Taylor, Nelson, Zimmer, Jones.

Nays: None.

Absent: Tague, Daniel.

APPROVED. Motion: Taylor / Galbraith to move **approval of item to 4.) install wood windows where wood windows previously existed** that, based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-08-125, staff report and during the public hearing, the Commission finds:

- that when window replacement is necessary due to deterioration beyond repair replacement should be in-kind;
- that replacement within the historic opening is appropriate;
- that replacement with like materials and configurations to the original is appropriate;
- that clear glass must be used in all windows;
- that true divided lite is required where divided lites are installed;
- that thermal pane windows are acceptable only as replacement windows when the historic windows in a building have been previously removed;
- that this action is consistent with the provisions of *4250.4D(3)(4)(5) and (6) of the Historic Preservation Ordinance and Subchapters 2.1 and 2.5 of the Preservation Guidelines and Standards*;
- that based upon the evidence presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, the action requested is in compliance, and the proposed material change in appearance will not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical or architectural significance and value of the historic property and district according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Ayes: Collier, Holcombe, Galbraith, Taylor, Nelson, Zimmer, Jones.

Nays: None.

Absent: Tague, Daniel.

DENIED. Motion: Taylor / Zimmer to move **denial with prejudice of item to 5.) install wood windows where steel casement windows previously existed** that, based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-08-125, staff report and during the public hearing, the Commission finds:

- that material, configuration, proportion, shape, pattern, details or profile of proposed windows do not match that of the original windows;
- that if original steel casement windows are deteriorated beyond repair and require replacement, they must be replaced with steel casement windows that match in proportion shape, location, pattern, size, materials, details and

## Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 21 of 33

11/5/2008

- profile;
- that steel casement windows are available on the market;
- that this action is consistent with the provisions of *4250.4D(3)(4)(5) and (6) of the Historic Preservation Ordinance and Subchapters 2.1 and 2.5 of the Preservation Guidelines and Standards*; and
- that based upon the evidence presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, the action requested is not in compliance, and the proposed material change in appearance will have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical or architectural significance and value of the historic property and district according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Ayes: Collier, Holcombe, Galbraith, Taylor, Nelson, Zimmer, Jones.

Nays: None.

Absent: Tague, Daniel.

APPROVED. Motion: Taylor / Holcombe to move **approval of item 6.) install wood windows where aluminum windows previously existed** that, based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-08-125, staff report and during the public hearing, the Commission finds:

- that replacement of non-historic incompatible windows with windows that are more historically appropriate, (appropriate materials and lite configuration) is encouraged;
- that replacement within the historic opening is appropriate;
- that true divided lite is required where divided lites are installed;
- that thermal pane windows are acceptable only as replacement windows when the historic windows in a building have been previously removed;
- that this action is consistent with the provisions of *4250.4D(3)(4)(5) and (6) of the Historic Preservation Ordinance and Subchapters 2.5 of the Preservation Guidelines and Standards*;
- that based upon the evidence presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, the action requested is in compliance, and the proposed material change in appearance will not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical or architectural significance and value of the historic property and district according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Ayes: Collier, Holcombe, Galbraith, Taylor, Nelson, Zimmer, Jones.

Nays: None.

Absent: Tague, Daniel.

## Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 22 of 33

11/5/2008

APPROVED with Condition. Motion: Taylor / Galbraith to move **conditional approval of items 7.) remove existing metal clad french doors from enlarged window area, and 8.) install wood french doors (this includes item 2.) enlarge one window opening on the east side to accommodate french doors** that, based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-08-125, staff report and during the public hearing, the Commission finds:

- that this item will was changed from installation of wood doors to installation of wood window at the original size;
- that removal of non-historic fabric is appropriate;
- that design of the replacement window must be based on historic documentation if possible and must reflect the style and period of the building;
- that the door location is inappropriate;
- that if window openings have been altered, it is appropriate to return them to the original size;
- that material, configuration, proportion, shape, pattern, details or profile of proposed windows should match that of the original windows;
- that this action is consistent with the provisions of *4250.4D(3)(4)(5) and (6) and 4250.4L(2) of the Historic Preservation Ordinance and Subchapters 2.1 and 2.4 of the Preservation Guidelines and Standards*;
- that based upon the evidence presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, the action requested is in compliance, and the proposed material change in appearance will not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical or architectural significance and value of the historic property and district according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

**Condition of approval is that the applicant shall submit new dimensioned drawings for staff approval prior to issuance of the Certificate of Appropriateness.**

Ayes: Collier, Holcombe, Galbraith, Taylor, Nelson, Zimmer, Jones.

Nays: None.

Absent: Tague, Daniel.

DENIED. Motion: Taylor / Nelson to move **denial with prejudice of item 1a.) removal of three sets of steel casement windows** that, based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-08-125, staff report and during the public hearing, the Commission finds:

- that insufficient evidence has been provided to verify that windows were deteriorated beyond repair;

## Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 23 of 33

11/5/2008

- that it is necessary to retain and preserve original windows as these are character-defining features;
- that existing original windows must be repaired and retained wherever possible;
- that when window replacement is necessary due to deterioration beyond repair replacement should be in-kind;
- that this action is consistent with the provisions of *4250.4D(3)(4)(5) and (6), 4250.4H and 4250.4L(2) of the Historic Preservation Ordinance and Subchapters 2.1 and 2.5 of the Preservation Guidelines and Standards;*
- that based upon the evidence presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, the action requested is not in compliance, and the proposed material change in appearance will have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical or architectural significance and value of the historic property and district according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Ayes: Collier, Holcombe, Galbraith, Taylor, Nelson, Zimmer, Jones.

Nays: None.

Absent: Tague, Daniel.

APPROVED. Motion: Taylor / Zimmer to move approval of items 1c.) two wood windows in front dormers, and 1d.) one wood window on east side that, based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-08-125, staff report and during the public hearing, the Commission finds:

- that a unique circumstance exists since the original wood windows were removed and replaced with vinyl windows and the vinyl windows will be removed and replaced with wood windows;
- the action is historically appropriate and is consistent with the spirit and intent of the Preservation Guidelines;
- that the proposed work will not adversely affect the historic character of the property or the integrity of the historic district;
- that when window replacement is necessary due to deterioration beyond repair replacement should be in-kind;
- that this action is consistent with the provisions of *4250.4D(3)(4)(5) and (6), 4250.4H and 4250.4L(2) of the Historic Preservation Ordinance and Subchapters 2.1 and 2.5 of the Preservation Guidelines and Standards;*and
- that based upon the evidence presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, the action requested is not in compliance, but because of the unique circumstances the proposed material change in appearance would not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical or architectural significance and value of the historic property and

**Historic Preservation Commission**

Minutes - Page 24 of 33

11/5/2008

district according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Ayes: Collier, Holcombe, Galbraith, Taylor, Nelson, Zimmer, Jones.

Nays: None.

Absent: Tague, Daniel

- 6S. HPCA-08-087 at 704 NW 42nd St. (Crown Heights), Ward 2. Consideration and possible action on the application of Monte S. Turrentine for a Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) replace all windows.

Monte Turrentine was present for comment.

The Crown Heights Preservation Review Committee submitted written comments to staff prior to the meeting.

DENIED. Motion: Holcombe / Galbraith to move **denial with prejudice all items except window B** that, based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-08-087, staff report and during the public hearing, the Commission finds:

- that the submitted evidence concerning the deteriorated condition of the windows to be inadequate to justify their removal;
- that the guidelines provide for replacement in-kind for units deteriorated beyond repair;
- that this action is consistent with the provisions of *4250.4 D(3)(4)(5) and (6) and 4250.4 L(2) of the Historic Preservation Ordinance and Subchapter 2.5 of the Preservation Guidelines and Standards*; and
- that based upon the evidence presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, the action requested is not in compliance, and the proposed material change in appearance would have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical or architectural significance and value of the historic property and district according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Ayes: Collier, Holcombe, Galbraith, Taylor, Nelson, Zimmer, Jones.

Nays: None.

Absent: Tague, Daniel.

APPROVED. Motion: Holcombe / Galbraith to move **approval of window B** that, based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-08-087 staff report and during the public hearing, the Commission finds:

## Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 25 of 33

11/5/2008

- that this window is on an infilled porch, and is not historic;
- that the new window is of a pattern similar to the old;
- that this action is consistent with the provisions of *4250.4 D(3)(4)(5) and (6) and 4250.4 L(2) of the Historic Preservation Ordinance and Subchapter 2.5 of the Preservation Guidelines and Standards*; and
- that based upon the evidence presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, the action requested is in compliance, and the proposed material change in appearance would not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical or architectural significance and value of the historic property and district according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Ayes: Collier, Holcombe, Galbraith, Taylor, Nelson, Zimmer, Jones.

Nays: None.

Absent: Tague, Daniel.

- 6T. HPCA-08-048 at 917 NW 40th St. (Crown Heights), Ward 2. Consideration and possible action on the application of Stanley Crawford for a Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) paint the brick.

Stanley Crawford was not present for comment.

The Crown Heights Preservation Review Committee submitted written comments to staff prior to the meeting.

DENIED. Motion: Holcombe / Nelson to move **denial with prejudice** that, based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-08-048, staff report and during the public hearing, the Commission finds:

- that the existing southeast porch enclosure is of brick that appears the same as the original brick from a distance, and that it has been in place for many years;
- that this action is consistent with the provisions of *4250.4 D(3)(4)(5) and (6) and 4250.4 J of the Historic Preservation Ordinance and Subchapters 2.10 and 4.1 of the Preservation Guidelines and Standards*; and
- that for the great majority of the brick, based upon the evidence presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, the action requested is not in compliance, and the proposed material change in appearance would have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical or architectural significance and value of the historic property and district according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

**Historic Preservation Commission**

Minutes - Page 26 of 33

11/5/2008

Ayes: Collier, Holcombe, Galbraith, Taylor, Nelson, Zimmer, Jones.

Nays: None.

Absent: Tague, Daniel.

- 6U. HPCA-08-152 at 1620 NW 38th St. (Putnam Heights), Ward 2. Consideration and possible action on the application of Connie Scothorn for a Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) install concrete sidewalk in front yard and 6.) remove small section of pavement.

Connie Scothorn was not present for comment.

DENIED. Motion: Zimmer / Jones to move **denial with prejudice of item to 1.) install concrete sidewalk in front yard** that, based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-08-152, staff report and during the public hearing, the Commission finds:

- that sidewalks must be located perpendicular to the street, except at individual properties in which historical documentation is presented that demonstrates previous existence of more naturalistic shapes that conformed to the topography of the specific property;
- that this action is consistent with the provisions of *4250.4D(3)(4)(5) and (6) and 4250.4(E)4 of the Historic Preservation Ordinance and Subchapter 1.3 of the Preservation Guidelines and Standards;*
- that based upon the evidence presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, the action requested is **not in compliance**, and the proposed material change in appearance would have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical or architectural significance and value of the historic property and district according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Ayes: Collier, Holcombe, Galbraith, Taylor, Nelson, Zimmer, Jones.

Nays: None.

Absent: Tague, Daniel.

APPROVED. Motion: Zimmer / Jones to move **approval of item 6.) remove small section of pavement** that, based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-08-152 staff report and during the public hearing, the Commission finds:

- that the paving is noncontributing to the historic district and the demolition will not adversely affect the historic character of the property or district;
- that this action is consistent with the provisions of *4250.4D(3)(4)(5) and (6), 4250.4(E)4, and 4250.4L of the Historic Preservation Ordinance;*

## Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 27 of 33

11/5/2008

- that based upon the evidence presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, the action requested is in compliance, and the proposed material change in appearance would not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical or architectural significance and value of the historic property and district according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Ayes: Collier, Holcombe, Galbraith, Taylor, Nelson, Zimmer, Jones.

Nays: None.

Absent: Tague, Daniel.

- 6V. HPCA-08-151 at 1417 NW 38th St. (Putnam Heights), Ward 2. Consideration and possible action on the application of David H. Pasnau for a Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) install garage door.

David H. Pasnau was present for comment.

APPROVED. Motion: Nelson / Zimmer to move **approval** that, based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-08-151 staff report and during the public hearing, the Commission finds:

- that there are unique circumstances that the garage frame will not accommodate two single garage doors;
- that this action is historically appropriate and is consistent with the spirit and intent of the Preservation Guidelines;
- that the proposed work will not adversely affect the historic character of the property or the integrity of the historic district
- that the scale will not adversely affect the appearance of the property from the street;
- that this action is consistent with the provisions of *4250.4D(3)(4)(5)and(6) and 4250.4L(2)of the HP Historic Preservation Ordinance and Subchapter 2.9 of the Preservation Guidelines and Standards;*
- that based upon the evidence presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, the action requested is not in compliance, but because of the unique circumstances the proposed material change in appearance would not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical or architectural significance and value of the historic property and district according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Ayes: Collier, Holcombe, Galbraith, Taylor, Nelson, Zimmer, Jones.

## Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 28 of 33

11/5/2008

Nays: None.

Absent: Tague, Daniel.

- 6W. HPCA-08-044 at 2329 NW 28th St. (Shepherd), Ward 2. Consideration and possible action on the application of Robert Toomey for a Certificate of Appropriateness to 3.) install fence.

Robert Toomey was not present for comment.

The Shepherd Preservation Review Committee submitted written comments to staff prior to the meeting.

APPROVED. Motion: Holcombe / Galbraith to move **approval** that, based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-08-044 staff report and during the public hearing, the Commission finds:

- that unique circumstances require a fence forward of the 50% mark on the house due to adjacent commercial zoning;
- that this action is consistent with the provisions of *4250.4D(5)and(6) and 4250.4L(2) of the HP Historic Preservation Ordinance and Subchapters 2.2, 2.5, and 2.10 of the Preservation Guidelines and Standards*; and
- that based upon the evidence presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, the action requested is in compliance, and the proposed material change in appearance would not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical or architectural significance and value of the historic property and district according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Ayes: Collier, Holcombe, Galbraith, Taylor, Nelson, Zimmer, Jones.

Nays: None.

Absent: Tague, Daniel.

- 6X. HPCA-08-158 at 115 and 117 NW 20th St. (Heritage Hills East), Ward 7. Consideration and possible action on the application of David Wilson Peter Dolese for a Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) demolish shared garage.

**Approved** on Consent Docket.

- 6Y. HPCA-08-150 at 427 NW 21st St. (Heritage Hills), Ward 6. Consideration and possible action on the application of Julia Ehrhardt for a Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) replace roof including 1a.) remove existing composition roofing, 1b.) remove original layer of wood shingles, 1c.) install plywood decking,

## Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 29 of 33

11/5/2008

1d.) install 3-tab fiberglass shingle, and 1e.) change color of roof shingles from white to gray.

**Approved** on Consent Docket.

- 6Z. HPCA-08-160 at 610 NW 14th St. (Heritage Hills), Ward 6. Consideration and possible action on the application of Douglas & Sandy Beall W. by Jeff Jenkins, Architect, LLC for a Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) demolish garage.

Jeff Jenkins, Architect, and Jeff Reynolds of Crown Construction were present for comment.

Staff received the structural engineers report prior the meeting.

CONTINUED. Motion: Zimmer / Galbraith to move **30-day continuance** that, based upon the evidence that has been presented in the application of HPCA-08-160, Staff Report and during the public hearing, that the Commission find that additional information is required from the applicant in order to determine whether the action requested is in compliance with Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Ayes: Collier, Holcombe, Galbraith, Taylor, Nelson, Zimmer, Jones.

Nays: None.

Absent: Tague, Daniel.

- 6AA. HPCA-08-118 at 230 NW 17th St. (Heritage Hills), Ward 6. Consideration and possible action on the application of Mark and Barbara Brockhaus for a Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) construct new porte-cochere supported by brick columns to replace existing porte-cochere supported by steel pipe columns, 3.) install railing over front entry vestibule, 4.) remove shutters on front façade, 5.) install two-story wood trellises on front facade, 6.) remove exiting lattice screen on west side of porch, and 7.) install new cedar lattice screen on west side of porch.

Mark Brockhaus was present for comment.

APPROVED. Motion: Zimmer / Holcombe to move **approval of all items** that, based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-08-118 staff report and during the public hearing, the Commission finds:

- that the proposed work will not destroy or alter all, or part of a resource;
- that, based on the historic photos, the proposed work will not introduce visual elements that are out of character with the resource and its setting, or that

**Historic Preservation Commission**

Minutes - Page 30 of 33

11/5/2008

would adversely affect the physical integrity of the resource that the proposed materials and design are compatible with the aesthetic and structural appearance of the resource and the significant characteristics;

- that the existing porte-cochere and shutters are not original to the structure and the removal will not adversely affect the historic character of the property or district;
- that historic photographic evidence is presented illustrating the original existence of a porte-cochere, entry balustrade, and trellis that is reflected in the proposal;
- that the elements of the proposed work match the original in scale, massing, materials, and details;
- that the proposed installation of the trellises reflects the period photo provided and will be compatible with the historic building in height, proportion, style, materials, detail and color will be appropriate;
- that this action is consistent with the provisions of *4250.4D(3)(4)(5)and(6) and 4250.4L(2)of the HP Historic Preservation Ordinance and Subchapters 2.1, 2.2, and 2.3 of the Preservation Guidelines and Standards;*
- that based upon the evidence presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, the action requested is in compliance, and the proposed material change in appearance would not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical or architectural significance and value of the historic property and district according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Ayes: Collier, Holcombe, Galbraith, Nelson, Zimmer, Jones.

Nays: None.

Absent: Tague, Daniel, Taylor.

- 6BB. HPCA-08-098 at 912 NW 14th St. (Heritage Hills), Ward 6. Consideration and possible action on the application of Patrick & Linn Moore for a Certificate of Appropriateness to 2.) erect an arbor in backyard.

**Continued** on Continuance Docket.

**7. OTHER BUSINESS**

None.

**8. COMMUNICATIONS AND REPORTS**

**A. Comments from Commission Members**

**B. Comments from Municipal Counselor**

**C. Administrative Approvals**

- 8C1. HPCA-08-149** at 130 NW 17th St. (Heritage Hills East), Ward 7. Staff is announcing the Administrative Approval of the item on the application of application of by Todd Riddles for GTH Investment Holdings, LLC for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) screen dumpster with 6 foot stockade fence.
- 8C2. HPCA-08-152** at 1620 NW 38th St. (Putnam Heights), Ward 2. Staff is announcing the Administrative Approval of the item on the application of Connie Scothorn for Certificate of Appropriateness to 4.) installation of a concrete sidewalk in the back yard.
- 8C3. HPCA-08-161** at 2515-19 N Robinson Ave. (Jefferson Park), Ward 2. Staff is announcing the Administrative Approval of the items on the application of David Silver - Mor-Jen Properties LLC for Certificate of Appropriateness to 3.) remove composition roof on the garage and 4.) installation of new composition roof on the garage.
- 8C4. HPCA-08-162** at 536 NW 39th St. (Crown Heights), Ward 2. Staff is announcing the Administrative Approval of the item on the application of Bryan Garrett for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) replace existing driveway.
- 8C5. HPCA-08-155** at 222 NW 24th St. (Jefferson Park), Ward 2. Staff is announcing the Administrative Approval of the items on the application of Ricky D. Glass by Katherine Reynolds for Certificate of Appropriateness to 2.) install storm windows, 3.) remove of excess cyclone fencing at SW corner 4.) install stockade fencing, and 5.) add gate across the driveway.
- 8C6. HPCA-08-156** at 212 NW 24th St. (Jefferson Park), Ward 2. Staff is announcing the Administrative Approval of the items on the application of Ricky D. Glass by Katherine Reynolds for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) install new storm windows, 2.) remove chainlink fencing (SE corner), 3. installation of 6-foot tall dog-eared stockade fence and 4.) install matching gate at driveway.
- 8C7. HPCA-08-157** at 817 NW 19th St. (Mesta Park), Ward 6. Staff is announcing the Administrative Approval of the item on the application of Sammie L. Flippo - Rev. Trust for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) replace chain link fence with 4' stockade fence

## Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 32 of 33

11/5/2008

- 8C8. HPCA-08-120** at 912 NW 16th St. (Mesta Park), Ward 6. Consideration and possible action on application of Don E. Steel for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) replace existing 4-foot tall wooden fence on the east property line with a 6-foot tall wood fence, and 2.) replace existing gutters at rear of house.

### D. Withdrawals

- 8D1. HPCA-08-044** at 2329 NW 28th St. (Shepherd), Ward 2. Staff is announcing the applicant's request on October 10, 2008 to withdraw the item on the application of Robert Toomey for Certificate of Appropriateness to replace windows.
- 8D2. HPCA-08-124** at 812 NW 25th St. (Paseo), Ward 2. Staff is announcing the applicant's request on October 13, 2008 to withdraw the items on the application of Billy Gray for Restoration Properties by A. J. Gray for Certificate of Appropriateness to 3.) remove front porch columns, 4.) construct new wood columns.
- 8D3. HPCA-08-060** at 625 NW 27th St. (Paseo), Ward 2. Staff is announcing the applicant's request on October 28, 2008 to withdraw the item on the application of Gail Irwin for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) replace windows.
- 8D4. HPCA-08-077** at 525 NW 17th St. (Mesta Park), Ward 6. Staff is announcing the applicant's request on October 29, 2008 to withdraw the item on the application of Kimberly Long for Certificate of Appropriateness to 5.) add porch railing.

### E. Board of Adjustment

- 8E1. HPCA-06-098** at 2916 D Paseo Dr. (Paseo), Ward 6. Staff is announcing the appeal of the Historic Preservation Commissions denial of the application of Paseo Village by John Belt for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) install mural and fountain. **-This appeal has been rescheduled to the November 6, 2008 Board Of Adjustment meeting.**
- 8E2. HPCA-08-133** at 415 NW 22nd St. (Mesta Park), Ward 6. Staff is announcing the appeal of the Historic Preservation Commissions denial of the application of Timothy J. Lyons for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) demolish and replace original brick chimney. **This appeal is scheduled for the December 3, 2008 Board Of Adjustment meeting.**

## 9. CITIZENS TO BE HEARD

**Historic Preservation Commission**

Minutes - Page 33 of 33

11/5/2008

Melba Holt, voiced protest on application HPCA-08-140.

**10. OTHER BUSINESS**

- A.** The next regularly scheduled meeting for the Historic Preservation Commission is Wednesday, December 3, 2008 at 2:00 p.m. at the Municipal Building, City Council Chamber. New applications and information on continued projects are to be submitted to staff by 5:00 p.m., Wednesday, November 12, 2008.
- B.** The next regularly scheduled workshop for the Historic Preservation Commission is Monday, November 10, 2008 at 4:00 p.m. at 420 W. Main Street, Suite 900.

**9. ADJOURNMENT (6:02 p.m.)**

Motion: Holcombe / Galbraith to adjourn the 11/5/2008, meeting of the Historic Preservation Commission.

Ayes: Collier, Holcombe, Galbraith, Taylor, Nelson, Zimmer, Jones.

Nays: None.

Absent: Tague, Daniel.

pjh