

MINUTES
Regular Meeting
HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION
October 01, 2008 - 2:00 p.m.
Municipal Building, City Council Chamber

The meeting of the Oklahoma City Historic Preservation Commission was called to order in the City Council Chamber, 3rd Floor of the Municipal Building, 200 N. Walker Avenue, Oklahoma City, Oklahoma. The meeting convened at 2:04 p.m. Notice of the meeting and agenda were filed with the City Clerk's office and posted on the Council bulletin board 24 hours prior to the meeting.

1. CALL TO ORDER AND ROLL CALL

Members Present: Roland Tague, Chairman
Karen Collier, Vice-Chair
Carolee Galbraith
Jane Holcombe
Karen Nelson
Nedra Jones
Karen Zimmer

Members Absent: Thomas J. Daniel, IV
Marnie Taylor

Staff Present: Susan Miller, Planner IV, Planning Department
John Calhoun, AIA, Planner II, Planning Department
Scottye Montgomery, Planner II, Planning Department
Angela Yetter, Planner I, Planning Department
Paula Hurst, Planning Department
Rita Douglas-Talley, Assistant Municipal Counselor
Russell Claus, Planning Director

2. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

APPROVED. Motion: Galbraith / Zimmer to **approve** the minutes of the September 3, 2008, Historic Preservation Commission meeting.

Ayes: Tague, Collier, Holcombe, Galbraith, Jones, Nelson, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Absent: Daniel, Taylor.

3. CITATION REPORT

Mr. Woods, Compliance Officer, was present for comment.

4. CONTINUANCE REQUESTS

A. Staff request continuance of the following cases:

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 2 of 20

October 1, 2008

6G. [HPCA-08-111](#) at 2701 N Walker Ave. (Paseo), Ward 2. Staff requests a 60-day continuance on application by OKC Housing Svcs. Redev. Corp. dba Positively Paseo for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) construct new garage, 2.) construct new sidewalk with stair from front porch east to street and install handrails, and 10.) replace back porch.

B. Other continuance requests:

6H. [HPCA-08-112](#) at 2705 N Walker Ave. (Paseo), Ward 2. The applicant requests a 30-day continuance on application by OKC Housing Svcs Redev Corp dba Positively Paseo for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) multi-gable composition roof, 2.) smooth finish HardiPlank horizontal lap siding, 3.) wood rafter tails, soffits, cornerboards and trim, 4.) stucco foundation, stucco partial height wall at porch and stucco/wood columns with cast stone trim, 5.) wood rails, 6.) vinyl clad, insulated, 1/1 wood windows with clear glass, 7.) wood doors with clear glass, 8.) light fixtures and 9.) medium grey brushed-concrete sidewalks and driveway.

CONTINUED. Motion: Collier / Galbraith to move approval of continuance requests, based upon the evidence that has been presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, the Commission finds additional information is required from the applicant in order to determine whether the action requested is in compliance with Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Ayes: Tague, Collier, Holcombe, Galbraith, Jones, Nelson, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Absent: Daniel, Taylor.

5. CONSENT DOCKET CASES

None.

6. CASES FOR INDIVIDUAL CONSIDERATION

6A. HPCA-08-123 at 434 NW 18th ST. (Heritage Hills), Ward 6. Consideration and possible action on the application of Richard Grellner by Jerry Dickson for a Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) replace aluminum windows on north and east sides and 3.) replace wood in-fill with brick.

Jerry Dickson was present for comment.

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 3 of 20

October 1, 2008

APPROVED. Motion: Zimmer / Jones to move **approval** that, based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-08-123 staff report and during the public hearing, the Commission finds:

- that the applicant is replacing wood infill with glass doors and side lites in wood frames in lieu of brick infill as presented
- that the proposed doors and side lites at the front façade will be wood frame with clear glass in true divided lites and will be compatible with the original form, style and period of the building;
- that the proposal shows compatibility of the building materials with the aesthetic and structural appearance of the resource including, but not limited to, the consideration of texture, style, color or the components, and the combination of elements, such as brick, stone, concrete, shingle, wood or stucco;
- that the proposal is compatible to the significant characteristics of the resource including, but not limited to, a consideration of a harmony of materials, details, height, mass, proportion, rhythm, scale, setback, shape, street accessories and workmanship;
- that the components to be removed are noncontributing to the historic district and the demolition will not adversely affect the historic character of the property or district;
- that the replacement of non-historic incompatible windows with windows that are more historically appropriate, (appropriate materials and light configuration) is encouraged;
- that the replacement of non-historic incompatible windows with windows that are more historically appropriate is encouraged;
- that the insulated windows are acceptable as replacement windows when the historic windows in a building have been previously removed;
- that the proposed replacement windows will be clear, true divided lites and reflect the style and period of the building;
- that there is no evidence as to the historic condition of the porch and that the porch is not connected to a main porch or balcony and will not detract from the historic details of the porch and house;
- that the infill material will be matching in texture, color and detail;
- that this action is consistent with the provisions of *4250.4D(5)and(6) and 4250.4L(2) of the HP Historic Preservation Ordinance and Subchapters 2.2, 2.5, and 2.10 of the Preservation Guidelines and Standards*; and
- that based upon the evidence presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, the action requested is in compliance, and the proposed material change in appearance would not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical or architectural significance and value of the historic property and district according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 4 of 20

October 1, 2008

Ayes: Tague, Collier, Holcombe, Galbraith, Jones, Nelson, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Absent: Daniel, Taylor.

- 6B. HPCA-08-147 at 1020 NW 14th ST. (Heritage Hills), Ward 6. Consideration and possible action on the application of Clayton Hansen, III for a Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) replace front door, 2.) and create a new opening on west side of garage and install a pedestrian wood door.

Clayton Hansen, III, was present for comment.

Applicant submitted additional information regarding the front door prior to the meeting.

APPROVED. Motion: Collier / Nelson to move **approval of item 1.) replace front door** that, based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-08-147 and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds:

- that the proposed door is solid wood;
- that this action is consistent with the provisions of *4250.4D (5) and (6) and 4250.4L(2) of the Historic Preservation Ordinance and Subchapter 2.4 of the Preservation Guidelines and Standards*; and
- that based upon the evidence presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, the action requested is in compliance, and the proposed material change in appearance would not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical or architectural significance and value of the historic property and district according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007..

Ayes: Tague, Collier, Holcombe, Jones, Nelson, Zimmer.

Nays: Galbraith.

Absent: Daniel, Taylor.

APPROVED. Motion: Collier / Nelson to move **approval of 2.) and create a new opening on west side of garage and install a pedestrian wood door** that, based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-08-147, staff report staff report and during the public hearing, the Commission finds:

- that the door is solid wood with clear glass;
- that the spacing and size of the new door and door opening in the west façade of the existing garage is similar to historic counterparts within the streetscape or district;

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 5 of 20

October 1, 2008

- that this new opening is not visible from the street and is minimally visible from the adjacent property;
- that this action is consistent with the provisions of *4250.4D (5)and(6) and 4250.4L(2)of the HP Historic Preservation Ordinance and Subchapter 2.9 of the Preservation Guidelines and Standards*; and
- that based upon the evidence presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, the action requested is in compliance, and the proposed material change in appearance would not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical or architectural significance and value of the historic property and district according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Ayes: Tague, Collier, Holcombe, Galbraith, Jones, Nelson, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Absent: Daniel, Taylor.

- 6C. HPCA-08-133 at 415 NW 22ND ST. (Mesta Park), Ward 6. Consideration and possible action on the application of Timothy J. Lyons for a Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) demolish and replace original brick chimney, and 2a.) demolish and replace original brick stem walls with concrete block faced with original brick where visible from the street and 2b.) demolish and replace original brick stem walls with concrete block faced with stucco where not visible from the street.

Timothy J. Lyons was present for comment.

Randy Floyd, of Randy Floyd Architects, offered comments.

The Mesta Park Preservation Review Committee submitted written comments to staff prior to the meeting.

Raina Pelofsky, Mesta Park Preservation Review Committee was present for comment.

DENIED. Motion: Holcombe / Galbraith to move **denial without prejudice on item 1.) demolish and replace original brick chimney** that, based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-08-133, staff report and during the public hearing, the Commission finds:

- that the chimney is a historic feature of the house;
- that the size portion, massing and scale are not compatible with the district;
- that missing or severely deteriorated elements may be replaced in-kind (replaced with the same element or material) to closely match the original feature;

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 6 of 20

October 1, 2008

- that the applicant has enlarged the chimney from its original size;
- that the applicant stated that the chimney originally was not a wood burning fireplace;
- that the applicant stated that the replaced chimney has been enlarged so that it can be a wood burning fireplace;
- that this action is not consistent with the provisions of *4250.4D(3)(4)(5)and(6) and 4250.4L(2)of the HP Historic Preservation Ordinance and Subchapter 2.1 of the Preservation Guidelines and Standards*; and
- that based upon the evidence presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, the action requested is not compliance, and the proposed material change in appearance would have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical or architectural significance and value of the historic property and district according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Ayes: Tague, Holcombe, Galbraith, Jones, Nelson, Zimmer.

Nays: Collier.

Absent: Daniel, Taylor.

APPROVED. Motion: Holcombe / Collier to move **approval of item 2a.) demolish and replace original brick stem walls with concrete block faced with original brick where visible from the street** that, based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-08-133 staff report and during the public hearing, the Commission finds:

- that missing or severely deteriorated elements may be replaced in-kind (replaced with the same element or material) to closely match the original feature;
- that this action is consistent with the provisions of *4250.4D(3)(4)(5)and(6) and 4250.4L(2)of the HP Historic Preservation Ordinance and Subchapter 2.1 of the Preservation Guidelines and Standards*; and
- that based upon the evidence presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, the action requested is in compliance, and the proposed material change in appearance would not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical or architectural significance and value of the historic property and district according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Ayes: Tague, Collier, Holcombe, Galbraith, Jones, Nelson, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Absent: Daniel, Taylor.

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 7 of 20

October 1, 2008

APPROVED. Motion: Collier / Galbraith to move **approval of item 2b.) demolish and replace original brick stem walls with concrete block faced with stucco where not visible from the street** that, based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-08-133, staff report and during the public hearing, the Commission finds:

- that missing or severely deteriorated elements may be replaced in-kind (replaced with the same element or material) to closely match the original feature;
- that this action is consistent with the provisions of *4250.4D(3)(4)(5)and(6) and 4250.4L(2)of the HP Historic Preservation Ordinance and Subchapter 2.1 of the Preservation Guidelines and Standards*; and
- that based upon the evidence presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, the action requested is in compliance, and the proposed material change in appearance would not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical or architectural significance and value of the historic property and district according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Ayes: Tague, Collier, Holcombe, Galbraith, Jones, Nelson, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Absent: Daniel, Taylor.

- 6D. HPCA-08-143 at 927 NW 20th ST. (Mesta Park), Ward 6. Consideration and possible action on the application of Kristin and Christopher Liles for a Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) remove existing front door, 2.) install new front door, and 3.) install storm door at front entryThe property owner requests approval to remove the existing front door, which appears to show some evidence of a previous location, and install a new wood door and a storm door.

Christopher Liles was present for comment.

The Mesta Park Preservation Review Committee submitted written comments to staff prior to the meeting.

Raina Pelofsky, Mesta Park Preservation Review Committee was present for comment.

CONTINUED. Motion: Zimmer / Nelson to move **30-day continuance** that, based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-08-143, staff report and during the public hearing, the Commission finds that additional information is required from the applicant in order to determine whether the action requested is in compliance with Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 8 of 20

October 1, 2008

Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Ayes: Tague, Collier, Holcombe, Galbraith, Jones, Nelson, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Absent: Daniel, Taylor.

- 6E. HPCA-08-077 at 525 NW 17th St. (Mesta Park), Ward 6. Consideration and possible action on the application of Kimberly Long for a Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) install deck, 2.) remove one window set, 3.) install french doors, 4.) remove back porch enclosure and steps, and 5.) add porch railing.

Kimberly Long was present and supplied additional information prior to the meeting.

The Mesta Park Preservation Review Committee submitted written comments to staff prior to the meeting.

Raina Pelofsky, Mesta Park Preservation Review Committee was present for comment.

APPROVED. Motion: Collier / Zimmer to move **approval of item 1.) install deck** that, based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-08-077, staff report and during the public hearing, the Commission finds:

- that the proposed alterations are not visible from the street and not at a primary façade of the house;
- that the wood deck is not attached to the historic house;
- that this action is consistent with the provisions of *4250.4D(3)(4)(5)and(6) and 4250.4L(2)of the HP Historic Preservation Ordinance and Subchapter 2.4 of the Preservation Guidelines and Standards*; and
- that based upon the evidence presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, the action requested is in compliance, and the proposed material changes in appearance would not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical or architectural significance and value of the historic property and district according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Ayes: Tague, Collier, Holcombe, Galbraith, Jones, Nelson, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Absent: Daniel, Taylor.

APPROVED. Motion: Holcombe / Galbraith to move **approval of items 2.) remove one window set, 3.) install french doors** that, based upon the evidence

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 9 of 20

October 1, 2008

presented in the application of HPCA-08-077, staff report and during the public hearing, the Commission finds:

- that the proposed alterations are not visible from the street and not at a primary façade of the house;
- that the proposed doors are full-light wood doors with clear glass, cladding, and true divided lite;
- that the proposed doors are located in the width of the original window opening;
- that this action is consistent with the provisions of *4250.4D(3)(4)(5)and(6) and 4250.4L(2)of the HP Historic Preservation Ordinance and Subchapter 2.4 of the Preservation Guidelines and Standards*; and
- that based upon the evidence presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, the action requested is in compliance, and the proposed material changes in appearance would not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical or architectural significance and value of the historic property and district according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Ayes: Tague, Collier, Holcombe, Galbraith, Jones, Nelson, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Absent: Daniel, Taylor.

CONTINUED. Motion: Galbraith / Holcombe to move **30-day continuance on items 4.) remove back porch enclosure and steps, and 5.) add porch railing** that, based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-08-077 and during the public hearing, the Commission finds that additional information is required from the applicant in order to determine whether the action requested is in compliance with Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Ayes: Tague, Collier, Holcombe, Galbraith, Jones, Nelson, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Absent: Daniel, Taylor.

- 6F. HPCA-08-145 at 724 NW 18th St. (Mesta Park), Ward 6. Consideration and possible action on the application of Paul Wilkes, for Stephen M. and Deborah E. Wilkes by Matt Parsons for a Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) remove iron columns and railings, and 2.) add columns and railings.

Matt Parsons was present for comment.

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 10 of 20

October 1, 2008

The Mesta Park Preservation Review Committee submitted written comments to staff prior to the meeting.

Raina Pelofsky, Mesta Park Preservation Review Committee was present for comment.

CONTINUED. Motion: Galbraith / Zimmer to move **30-day continuance** that, based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-08-145, staff report and during the public hearing, the Commission finds that additional information is required from the applicant in order to determine whether the action requested is in compliance with Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Ayes: Tague, Collier, Holcombe, Galbraith, Jones, Nelson, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Absent: Daniel, Taylor.

- 6G. HPCA-08-111 at 2701 N Walker Ave. (Paseo), Ward 2. Consideration and possible action on the application of OKC Housing Svcs. Redev. Corp. dba Positively Paseo for a Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) construct new garage, 2.) construct new sidewalk with stair from front porch east to street and install handrails, and 10.) replace back porch.

Continued on Continuance Docket.

- 6H. HPCA-08-112 at 2705 N Walker Ave. (Paseo), Ward 2. Consideration and possible action on the application of OKC Housing Svcs Redev Corp dba Positively Paseo for a Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) multi-gable composition roof, 2.) smooth finish HardiPlank horizontal lap siding, 3.) wood rafter tails, soffits, cornerboards and trim, 4.) stucco foundation, stucco partial height wall at porch and stucco/wood columns with cast stone trim, 5.) wood rails, 6.) vinyl clad, insulated, 1/1 wood windows with clear glass, 7.) wood doors with clear glass, 8.) light fixtures and 9.) medium grey brushed-concrete sidewalks and driveway.

Continued on Continuance Docket.

- 6I. HPCA-08-131 at 2604 N Shartel Ave. (Paseo), Ward 2. Consideration and possible action on the application of Mike Assef Living Trust for a Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) replace driveway and 2.) add parking area.

Mr. Assef was not present for comment.

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 11 of 20

October 1, 2008

CONTINUED. Motion: Collier / Holcombe to move **30-day continuance** that, based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-08-131, staff report and during the public hearing, the Commission finds that additional information is required from the applicant in order to determine whether the action requested is in compliance with Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Ayes: Tague, Collier, Holcombe, Galbraith, Jones, Nelson, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Absent: Daniel, Taylor.

- 6J. HPCA-08-037 at 2901 N Hudson Ave. (Jefferson Park), Ward 2. Consideration and possible action on the application of Frances DeCarlo for a Certificate of Appropriateness to 2.) install pre-manufactured shed.

Frances DeCarlo was present for comment.

DENIAL. Motion: Collier / Jones to move **denial with prejudice** that, based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-08-037, staff report and during the public hearing, the Commission finds:

- that the proposed materials are incompatible;
- that the proposed materials are not comparable to recommended new construction materials;
- that this action is consistent with the provisions of *4250.4D(3)(4)(5) and (6) of the HP Historic Preservation Ordinance and Subchapters 3.4 and 3.5 of the Preservation Guidelines and Standards*; and
- that based upon the evidence presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, the action requested is not in compliance, and the proposed material change in appearance would have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical or architectural significance and value of the historic property and district according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Ayes: Tague, Collier, Holcombe, Galbraith, Jones, Nelson, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Absent: Daniel, Taylor.

- 6K. HPCA-08-140 at 424 NW 30th ST. (Jefferson Park), Ward 2. Consideration and possible action on the application of John and Jeniffer Bullard for a Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) construct new deck on first floor, including 1a.) new guardrail along all open sides, 1b.) new handrail and new steps from grade to deck 2.) remove

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 12 of 20

October 1, 2008

existing upper level wood deck, 3.) construct new deck on second level, including 3a.) install new guardrail along all open sides, 3b.) install 6' stockade fence panel at west side to screen from adjacent property 4.) enclose exterior basement door and stairwell, 5.) remove existing siding from rear one-story addition, 6.) replace siding on existing rear one-story addition, and 7.) install french doors on rear of addition.

John Bullard was present for comment and submitted additional information prior to the meeting.

CONTINUED. Motion: Collier / Galbriath to move **60-day continuance** that, based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-08-140, staff report and during the public hearing, the Commission finds that additional information is required from the applicant in order to determine whether the action requested is in compliance with Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Ayes: Tague, Collier, Holcombe, Galbraith, Jones, Nelson, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Absent: Daniel, Taylor.

- 6L. HPCA-08-144 at 2919 N Robinson Ave. (Jefferson Park), Ward 2. Consideration and possible action on the application of Laurie Claus by Kenneth Fitzsimmons of TASK Design, Inc. for a Certificate of Appropriateness to 1a.) remove existing shingle siding, 1b.) restore or replace in kind original lap siding, 1c.) install new window at north rear façade, 2a.) remove existing aluminum storm door and windows on north, south, and west side of existing porch attached to rear of house, 2b.) install new painted metal veneer doors and side lite in center of west façade of porch, 2c.) infill and restore or replace in kind original lap siding at south, north, and west facades of porch 2d.) remove existing brick piers at rear porch 2e.) construct new concrete foundation for porch, and 3a.) remove existing concrete steps from porch to grade at west elevation, 3b.) construct new concrete landing and steps from porch to grade at west elevation.

Kenneth Fitzsimmons was present for comment.

Staff received comments from a neighbor.

APPROVED. Motion: Galbraith / Collier to move **approval of items 1a.) remove existing shingle siding, 1b.) restore or replace in kind original lap siding** that, based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-08-144, staff report and during the public hearing, the Commission finds:

- that the proposed renovations will not destroy or alter the historic resource;

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 13 of 20

October 1, 2008

- that the existing siding to be removed is non-historic and original lap-siding will be repaired and repainted or replaced in-kind;
- that this action is consistent with the provisions of *4250.4D(3),(5) and (6) and 4250.4L(2) of the HP Historic Preservation Ordinance and Subchapter 2.1, 2.4, 2.5, 2.10 of the Preservation Guidelines and Standards*; and
- that based upon the evidence presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, the action requested is in compliance, and the proposed material change in appearance would not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical or architectural significance and value of the historic property and district according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Ayes: Tague, Collier, Holcombe, Galbraith, Jones, Nelson, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Absent: Daniel, Taylor.

CONTINUED. Motion: Collier / Zimmer to move **30-day continuance on item 1c.) install new window at north rear façade** that, based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-08-144, staff report and during the public hearing, the Commission finds that additional information is required from the applicant in order to determine whether the action requested is in compliance with Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Ayes: Tague, Collier, Holcombe, Jones, Nelson, Zimmer.

Nays: Galbraith.

Absent: Daniel, Taylor.

CONTINUED. Motion: Collier / Galbraith to move **30-day continuance on items 2a.) remove existing aluminum storm door and windows on north, south, and west side of existing porch attached to rear of house, 2b.) install new painted metal veneer doors and side lite in center of west façade of porch, 2c.) infill and restore or replace in kind original lap siding at south, north, and west facades of porch 2d.) remove existing brick piers at rear porch 2e.) construct new concrete foundation for porch, and 3a.) remove existing concrete steps from porch to grade at west elevation, 3b.) construct new concrete landing and steps from porch to grade at west elevation** that, based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-08-144 and during the public hearing, the Commission finds that additional information is required from the applicant in order to determine whether the action requested is in compliance with Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 14 of 20

October 1, 2008

The motion including a specific finding of objection to painted metal veneer doors as opposed to wood doors.

Ayes: Tague, Collier, Holcombe, Galbraith, Jones, Nelson, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Absent: Daniel, Taylor.

- 6M. HPCA-08-080 at 532 NW 40th ST. (Crown Heights), Ward 2. Consideration and possible action on the application of Mark & Denise Hole for a Certificate of Appropriateness to 2.) construct new 1-story garage including, 2a.) composition shingle roof, 2b.) 8" horizontal lap siding above brick stem wall, 2c.) two wood overhead garage doors at front façade and 2d.) wood pedestrian door at east façade. Mr. Hole was present for comment.

APPROVED. Motion: Galbraith / Zimmer to move **approval** that, based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-08-080, staff report and during the public hearing, the Commission finds:

- that the proposed garage will be constructed as an accessory use to the residential structure in a permanent location;
- that the building materials of the proposed garage will be compatible with the aesthetic and structural appearance of the resource including, but not limited to, the consideration of texture, style, color or the components, and the combination of elements, such as brick, stone, concrete, shingle, wood or stucco;
- that the design of the garage will be compatible to the significant characteristics of the resource including, but not limited to, a consideration of a harmony of materials, details, height, mass, proportion, rhythm, scale, setback, shape, street accessories and workmanship;
- that the proposed new garage is necessary and will replace the original garage approved for demolition;
- that the proposed garage will be compatible in size, scale, proportion, spacing, texture, setbacks, height, materials, color and detail to the main residential building and will relate to similar garages within the neighborhood;
- that the proposed garage will follow the historic setback patterns of other garages in the streetscape or neighborhood;
- that the materials to be used reflect the use and function of the garage, and not necessarily that of the primary building, that are often acceptably different than that of the main building;
- that the proposed structure will be modest in scale with a hip roof and little or no ornamentation at the doors or windows;
- that the garage will be similar in height to similar, historic one-story garages in the street and district;

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 15 of 20

October 1, 2008

- that the two garage doors are proposed to be of wood panels;
- that the cementitious siding (smooth) finish of an appropriate profile is appropriate to new construction of garages;
- that this action is consistent with the provisions of *4250.4D (4)(5) and (6) of the HP Historic Preservation Ordinance and Subchapter 3.3 and 3.5 of the Preservation Guidelines and Standards*; and
- that based upon the evidence presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, the action requested is in compliance, and the proposed material change in appearance would not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical or architectural significance and value of the historic property and district according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Ayes: Tague, Collier, Holcombe, Galbraith, Jones, Nelson, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Absent: Daniel, Taylor.

- 6N. HPCA-08-146 at 620 NW 41st ST. (Crown Heights), Ward 2. Consideration and possible action on the application of Leland W. Dennis, M.D. for a Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) construct an detached 14' x 16' wood deck at rear of structure including, 1a.) install a 36" decorative iron railing to complement existing railing at upper deck.

Leland W. Dennis, M.D. was present for comment.

APPROVED. Motion: Holcombe / Collier to move **approval** that, based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-08-146, staff report and during the public hearing, the Commission finds:

- that the proposed deck is detached from the residential structure in order to leave the existing façade undisturbed;
- that the building materials proposed are compatible with the aesthetic and structural appearance of the resource;
- that the design of the proposed deck is compatible with the significant characteristics of the resource;
- that this action is consistent with the provisions of *4250.4D(3)(5) and (6) of the HP Historic Preservation Ordinance and Subchapter 1.5 of the Preservation Guidelines and Standards*; and
- that based upon the evidence presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, the action requested is in compliance, and the proposed material change in appearance would not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical or architectural significance and value of the historic property and district according to the Preservation Guidelines and

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 16 of 20

October 1, 2008

Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Ayes: Tague, Collier, Holcombe, Galbraith, Jones, Nelson, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Absent: Daniel, Taylor.

60. HPCA-08-125 at 517 NW 37th ST. (Crown Heights), Ward 2. Consideration and possible action on the application of Shaun Parrish by Sam Moore for a Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) remove vinyl windows, 2.) install new wood windows, 3.) remove metal clad French doors and 4.) install wood french doors.

Mr. Parrish and Mr. Moore were not present for comment.

CONTINUED. Motion: Collier / Holcombe to move **60-day continuance** that, based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-08-125, staff report and during the public hearing, the Commission finds that additional information is required from the applicant in order to determine whether the action requested is in compliance with Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Ayes: Tague, Collier, Holcombe, Galbraith, Jones, Nelson, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Absent: Daniel, Taylor.

- 6P. HPCA-08-138 at 616 NW 41st St. (Crown Heights), Ward 2. Consideration and possible action on the application of Teri Baumberger for a Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) replace exterior shutters.

Teri Baumberger was present for comment.

APPROVED. Motion: Collier / Zimmer to move **approval** that, based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-08-138, staff report and during the public hearing, the Commission finds:

- that removal of non-historic material is appropriate;
- that ornamental shutters were present on the house historically;
- that the proposed shutters and material are appropriate to the style and character of the house;
- that the shutters are half the width of the window, and are mounted to appear to be operational;
- that the mounting of the shutters is historically appropriate;
- that this action is consistent with the provisions of 4250.4D(3)(4)(5)and(6)

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 17 of 20

October 1, 2008

and 4250.4L(2) of the HP Historic Preservation Ordinance and Subchapter 2.5 of the Preservation Guidelines and Standards; and

- that based upon the evidence presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, the action requested is in compliance, and the proposed material change in appearance would not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical or architectural significance and value of the historic property and district according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Ayes: Tague, Collier, Holcombe, Galbraith, Jones, Nelson, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Absent: Daniel, Taylor.

- 6Q. HPCA-08-066 at 2100 N Robinson. (Heritage Hills East), Ward 7. Consideration and possible action on the application of Tonya Neequaye for a Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) install fence.

Tonya Neequaye was present for comment.

APPROVED with CONDITION. Motion: Holcombe / Zimmer to move **approval with condition** that, based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-08-066 staff report and during the public hearing, the Commission finds:

- that a the positioning of the house and the driveway are unique to the block;
- that the orientation of the house on this lot provides a unique circumstance;
- that the proposed fence location is historically appropriate, given the unique circumstance, is consistent with the spirit and intent of the Preservation Guidelines and will not adversely affect the historic character of the property or the integrity of the historic district;
- that the fence location is similar to the other historic properties in the district;
- that the proposal is consistent with the criteria for administrative approval except the proposed location;
- that this action is consistent with the provisions of 4250.4D(4), 4250.4E(4)(a), 4250.4H, 4250.4I(2) and Subchapters 1.2 and 1.9 of the Preservation Guidelines and Standards; and
- that based upon the evidence presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, the action requested is not in compliance, but because of the unique circumstances the proposed material change in appearance would not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical or architectural significance and value of the historic property and district according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 18 of 20

October 1, 2008

that the proposed gate will be no wider than 1-foot on each side of the driveway.

Ayes: Tague, Collier, Holcombe, Galbraith, Jones, Nelson, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Absent: Daniel, Taylor.

7. OTHER BUSINESS

7A. Vote on 2009 Calendar for Historic Preservation Commission Meetings.

7B. Vote on 2009 Calendar for Historic Preservation Commission Workshop Meetings.

APPROVED. Motion: Jones / Collier to move **approval of items 7A 2009 Calendar for Historic Preservation Commission Meetings and 7B 2009 Calendar for Historic Preservation Commission Workshop Meetings.**

Ayes: Tague, Collier, Holcombe, Galbraith, Jones, Nelson, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Absent: Daniel, Taylor.

8. COMMUNICATIONS

A. Administrative Approvals

8A1. HPCA-08-124 at 812 NW 25th St. (Paseo), Ward 2. Staff is announcing the Administrative Approval of the item on the application of Billy Gray for Restoration Properties by A. J. Gray for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) install storm windows on all windows at the house.

8A2. HPCA-08-128 at 1020 NW 14th St. (Heritage Hills), Ward 6. Staff is announcing the Administrative Approval of the items on the application of Clayton Hansen, III for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) install fence, and 2.) widen driveway.

8A3. HPCA-08-143 at 927 NW 20th St. (Mesta Park), Ward 6. Staff is announcing the Administrative Approval of the item on the application of Kristin and Christopher Liles for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) replacement of existing wood fence with a dogeared wood stockade fence.

8A4. HPCA-08-117 at 529 NW 42nd St. (Crown Heights), Ward 2. Staff is announcing the Administrative Approval of the item on the application of Richard and Susan Wymer for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) install gutters and downspouts.

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 19 of 20

October 1, 2008

- 8A5. **HPCA-08-134** at 245 NW Eubanks St. (Edgemere Park), Ward 2. Staff is announcing the Administrative Approval of the item on the application of Eric & Shawna Casazza for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) widen driveway.
- 8A6. **HPCA-08-062** at 617 NW 14th St. (Heritage Hills), Ward 6. Staff is announcing the Administrative Approval of the item on the application of Richard and Glenna Tanenbaum by Tim Zajac for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) install light fixtures at garage.
- 8A7. **HPCA-08-132** at 412 NW 25th St. (Jefferson Park), Ward 2. Staff is announcing the Administrative Approval of the item on the application of Walter Van President of Premier Properties for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) install light fixtures.
- 8A8. **HPCA-08-121** at 833 NW 15th St. (Heritage Hills), Ward 6. Staff is announcing the Administrative Approval of the items on the application of Suzette Hatfield for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) install awnings and 2.) install roof hatch.

B. Withdrawals

None.

C. Board of Adjustment (BOA)

- 8C1. **HPCA-08-091** at 520 NW 40th ST. (Crown Heights), Ward 2. Staff is announcing the appeal of the Historic Preservation Commissions denial of the application of David & Ambra Gales for a Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) cover existing concrete front porch and sidewalk with flagstone (completed work). **On September 4, 2008, Board of Adjustment denied the applicants appeal.**
- 8C2. **HPCA-06-098** at 2916 D Paseo Dr. (Paseo), Ward 6. Staff is announcing the appeal of the Historic Preservation Commissions denial of the application of Paseo Village by John Belt for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) install mural and fountain. – **The September 18, 2008 BOA meeting was cancelled. This appeal has been rescheduled to the October 2, 2008 Board Of Adjustment meeting.**

- H. **2008-2009 CLG Subgrant Agreement was approved by City Council on September 23, 2008.**

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 20 of 20

October 1, 2008

- I. National Trust Conference October 21, 2008 through October 25, 2008.
- J. The next regularly scheduled meeting for the Historic Preservation Commission is Wednesday, November 5, 2008 at 2:00 p.m. at the Municipal Building, City Council Chamber. New applications and information on continued projects are to be submitted to staff by 5:00 p.m., Tuesday, October 14, 2008.

9. ADJOURNMENT (6:03 p.m.)

Motion: Zimmer / Jones to adjourn the 10/1/2008, meeting of the Historic Preservation Commission.

Ayes: Tague, Collier, Holcombe, Galbraith, Jones, Nelson, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Absent: Daniel, Taylor.

pjh