

MINUTES
Regular Meeting
HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION
September 03, 2008 - 2:00 p.m.
Municipal Building, City Council Chamber

The meeting of the Oklahoma City Historic Preservation Commission was called to order in the City Council Chamber, 3rd Floor of the Municipal Building, 200 N. Walker Avenue, Oklahoma City, Oklahoma. The meeting convened at 2:02 p.m. Notice of the meeting and agenda were filed with the City Clerk's office and posted on the Council bulletin board 24 hours prior to the meeting.

1. CALL TO ORDER AND ROLL CALL

Members Present: Roland Tague, Chairman
Carolee Galbraith
Marnie Taylor
Jane Holcombe (Arrived at item 6B)
Thomas J. Daniel IV (Arrived at item 3)
Karen Collier
Karen Nelson
Karen Zimmer

Members Absent: Nedra Jones

Staff Present: Eva Osborne, AIA, Preservation Architect, Planning Department
Susan Miller, Planner IV, Planning Department
Paula Hurst, Planning Department
Rita Douglas-Talley, Assistant Municipal Counselor

2. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

APPROVED. Motion: Collier / Galbraith to **approve** the minutes of the August 6, 2008, Historic Preservation Commission meeting.

Ayes: Tague, Collier, Galbraith, Taylor, Nelson, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Absent: Jones, Daniel, Holcombe.

3. CITATION REPORT

Mr. Woods, Compliance Officer, was present for comment.

4. CONTINUANCE REQUESTS

A. Staff request continuance of the following cases:

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 2 of 22

9/3/2008

6A. HPCA-08-066 at 2100 N Robinson. (Heritage Hills East), Ward 7. Staff requests a 30-day continuance on application of Tonya Neequaye for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) install fence.

B. Other continuance requests:

6N. HPCA-08-037 at 2901 N Hudson Ave. (Jefferson Park), Ward 2. The applicant requests a 30-day continuance on application of Frances DeCarlo by Jeremy Thomas for Certificate of Appropriateness to 2.) install pre-manufactured shed.

6F. HPCA-08-123 at 434 NW 18th ST. (Heritage Hills), Ward 6. The applicant requests a 60-day continuance on the application of Richard Grellner by Jerry Dickson for a Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) replace aluminum windows on north and east sides and 3.) replace wood in-fill with brick.

6J. HPCA-08-120 at 912 NW 16th ST. (Mesta Park), Ward 6. The applicant requests a 60-day continuance on the application of Don E. Steel for a Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) remove east walls of garge to create covered patio, 2.) install columns and finish existing walls, roof and ceiling with wood to accommodate proposed configuration at garage, 3.) replace garage door, 4.) install screen door on front façade, and 5.) install wood railing on west side of front porch to match existing railing.

CONTINUED. Motion: Daniel / Collier to move approval of continuance requests, based upon the evidence that has been presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds that additional information is required from the applicants in order to determine whether the action requested is in compliance with Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Ayes: Tague, Daniel, Collier, Galbraith, Taylor, Nelson, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Absent: Jones, Holcombe.

5. CONSENT DOCKET CASES

None.

6. CASES FOR INDIVIDUAL CONSIDERATION

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 3 of 22

9/3/2008

- 6A. HPCA-08-066** at 2100 N Robinson. (Heritage Hills East), Ward 7. Consideration and possible action on the application of Tonya Neequaye for a Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) install fence.

Heard as item 4A

- 6B. HPCA-08-041** at 611 NW 15th ST. (Heritage Hills), Ward 6. Consideration and possible action on the application of Brad & Elizabeth Gawey by Tim Zajac for a Certificate of Appropriateness to 4.) amend the previously approved proposal to delete the eave overhang and finish edge of roof with wood trim flush with north wall.

Mr. Zajac and Mr. Reynolds were present for comment.

Mr. and Mrs. Eldridge were present for comment.

CONTINUED. Motion: Collier / Taylor to move **continuance for 90-days** based upon the evidence that has been presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds that additional information is required from the applicant in order to determine whether the action requested is in compliance with Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Ayes: Tague, Daniel, Collier, Holcombe, Taylor, Nelson, Zimmer.

Nays: Galbraith.

Absent: Jones.

- 6C. HPCA-08-056** at 916 NW 14th ST. (Heritage Hills), Ward 6. Consideration and possible action on the application of Michael McClintock for a Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) replace portion of wood fence at north end on east property line, 2.) add wood lattice to existing concrete block wall at south section on east property line, 3.) construct masonry landscape edging, and 4.) construct concrete pad below grade at raised planter

Mr. McClintock was present for comment.

Staff received comments regarding this application.

APPROVED. Motion: Collier / Nelson to move **approval of item 1.)** replace portion of wood fence at north end on east property line, that, based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-08-056, Staff Report and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds:

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 4 of 22

9/3/2008

- that the fence is forward of the 50% mark of the house;
- that the proposed cedar plank with wood cap is consistent with the character of the property or district and is listed as an appropriate fence material in subchapter 1.9 of the Preservation Guidelines and Standards;
- that there is a unique circumstance although the fence location is forward of the 50% mark of the house, it is behind the prominent features visible from the street and the side front of the house, including the back brick pillar of the non-existent side porch, and that moving it back closer to the 50% mark would butt the fence up to a window or bank of windows;
- that this action is consistent with the provisions of *4250.4D(5)and(6), 4250.4H and 4250.4I(2) of the Historic Preservation Ordinance and Subchapter 1.9 of the Preservation Guidelines and Standards;*
- That the action requested is not in compliance, but because of the unique circumstances the proposed material change in appearance would not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical or architectural significance and value of the historic property and district according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Ayes: Tague, Daniel, Collier, Holcombe, Galbraith, Taylor, Nelson, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Absent: Jones.

APPROVED. Motion: Collier / Taylor to move approval of item 2.) add wood lattice to existing concrete block wall at south section on east property line, that, based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-08-056, Staff Report and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds:

- that the proposed wood lattice is consistent with the character of the property or district and is listed as an appropriate fence material in subchapter 1.9 of the Preservation Guidelines and Standards;
- that this action is consistent with the provisions of *4250.4D(5)and(6), 4250.4H and 4250.4I(2) of the Historic Preservation Ordinance and Subchapter 1.9 of the Preservation Guidelines and Standards;*
- that based upon the evidence presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, the action requested is in compliance, and the proposed material change in appearance would not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical or architectural significance and value of the historic property and district according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Ayes: Tague, Daniel, Collier, Holcombe, Galbraith, Taylor, Nelson, Zimmer.

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 5 of 22

9/3/2008

Nays: None.

Absent: Jones.

APPROVED. Motion: Taylor / Collier to move approval of item 3.) construct masonry landscape edging, that, based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-08-056, Staff Report and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds:

- that the raised planting beds do not exceed 18 inches in height (from undisturbed grade);
- that this action is consistent with the provisions of *4250.4D(5)and(6), 4250.4H and 4250.4I(2) of the Historic Preservation Ordinance and Subchapter 1.6 of the Preservation Guidelines and Standards;*
- that based upon the evidence presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, the action requested is in compliance, and the proposed material change in appearance would not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical or architectural significance and value of the historic property and district according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Ayes: Tague, Daniel, Collier, Holcombe, Galbraith, Taylor, Nelson, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Absent: Jones.

APPROVED. Motion: Holcombe / Collier to move approval of item 4.) construct concrete pad below grade at raised planter that, based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-08-056, Staff Report and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds:

- that the raised planting beds do not exceed 18 inches in height (from undisturbed grade);
- that this action is consistent with the provisions of *4250.4D(5)and(6), 4250.4H and 4250.4I(2) of the Historic Preservation Ordinance and Subchapter 1.3, 1.6 of the Preservation Guidelines and Standards;*
- that based upon the evidence presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, the action requested is in compliance, and the proposed material change in appearance would not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical or architectural significance and value of the historic property and district according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Ayes: Tague, Daniel, Collier, Holcombe, Galbraith, Taylor, Nelson, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 6 of 22

9/3/2008

Absent: Jones.

- 6D. HPCA-08-118** at 230 NW 17th ST. (Heritage Hills), Ward 6. Consideration and possible action on the application of Mark and Barbara Brockhaus for a Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) construct new porte-cochere supported by brick columns to replace existing porte-cochere supported by steel pipe columns and 2.) construct new brick column to support balcony at southeast corner of house to replace existing steel pipe column.

Mark Brockhaus was present for comment.

CONTINUED. Motion: Daniel / Zimmer to move **continuance for 60-days for item 1.** construct new porte-cochere supported by brick columns to replace existing porte-cochere supported by steel pipe columns, that based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-08-118, Staff Report and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds:

- That based upon the evidence that has been presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds that additional information is required from the applicant in order to determine whether the action requested is in compliance with Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Ayes: Tague, Daniel, Collier, Holcombe, Galbraith, Taylor, Nelson, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Absent: Jones.

APPROVED. Motion: Taylor / Holcombe to move **approval of item 2.** construct new brick column to support balcony at southeast corner of house to replace existing steel pipe column, that, based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-08-118, Staff Report and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds:

- that the balcony at the southeast corner of the house is not historic;
- that the removal of these features is appropriate;
- that the proposed column is similar to the historic columns;
- that this action is consistent with the provisions of *4250.4D(3)(4)(5)and(6) and 4250.4L(2)of the HP Historic Preservation Ordinance and Subchapter 2.2 of the Preservation Guidelines and Standards;*
- that based upon the evidence presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, the action requested is in compliance, and the proposed material change in appearance would not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical or architectural significance and value of the

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 7 of 22

9/3/2008

historic property and district according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Ayes: Tague, Daniel, Collier, Holcombe, Galbraith, Taylor, Nelson, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Absent: Jones.

- 6E. HPCA-08-121** at 833 NW 15th ST. (Heritage Hills), Ward 6. Consideration and possible action on the application of Suzette Hatfield for a Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) replace vinyl windows with wood windows.

Suzette Hatfield was present for comment.

APPROVED. Motion: Daniel / Holcombe to move **approval as amended with the condition that clear glass will be used and not LowE** that, based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-08-121, Staff Report and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds:

- that the applicant amended the application to provide that the windows would have clear glass and LowE glass will not be used;
- that the existing windows are not the historic windows;
- that the existing/historic window openings will not be altered;
- that the proposed wood windows will match the historic windows in proportion, shape, location, pattern, size, materials, details and profile;
- that the historic windows at the proposed locations have been removed;
- that the proposed windows will have insulated, clear glazing and not Low E;
- that the proposed windows are true divided-light;
- that this action is consistent with the provisions of *4250.4D(5)and(6) and 4250.4L(2)of the HP Historic Preservation Ordinance and Subchapter 2.5 of the Preservation Guidelines and Standards;*
- that based upon the evidence presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, the action requested is in compliance, and the proposed material change in appearance would not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical or architectural significance and value of the historic property and district according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007

Ayes: Tague, Daniel, Collier, Holcombe, Galbraith, Taylor, Nelson, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Absent: Jones.

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 8 of 22

9/3/2008

- 6F. HPCA-08-123** at 434 NW 18th ST. (Heritage Hills), Ward 6. Consideration and possible action on the application of Richard Grellner by Jerry Dickson for a Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) replace aluminum windows on north and east sides and 3.) replace wood in-fill with brick.

Heard as item 4B.

- 6G. HPCA-08-128** at 1020 NW 14th ST. (Heritage Hills), Ward 6. Consideration and possible action on the application of Clayton Hansen, III for a Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) in-fill existing window on the west side of house and 2.) relocate and replace window at back façade.

Megan Hansen and Clayton “Trey” Hansen, III, were present for comment.

APPROVE with Condition. Motion: Daniel / Holcombe move **approval with condition of item 2.)** relocate and replace window at back façade, that, based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-08-128 and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds:

- that the historic window openings (brick) will be altered;
- that this action is consistent with the provisions of *4250.4D(3),(4),(5)and(6) and 4250.4L(2)of the HP Historic Preservation Ordinance and Subchapter 2.5 of the Preservation Guidelines and Standards;*
- that based upon the evidence presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, the action requested with condition is in compliance, and the proposed material change in appearance would not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical or architectural significance and value of the historic property and district according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

The condition of approval is that the window will be single pane, clear glass, and true-divided light.

Ayes: Tague, Daniel, Collier, Holcombe, Galbraith, Taylor, Nelson, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Absent: Jones.

DENIED. Motion: Daniel / Holcombe move **denial with prejudice of item 1.)** in-fill existing window on the west side of house that, based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-08-128 and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds:

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 9 of 22

9/3/2008

- that this action is not consistent with the provisions of *4250.4D(3),(4),(5)and(6) and 4250.4L(2)of the HP Historic Preservation Ordinance and Subchapter 2.5 of the Preservation Guidelines and Standards;*
- that the existing windows are the historic windows;
- that no evidence has been presented to verify that the windows are deteriorated beyond repair;
- that the historic window openings (brick) will be altered;
- that based upon the evidence presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, the action requested is not in compliance, and the proposed material change in appearance would have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical or architectural significance and value of the historic property and district according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Ayes: Tague, Daniel, Collier, Holcombe, Galbraith, Taylor, Nelson, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Absent: Jones.

- 6H.** **HPCA-08-077** at 525 NW 17th ST. (Mesta Park), Ward 6. Consideration and possible action on the application of Josef & Rebecca McGuigan by Kimberly Long for a Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) install deck, 2.) remove 1 window set and 3.) install french doors.

Heard out of order after 6I.

- 6I.** **HPCA-08-116** at 825 NW 16th ST. (Mesta Park), Ward 6. Consideration and possible action on the application of Russell Fox for a Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) install gable support brackets, 2.) replace deteriorated windows, 3.) replace 4 windows at sunroom, 4.) remove door and window at west façade of secondary structure and 5.) install side-hinged carriage door at the garage.

Russell Fox was present for comment.

Applicant withdrew item 2.

APPROVED. Motion: Collier / Galbraith to move **approval of item 1.)** install gable support brackets that, based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-08-116, Staff Report and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds:

- that the wood support brackets are consistent with the historic character of the property;
- That there was evidence that historic gable support brackets existed on this

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 10 of 22

9/3/2008

house previously;

- that this action is consistent with the provisions of *4250.4D(3)(4)(5)and(6) of the Historic Preservation Ordinance and Subchapter 2.7 of the Preservation Guidelines and Standards;*
- that based upon the evidence presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, the action requested is in compliance, and the proposed material change in appearance would not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical or architectural significance and value of the historic property and district according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Ayes: Tague, Daniel, Collier, Holcombe, Galbraith, Taylor, Nelson, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Absent: Jones.

APPROVED. Motion: Collier / Nelson to move approval of item 3.) replace 4 windows at sunroom that, based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-08-116, Staff Report and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds:

- that the windows at the sunroom are not historic;
- that the proposed windows at the sunroom are insulated true divided-light windows with clear glass;
- that this action is consistent with the provisions of *4250.4D(3)(4)(5)and(6) and 4250.4L(2) of the Historic Preservation Ordinance and Subchapter 2.5 of the Preservation Guidelines and Standards;*
- that based upon the evidence presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, the action requested is in compliance, and the proposed material change in appearance would not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical or architectural significance and value of the historic property and district according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Ayes: Tague, Daniel, Collier, Holcombe, Galbraith, Taylor, Nelson, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Absent: Jones.

APPROVED. Motion: Holcombe / Collier to move approval of items 4.) remove door and window at west façade of secondary structure and 5.) install side-hinged carriage door at the garage that, based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-08-116, Staff Report and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds:

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 11 of 22

9/3/2008

- that the door and window at the west façade of the secondary structure are not historic;
- that the proposed wood side-hinged garage door matches the historic character of the property and district;
- that this action is consistent with the provisions of *4250.4D(3)(4)(5)and(6) and of the Historic Preservation Ordinance and Subchapter 2.9 of the Preservation Guidelines and Standards;*
- that based upon the evidence presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, the action requested is in compliance, and the proposed material change in appearance would not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical or architectural significance and value of the historic property and district according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Ayes: Tague, Daniel, Collier, Holcombe, Galbraith, Taylor, Nelson, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Absent: Jones.

- 6H. HPCA-08-077** at 525 NW 17th ST. (Mesta Park), Ward 6. Consideration and possible action on the application of Josef & Rebecca McGuigan by Kimberly Long for a Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) install deck, 2.) remove 1 window set and 3.) install french doors.

Heard out of order after 6I.

Kimberly Long was not present for comment.

CONTINUED. Motion: Taylor / Galbraith to move **continuance for 30-days**, based upon the evidence that has been presented in the application of HPCA-08-077, Staff Report and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds:

- that additional information is required from the applicant in order to determine whether the action requested is in compliance with Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Ayes: Tague, Daniel, Collier, Holcombe, Galbraith, Taylor, Nelson, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Absent: Jones.

- 6J. HPCA-08-120** at 912 NW 16th ST. (Mesta Park), Ward 6. Consideration and possible action on the application of Don E. Steel for a Certificate of

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 12 of 22

9/3/2008

Appropriateness to 1.) remove east walls of garge to create covered patio including east half of front (north) façade and east half of back (south) facade, 2.) install columns and finish existing walls, roof and ceiling with wood to accommodate proposed configuration at garage, 3.) replace garage door, 4.) install screen door on front façade, and 5.) install wood railing on west side of front porch to match existing railing.

Heard as item 4B.

- 6K. HPCA-08-126** at 401-403 NW 22nd ST. (Mesta Park), Ward 6. Consideration and possible action on the application of James W. Schuelein for a Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) replace fence forward of the halfway point at the sideyard.

James W. Schuelein was present for comment.

APPROVED. Motion: Daniel / Zimmer move **approval** that, based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-08-126 and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds:

- that there is a unique circumstance concerning this multi-family residence adjacent to single-family residences as well as the safety and security for same
- that the proposed fence is forward of the halfway point at the side yard;
- that this action is consistent with the provisions of *4250.4D(3)(4)and(6), 4250.4H, 4250.4I(2) and 4250.4J of the Historic Preservation Ordinance and Subchapters 1.4 and 1.9 of the Preservation Guidelines and Standards;*
- That the action requested is not in compliance, but because of the unique circumstances the proposed material change in appearance would not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical or architectural significance and value of the historic property and district according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Ayes: Tague, Daniel, Collier, Holcombe, Galbraith, Taylor, Nelson, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Absent: Jones.

- 6L. HPCA-08-127** at 1018 1/2 NW 17th ST. (Mesta Park), Ward 6. Consideration and possible action on the application of Laurent & Laura Massenat for a Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) replace steel garage doors with wooden carriage doors.

APPROVED. Motion: Holcombe / Daniel to move **approval** that, based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-08-127, Staff Report and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds:

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 13 of 22

9/3/2008

- that the existing steel overhead garage door is not historic;
- that the proposed wood overhead garage door is compatible with the historic character of the property;
- that this action is consistent with the provisions of *4250.4D(5)and(6) and 4250.4L(2)of the HP Historic Preservation Ordinance and Subchapter 2.9 of the Preservation Guidelines and Standards;*
- that based upon the evidence presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, the action requested is in compliance, and the proposed material change in appearance would not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical or architectural significance and value of the historic property and district according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Ayes: Tague, Daniel, Collier, Holcombe, Galbraith, Taylor, Nelson, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Absent: Jones.

- 6M. HPCA-08-124** at 812 NW 25th ST. (Paseo), Ward 2. Consideration and possible action on the application of Billy Gray for Restoration Properties for A. J. Gray for a Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) remove siding and repair/replace wood horizontal lap siding below, 2.) replace windows, 3.) remove front porch columns, 4.) constuct new wood columns and 5.) construct wood deck.

A.J. Gray was present for comment.

APPROVED. Motion: Collier / Zimmer to move **approval** of items 1.) remove siding and repair/replace wood horizontal lap siding below and 2.) replace windows (**only missing windows**) that, based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-08-124, Staff Report and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds:

- that the exposed siding material is not historic;
- that the wood horizontal lap siding is the historic siding;
- that the wood horizontal lap siding will be repaired/replaced in-kind;
- that the existing windows are the historic windows;
- that the missing windows only will be replaced to match the existing historic windows;
- that this action is consistent with the provisions of *4250.4D(3)(4)(5)and(6) and 4250.4L(2) of the Historic Preservation Ordinance and Subchapter 2.5 and 2.10 of the Preservation Guidelines and Standards;*
- that based upon the evidence presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, the action requested is in compliance, and the

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 14 of 22

9/3/2008

proposed material change in appearance would not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical or architectural significance and value of the historic property and district according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Ayes: Tague, Daniel, Collier, Holcombe, Galbraith, Taylor, Nelson, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Absent: Jones.

CONTINUED. Motion: Daniel / Zimmer move to **continue for 60-days** items 3.) remove front porch columns, 4.) construct new wood columns and 5.) construct wood deck that, based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-08-124 and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds:

- that the action requested cannot be approved at this time, and
- that additional information is required from the applicant in order to determine whether the action requested is in compliance, and
- that based upon the evidence that has been presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, additional information is required from the applicant in order to determine whether the action requested is in compliance with the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Ayes: Tague, Daniel, Collier, Holcombe, Galbraith, Taylor, Nelson, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Absent: Jones.

- 6N. HPCA-08-037** at 2901 N Hudson Ave. (Jefferson Park), Ward 2. Consideration and possible action on the application of Frances DeCarlo by Jeremy Thomas for a Certificate of Appropriateness to 2.) install pre-manufactured shed.

Heard as item 4B.

- 6O. HPCA-08-119** at 700 NW 42nd ST. (Crown Heights), Ward 2. Consideration and possible action on the application of Josiah and Lizzie Daniel by Kevin Heid for a Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) remove epoxy stone driveway from southeast corner of house to the street, 2.) construct new concrete driveway, 3.) replace front porch steps and sidewalk with current configuration.

Kevin Heid was present for comment.

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 15 of 22

9/3/2008

The Crown Heights Preservation Review Committee submitted written comments to staff prior to the meeting.

APPROVED. Motion: Collier / Nelson to move **approval** that, based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-08-119, Staff Report and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds:

- that the existing driveway, sidewalk and stair are deteriorated;
- that the driveway is a safety hazard to the public;
- that the proposed concrete will be medium grey brushed concrete to match the historic concrete;
- that this action is consistent with the provisions of *4250.4D(3)(4)(5)and(6) and 4250.4L(2)of the HP Historic Preservation Ordinance and Subchapter 1.3 and 1.6 of the Preservation Guidelines and Standards;*
- that based upon the evidence presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, the action requested is in compliance, and the proposed material change in appearance would not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical or architectural significance and value of the historic property and district according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Ayes: Tague, Daniel, Collier, Holcombe, Galbraith, Taylor, Nelson, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Absent: Jones.

- 6P. HPCA-08-113** at 708 NW 42nd ST. (Crown Heights), Ward 2. Consideration and possible action on the application of Paul Sechrist for a Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) remove sidewalk, and 2.) widen driveway.

Paul Sechrist was present for comment.

The Crown Heights Preservation Review Committee submitted written comments to staff prior to the meeting.

APPROVED IN PART. Motion: Daniel / Holcombe, move **Approval in Part of Items 1.) and 2.) not to include the color of the concrete** that, based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-08-113 and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds:

- that the old concrete features were a threat to public safety and the demolition was necessary to alleviate said threat;
- that the joints in the old concrete were not a significant feature to be replaced;
- that the topography was not significantly changed;

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 16 of 22

9/3/2008

- that this action is consistent with the provisions of *4250.4D(3)(4)(5)and(6), 4250.4H, 4250.4I(2) and 4250.4L(2)(b) of the Historic Preservation Ordinance and Subchapter 1.3 and 1.6 of the Preservation Guidelines and Standards;*
- that based upon the evidence presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, the action (in part) as requested is in compliance, and the proposed material change in appearance would not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical or architectural significance and value of the historic property and district according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Ayes: Tague, Daniel, Collier, Holcombe, Galbraith, Taylor, Nelson, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Absent: Jones.

DENIAL IN PART. Motion: Daniel / Galbraith to move **Denial with prejudice in Part of Items 1.) and 2.) concerning the color of the concrete** that, based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-08-113 and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds:

- that the color of the new concrete is not medium grey brushed-concrete and is not consistent in color with the historic concrete at the property or at the district;
- that this action is consistent with the provisions of *4250.4D(3)(4)(5)and(6), 4250.4H, 4250.4I(2) and 4250.4L(2)(b) of the Historic Preservation Ordinance and Subchapter 1.3 and 1.6 of the Preservation Guidelines and Standards;*
- that based upon the evidence presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, the action (in part) as requested is not in compliance, and the proposed material change in appearance would have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical or architectural significance and value of the historic property and district according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Ayes: Tague, Daniel, Collier, Holcombe, Galbraith, Taylor, Nelson, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Absent: Jones.

- 6Q. HPCA-08-122** at 609 NW 42nd ST. (Crown Heights), Ward 2. Consideration and possible action on the application of Nancy Love Robertson by Kenneth Fitzsimmons, AIA for a Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) remove wood french doors and replace with metal doors (non-historic part of house), 2.) demo portion of

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 17 of 22

9/3/2008

non-historic wall to install casement window, 3.) replace storm doors at front/side door (non-historic).

Kenneth Fitzsimmons was present for comment.

The Crown Heights Preservation Review Committee submitted written comments to staff prior to the meeting.

Item 3.) replace storm doors at front/side door (non-historic), will be approved administratively.

APPROVED. Motion: Collier / Daniel to move **Approval of items 1.) and 2.)** that, based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-08-122 and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds:

- that a unique circumstance exists since the house was built in the 1940's and the addition is non-historic and a metal frame door will compliment the original materials
- that the doors to be removed are not historic;
- that the doors and window will be located in an addition;
- that the historic windows are metal;
- that the proposed doors and windows are aluminum with clear glass;
- that this action is consistent with the provisions of *4250.4D(3)(4)(5)and(6) and 4250.4L(2)of the HP Historic Preservation Ordinance and Subchapter 2.4 and 2.5 of the Preservation Guidelines and Standards;*
- that based upon the evidence presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, the action requested is in compliance, and the proposed material change in appearance would not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical or architectural significance and value of the historic property and district according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Ayes: Tague, Daniel, Collier, Holcombe, Galbraith, Taylor, Nelson, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Absent: Jones.

- 6R. HPCA-08-129** at 833 NW 39th ST. (Crown Heights), Ward 2. Consideration and possible action on the application of Kent Johnson and Brenda Vincent for a Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) demo wall, 2.) remove picture window, 3.) re-frame, and 4.) install in-swing french doors and sidelight.

Kent Johnson and Brenda Vincent were present for comment.

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 18 of 22

9/3/2008

The Crown Heights Preservation Review Committee submitted written comments to staff prior to the meeting.

APPROVED. Motion: Daniel / Galbraith to move **approval** that, based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-08-129, Staff Report and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds:

- that the existing window is not historic;
- that the proposed alterations are at the back façade not visible from the street;
- that the proposed door assembly is compatible with the existing door openings in proportion, shape, location, pattern, size and material.
- That the proposed door assembly is simulated divided-light with clear glass and cladding;
- that this action is consistent with the provisions of *4250.4D(3)(4)(5)and(6) and 4250.4L(2)of the HP Historic Preservation Ordinance and Subchapter 2.4 of the Preservation Guidelines and Standards;*
- that based upon the evidence presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, the action requested is in compliance, and the proposed material change in appearance would not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical or architectural significance and value of the historic property and district according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Ayes: Tague, Daniel, Collier, Holcombe, Galbraith, Taylor, Nelson, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Absent: Jones.

- 6S. HPCA-08-044** at 2329 NW 28th ST. (Shepherd), Ward 2. Consideration and possible action on the application of Robert Toomey for a Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) remove plywood and window(s) from window opening, 2.) install replacement windows, 3.) repair/replace in-kind wood horizontal lap siding and install new horizontal lap siding at locations where it is missing, 4.) remove particle board and vinyl soffit and fascia, 5.) install new wood fascia, bead board soffit and wood trim, 6.) remove security bars from windows and doors and 7.) replace wood/aluminum trim along window openings on west façade of house with wood trim to match the historic trim.

Robert Toomey was present for comment.

APPROVED. Motion: Daniel / Galbraith to move **approval** of items 3.), 4.), 5.), 6.) and 7.) that, based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-08-044, Staff Report and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds:

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 19 of 22

9/3/2008

- that the proposed wood horizontal lap siding was the historic condition;
- that the proposed wood soffits, fascia and trim are consistent with the character of the property;
- that the security bars are not a historic feature;
- that this action is consistent with the provisions of *4250.4D(3)(4)(5)and(6) and 4250.4L(2) of the Historic Preservation Ordinance and Subchapter 1.9, 2.5 and 2.10 of the Preservation Guidelines and Standards;*
- that based upon the evidence presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, the action requested is in compliance, and the proposed material change in appearance would not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical or architectural significance and value of the historic property and district according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Ayes: Tague, Daniel, Collier, Holcombe, Galbraith, Taylor, Nelson, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Absent: Jones.

CONTINUED. Motion: Holcombe / Daniel to move **continuance for 60-days** items 1.) remove plywood and window(s) from window opening, 2.) install replacement windows, that based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-08-044, Staff Report and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds:

- that the action requested cannot be approved at this time, and
- that additional information is required from the applicant in order to determine whether the action requested is in compliance, and
- that based upon the evidence that has been presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, additional information is required from the applicant in order to determine whether the action requested is in compliance with the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Ayes: Tague, Daniel, Collier, Holcombe, Galbraith, Taylor, Nelson, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Absent: Jones.

7. OTHER BUSINESS

- 7A. HPCA-08-130** at 422 NW 27th ST. (Jefferson Park), Ward 2. To receive comments from the Historic Preservation Commission regarding the historic integrity of the detached garage. This item will be referred to Neighborhood

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 20 of 22

9/3/2008

Services for dilapidated structure processing.

FORWARD COMMENTS. Motion: Daniel / Collier to forward comments that the Historic Preservation Commissions finding is that the detached garage is historic, and is a contributing resource to the neighborhood.

Ayes: Tague, Daniel, Collier, Holcombe, Galbraith, Taylor, Nelson, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Absent: Jones.

7B. Election of Vice-Chairman.

APPROVED. Motion: Holcombe / Galbraith to nominate Karen Collier as Vice-Chairman.

8. COMMUNICATIONS

A. Administrative Approvals

8A1. HPCA-08-115 at 832 NW 39th ST. (Crown Heights), Ward 2. Staff is announcing the Administrative Approval of the item on the application of Valerie Engelbrecht by David Parker for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) install new fence.

8A2. HPCA-08-092 at 824 NW 18th ST. (Mesta Park), Ward 6. Staff is announcing the Administrative Approval of the item on the application of Harold C Straughn Family Trust for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) install mechanical devices on roof.

8A3. HPCA-08-092 at 824 NW 18th ST. (Mesta Park), Ward 6. Staff is announcing the Administrative Approval of the item on the application of Harold C Straughn Family Trust for Certificate of Appropriateness to 2.) install 6 additional intake vents at the soffits.

8A4. HPCA-08-012 at 3110 N Harvey Pkwy. (Edgemere Park), Ward 2. Staff is announcing the Administrative Approval of the items on the application of Mike Giese for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) install mechanical devices on roof, and 2.) install gate/fence.

B. Withdrawals

8B1. HPCA-08-008 at 2321 NW 28th ST. (Shepherd), Ward 2. Staff is announcing the withdrawal on July 16, 2008, of the items on the application of Mary W. Martin, MD for Certificate of Appropriateness to

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 21 of 22

9/3/2008

1.) install fence.

C. Board of Adjustment (BOA)

8C1. HPCA-08-059 at 224 W Eubanks ST. (Edgemere Park), Ward 2. Staff is announcing the appeal of the Historic Preservation Commissions denial of the application of Zack and Jen Woods for Certificate of Appropriateness to 2.) remove sidewalk and install concrete pavers for front sidewalk. **On August 7th, 2008, the Board of Adjustment denied the applicant's appeal.**

8C2. HPCA-08-091 at 520 NW 40th ST. (Crown Heights), Ward 2. Staff is announcing the appeal of the Historic Preservation Commissions denial of the application of David & Ambra Gales for a Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) cover existing concrete front porch and sidewalk with flagstone (completed work). **Appeal is scheduled to be heard at the September 4, 2008, Board of Adjustment meeting.**

8C3. HPCA-06-098 at 2916 D Paseo Dr. (Paseo), Ward 6. Staff is announcing the appeal of the Historic Preservation Commissions denial of the application of Paseo Village by John Belt for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) install mural and fountain. - **Appeal is scheduled to be heard at the September 18, 2008, Board of Adjustment meeting.**

D. Meeting summary of the "Paseo Coalition" by Roland Tague.

E. Resignation of Thomas Small, AIA, Vice-Chairman effective August 28, 2008.

F. 2008-2009 CLG Application Amendment was approved by City Council on August 26, 2008.

G. Preserve America Communities application was approved by City Council on August 26, 2008 and was submitted to Preserve America Communities in Washington D.C. on August 28, 2008.

H. The next regularly scheduled meeting for the Historic Preservation Commission is Wednesday, October 1, 2008 at 2:00 p.m. at the Municipal Building, City Council Chamber. New applications and information on continued projects are to be submitted to staff by 5:00 p.m., Tuesday, September 9, 2008.

9. ADJOURNMENT (6:35 p.m.)

Motion: Daniel / Collier to adjourn the 9/3/2008, meeting of the Historic Preservation Commission.

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 22 of 22

9/3/2008

Ayes: Tague, Daniel, Collier, Holcombe, Galbraith, Taylor, Nelson, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Absent: Jones.

EO