

MINUTES
Regular Meeting
HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION
January 07, 2009 - 2:00 p.m.
Municipal Building, City Council Chamber

The meeting of the Oklahoma City Historic Preservation Commission was called to order in the City Council Chamber, 3rd Floor of the Municipal Building, 200 N. Walker Avenue, Oklahoma City, Oklahoma. The meeting convened at 2:04 p.m. Notice of the meeting and agenda were filed with the City Clerk's office and posted on the Council bulletin board 24 hours prior to the meeting.

1. CALL TO ORDER AND ROLL CALL

Members Present: Roland Tague, Chairman
Karen Collier, Vice-Chair
Carolee Galbraith
Jane Holcombe
Thomas J. Daniel IV
Karen Nelson
Nedra Jones
Karen Zimmer

Members Absent: Marnie Taylor

Staff Present: Susan Miller, Planner IV, Planning Department
John Calhoun, AIA, Planner II, Planning Department
Scottye Montgomery, Planner II, Planning Department
Angela Yetter, Planner I, Planning Department
Paula Hurst, Planning Department
Rita Douglas-Talley, Assistant Municipal Counselor

2. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

APPROVED. Motion: Holcombe / Daniel to **approve as amended** the minutes of the December 3, 2008, Historic Preservation Commission meeting.

Ayes: Tague, Collier, Daniel, Holcombe, Galbraith, Nelson, Jones, Zimmer.
Nays: None.
Absent: Taylor.

APPROVED. Motion: Collier / Zimmer to **approve to waive the reading of the Standard Findings of Fact and incorporate them into the minutes.**

Ayes: Tague, Collier, Daniel, Holcombe, Galbraith, Nelson, Jones, Zimmer.
Nays: None.
Absent: Taylor.

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 2 of 18

January 7, 2009

3. CITATION REPORT

Heard after item 4B)

4. CONTINUANCE REQUESTS

A. Staff request continuance of the following cases:

- 6F. HPCA-08-178** at 233 NW 31st St. (Edgemere Park), Ward 2. Consideration and possible action on application of Monica Reid by Eric Guyer of Quality Construction for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) replace the front glass door.

Applicant was not present.

CONTINUED. Motion: Galbraith / Nelson to move **continuance for 30-days** based upon the evidence that has been presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, that the Commission find that additional information is required from the applicant in order to determine whether the action requested is in compliance with Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Ayes: Tague, Collier, Daniel, Holcombe, Galbraith, Nelson, Jones, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Absent: Taylor.

B. Other continuance requests:

- 6E. HPCA-08-180** at 119 NW 25th St. (Jefferson Park), Ward 7. Consideration and possible action on application of Sheveron Glover for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) demolish garage.

Applicant was not present.

CONTINUED. Motion: Daniel / Galbraith to move **continuance for 30-days** based upon the evidence that has been presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, that the Commission find that additional information is required from the applicant in order to determine whether the action requested is in compliance with Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Ayes: Tague, Collier, Daniel, Holcombe, Galbraith, Nelson, Jones, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 3 of 18

January 7, 2009

Absent: Taylor.

3. (Heard out of order) CITATION REPORT

Mr. Woods, Compliance Officer, was present for comment.

5. CONSENT DOCKET CASES

- 6A. HPCA-08-175** at 2705 N Walker Ave. (Paseo), Ward 2. Consideration and possible action on application of Oklahoma City Housing Services Redevelopment Corporation by Ron Walters Construction Services, Incorporated for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) amend previous approval on HPCA-08-112 to change lap siding from HardiPlank to wood.

Ron Walters of Ron Walters Construction Services, Incorporated was present for comment.

- 6B. HPCA-08-176** at 726 NW 28th St.. (Paseo), Ward 2. Consideration and possible action on application of Oklahoma City Housing Services Redevelopment Corporation by Ron Walters Construction Services, Incorporated for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) construct a new one-story single-family dwelling, including 1a.) gable and hipped roof with composition shingles, 1b.) wood lap siding with wood corner boards, fascia and trim and wood soffits, 1c.) exposed concrete stem wall, 1d.) brick/wood columns and rail, 1e.) 1/1 wood windows and wood shutters, 1f.) wood doors with clear glass; and 2.) concrete sidewalks, parking pad and condenser pad.

Ron Walters of Ron Walters Construction Services, Incorporated was present for comment.

APPROVED. Motion: Collier / Zimmer to move **approval of consent docket items** based upon the evidence presented in the applications, Staff Reports and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds:

Specific findings of fact for HPCA-08-175:

- that the proposed construction of this infill residence is compatible in size, scale, proportion, spacing, texture, setbacks, height, materials, color, and detail to adjacent and nearby buildings and streetscapes;
- that the design of this new construction is compatible with historic styles within the district yet does not imitate them;
- that all provisions of HPCA-08-112 remain as approved except for HardiPlank siding;

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 4 of 18

January 7, 2009

- that the use of wood siding with #105 pattern is appropriate for this new construction;
- that this action is consistent with the provisions of *4250.4 D (3), (5) and (6) of the Historic Preservation Ordinance, and Subchapter(s) 3.1 and 3.5 of the Preservation Guidelines and Standards*; and
- that based upon the evidence presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, the action requested is in compliance, and the proposed material change in appearance would not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical or architectural significance and value of the historic property and district according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Specific findings of fact for HPCA-08-176:

- that the proposed construction of this one-story infill residence is compatible in size, scale, material and detail to the character of the historic district;
- that the proposed windows are wood double-hung windows;
- that the doors are wood with clear glass;
- that the parking pad is appropriate when considering the specific location and constraints of the site;
- that the curve of the sidewalk is necessary to accommodate the retention of the driveway and therefore appropriate at this particular site;
- that all provisions of the previously approved application, HPCA-08-024, remain except for HardiPlank siding;
- that the use of wood siding with #105 pattern is appropriate for this new construction;
- that this action is consistent with the provisions of *4250.4 D (3), (5) and (6) of the Historic Preservation Ordinance, 4800.C (2)(C) of the Neighborhood Conservation Ordinance, and Subchapters 1.1, 1.2, 1.3, 3.1 and 3.5 of the Preservation Guidelines and Standards*; and
- that based upon the evidence presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, the action requested is in compliance, and the proposed material change in appearance would not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical or architectural significance and value of the historic property and district according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 5 of 18

January 7, 2009

Ayes: Tague, Collier, Daniel, Holcombe, Galbraith, Nelson, Jones, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Absent: Taylor.

6. CASES FOR INDIVIDUAL CONSIDERATION

- 6A. HPCA-08-175 at 2705 N Walker Ave. (Paseo), Ward 2. Consideration and possible action on application of Oklahoma City Housing Services Redevelopment Corporation by Ron Walters Construction Services, Incorporated for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) amend previous approval on HPCA-08-112 to change lap siding from HardiPlank to wood.

Approved on Consent Docket.

- 6B. HPCA-08-176 at 726 NW 28th St.. (Paseo), Ward 2. Consideration and possible action on application of Oklahoma City Housing Services Redevelopment Corporation by Ron Walters Construction Services, Incorporated for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) construct a new one-story single-family dwelling, including 1a.) gable and hipped roof with composition shingles, 1b.) wood lap siding with wood corner boards, fascia and trim and wood soffits, 1c.) exposed concrete stem wall, 1d.) brick/wood columns and rail, 1e.) 1/1 wood windows and wood shutters, 1f.) wood doors with clear glass; and 2.) concrete sidewalks, parking pad and condenser pad.

Approved on Consent Docket.

- 6C. HPCA-08-177 at 2920, 2924 & 2928 Paseo. (Paseo), Ward 2. Consideration and possible action on application of Paseo Village by John Belt for Certificate of Appropriateness to **1.) on 2928A Paseo**, 1a.) replace west, south, and north façades wall material, and add parapets - remove pressed-wood wall boards; remove metal roofing and add a flat-top parapet above the roofline; walls have wood covered with genuine stucco, 1b.) change windows - on the west side add two, single-pane units with no dividers; the panes set-in 1" to 2" from the face of the frames; the frames are of 1"x4" wood, smooth and stained, 1c.) install one wood and glass door - single large pane, on the west side, 1d.) re-cover the existing west side garage door - as constructed, rough wood simulating a side-hinged door, 1e.) add porch on the west side - round columns of wood hand-scraped, smooth, and stained; corbels as shown of smooth, stained wood; single railing 42-inch tall of smooth stained wood; canopy with 2'-tall parapet; add canales (water spouts); ceiling underside of wood stained to match posts; wood floor, 1f.) add door and steps and canopy on the east side - door flush wood or metal; canopy with metal roof; **2.) on 2928B Paseo**, 2a.) add windows - on the west side add two, single-pane units with no dividers; the panes will be set-in 1" to 2" from the face of the frames, frames of 1"x4" wood, 2b.) install wood and glass door - single large pane, on the west side, 2c.) add cover at west side - fabric

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 6 of 18

January 7, 2009

awning over door and windows, 2d.) install a roofless utility enclosure next to 2920 Paseo - match the existing pressed-wood siding on 2928B, with doorway of matching material; **3.) on 2920 Paseo**, 3a.) install wood and glass door on the north side - single large pane, 3b.) install deck behind 2920 and 2924 Paseo - height at the floor level of 2920, where it meets the building edges (no railings), 3c.) install filler panel between the back corners of 2920 and 2924 Paseo - stuccoed wood; **4.) other property features** 4a.) install walkways of concrete, and a wood bridge over water feature as constructed, 4b.) enhance landscaping - rock-lined waterway, large stones crossing, other vegetation, 4c.) install platform - on north side, as constructed, 4d.) remove parking lot fence at northwest corner - add 2' to 3'-high shrubbery, and 4e.) add rail fence along north side - as constructed with extension to 2928A porch, with the option to use smooth, stained wood.

John Belt was present for comment.

Staff received comments, from a tenant, prior to the meeting.

APPROVED with Condition. Motion: Collier / Nelson to move **approval with conditions** that, based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-08-177 and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds:

- that the buildings on this property are not considered historic;
- that the building identified as 2928A and 2928B Paseo has been a secondary structure;
- that the proposed new openings for 2928A and 2928B Paseo permit the conversion of this storage building to retail uses in this commercial district;
- that 2928A and 2928B Paseo has existing pressed-wood siding and corrugated metal roofing, which may remain in-place unless modified with Commission approval;
- that the proposed stucco wall material for 2928A Paseo complies with the requirements for construction in the underlying zone;
- that the proposed work is a “unique circumstance” due to the non-historic nature of the structures and significant alterations over time;
- that the proposed work is a “unique circumstance” due to commercial use and setting;
- that the proposed work is historically appropriate and is consistent with the spirit and intent of the Preservation Guidelines;
- that the proposed work will not adversely affect the historic character of the property or the integrity of the historic district;
- that the proposed changes will have no effect upon the appearance of any historic building;
- that this action is consistent with the provisions of §4250.4 D (3)(4)(5) and (6), §4250.4 H, §4250.4 J, and §4250.4 L(2) of the Historic Preservation Ordinance; §7300.8 B, §7300.8 E, and §7300.8 F of the Paseo NC Zoning

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 7 of 18

January 7, 2009

Ordinance; and Subchapters 1.6, 1.9, 2.2, 2.4, 2.5, 2.6, 2.9, 2.10, 3.2, 3.4, and 3.5 of the Preservation Guidelines and Standards; and

- that based upon the evidence that has been presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, that although the action requested cannot be approved as presented, that in recognition of the applicant's willingness to accept the conditions of approval, that the amended action requested is in compliance, and the proposed material change in appearance would not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historic or architectural significance and value of the historic property and/or district according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Conditions of approval are:

- For item 1a.), the stucco on the west, south, and north walls of 2928A will have a smooth finish;
- For items 1b.) and 2a.), the windows on the west side of 2928A and 2928B will be of clear glazing;
- For item 1d.), the west-side garage door of 2928A will be stained to match the porch columns;
- For item 1f.), the canopy over the east side door of 2928A will be either changed to a cloth awning or omitted;
- For item 2c.), the cloth awning over the west side openings of 2928B will be divided into three sections, one over each opening;
- For item 4a.), the concrete walkways will be brushed medium-grey;
- For item 4d.), the shrubbery along the street edges of the four-car parking lot will be a minimum of 3' tall;
- For item 4e.), the fence along the north side will be smooth, stained wood;
- clarification that the rail fence will be replacing the majority of the stockade fencing at the northern boundary, easterly to the front of the building, leaving a small panel of the stockade fencing at the porch location; and
- the retaining wall and concrete blocks will have a visually smooth surface.

Ayes: Tague, Collier, Daniel, Holcombe, Galbraith, Nelson, Jones, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Absent: Taylor.

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 8 of 18

January 7, 2009

- 6D. HPCA-08-174 at 2808 N Robinson Ave. (Jefferson Park), Ward 7. Consideration and possible action on application of Carl C. Smith for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) replace balcony railing.

Carl Smith and Frankie Currin were present for comment.

CONTINUED. Motion: Collier / Holcombe to move **continuance for 60-days** that, based upon the evidence that has been presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, that the Commission find that additional information is required from the applicant in order to determine whether the action requested is in compliance with Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Ayes: Tague, Collier, Daniel, Holcombe, Galbraith, Nelson, Jones, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Absent: Taylor.

- 6E. HPCA-08-180 at 119 NW 25th St. (Jefferson Park), Ward 7. Consideration and possible action on application of Sheveron Glover for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) demolish garage.

Continued on Continuance Docket.

- 6F. HPCA-08-178 at 233 NW 31st St. (Edgemere Park), Ward 2. Consideration and possible action on application of Monica Reid by Eric Guyer of Quality Construction for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) replace the front glass door.

Continued on Continuance Docket.

- 6G. HPCA-08-182 at 704 NW 42nd St. (Crown Heights), Ward 2. Consideration and possible action on application of Monte S. Turrentine by Eva Osborne, AIA for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1a.) remove wood windows with aluminum panning, 1b.) remove steel casement windows, 1c.) remove wood window frames with panning, 2a.) remove recently installed wood windows with aluminum cladding and insulated glazing, 2b.) remove new window frames, 3a.) install new 1/1 wood windows with single-pane glazing and no cladding, 3b.) install new steel casement windows with single-pane glazing, 3c.) install painted wood window frames with no cladding.

Monte Turrentine and Eva Osborne, were present for comment.

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 9 of 18

January 7, 2009

The Crown Heights Preservation Review Committee submitted written comments to staff prior to the meeting.

DENIED. Motion: Collier / (no second) – **Motion Failed.**

APPROVED. Motion: Daniel / Zimmer move **approval of items** 1a.) remove wood windows with aluminum panning, 1c.) remove wood window frames with panning, 2a.) remove recently installed wood windows with aluminum cladding and insulated glazing, 2b.) remove new window frames, 3a.) install new 1/1 wood windows with single-pane glazing and no cladding, and, 3c.) install painted wood window frames with no cladding that, based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-08-182 and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds:

- that the submitted evidence concerning the deteriorated condition of the wood sash windows and wood frames may be inadequate to justify their removal; however, the added cladding could have caused hidden deterioration;
- that the original windows and frames are not available for installation;
- that the guidelines provide for replacement in-kind for units deteriorated beyond repair;
- that the proposed windows and frames are as near to in-kind as possible, given the available information;
- that the currently installed windows and frames are not appropriate to this historic resource;
- that this action is consistent with the provisions of *4250.4 D(3)(4)(5) and (6) and 4250.4 H and 4250.4 J of the Historic Preservation Ordinance and Subchapter 2.5 of the Preservation Guidelines and Standards;* and
- that based upon the evidence presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, the action requested as related to replacement of sash windows with single pane units, and replacement of wood window frames is in compliance, and the proposed material change in appearance as related to would not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical or architectural significance and value of the historic property and district according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007; and

Ayes: Tague, Daniel, Holcombe, Galbraith, Nelson, Jones, Zimmer.

Nays: Collier.

Absent: Taylor.

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 10 of 18

January 7, 2009

APPROVED. Motion: Daniel / Zimmer move approval of items 1b.) remove steel casement windows, and 3b.) install new steel casement windows with single-pane glazing that, based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-08-182 and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds:

- that the submitted evidence concerning the deteriorated condition of the casement windows is inadequate to justify their removal;
- that the original windows and frames are not available for installation;
- that the guidelines provide for replacement in-kind for units deteriorated beyond repair;
- that the proposed windows and frames are as near to in-kind as possible, given the available information;
- that the currently installed windows and frames are not in compliance with the Preservation Guidelines and Standards;
- that this action is consistent with the provisions of *4250.4 D(3)(4)(5) and (6) and 4250.4 H and 4250.4 J of the Historic Preservation Ordinance and Subchapter 2.5 of the Preservation Guidelines and Standards*; and
- that based upon the evidence presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, the action requested as related to replacement of presently existing windows with new steel casement windows with single pane glazing which replicates the historic steel casement windows is in compliance, and the proposed material change in appearance would not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical or architectural significance and value of the historic property and district according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Ayes: Tague, Daniel, Holcombe, Galbraith, Nelson, Zimmer.

Nays: Collier, Jones.

Absent: Taylor.

- 6H. HPCA-08-172 at 620 NW 14th St.. (Heritage Hills), Ward 6. Consideration and possible action on application of Kimberlyn Hall for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) remove original window and patio door, 2a.) replace one original kitchen window at west façade, 2b.) replace original patio door at north facade 4.) remove non-original windows, 5.) replace none-original windows to include 5a.) replace one kitchen window at west façade and one kitchen window at south façade, 5b.) replace one stairwell window at west façade, 5c.) replace master bathroom window at south façade, 5d.) replace three bay windows at north (front) façade.

Charlie Hall was present for comment.

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 11 of 18

January 7, 2009

DENIED. Motion: Holcombe / Galbraith to move **denial with prejudice** that, based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-08-172 and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds:

- that there is no documentation as to the condition of the original window and door;
- that the proposed replacement glass is LoE in all items;
- that this action is consistent with the provisions of *4250.4 D (3), (5) and (6), 4250.4.H, and 4250.4 L (2) of the Historic Preservation Ordinance and Subchapter(s) 2.1, 2.4, 2.5 of the Preservation Guidelines and Standards*; and
- that based upon the evidence presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, the action requested is not in compliance, and the proposed material change in appearance would have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical or architectural significance and value of the historic property and district according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Ayes: Tague, Collier, Daniel, Holcombe, Galbraith, Nelson, Jones, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Absent: Taylor.

- 6I. HPCA-08-181 at 400 NW 19th St. (Heritage Hills), Ward 6. Consideration and possible action on application of Paul & Judy Lambert by Eva Osborne, AIA for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) remove aluminum windows retaining wood transoms and perimeter wood jambs and headers and 2.) install new 1/1 wood windows with clear insulated glass and no cladding.

Eva Osborne was present for comment.

APPROVED. Motion: Holcombe / Daniel to move **approval** that, based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-08-181 and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds:

- that the removal of non-original windows and replacement of those windows will not destroy or alter all, or part, of a resource;
- that the materials proposed to replace the existing non-historic windows are compatible with the aesthetic and structural appearance of the resource including, but not limited to, the consideration of texture, style, color or the components, and the combination of elements, such as brick, stone, concrete, shingle, wood or stucco;

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 12 of 18

January 7, 2009

- that the design of the proposed replacement windows is compatible to the significant characteristics of the resource including, but not limited to, a consideration of a harmony of materials, details, height, mass, proportion, rhythm, scale, setback, shape, street accessories and workmanship;
- that the proposed replacement windows will be clear insulated glass in solid wood frames;
- that the design and materials of the proposed windows will reflect the characteristics of the historic building while still distinguishing them as modern replacements;
- that the historic windows were previously removed and replaced with the existing aluminum windows;
- that this action is consistent with the provisions of *4250.4 D (3), (4), (5) and (6) and 4250.4 L (2) of the Historic Preservation Ordinance and Subchapters 2.1 and 2.5 of the Preservation Guidelines and Standards*; and
- that based upon the evidence presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, the action requested is in compliance, and the proposed material change in appearance would not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical or architectural significance and value of the historic property and district according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Ayes: Tague, Collier, Daniel, Holcombe, Galbraith, Nelson, Jones, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Absent: Taylor.

- 6J. HPCA-08-157 at 817 NW 19th St.. (Mesta Park), Ward 6. Consideration and possible action on application of Sammie L. Flippo - Rev. Trust for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) remove deteriorated existing concrete garage slab, 2.) construct a new one-story 2-car garage to include 2a.) composition shingled gable roof, 2b.) horizontal wood lap siding, 2c.) solid wood paneled overhead door, 2d.) double paned fixed glass window, 2e.) wood panel pedestrian door, 3.) install deck, steps, and railing at rear façade, 4.) remove existing non-original windows at rear (north) facade, and 5.) install single insulated door and side lites.

Sammie L. Flippo was not present for comment.

The Mesta Park Preservation Review Committee submitted written comments to staff prior to the meeting.

CONTINUED. Motion: Daniel / Collier to move continuance for 30-days on item 2c.) solid wood paneled overhead door that, based upon the evidence that has been

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 13 of 18

January 7, 2009

presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, that the Commission find that additional information is required from the applicant in order to determine whether the action requested is in compliance with Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Ayes: Tague, Collier, Daniel, Holcombe, Galbraith, Nelson, Jones, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Absent: Taylor.

APPROVED. Motion: Daniel / Collier to move ~~approval on items 1.) remove deteriorated existing concrete garage slab, 2.) construct a new one-story 2-car garage to include 2a.) composition shingled gable roof, 2b.) horizontal wood lap siding, 2d.) double paned fixed glass window, 2e.) wood panel pedestrian door, 4.) remove existing non-original windows at rear (north) facade, and 5.) install single insulated door and side lites~~ that, based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-08-157 and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds:

- that this action would not destroy or alter all, or part, of a resource;
- that the building materials proposed for this project are compatible with the aesthetic and structural appearance of the resource including, but not limited to, the consideration of texture, style, color or the components, and the combination of elements, such as brick, stone, concrete, shingle, wood or stucco;
- that the design of the proposed garage, and door assembly is compatible to the significant characteristics of the resource including, but not limited to, a consideration of a harmony of materials, details, height, mass, proportion, rhythm, scale, setback, shape, street accessories and workmanship;
- that a garage is necessary and the original, as illustrated in the Sanborn Map, has been demolished prior to this owner's acquisition;
- that the design of the proposed garage is modest and does not compete with the primary residential structure;
- that the Sanborn Map shows a detached garage of a similar size and that no historic evidence has been presented as to the style or details of the original structure;
- that the spacing and size of the proposed window and pedestrian door in the garage are similar to the historic counterparts and to the proportion of window to wall space as well as shape, location, pattern, size, materials and details within the district;
- that the new door and side lites proposed in the residence are replacing non-historic windows and are located in the rear façade;

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 14 of 18

January 7, 2009

- that this action is consistent with the provisions of *4250.4 D (3), (5,) and (6) and 4250.4 L (2) of the Historic Preservation Ordinance and Subchapter(s) 1.5, 2.4, 2.5, 3.3, 3.5 of the Preservation Guidelines and Standards*; and
- that based upon the evidence presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, the action requested is in compliance, and the proposed material change in appearance would not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical or architectural significance and value of the historic property and district according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

CONTINUED. Motion: Daniel / Collier to move **continuance for 30-days on item 3.) install deck, steps, and railing at rear façade** that, based upon the evidence that has been presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, that the Commission find that additional information is required from the applicant in order to determine whether the action requested is in compliance with Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Ayes: Tague, Collier, Daniel, Holcombe, Galbraith, Nelson, Jones, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Absent: Taylor.

- 6K. HPCA-08-179 at 926 NW 17th St. (Mesta Park), Ward 6. Consideration and possible action on application of Lewis Hassell by Jeremy Hume of Quality Construction for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) remove window in south attic gable, 2.) replace window with option 2a.) a larger half-circle, wood, true divided lite window unit for emergency egress from new bedroom in existing attic space, or option 2b.) a 1/1 wood casement window.

Jeremy Hume was present for comment.

The Mesta Park Preservation Review Committee submitted written comments to staff prior to the meeting.

APPROVED. Motion: Holcombe / Nelson to move **approval with Option 2A** that, based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-08-179 and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds:

- that the proposed demolition and replacement of the attic window will not destroy or alter all, or part, of a resource;
- that the proposed replacement window material is compatible with the aesthetic and structural appearance of the resource including, but not limited

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 15 of 18

January 7, 2009

to, the consideration of texture, style, color or the components, and the combination of elements, such as brick, stone, concrete, shingle, wood or stucco;

- that the design of the replacement window is compatible to the significant characteristics of the resource including, but not limited to, a consideration of a harmony of materials, details, height, mass, proportion, rhythm, scale, setback, shape, street accessories and workmanship;
- that the replacement window will reflect the style and period of the historic building;
- that the proposed windows will be solid wood frame and trim and clear single-pane glass in true divided lites;
- that in order to achieve the clearance required by the Municipal Building Code and keep the size of the new opening as close to the original window openings as possible, the proposed windows will be wood casements and that the casement window configuration will resemble the original sash windows;
- that the requirements of the Municipal Building Code dictating the opening clearance necessary for emergency egress and rescue from upper level bedrooms constitutes a unique circumstance;
- that although the Guidelines dictate that existing windows, and replacement window configuration, and sizes be maintained, following this mandate could represent a threat to the safety of residents and visitors and would violate the Municipal Building Code;
- that this action is consistent with the provisions of *4250.4 D (3), (5) and (6), 4250.4 (I), and 4250.4 L (2) of the Historic Preservation Ordinance and Subchapter 2.5 of the Preservation Guidelines and Standards*; and
- that based upon the evidence presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, the action requested is in compliance, and that the proposed material change in appearance would not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical or architectural significance and value of the historic property and district according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Ayes: Tague, Collier, Daniel, Holcombe, Galbraith, Nelson, Jones, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Absent: Taylor.

7. OTHER BUSINESS

(Heard out of order) **7B.** CE-757 Easement Closing (Mesta Park), Ward 6, Requesting recommendation from the Historic Preservation Commission on an

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 16 of 18

January 7, 2009

application set for hearing by the Planning Commission on January 15, 2009 for easement closing platted east/west alley in all of Block 28 in University Addition located south of NW 22nd Street between Dewey Avenue and Walker Avenue.

Heather Hendricks was present for comment.

RECOMMENDATION. Motion: Collier / Galbraith to move **recommend approval**.

Ayes: Tague, Collier, Daniel, Holcombe, Galbraith, Nelson, Jones, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Absent: Taylor.

- 7A.** Zoning Change SPUD-497 (Heritage Hills East), Ward 7. Requesting recommendation from the Historic Preservation Commission on an application set for hearing by the Planning Commission on January 15, 2009 to REZONE from R4/General Residential/Historic Landmark/Urban Conservation District to SPUD-497 at 124 NW 15th Street.

Note: This proposed SPUD was reviewed and received comments by the Historic Preservation Commission at last month's meeting. However, the applicant was not notified and therefore, did not attend the meeting. This item is put back on the agenda this month for reconsideration and to allow the applicant to be present and address the Commission regarding the SPUD application.

Bert Belanger, for Fred and Steve Neighbors, was present for comment.

Staff received comments from Heritage Hills East Neighborhood Association.

NO ACTION. Mr. Belanger stated that he would request a deferral on the January 15th Planning Commission to allow him time to meet with the Heritage Hills East Neighborhood Association, then return to the Historic Preservation Commission (within at least 60 days) for a recommendation once those issues are resolved.

- 7B.** CE-757 Easement Closing (Mesta Park), Ward 6, Requesting recommendation from the Historic Preservation Commission on an application set for hearing by the Planning Commission on January 15, 2009 for easement closing platted east/west alley in all of Block 28 in University Addition located south of NW 22nd Street between Dewey Avenue and Walker Avenue.

Heard prior to item 7A.

- 7C.** Proposed Ordinance Amendment: Consider proposed changes to the ordinance

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 17 of 18

January 7, 2009

regarding Historic Preservation Commission membership requirements.

The Mesta Park Preservation Review Committee submitted written comments to staff prior to the meeting.

DEFERRED Motion: Daniel / Zimmer to move **deferral**.

Ayes: Tague, Collier, Daniel, Holcombe, Galbraith, Nelson, Jones, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Absent: Taylor.

8. COMMUNICATIONS AND REPORTS

A. Commission Members

B. Municipal Counselor

C. Administrative Approvals

8C1. HPCA-08-183 at 421 NW 26th St. (Jefferson Park), Ward 2. Staff is announcing the Administrative Approval of the item on the application of Shawna Villines for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) install fence.

8C2. HPCA-08-172 at 620 NW 14th St.. (Heritage Hills), Ward 6. Staff is announcing the Administrative Approval of the item on the application of Kimberlyn Hall for Certificate of Appropriateness to 6.) replace existing fence and gate at side yard.

D. Withdrawals

8D1. HPCA-08-159 at 505 NW 42nd St.. (Crown Heights), Ward 2. Staff is announcing the withdrawal of the items on the application of Barbara Charlet for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) remove wood deck, 2.) install concrete deck, and 3.) install stone fireplace.

E. Board of Adjustment

8E1. HPCA-08-133 at 415 NW 22nd St. (Mesta Park), Ward 6. Staff is announcing the appeal of the Historic Preservation Commissions denial of the application of Timothy J. Lyons for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) demolish and replace original brick chimney. **On December 4, 2008, the Board Of Adjustment upheld the decision of the Historic Preservation Commission.**

8E2. HPCA-08-049 at 3015 N Harvey Pkwy. (Jefferson Park), Ward 2. Staff is

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 18 of 18

January 7, 2009

announcing the appeal of the Historic Preservation Commissions denial of the application of Greta Stromberg for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) replace windows. **This appeal is scheduled for the January 8, 2009 Board Of Adjustment meeting.**

9. CITIZENS TO BE HEARD

10. OTHER BUSINESS

- A. Catherine Montgomery, AIA, has been hired as the City's new Historic Preservation Architect. Her first day of employment will be January 23, 2009.
- B. The next regularly scheduled meeting for the Historic Preservation Commission is Wednesday, February 4, 2009 at 2:00 p.m. at the Municipal Building, City Council Chamber. New applications and information on continued projects are to be submitted to staff by 4:00 p.m., Tuesday, January 13, 2009.
- C. The next regularly scheduled workshop for the Historic Preservation Commission scheduled for Monday, January 12, 2009 at 4:00 p.m. at 420 W. Main Street, Suite 900, is cancelled.

11 ADJOURNMENT (4:35 p.m.)

Motion: Daniel / Zimmer to adjourn the 1/7/2009, meeting of the Historic Preservation Commission.

Ayes: Tague, Collier, Daniel, Holcombe, Galbraith, Nelson, Jones, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Absent: Taylor.

pjh