

MINUTES
Regular Meeting
HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION
May 2, 2007 - 3:00 p.m.
Municipal Building, City Council Chamber

The meeting of the Oklahoma City Historic Preservation Commission was called to order in the City Council Chamber, 3rd Floor of the Municipal Building, 200 N. Walker Avenue, Oklahoma City, Oklahoma. The meeting convened at 3:05 p.m. Notice of the meeting and agenda were filed with the City Clerk's office and posted on the Council bulletin board 24/48 hours prior to the meeting.

1. CALL TO ORDER AND ROLL CALL

Members Present: Thomas J. Daniel IV, Chairman
Thomas Small, AIA, Vice-Chairman
Carolee Galbraith
Marnie Taylor
Jane Holcombe
Roland Tague
Karen Collier
Karen Nelson

Members Absent: Randy Floyd

Staff Present: Eva Osborne, AIA, Preservation Architect, Planning Department
Susan Miller, Planner IV, Planning Department
Johnie Matthews, Planning Department
Rita Douglas-Talley, Assistant Municipal Counselor

2. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

APPROVED. Motion: Small/Galbraith to approve the minutes of the April 4, 2007, Historic Preservation Commission meeting. Ayes: Daniel, Galbraith, Taylor, Holcombe, Small, Collier, Tague and Nelson. Nays: None.

3. CITATION REPORT

Mr. Wilson, Zoning Inspector, was present for comment and to introduce Matt Maloy.

4. CONTINUANCE REQUESTS

- A. Staff request continuance of the following cases:
None
- B. Other continuance requests:
None

Historic Preservation Commission

May 2, 2007

Minutes - Page 2 of 17

5. CONSENT DOCKET CASES

- 5A. HPCA-07-040 at 810 1/2 NW 18. (Mesta Park), Ward 6. Consideration and possible action on application of Sandra Fix for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) construct 2-story garage/apartment with insulated wood windows.

Ms. Fix was not present for comment.

The Mesta Park Preservation Review Committee submitted written comments to staff prior to the meeting.

APPROVED. Motion: Taylor/Tague to approve the above item as stated. Ayes: Daniel, Galbraith, Taylor, Holcombe, Small, Collier, Tague and Nelson. Nays: None.

6. CASES FOR INDIVIDUAL CONSIDERATION

- 6A. HPCA-07-014 at 825 NW 15. (Heritage Hills), Ward 6. Consideration and possible action on application of Dr. Lance and Winnie Hoover by Rodney Poole for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) remove metal carport at driveway including 1a.) repair east façade of balcony structure and 1b.) relocate awning, 2.) construct new addition including 2a.) composition shingle roof and flat copper roof, 2b.) brick walls, 2c.) wood single-pane true divided-light windows, 2d.) wood/clear glass doors, 2e.) concrete porches and balcony with iron rails, 2f.) brick chimney and 2g.) dormers.

Dr. Hoover was present for comment. During Dr. Hoover's discussion with the Commissioners, he requested a comparison of his proposed ratio of built square footage/green space square footage to the ratio of 2 other properties. The first property is at the Northeast corner of 14th Street and Dewey and the second property is at 911 NW 15th Street.

The Heritage Hills Preservation Review Committee did not submit to staff written comments prior to the meeting.

Staff received 2 letters of protest and 1 letter of support for the proposal from citizens, prior to the meeting.

Commissioner Tague announced that he must abstain from voting as his law partner submitted a letter of protest.

DENIED. Motion: Small/Collier to **deny without prejudice** the application HPCA-07-014. Ayes: Daniel, Galbraith, Taylor, Holcombe, Small, Collier and Nelson. Nays: None. Abstained: Tague. The Staff Report as well as the Commissioners pointed out issues where the proposal is not consistent with the Design Guidelines.

Historic Preservation Commission

May 2, 2007

Minutes - Page 3 of 17

In response, several amendments were made by the applicant and verbally explained during the meeting. These amendments have not been illustrated by the submitted drawings and the submitted proposal lacks sufficient product information, etc. Therefore, the application was denied without prejudice for lack of information.

Ms. Raina Pelofsky addressed the Commission to complain that the protest letters concerning the previous design proposal that were submitted for the April 7, 2007 meeting and distributed to the Commissioners at that meeting, were not re-distributed to the Commissioners at the present meeting or with the Staff Report. The Commissioners asked staff to implement a new policy to make new copies of all protest letters and re-distribute these copies each time an application was heard due to a continuance.

- 6B. HPCA-07-048 at 916 NW 14. (Heritage Hills), Ward 6. Consideration and possible action on application of Michael McClintock by Chris Evans for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) demolish existing addition and 2.) construct new 1-story addition including 2a.) composition roof to match existing roof, 2b.) wood horizontal lap siding, 2c.) wood corner boards, wood trim/fascia and wood bead board soffits, 2d.) true divided-light wood windows with aluminum cladding, 2e.) wood pedestrian door with clear glass and aluminum cladding and 2f.) new concrete porch with wood rail.

Mr. McClintock was present for comment and agreed to the amendments/conditions listed below.

The Heritage Hills Preservation Review Committee did not submit written comments to staff prior to the meeting.

CONDITIONALLY APPROVED. Motion: Small/Holcombe to **conditionally approve** the application HPCA-07-048, including the proposed demolition. Ayes: Daniel, Galbraith, Taylor, Holcombe, Small, Collier, Tague and Nelson. Nays: None.

The demolition was approved due to the finding that the 1-story addition subject to demolition is not a significant historic feature of the property and is not contributing to the historic integrity of the district.

The condition of approval is as follows:

Concerning Item 2.) match the historic back porch roof retaining the existing beam and overhang as shown in the photograph and replace the 2 existing columns with a pilaster made of wood that boxes in a frame. The drawings including the elevations must be revised to reflect the amendments/conditions and submitted to staff for

Historic Preservation Commission

May 2, 2007

Minutes - Page 4 of 17

verification that the changes have been accurately illustrated prior to the issuance of the Certificate of Appropriateness.

- 6C. HPCA-07-051 at 801 NW 15. (Heritage Hills), Ward 6. Consideration and possible action on application of John Richardson III for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) replace garage doors, 2.) replace and increase (or add new) driveway, 3.) construct new iron fence with brick columns at west sideyard and iron gates across driveways, 4.) remove existing wood fence and construct new wood fence at east sideyard, 5.) demolish back porch and construct new porch 6.) construct arbor and 7.) remove window and brick below window at a window opening at the east end of the back (north) façade and install French door assembly.

Mr. And Ms. Richardson were present for comment and amended the proposal in response to the Staff Report as follows:

- Mr. Richardson implied that there were no amendments to Items 1.), 5.) and 7.) however, he clarified that the bottom of the upper beam of the arbor will be no higher than 7'-0".
- All of the proposed fences are no higher than 6'-0".
- The fence running east/west along the south end of the east sideyard (along 15th Street) will be wrought iron with brick columns, as illustrated in the submitted drawings and the fence running north/south along the east property line (along Shartel) will be wood with brick columns as previously proposed.
- The new exterior doors at the new back porch are illustrated by photos of the interior doors and a "Photoshop" print of the exterior north elevation with the doors at the proposed location. The applicant stated that they will be custom crafted with wood and clear glass, true divided-light and no cladding. The existing masonry that defines the perimeter of the existing window opening will not be altered except that the sill will be removed and the brick wall below the opening will be removed down to finished floor height. (Note: no change has been proposed concerning the basement windows at the north façade and therefore, they will be covered without permanent alterations so that they will remain in the current condition without further damage after the new porch is constructed.)
- The new driveway section will be 10'-0" wide rather than the illustrated 12'-0" wide.
- The chainlink fence will be removed and replaced with the adjacent new fence type.
- The new concrete will be medium grey brushed concrete to match the color of the historic concrete. There will be no decorative scoring pattern and no decorative tile or pavers at new concrete areas.

Staff received 1 letter of protest from a citizen, prior to the meeting. Copies of the letter were handed to the Commissioners prior to the meeting.

Historic Preservation Commission

May 2, 2007

Minutes - Page 5 of 17

The Heritage Hills Preservation Review Committee did not submit written comments to staff prior to the meeting. However, the Preservation Review Committee Representative was present with comments.

Ms. Raina Pelofsky was present to comment.

APPROVED. Motion: Tague/Galbraith to **approve Item 1.)** of the application HPCA-07-051. Ayes: Daniel, Galbraith, Taylor, Holcombe, Small, Collier, Tague and Nelson. Nays: None.

CONDITIONALLY APPROVED. Motion: Tague/Small to **conditionally approve Item 2.)** of the application HPCA-07-051, as amended. Ayes: Daniel, Taylor, Small, Tague and Nelson. Nays: Galbraith, Holcombe and Collier.

Based on the unique circumstance of this property, the HP Commission is issuing a finding that this proposed work item (Item 2.), with conditions and amendments, is historically appropriate and is consistent with the spirit and intent of the Guidelines and that the proposed work will not adversely affect the historic character of the property or the integrity of the historic district. The referenced unique circumstance is that existing features of the building protrude into the clearance defined by the width of the driveway under the porte-cochere. The protrusions limit the usage of the property including access to the backyard and garage.

The conditions of approval of Item 2 are as follows:

- The new driveway will be reduced in width, as amended by the applicant, to 10'-0" wide rather than 12'-0" wide,
- The north half of the new driveway adjacent to the porte-cochere will be a mirrored image of the south half of the new driveway adjacent to the porte-cochere with the existing driveway continuing to the north until it ends at the garage doors. This northern section of driveway will be no wider than 10'-0" where it abuts the north end of the double drive and it will match the width of the south façade of the garage for a length of no more than 20'-0" at the north end.
- There will be no parking area west of the garage.
- All amendments and conditions of approval must be illustrated by the revised drawings and submitted to staff for verification prior to the issuance of the Certificate of Appropriateness.

DENIED. Motion: Tague/Galbraith to **deny with prejudice Item 3.)** of the application HPCA-07-051, as amended. Ayes: Daniel, Galbraith, Taylor, Holcombe, Small, Collier, Tague and Nelson. Nays: None.

Historic Preservation Commission

May 2, 2007

Minutes - Page 6 of 17

The proposed iron fences and gates at the west side yard were denied with prejudice because they fail to meet the Design Guidelines in that the location is forward of the half-way point at the side yard.

RESCEND PREVIOUS MOTION. Motion: Tague/Taylor to **rescind the previous motion concerning Item 3.)** of the application HPCA-07-051, as amended. Ayes: Daniel, Galbraith, Taylor, Holcombe, Small, Collier, Tague and Nelson. Nays: None.

CONDITIONALLY APPROVED. Motion: Tague/Taylor to **conditionally approve Item 3.)** of the application HPCA-07-051, as amended. Ayes: Daniel, Galbraith, Taylor, Holcombe, Small, Collier, Tague and Nelson. Nays: None.

The conditions of approval of Item 3.) are as follows:

The proposed fence and gates at the west side of the property will be no further forward than the back column of the porte-cochere. The applicant had amended the proposal to include the removal of the existing chain link fence to be replaced with the proposed new fence. The fence will be no higher than 6'-0".

CONDITIONALLY APPROVED. Motion: Tague/Small to **conditionally approve item 4.)** of the application HPCA-07-051, as amended. Ayes: Daniel, Galbraith, Taylor, Holcombe, Small, Collier, Tague and Nelson. Nays: None.

The condition of approval of Item 4.) is as follows:

The fence that runs north/south along Shartel will be the illustrated wood with brick columns fence at the north portion and the illustrated wrought iron with brick columns fence at the south portion. The change of fence types will occur at a point flush with the back pilaster at the corner of the house. The fence that runs east/west along 15th Street will be the illustrated wrought iron with brick columns fence. The fence will be no higher than 6'-0".

APPROVED. Motion: Tague/Holcombe to **approve item 5.)** of the application HPCA-07-051. Ayes: Daniel, Galbraith, Taylor, Holcombe, Small, Collier, Tague and Nelson. Nays: None.

APPROVED. Motion: Tague/Small to **approve item 6.)** of the application HPCA-07-051, as amended. Ayes: Daniel, Galbraith, Taylor, Holcombe, Small, Collier, Tague and Nelson. Nays: None. The proposal was amended so that the bottom of the structural beam above the arbor will be no higher than 7'-0".

Historic Preservation Commission

May 2, 2007

Minutes - Page 7 of 17

CONDITIONALLY APPROVED. Motion: Tague/Collier to **conditionally approve item 7.)** of the application HPCA-07-051, as amended. Ayes: Daniel, Galbraith, Taylor, Holcombe, Small, Collier, Tague and Nelson. Nays: None.

The condition of approval of Item 7.) is as follows:

The proposed door assembly will match the supplemental information handed-out at the meeting including the "Photoshop" print provided that the doors will be constructed of wood, clear glass, true divided-light with no cladding and the masonry to the sides and above the existing window opening will remain undisturbed.

- 6D. HPCA-07-052 at 1015 NW 14. (Heritage Hills), Ward 6. Consideration and possible action on application of Carla Wood by Kevin Heid for KRD Construction for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) demolish garage and 2.) construct 2-car, 2-story garage caretaker loft including 2a.) Option 1 for asphalt shingle front gable roof with stucco/timbers above brick walls or 2b.) Option 2 brick walls below a hipped roof, 2c.) wood true divided-light windows, 2d.) wood panel pedestrian doors, 2e.) wood stair and 2f.) two options for garage doors.

Mr. Heid was present for comment. The applicant brought copies of a structural engineer's report that were handed-out at the meeting. The applicant amended the application to delete the metal garage door option. Additionally, the roof slope was amended to 4/12.

John Joyce was present with comments.

The Heritage Hills Preservation Review Committee did not submit written comments to staff prior to the meeting.

Diane Wilks, neighboring property owner to the east addressed the Commission objecting to the 2-story proposed garage as it relates to a mature tree.

APPROVED. Motion: Small/Taylor to **approve item 1.)** of the application HPCA-07-052. Ayes: Daniel, Galbraith, Taylor, Holcombe, Small, Tague, and Nelson. Nays: Collier. The demolition was approved based on the structural engineer's letter and testimony at the meeting that the structure is an imminent threat to public safety and the only way to alleviate said threat is to demolish the structure.

CONTINUED. Motion: Galbraith/ Tague to **continue for 30-days item 2.)** of the application HPCA-07-052, as amended and clarified. Ayes: Daniel, Galbraith, Taylor, Holcombe, Small, Collier, Tague and Nelson. Nays: None. The Commission noted that the property is at the edge of the district with Commercial uses near by. The continuance was granted to allow the property owner additional time to consider moving the proposed new garage to protect the tree.

Historic Preservation Commission

May 2, 2007

Minutes - Page 8 of 17

- 6E. HPCA-07-053 at 200 NW 17. (Heritage Hills), Ward 7. Consideration and possible action on application of Tyler Peyton for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) replace roof including first layer of wood shingles 2.) replace fence.

Mr. Peyton was present for comment.

The Heritage Hills Preservation Review Committee did not submit written comments to staff prior to the meeting.

CONDITIONALLY APPROVED. Motion: Collier/Holcombe to **conditionally approve item 1.)** of the application HPCA-07-053. Ayes: Daniel, Galbraith, Taylor, Holcombe, Small, Collier, Tague and Nelson. Nays: None.

The condition of approval is as follows:

The applicant must follow the recommendations written in the staff report and the color of the new shingles will be a neutral color.

CONTINUED. Motion: Collier/Galbraith to **continue for 30-days item 2.)** of the application HPCA-07-053, as amended. Ayes: Daniel, Galbraith, Taylor, Holcombe, Small, Collier, Tague and Nelson. Nays: None. The fence item was amended to meet the criteria for administrative approval including a height of 4'-0" and change of location. Therefore, the item was continued for 30-days to provide for administrative review. Additional drawings are necessary to illustrate the proposal.

- 6F. HPCA-07-056 at 428 NW 21. (Heritage Hills), Ward 6. Consideration and possible action on application of Mary Marlo Barton by Robert W. Haggard for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) build new garage/cabana including 1a.) hipped roof with asphalt shingles, 1b.) HardiPlank horizontal lap siding, 1c.) wood 1/1 windows with clear glass, 1d.) 15-light true divided-light wood pedestrian door with clear glass, 1e.) two wood panel garage doors and 2.) 2-story addition at house including 2a.) asphalt shingle roof and bead board soffits with wood fascia, 2b.) wood horizontal lap siding, 2c.) 1/1 wood windows, 6-light fixed window 2d.) wood full-light doors with no divisions with transoms above, 15-light true divided-light wood pedestrian door, 2e.) lower first-floor finished floor height, 3.) covered patio with open wood beams above 10" diameter columns to match historic double-columns at front porch, 4.) new 10" diameter columns to replace pipe-columns at flat roofed carport, 5.) uncover and repair kitchen window, 6.) construct wood fence with steel gate at driveway, 7.) two light fixture types and 8.) gutter and downspouts.

Mr. Haggard was present for comment.

Ms. Barton was present for comment.

Historic Preservation Commission

May 2, 2007

Minutes - Page 9 of 17

The Heritage Hills Preservation Review Committee did not submit written comments to staff prior to the meeting.

APPROVED. Motion: Collier/Galbraith to **approve item 1.)** of the application HPCA-07-056. Ayes: Daniel, Galbraith, Taylor, Holcombe, Small, Collier, Tague and Nelson. Nays: None.

APPROVED. Motion: Tague/Collier to **approve item 2.)** of the application HPCA-07-056. Ayes: Daniel, Galbraith, Taylor, Holcombe, Small, Collier, Tague and Nelson. Nays: None.

APPROVED. Motion: Collier/Holcombe to **approve item 3.)** of the application HPCA-07-056. Ayes: Daniel, Galbraith, Taylor, Holcombe, Small, Collier, Tague and Nelson. Nays: None.

APPROVED. Motion: Holcombe/Galbraith to **approve item 4.)** of the application HPCA-07-056. Ayes: Daniel, Galbraith, Taylor, Holcombe, Small, Collier, Tague and Nelson. Nays: None.

APPROVED. Motion: Collier/Holcombe to **approve item 5.)** of the application HPCA-07-056. Ayes: Daniel, Galbraith, Taylor, Holcombe, Small, Collier, Tague and Nelson. Nays: None.

CONDITIONALLY APPROVED. Motion: Collier/Galbraith to **conditionally approve item 6.)** of the application HPCA-07-056. Ayes: Daniel, Galbraith, Taylor, Holcombe, Small, Collier, Tague and Nelson. Nays: None.

The condition of approval is as follows:

The applicant amended the application to provide that the fence and gate will not exceed a max. height of 6'-0".

APPROVED. Motion: Holcombe/Galbraith to **approve item 7.)** of the application HPCA-07-056. Ayes: Daniel, Galbraith, Taylor, Holcombe, Small, Collier, Tague and Nelson. Nays: None.

APPROVED. Motion: Collier/Taylor to **approve item 8.)** of the application HPCA-07-056. Ayes: Daniel, Galbraith, Taylor, Holcombe, Small, Collier, Tague and Nelson. Nays: None.

The applicant clarified the proposal as follows:

The gutters and downspouts will match the color of the existing gutter.

Historic Preservation Commission

May 2, 2007

Minutes - Page 10 of 17

- 6G. HPCA-06-149 at 2215 N Walker. (Mesta Park), Ward 6. Consideration and possible action on application of OKC Public School District by Patrick Schoenfeldt for Certificate of Appropriateness to 4c.) amend the window proposal to include “low E” glazing rather than the previously approved “clear” glazing.

Mr. Schoenfeldt was present for comment.

Mr. Hasenbeck was present to comment with testing statistics and samples of the Low E glazing.

The Mesta Park Preservation Review Committee submitted written comments to staff prior to the meeting.

APPROVED. Motion: Collier/Small to approve the application HPCA-06-149. Ayes: Daniel, Galbraith, Taylor, Holcombe, Small, Collier, Tague and Nelson. Nays: None. The proposal was approved based on the statistics provided for the “low E” glass because according to the data and interpreted by the Commission, the proposed glazing meets the Design Guidelines’ requirement for clear glass. The proposed product is PPG Sungate 500. Based on the publication, the product has a reflectivity of 17% and visible light transmittance (VLT) not lower than 74.

The Commission requested that the criteria for maximum light reflectance and light transmission for “Low E” glass that was discussed should be included as a margin note in the Design Guidelines.

- 6H. HPCA-07-050 at 801 NW 17. (Mesta Park), Ward 6. Consideration and possible action on application of James A. Pickins for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) replace garage doors with 2 options and 2.) rebuild wood steps and porch to door (west façade of house).

Mr. Pickins was present for comment. He amended the proposal to include turning the stair at the west façade so that the stair will be parallel to the back wall of the house. He agreed with the Staff Report that the balusters at the stair rail will have flush horizontal and vertical wood pieces rather than the vertical wood lying adjacent to the horizontal wood. The garage doors will be retained/repared using a mechanical device to operate the movement.

The Mesta Park Preservation Review Committee submitted written comments to staff prior to the meeting.

CONTINUED. Motion: Small/Galbraith to **continue for 30-days item 1.)** of the application HPCA-07-050. Ayes: Daniel, Galbraith, Taylor, Holcombe, Small, Collier, Tague and Nelson. Nays: None. This item was continued to allow the

Historic Preservation Commission

May 2, 2007

Minutes - Page 11 of 17

applicant additional time to find a product to assist in the operating movement of the historic garage doors.

CONDITIONALLY APPROVED. Motion: Small/Taylor to **conditionally approve item 2.)** of the application HPCA-07-050, as amended. Ayes: Daniel, Galbraith, Taylor, Holcombe, Small, Collier, Tague and Nelson. Nays: None.

The condition of approval of Item 2 is as follows:

The stair will be constructed parallel to the back wall of the house and the baluster wood will be constructed with a mitered joint rather than the horizontal and vertical pieces being lapped.

- 6I. HPCA-07-039 at 517 NW 27. (Paseo), Ward 2. Consideration and possible action on application of Traci Aldridge by Juan Huaman for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) remove 3 brick piers and metal columns and 2.) add two twisted brick columns at front porch.

The applicant and property owner were not present for comment.

The Paseo Neighborhood Association did not submit written comments to staff prior to the meeting.

DENIED. Motion: Small/Collier to **deny with prejudice** the application HPCA-07-039. Ayes: Daniel, Galbraith, Taylor, Holcombe, Small, Collier, Tague and Nelson. Nays: None. The application was denied because the Design Guidelines state that significant Historic Features should be retained/repared rather than being replaced. The new columns were denied because the design is not consistent with the character of the historic district.

The Commission commented that photographs illustrate work items that were completed without a Certificate of Appropriateness. The action taken at this meeting, the Staff Report as well as a list of additional work items subject to review should be forwarded to the zoning inspector and compliance attorney.

- 6J. HPCA-07-037 at 517 NW 29. (Paseo), Ward 2. Consideration and possible action on application of F & C Holdings, LLC by Richard Foster for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) install railing at upper balcony.

Mr. Foster was not present for comment.

The Paseo Neighborhood Association did not submit written comments to staff prior to the meeting.

Historic Preservation Commission

May 2, 2007

Minutes - Page 12 of 17

APPROVED. Motion: Collier/Holcombe to **approve the application** HPCA-07-037. Ayes: Daniel, Taylor, Holcombe, Small, Collier, Tague and Nelson. Nays: Galbraith.

- 6K. HPCA-07-054 at 3101 N. Harvey Pkwy. (Edgemere Park), Ward 2. Consideration and possible action on application of Terry and Jann Hook by Randy Floyd Architects for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) amend HPCA-06-108 to construct proposed house 1'-11" to the south of the previously approved location and 2.) amend HPCA-06-108 to construct front sidewalk with 4'-0" width rather than the previously approved 3'-0" width.

Mr. and Ms. Hook were present for comment. Ms. Hook requested that Item 2.) be withdrawn for consideration at a future meeting.

Ms. Floyd was not present for comment.

The Edgemere Park Preservation Review Committee submitted written comments to staff prior to the meeting.

APPROVED. Motion: Tague/Galbraith to **approve the application** HPCA-07-054. Ayes: Daniel, Galbraith, Taylor, Holcombe, Small, Collier, Tague and Nelson. Nays: None.

- 6L. HPCA-07-044 at 228 NW 35. (Edgemere Park), Ward 2. Consideration and possible action on application of Kathryn Zenda for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) replace front walk.

Ms. Zenda was present for comment.

The Edgemere Park Preservation Review Committee submitted written comments to staff prior to the meeting.

DENIED. Motion: Collier/Holcombe to **deny with prejudice the application** HPCA-07-044. Ayes: Daniel, Galbraith, Taylor, Holcombe, Small, Collier, Tague and Nelson. Nays: None. The Commission found that the subject sidewalk is a significant historic feature of the property and therefore, it should be repaired/replaced in-kind.

- 6M. HPCA-07-055 at 704 NW 42. (Crown Heights), Ward 2. Consideration and possible action on application of Monte Turrentine by Todd Edmonds for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) demolish garage 2.) build new 1-story garage including 2a.) composition shingle roof, 2b.) wood or smooth HardiPlank horizontal lap siding, 2c.) aluminum clad wood double-hung window with no divisions, 2d.) wood ½-light pedestrian door, 2e.) wood panel overhead garage door and 3.) install new wood

Historic Preservation Commission

May 2, 2007

Minutes - Page 13 of 17

gates.

Mr. Turrentine was present for comment.

Mr. Edmonds was present for comment. He amended the application to withdraw Item 3.). A structural engineer's report was handed-out at the beginning of the meeting and supplemental photographs were provided that illustrate structural issues at the interior.

Mr. Joyce, Preservation Review Committee Representative was present with comments. He offered an opinion concerning the condition of the garage and clarified the Preservation Review Committee's report.

The Crown Heights Preservation Review Committee submitted written comments to staff prior to the meeting.

The Commission stated that all structural engineer's reports or architect's reports must be stamped with a professional seal and signature, as required by policy.

(MOTION FAILED) DENIED. Motion: Collier/Holcombe to **deny without prejudice item 1.)** of the application HPCA-07-055. Ayes: Collier and Holcombe. Nays: Daniel, Galbraith, Taylor, Small, Tague and Nelson. The motion to deny the demolition was based on the finding that inadequate documentation was presented in support of a finding that the garage is an imminent threat to public safety and the only means of eleviating said threat is to demolish the structure. *(Note: this motion failed for lack of a majority vote.)*

(MOTION FAILED) APPROVED. Motion: Taylor/Small to **approve item 1.)** of the application HPCA-07-055. Ayes: Daniel, Taylor, Small and Nelson. Nays: Galbraith, Holcombe, Collier and Tague. The motion to approve the demolition was based on the finding that the garage is an imminent threat to public safety and the only means of eleviating said threat is to demolish the structure. *(Note: this motion failed for lack of a majority vote.)*

APPROVED. Motion: Small/Taylor to **approve item 1.)** of the application HPCA-07-055. Ayes: Daniel, Galbraith, Taylor, Small, Tague and Nelson. Nays: Collier and Holcombe. The motion to approve the demolition was based on the finding that the garage has lost its historic integrity and therefore, it does not contribute to the historic character of the district.

CONDITIONALLY APPROVED. Motion: Small/Taylor to **conditionally approve item 2.)** of the application HPCA-07-055, as amended. Ayes: Daniel, Galbraith, Taylor, Small, Tague and Nelson. Nays: Holcombe and Collier. The applicant

Historic Preservation Commission

May 2, 2007

Minutes - Page 14 of 17

amended the proposal to locate the garage as close to the southeast corner of the lot, as possible.

The condition of approval is as follows:

The proposed garage will be rotated 90 degrees with all features to remain as illustrated. The garage will be located at the southeast corner of the lot as far back as building codes will allow.

- 6N. HPCA-07-023 at 825 NW 41. (Crown Heights), Ward 2. Consideration and possible action on application of Christy Counts by Lori Derichsweiler for Certificate of Appropriateness to construct cedar pergola.

Ms. Counts and Ms. Derichsweiler were not present for comment.

The Crown Heights Preservation Review Committee submitted written comments to staff prior to the meeting.

CONTINUED. Motion: Collier/Galbraith to **continue for 30-days the application** HPCA-07-023. Ayes: Daniel, Galbraith, Taylor, Holcombe, Small, Collier, Tague and Nelson. Nays: None. The application was continued for 30-days to allow the applicant additional time to consider the construction details of the pergola and to come to the Commission Meeting to answer questions.

- 6O. HPCA-07-025 at 701 NW 39. (Crown Heights), Ward 2. Consideration and possible action on application of Karen Beckman by David Marchese for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1a.) remove back door and surround and in-fill with stucco to match the existing wall, 1b.) remove stair and platform, 1c.) remove awning above door, 1d.) repair wall at area of demolition, 1d.) remove window, trim, sill and wall below window, 2.) install new door assembly, 3.) install new door at existing window location, 4.) install new awning above door, 5.) install new stair with platform.

Ms. Beckman and Mr. Marchese were present for comment.

The Crown Heights Preservation Review Committee submitted written comments to staff prior to the meeting.

CONDITIONALLY APPROVED. Motion: Collier/Galbraith to **conditionally approve the application** HPCA-07-025. Ayes: Daniel, Galbraith, Taylor, Holcombe, Small, Collier, Tague and Nelson. Nays: None.

The condition of approval is as follows:

Historic Preservation Commission

May 2, 2007

Minutes - Page 15 of 17

The existing steps at the back door will remain as well as the existing milk bottle slot. Additionally, the only awning style that is approved is the flat awning.

7. OTHER BUSINESS

- 7A. HP-07-028 at 416 NW 29. (Jefferson Park), Ward 2. Historic Preservation Commission recommendation concerning the historic integrity of the property.

John Wilson, Planning Department was present for comment.

Mr. Smitherman was present with comments.

Mr. King was present with comments. He submitted to staff a document that describes his complaints concerning the inspectors. Copies of this document were distributed to the Commissioners. Mr. King showed the Commission and described a survey that was signed by his neighbors, to illustrate how many neighbors had altered their houses.

Ms. Alva Johnson was present with comments.

Mr. Joyce, Crown Heights Preservation Review Committee was present for comment.

The Jefferson Park Preservation Review Committee did not submit written comments to staff prior to the meeting.

APPROVED. Motion: Collier/Galbraith to resolve to recommend that the City Council take into consideration the Historic Preservation Commission's opinion that the property has been altered during the past to the point that it no longer retains its historic integrity and therefore, the proposed demolition would not diminish the historic character of the district. Ayes: Daniel, Galbraith, Taylor, Holcombe, Small, Collier, Tague and Nelson. Nays: None.

- 7B. HP-07-036 at 2820 N ROBINSON. (Jefferson Park), Ward 2. Historic Preservation Commission recommendation concerning the historic integrity of the property.

John Wilson, Planning Department was present for comment.

Mr. Jackson, property owner was present for comment.

Mr. Joyce, Crown Heights Preservation Review Committee was present for comment.

Historic Preservation Commission

May 2, 2007

Minutes - Page 16 of 17

The Jefferson Park Preservation Review Committee did not submit written comments to staff prior to the meeting.

APPROVED. Motion: Tague/Galbraith to resolve to recommend that the City Council take into consideration the Historic Preservation Commission's opinion that the property retains its historic integrity and therefore, the proposed demolition would diminish the historic character of the district. Ayes: Daniel, Galbraith, Taylor, Holcombe, Small, Collier, Tague and Nelson. Nays: None.

8. COMMUNICATIONS

8A. Administrative Approval Report

8A1. HPCA-07-042 at 800 NW 42. (Crown Heights), Ward 2. Staff is announcing the Administrative Approval of the application for Certificate of Appropriateness of Steve Blevins by Loris Blevins to 1.) install fence.

8A2. HPCA-07-049 at 2505 N. Robinson. (Jefferson Park), Ward 2. Staff is announcing the Administrative Approval of the application for Certificate of Appropriateness of Pennington Place at Jefferson Park to 1.) install electric service on southwest corner of building 2.) install 8 heat pump units on north side of building.

8A3. HPCA-07-045 at 521 NW 40. (Crown Heights), Ward 2. Staff is announcing the Administrative Approval of the application of James Calder for Certificate of Appropriateness to widening of driveway not to exceed 10' in width.

8B. The change of Ordinance, amending Section 59-4800.H.(3)(d) of Article IV of Chapter 59 of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2002, pertaining to design regulations for Tract 5 of the Neighborhood Conservation District by deleting the requirement for white stucco was heard at the Planning Commission March 8, 2007. The Planning Commission recommended approval by City Council. The change was introduced at the March 27, 2007 City Council Meeting and the final hearing by City council was April 24, 2007. Telephone JJ Chambless for additional information at 297-2417.

8C. The change of Ordinance, amending Section 59-4200 of Article IV of Chapter 59 of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2002, establishing certain procedures for hearings before the Historic Preservation Commission and providing that appeals from the Historic Preservation Commission to the Board of Adjustment be on the record was heard by the Planning Commission at the March 8, 2007 meeting. The Planning Commission recommended approval by City Council. This item was introduced to City Council at the April 10, 2007 meeting. The City Council requested additional information to be presented at the final hearing, May 1, 2007.

Historic Preservation Commission

May 2, 2007

Minutes - Page 17 of 17

8D. The Appeal of Historical Preservation, Inc. et al, of the decision of an administrative official, regarding the issuance of a permit to erect a non-accessory sign (billboard) in the C-4 General Business District located at 2406 N. Robinson was heard at the March 1, 2007 Board of Adjustment meeting. The BOA sustained the administrative decision. An appeal has been filed in District Court. Telephone JJ Chambless for additional information at 297-2417.

8E. The next regularly scheduled meeting for the Historic Preservation Commission is Wednesday, June 6, 2007 at 3:00 p.m. at the Municipal Building, City Council Chamber. New applications and information on continued projects are to be submitted to staff by 5:00 p.m., Tuesday, May 8, 2007.

9. ADJOURNMENT (9:20 p.m.)

Motion: Small/Taylor to adjourn the May 2, 2007, meeting of the Historic Preservation Commission. Ayes: Daniel, Galbraith, Taylor, Holcombe, Small, Collier, Tague and Nelson. Nays: None.

EO