

MINUTES
Regular Meeting
HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION
March 7, 2007 - 3:00 p.m.
Municipal Building, City Council Chamber

The meeting of the Oklahoma City Historic Preservation Commission was called to order in the City Council Chamber, 3rd Floor of the Municipal Building, 200 N. Walker Avenue, Oklahoma City, Oklahoma. The meeting convened at 3:04 p.m. Notice of the meeting and agenda were filed with the City Clerk's office and posted on the Council bulletin board 24 hours prior to the meeting.

1. CALL TO ORDER AND ROLL CALL

Members Present: Thomas Small, AIA, Vice-Chairman
Carolee Galbraith
Marnie Taylor
Jane Holcombe
Roland Tague
Randy Floyd
Karen Nelson

Members Absent: Thomas J. Daniel IV, Chairman
Karen Collier

Staff Present: Eva Osborne, AIA, Preservation Officer, Planning Department
Susan Miller, Planner IV, Planning Department
Angela Yetter, Planner I, Planning Department
Rita Douglas-Talley, Assistant Municipal Counselor

2. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

APPROVED. Motion: Galbraith/Taylor to approve the minutes of the February 7, 2007, Historic Preservation Commission meeting. Ayes: Galbraith, Taylor, Holcombe, Small, Tague, Floyd, Nelson. Nays: None.

3. CITATION REPORT

Mr. Wilson, Zoning Inspector, was not present to comment.

Commissioner Tague asked that written information be included in the Meeting File that relates to the following issues:

- Information is included on the compliance spreadsheet that states that a CA was issued. These items should be deleted after they are reported, once.
- Information is included on the compliance spreadsheet that states that a citation was issued with no reference to the outcome of the citation. The resulting action should be reported.

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 2 of 9

- Some items state that no application has been filed. Follow-up needs to occur.
- In general, the report needs to be cleaned-up.
- Why is improvement at these properties taking so long?
- Why are unoccupied buildings sitting there so long?
- A suggestion was offered that an HP Commission Meeting date should be placed at the top of the report.

Raina Pelofsky addressed the Commission concerning the compliance issue.

4. CONTINUANCE REQUESTS

A. Staff request continuance of the following cases:
None.

B. Other continuance requests:

6E. HPCA-07-009 at 314 NW 17. (Heritage Hills HD), Ward 6. The applicant has contacted staff with another request to continue for 30-days application HPCA-07-009 by Lawrence DeBault, due to a family emergency. The items submitted for review are as follows: 1.) demolish garage and 2.) construct new garage including 2a.) HardiPlank horizontal lap siding, 2b.) side gable composition roof with metal standing seam shed dormer, 2c.) wood second floor deck with wood columns and wood rail at east (side) and north (front), 2d.) wood stair, 2e.) Pella wood windows with no divisions, 2f.) wood pedestrian doors and 2g.) double overhead wood door.

CONTINUED. Motion: Galbraith/Floyd to continue for 30-days the above item as stated. Ayes: Galbraith, Taylor, Holcombe, Small, Tague, Floyd, Nelson. Nays: None.

5. CONSENT DOCKET CASES

5A. HPCA-07-021 at 1510 NW 38. (Putnam Heights HD), Ward 2. Consideration and possible action on the application of Freddy and Julian Hibbard for a Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) replace storm door with new full-light storm door with white finish.

Mr. and Ms. Hibbard were not present.

APPROVED. Motion: Floyd/Tague to approve the application HPCA-07-021. Ayes: Galbraith, Taylor, Holcombe, Small, Tague, Floyd, Nelson. Nays: None.

6. CASES FOR INDIVIDUAL CONSIDERATION

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 3 of 9

- 6A. HPCA-06-126 at 3110 N Harvey Pkwy. (Edgemere Park HD), Ward 2. Consideration and possible action on the application of Shelly Giese for a Certificate of Appropriateness to 3.) remove doors, 4.) install new doors.

Mr. Giese was present.

The Edgemere Park Preservation Review Committee submitted written comments to staff prior to the meeting.

MOVE ITEM TO A FOLLOWING LOCATION ON THIS AGENDA. Motion: Floyd /Galbraith to move item to a following location on this agenda. Ayes: Galbraith, Taylor, Holcombe, Small, Tague, Floyd, Nelson. Nays: None.

- 6B. HPCA-06-146 at 3200 N. Walker. (Edgemere Park HD), Ward 2. Consideration and possible action on the application of Edgemere Elementary by Paul Meyer for a Certificate of Appropriateness to 8.) amend the previously approved item to reconfigure the east asphalt parking lot and the west concrete parking lot with sidewalks using the proposed/approved material, grey brushed-concrete. The amendment would provide that asphalt will be used at the reconfigured east (back) parking lot and non-pigmented new concrete will be used at the reconfigured west parking lot.

Mr. Meyer was present.

The Edgemere Park Preservation Review Committee submitted written comments to staff prior to the meeting.

CONDITIONALLY APPROVED. Motion: Floyd/Galbraith to conditionally approve the application HPCA-06-146. The condition for approval is that asphalt will be used as the new material at the east (back) parking lot however, the existing retaining walls and paving at the incline including the apron at the north end of the east (back) parking lot will either remain or will be replaced with the same material, medium grey brushed concrete to match the color of the historic concrete. Additionally, the new part of the parking lot expansion at the west (front) parking lot will be medium grey brushed-concrete and will match the color of the historic concrete as much as possible, using an unspecified method to achieve that goal. Ayes: Galbraith, Taylor, Holcombe, Small, Tague, Floyd, Nelson. Nays: None.

- 6C. HPCA-07-013 at 401 NW Eubanks. (Edgemere Park HD), Ward 2. Consideration and possible action on the application of Keith Eakins for a Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) remove all framing and existing material at back door and back window, 2.) in-fill door opening with recessed brick and 3.) install a pair of French doors at window opening.

Mr. Eakins was present.

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 4 of 9

The Edgemere Park Preservation Review Committee submitted written comments to staff prior to the meeting.

APPROVED. Motion: Taylor/Holcombe to approve the application HPCA-07-013. Ayes: Galbraith, Taylor, Holcombe, Small, Nelson. Nays: Floyd and Tague.

COMMISSIONER TAYLOR SUGGESTED THAT ATTENTION BE GIVEN TO THE ISSUE OF REQUIRING TRUE DIVIDED-LIGHT FOR NEW DOORS, AT A COMMISSIONER'S WORKSHOP.

- 6D. HPCA-07-008 at 532 NW 39. (Crown Heights HD), Ward 2. Consideration and possible action on the application of Anthony Brown for a Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) construct a new building addition including, 1a.) gable roof with shingles to match the existing roof, 1b.) brick first floor walls with wood horizontal lap siding at the second floor, 1c.) wood true divided-light windows, 1d.) wood true divided-light French doors, 1e.) wood deck with stair, 1f.) wood vent, wood corner boards, wood fascia and plywood soffet.

Mr. Brown was not present.

The Crown Heights Preservation Review Committee submitted written comments to staff prior to the meeting.

DENY. Motion: Tague/Floyd to deny without prejudice **item 1e.)** of application HPCA-07-008, because the item is not fully described concerning the material at the skirt of the deck and the rail. Ayes: Galbraith, Taylor, Holcombe, Small, Tague, Floyd, Nelson. Nays: None.

CONDITIONALLY APPROVED. Motion: Floyd/Galbraith to conditionally approve **all items except item 1e.)** of application HPCA-07-008. The condition of approval is that an articulated joint with a vertical orientation will be added at the location between the old brick and the new brick with a vertical wood trim board above at the second floor as illustrated on the East Elevation. Additionally, the soffet above the sliding doors at the new addition will be wood bead board. Ayes: Galbraith, Taylor, Holcombe, Small, Tague, Floyd, Nelson. Nays: None.

- 6E. HPCA-07-009 at 314 NW 17. (Heritage Hills HD), Ward 6. Consideration and possible action on the application of Lawrence DeBault for a Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) demolish garage and 2.) construct new garage including 2a.) HardiPlank horizontal lap siding, 2b.) side gable composition roof with metal standing seam shed dormer, 2c.) wood second floor deck with wood columns and wood rail at east (side) and north (front), 2d.) wood stair, 2e.) Pella wood windows with no divisions, 2f.) wood pedestrian doors and 2g.) double overhead wood door.

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 5 of 9

Note: This item was previously continued on the part of the Agenda, 4. CONTINUANCE REQUEST.

- 6F. HPCA-07-014 at 825 NW 15. (Heritage Hills HD), Ward 6. Consideration and possible action on the application of Dr. Lance Hoover by Rodney Poole for a Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) remove metal carport at driveway including 1a.) repair east façade of balcony structure and 1b.) relocate awning, 2.) construct new addition including 2a.) composition shingle roof, 2b.) brick walls, 2c.) wood single-pane true divided-light windows, 2d.) wood panel doors, 2e.) concrete porch with iron rails and two dormers.

Mr. Poole was present.

The Heritage Hills Preservation Review Committee submitted written comments to staff prior to the meeting.

Staff received 5 citizen protest letters prior to the meeting.

CONTINUED. Motion: Floyd/Tague to continue for 30-days the application HPCA-07-014. Ayes: Galbraith, Taylor, Holcombe, Small, Tague, Floyd, Nelson. Nays: None.

- 6A. HPCA-06-126 at 3110 N Harvey Pkwy. (Edgemere Park HD), Ward 2. Consideration and possible action on the application of Shelly Giese for a Certificate of Appropriateness to 3.) remove doors, 4.) install new doors.

Note: this item has been moved from previous location on the agenda.

Ms. Giese was present.

The Edgemere Park Preservation Review Committee submitted written comments to staff prior to the meeting.

APPROVED. Motion: Floyd/Taylor to approve the application HPCA-06-126, with the clarification that the front door will be 3'-0" wide and the two sidelights will be 2'-0" wide. Ayes: Galbraith, Taylor, Holcombe, Small, Tague, Floyd, Nelson. Nays: None.

- 6G. HPCA-07-022 at 307 NW 17. (Heritage Hills HD), Ward 6. Consideration and possible action on the application of Philip Reid & Gale Hobson for a Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) remove 8 plate glass windows, 2.) install 8 new windows to match the existing windows, 3.) remove doors at three locations and 4.) install new doors at three locations.

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 6 of 9

Mr. Reid was present.

CONDITIONALLY APPROVED. Motion: Floyd/Tague to conditionally approve the application HPCA-07-022. The condition of approval is that the 12-light antique door type that is proposed to be used at the front door location also be installed at side door opening. Additionally, a label stating that the door is not original to the subject historic property will be installed on any relocated antique door. Ayes: Galbraith, Taylor, Holcombe, Small, Tague, Floyd, Nelson. Nays: None.

- 6H. HPCA-07-015 at 1001 NW 17. (Mesta Park HD), Ward 6. Consideration and possible action on the application of Brett & Jennifer Vogler for a Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) install freestanding fireplace, 2.) construct new wood rail at upper floor front façade to match historic photo and 3.) construct new iron rail at upper floor back façade.

Mr. and Mrs. Vogler were present.

The Mesta Park Preservation Review Committee submitted written comments to staff prior to the meeting.

CONDITIONALLY APPROVED. Motion: Holcombe/Galbraith to conditionally approve **item 3.)** of the application HPCA-07-015. The condition of approval is that the new rail at the back (north) balcony will be wood with a design to match the North Elevation drawing for HPCA-03-085, painted white. Ayes: Galbraith, Taylor, Holcombe, Small, Tague, Floyd, Nelson. Nays: None.

APPROVED. Motion: Tague/Floyd to approve **item 2.)** of the application HPCA-07-015. Ayes: Galbraith, Taylor, Holcombe, Small, Tague, Floyd, Nelson. Nays: None.

APPROVED. Motion: Floyd/Holcombe to approve **item 1.)** of the application HPCA-07-015. Ayes: Galbraith, Taylor, Holcombe, Small, Tague, Floyd, Nelson. Nays: None.

- 6I. HPCA-07-017 at 521 NW 29. (Paseo HD), Ward 2. Consideration and possible action on the application of Shelby Davis for a Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) construct 2 pillars, 2.) replace particle board at parapet with various options for replacement material, 3.) install railing at upper front balcony to match existing.

Mr. Davis was not present.

DENIED. Motion: Floyd/Galbraith to deny with prejudice **item 1.)** of application HPCA-07-017, because the 2 pillar structures look too similar to the official signage for the Neighborhood Association and they would distract from the historic building.

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 7 of 9

The installation of the pillars would be detrimental to the authentic streetscape. Ayes: Galbraith, Taylor, Holcombe, Small, Tague, Floyd, Nelson. Nays: None.

CONTINUED. Motion: Galbraith/Taylor to continue for 30-days **item 2.)** of application HPCA-07-017 because the Commission needs additional information. The Commission grants the applicant permission to remove the existing non-historic material at the parapet so that photos can be taken of the underlying materials. Additional information is necessary concerning the historic condition at the parapets. Ayes: Galbraith, Taylor, Holcombe, Small, Tague, Floyd, Nelson. Nays: None.

CONTINUE. Motion: Floyd/Holcombe to continue for 30-days **item 3.)** of the application HPCA-07-017 to give the applicant an opportunity to submit the required drawings including a floor plan of the porch and a detail section of the rail with dimensions. The Commission determined that the rail at the first floor is not historic and additional research must be conducted by the applicant to determine the historic condition. Ayes: Galbraith, Taylor, Holcombe, Small, Tague, Floyd, Nelson. Nays: None.

7. OTHER BUSINESS

- 7A. National Register of Historic Places nomination for the Taft Junior High School, 2901 NW 23rd St. Consider and discuss resolution. (Ward 2).

RECOMMENDED APPROVAL. Motion: Tague/Holcombe to recommend approval of the National Register nomination. Ayes: Galbraith, Taylor, Holcombe, Small, Tague, Floyd, Nelson. Nays: None.

- 7B. National Register of Historic Places nomination for the Lake Overholser Dam, NW 16th St and E Lake Overholser Dr. Consider and discuss resolution. (Ward 1).

RECOMMENDED APPROVAL. Motion: Small/Holcombe to recommend approval of the National Register nomination. Ayes: Galbraith, Taylor, Holcombe, Small, Tague, Floyd, Nelson. Nays: None.

- 7C. Election of officers.

CONTINUED. Motion: Taylor/Holcombe to continue for 30-days the election of officers. Ayes: Galbraith, Taylor, Holcombe, Small, Tague, Floyd, Nelson. Nays: None.

8. COMMUNICATIONS

- 8A. Administrative Approval Report

8A1. HPCA-07-019 at 432 NW 17. (Heritage Hills HD), Ward 6. Staff is

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 8 of 9

announcing the Administrative Approval of the application of Tony Brooks for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) install iron gate.

8A2. HPCA-07-020 at 2103 N Shartel. (Heritage Hills HD), Ward 6. Staff is announcing the Administrative Approval of the application of Karyn Seabrooke by Todd Tramba for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) install fence.

8A3. HPCA-07-021 at 1510 NW 38. (Putnam Heights HD), Ward 2. Staff is announcing the Administrative Approval of the application of Freddy & Julian Hibbard for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) install fence.

8A4. HPCA-07-001 at 930 NW 22. (Mesta Park HD), Ward 6. Staff is announcing the Administrative Approval of the application of Ian Adams for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) install fence.

8B. HPCA-06-110 at 315 NW 17. (Heritage Hills HD), Ward 6. The appeal of the HP Commission's denial of the application of Randy and Darcie Thomas by Frank Kaderabek for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) demolish existing garage, was heard by the Board of Adjustment February 15, 2007. The BOA sustained the appeal and overturned the HP Commission's denial.

8C. A request for variance and appeal of the HP Commission's denial of the application for 2912 Paseo to install a mural and fountain has been continued to the March 15, 2007 Board of Adjustment meeting. For additional information or a copy of the staff report/agenda telephone JJ Chambless at 297-2417.

8D. The Appeal of Historical Preservation, Inc. et al, of the decision of an administrative official, regarding the issuance of a permit to erect a non-accessory sign (billboard) in the C-4 General Business District located at 2406 N. Robinson is scheduled to be heard at the March 1, 2007 Board of Adjustment meeting.

8E. The change of Ordinance, amending Section 59-4200 of Article IV of Chapter 59 of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2002, establishing certain procedures for hearings before the Historic Preservation Commission and providing that appeals from the Historic Preservation Commission to the Board of Adjustment be on the record was introduced to Planning Commission at the February 22, 2007 meeting. The change of ordinance is scheduled to be heard at the March 8, 2007 Planning Commission for recommendation to City Council.

8F. The change of Ordinance, amending Section 59-4800.H.(3)(d) of Article IV of Chapter 59 of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2002, pertaining to design regulations for Tract 5 of the Neighborhood Conservation District by deleting the requirement for white stucco was introduced at the February 22, 2007 Planning Commission meeting. The change of ordinance is scheduled to be heard at the March 8, 2007 Planning Commission for recommendation to City Council.

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 9 of 9

8G. The next regularly scheduled meeting for the Historic Preservation Commission is Wednesday, April 4, 2007 at 3:00 p.m. at the Municipal Building, City Council Chamber. New applications and information on continued projects are to be submitted to staff by 5:00 p.m., Tuesday, March 13, 2007.

9. ADJOURN (5:16pm)

Motion: Taylor/Tague to adjourn the March 7, meeting of the Historic Preservation Commission. Ayes: Galbraith, Taylor, Holcombe, Small, Tague Tague, Floyd, Nelson. Nays: None.