

MINUTES-draft
Regular Meeting
HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION
August 06, 2008 - 2:00 p.m.
Municipal Building, City Council Chamber

The meeting of the Oklahoma City Historic Preservation Commission was called to order in the City Council Chamber, 3rd Floor of the Municipal Building, 200 N. Walker Avenue, Oklahoma City, Oklahoma. The meeting convened at 2:01 p.m. Notice of the meeting and agenda were filed with the City Clerk's office and posted on the Council bulletin board 24 hours prior to the meeting.

1. CALL TO ORDER AND ROLL CALL

Members Present:

Thomas Small, AIA, Vice-Chairman
Carolee Galbraith
Jane Holcombe
Thomas J. Daniel IV
Karen Collier
Randy Floyd
Karen Zimmer

Members Absent: Roland Tague, Chairman
Marnie Taylor
Karen Nelson
Nedra Jones

Staff Present: Eva Osborne, AIA, Preservation Architect, Planning Department
Susan Miller, Planner IV, Planning Department
Paula Hurst, Planning Department
Rita Douglas-Talley, Assistant Municipal Counselor

2. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

APPROVED. Motion: Holcombe / Galbraith to **approve** the minutes of the July 2, 2008, Historic Preservation Commission meeting.

Ayes: Daniel, Galbraith, Small, Holcombe, Collier, Floyd, Zimmer.
Nays: None.
Absent: Tague, Taylor, Nelson, Jones.

3. CITATION REPORT

Mr. Woods, Compliance Officer, was present for comment.

4. CONTINUANCE REQUESTS

A. Staff request continuance of the following cases:

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 2 of 22

August 6, 2008

- 6B. HPCA-08-044** at 2329 NW 28th ST. (Shepherd), Ward 2. To **continue for 30-days** the application for a Certificate of Appropriateness of Robert Toomey to 1.) remove plywood and window(s) from window opening, 2.) install replacement windows, 3.) repair/replace in-kind wood horizontal lap siding and install new horizontal lap siding at locations where it is missing, 4.) remove particle board and vinyl soffit and fascia, 5.) install new wood fascia, bead board soffit and wood trim, 6.) remove security bars from windows and doors and 7.) replace wood/aluminum trim along window openings on west façade of house with wood trim to match the historic trim.

CONTINUED. Motion: Galbraith / Floyd to move **continuance for 30-days** based upon the evidence that has been presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds that additional information is required from the applicant in order to determine whether the action requested is in compliance with Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Ayes: Daniel, Galbraith, Small, Holcombe, Collier, Floyd, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Absent: Tague, Taylor, Nelson, Jones.

- B.** Other continuance requests:

None.

5. CONSENT DOCKET CASES

None.

6. CASES FOR INDIVIDUAL CONSIDERATION

- 6A. HPCA-08-106** at 2324 NW 26TH ST. (Shepherd), Ward 2. Consideration and possible action on application of Ann M. Martin for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) remove the windows and storm windows at the historic part of the house and 2.) install new insulated vinyl windows.

Ms. Martin was present for comment.

DENIED WITH PREJUDICE. Motion: Collier / Zimmer to move **denial with prejudice**, that, based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-08-106 and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds:

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 3 of 22

August 6, 2008

- That the existing windows are historic;
- That no evidence has been presented to verify that the windows are deteriorated beyond repair;
- That the proposal does not specify that the windows will be replaced in-kind;
- That the proposal does not specify wood windows that match in proportion, shape, location, pattern, size, materials, details and profile.
- That the proposal does not specify that the windows will be replaced with windows that replicate the division configuration of the historic windows;
- That the proposal specifies insulated window replacement for the single glazed historic windows;
- That the proposal specifies vinyl replacement windows for the historic wood windows;
- That this action is consistent with the provisions of *4250.4D(3)(4)(5)and(6) and 4250.4L(2)of the HP Historic Preservation Ordinance and Subchapter 2.5 of the Preservation Guidelines and Standards;*
- That based upon the evidence presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, the action requested is not in compliance, and the proposed material change in appearance would have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical or architectural significance and value of the historic property and district according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Ayes: Daniel, Galbraith, Small, Holcombe, Collier, Floyd, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Absent: Tague, Taylor, Nelson, Jones.

- 6B. HPCA-08-044** at 2329 NW 28th ST. (Shepherd), Ward 2. Consideration and possible action on application of Robert Toomey for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) remove plywood and window(s) from window opening, 2.) install replacement windows, 3.) repair/replace in-kind wood horizontal lap siding and install new horizontal lap siding at locations where it is missing, 4.) remove particle board and vinyl soffit and fascia, 5.) install new wood fascia, bead board soffit and wood trim, 6.) remove security bars from windows and doors and 7.) replace wood/aluminum trim along window openings on west façade of house with wood trim to match the historic trim.

Continued on Continuance Docket.

- 6C. HPCA-08-066** at 2100 N Robinson. (Heritage Hills East), Ward 7. Consideration and possible action on application of Tonya Neequaye for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) install fence.

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 4 of 22

August 6, 2008

Applicant was not present for comment.

CONTINUED. Motion: Daniel/ Collier to move **continuance for 30-days** based upon the evidence that has been presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds that additional information is required from the applicant in order to determine whether the action requested is in compliance with Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Ayes: Daniel, Galbraith, Small, Holcombe, Collier, Floyd, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Absent: Tague, Taylor, Nelson, Jones.

- 6D. HPCA-08-041** at 611 NW 15th ST. (Heritage Hills), Ward 6. Consideration and possible action on application of Brad & Elizabeth Gawey by Tim Zajac for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) amend the previously approved Certificate of Appropriateness to install 2 windows at upper west facade.

Mr. Zajac was not present for comment.

APPROVED. Motion: Daniel / Floyd to move **approval** that, based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-08-041, Staff Report and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds:

- That the proposed windows will be installed in a new garage;
- That the proposed windows are the same as the windows approved for the west façade of the building;
- That the proposed windows are fixed wood windows with no divisions and clear glass;
- That this action is consistent with the provisions of *4250.4D(3)(4)(5)and(6) of the HP Historic Preservation Ordinance and Subchapter 3.5 of the Preservation Guidelines and Standards;*
- That based upon the evidence presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, the action requested is in compliance, and the proposed material change in appearance would not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical or architectural significance and value of the historic property and district according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Ayes: Daniel, Galbraith, Small, Holcombe, Collier, Floyd, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 5 of 22

August 6, 2008

Absent: Tague, Taylor, Nelson, Jones.

- 6E. HPCA-08-108** at 517 NW 22nd ST. (Mesta Park), Ward 6. Consideration and possible action on application of Warren Palmer for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) restore garage by reconstructing deteriorated features based on physical evidence at the site and 2.) create concrete parking pad behind garage.

Mr. Palmer was not present for comment.

Staff received comments from Mesta Park Preservation Review Committee.

APPROVED. Motion: Floyd / Daniel to move **approval** that, based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-08-108, Staff Report and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds:

- That the demolition of the subject building does not require a Certificate of Appropriateness because the City Council has declared it to be dilapidated;
- That the applicant has proposed to retain and repair the in-tact historic fabric;
- That the proposed garage closely matches the original garage;
- That the addition at the north end of the structure will not be reconstructed;
- That this action is consistent with the provisions of *4250.4D(3)(5)and(6) and 4250.4H of the HP Historic Preservation Ordinance and Subchapter 2.1 and 2.9 of the Preservation Guidelines and Standards;*
- That based upon the evidence presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, the action requested is in compliance, and the proposed material change in appearance would not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical or architectural significance and value of the historic property and district according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Ayes: Daniel, Galbraith, Small, Holcombe, Collier, Floyd, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Absent: Tague, Taylor, Nelson, Jones.

- 6F. HPCA-08-033** at 931 NW 18th ST. (Mesta Park), Ward 6. Consideration and possible action on application of Brian Weaks for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) add wood crown moulding to top of columns at Northwest porch, upper and lower floors and Northeast porch, 2.) remove vinyl siding from the addition that is located on the first floor Northwest porch and 3.) provide plywood as exterior material at the addition and 4.) add pergola feature above columns at Northeast porch.

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 6 of 22

August 6, 2008

Brian and Kimberly Weaks were present for comment.

Staff received comments from Mesta Park Preservation Review Committee.

Raina Pelofsky was present for comment.

APPROVE. Motion: Collier / Zimmer to move **approval of item 1.) add wood crown moulding to top of columns at Northwest porch, upper and lower floors and Northeast porch,** that, based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-08-033 and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds:

- That the column is not historic;
- That no evidence of historic condition has been presented;
- There is physical evidence of previous crown moulding on the non-historic column trim;
- That this work item is subject to the criteria for new construction;
- That this action is consistent with the provisions of *4250.4D(3)(4)(5)and(6) and 4250.4H of the HP Historic Preservation Ordinance and Subchapter 3.5 of the Preservation Guidelines and Standards;*
- That based upon the evidence presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, the action requested is in compliance, and the proposed material change in appearance would not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical or architectural significance and value of the historic property and district according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Ayes: Daniel, Small, Holcombe, Collier, Zimmer.

Nays: Galbraith, Floyd.

Absent: Tague, Taylor, Nelson, Jones.

APPROVED. Motion: Collier / Zimmer to move **approval of item 2.) remove vinyl siding from the addition that is located on the first floor Northwest porch that,** based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-08-033, Staff Report and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds:

- That the vinyl siding is not historic;
- That the vinyl siding is not compatible with the historic character of the property;
- That this action is consistent with the provisions of *4250.4D(3)(4)(5)and(6) and 4250.4L(2)of the HP Historic Preservation Ordinance and Subchapter 2.1 of the Preservation Guidelines and Standards;*
- That based upon the evidence presented in the application, Staff Report and

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 7 of 22

August 6, 2008

during the public hearing, the action requested is in compliance, and the proposed material change in appearance would not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical or architectural significance and value of the historic property and district according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Ayes: Daniel, Galbraith, Small, Holcombe, Collier, Floyd, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Absent: Tague, Taylor, Nelson, Jones.

WITHDRAWN. Item 3.) provide plywood as exterior material at the addition.

DENIED WITH PREJUDICE. Motion: Floyd / Galbraith to move **denial with prejudice of 4.) add pergola feature above columns at Northeast porch**, that, based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-08-033 and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds

- That the proposed porch cover is not historic and is not reconstructed based on sufficient and accurate evidence of the historic condition;
- That the historic photograph illustrates a shed roof supported by brackets;
- That the new porch cover creates a false historical appearance through the application of new elements and details to a porch or balcony;
- That the new porch cover is not consistent with the character of the property;
- That this action is consistent with the provisions of *4250.4D(3)(4)(5)and(6) of the HP Historic Preservation Ordinance and Subchapter 2.1, 2.2 and 2.3 of the Preservation Guidelines and Standards;*
- That based upon the evidence presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, the action requested is not in compliance, and the proposed material change in appearance would have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical or architectural significance and value of the historic property and district according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Ayes: Daniel, Galbraith, Small, Holcombe, Floyd, Zimmer.

Nays: Collier.

Absent: Tague, Taylor, Nelson, Jones.

- 6G. HPCA-08-009** at 517 NW 27th ST. (Paseo), Ward 2. Consideration and possible action on application of Juan S. Huaman by Traci Aldridge for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) remove concrete and brick front porch including columns and pier, 2.) construct new brick/wood columns and brick pier on new

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 8 of 22

August 6, 2008

foundations and 5.) reconstruct wood front porch and step.

Juan S. Huaman and Traci Aldridge were present for comment.

APPROVED. Motion: Holcombe / Galbraith to move **approval** that, based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-08-009, Staff Report and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds:

- That the existing porch is not the historic porch and it is not compatible with the historic character of the property.
- That the brick/wood columns will be constructed on a foundation so that the brick base will sit on finished grade;
- That the concrete porch will be removed and replaced with a wood porch to match the photos and drawings.
- That this action is consistent with the provisions of *4250.4D(3)(4)(5)and(6), 4250.4H and 4250.4L(2)of the HP Historic Preservation Ordinance and Subchapter 2.1 and 2.2 of the Preservation Guidelines and Standards;*
- That based upon the evidence presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, the action requested is in compliance, and the proposed material change in appearance would not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical or architectural significance and value of the historic property and district according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Ayes: Daniel, Galbraith, Small, Holcombe, Collier, Floyd, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Absent: Tague, Taylor, Nelson, Jones.

- 6H. HPCA-08-037** at 2901 N Hudson Ave. (Jefferson Park), Ward 2. Consideration and possible action on application of Frances DeCarlo by Jeremy Thomas for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) construct wood pergola, and 2.) install pre-manufactured shed.

Frances DeCarlo was present for comment.

DENIED WITH PREJUDICE. Motion: Holcombe / Galbraith to move **denial with prejudice of item 1.) construct wood pergola.** that, based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-08-037 and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds

- That no evidence has been presented to verify that there was a pergola at the proposed location during the period of historic significance of the district;
- That the proposed pergola will be located at a primary façade;

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 9 of 22

August 6, 2008

- That this action is consistent with the provisions of *4250.4D(3)(4)(5)and(6) of the HP Historic Preservation Ordinance and Subchapter 2.2 and 2.3 of the Preservation Guidelines and Standards;*
- That based upon the evidence presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, the action requested is not in compliance, and the proposed material change in appearance would have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical or architectural significance and value of the historic property and district according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Ayes: Daniel, Galbraith, Small, Holcombe, Collier, Floyd, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Absent: Tague, Taylor, Nelson, Jones.

CONTINUED. Motion: Daniel / Floyd to move **continuance for 30-days on item 2.) install pre-manufactured shed**, based upon the evidence that has been presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds that additional information is required from the applicant in order to determine whether the action requested is in compliance with Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Ayes: Daniel, Galbraith, Small, Holcombe, Collier, Floyd, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Absent: Tague, Taylor, Nelson, Jones.

- 6I. HPCA-08-075** at 311 NW 26th ST. (Jefferson Park), Ward 2. Consideration and possible action on application of Jefferson Park Neighborhood Assn. by Loren Capron for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) construct new 1-story house including 1a.) composition shingle front gable roof, 1b.) HardyPlank horizontal lap siding with exposed concrete foundation wall, 1c.) wood 1/1 windows, 1d.) wood panel doors with clear glass, 1e.) brick and wood columns at exposed concrete porch and 2.) new 1-story garage including 2a.) composition shingle roof, 2b.) HardyPlank horizontal lap siding, 2c.) wood single-overhead garage door, 2d.) wood pedestrian door and 3.) new medium grey brushed concrete sidewalks and driveway and 4.) new light fixtures.

Loren Capron was present for comment.

APPROVED. Motion: Floyd / Daniel to move **approval** that, based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-08-075, Staff Report and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds:

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 10 of 22

August 6, 2008

- That the sidewalks and driveways will be constructed of brush-finished concrete in medium grey tones with a maximum driveway width of 10'-0";
- That the house and garage will be compatible in size, scale, proportion, spacing, texture, setbacks, height, materials, color and detail to the main residential building and/or relate to similar garages within the neighborhood;
- That the house will have a front setback consistent with the neighboring houses;
- That the walls will have cementitious horizontal lap siding;
- That the windows will be wood with insulated clear glass and cladding;
- That the doors will be wood with clear glass;
- That this action is consistent with the provisions of *4250.4D(4)(5)and(6) of the Historic Preservation Ordinance and Subchapter 1.3, 3.1, 3.3 and 3.5 of the Preservation Guidelines and Standards;*
- That based upon the evidence presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, the action requested is in compliance, and the proposed material change in appearance would not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical or architectural significance and value of the historic property and district according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Ayes: Daniel, Galbraith, Small, Holcombe, Collier, Floyd, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Absent: Tague, Taylor, Nelson, Jones.

- 6J. HPCA-08-111** at 2701 N Walker Ave. (Paseo), Ward 2. Consideration and possible action on application of OKC Housing Svcs. Redev. Corp. dba Positively Paseo for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) construct new garage, 2.) construct new sidewalk with stair from front porch east to street and install handrails, 3.) remove windows, 4.) install new windows, 5.) remove doors, 6.) install new doors, 7.) remove asphalt exterior siding, 8.) install smooth finish painted HardiPlank horizontal lap siding, 9.) restore front porch, 10.) replace back porch, 11.) install new light fixtures, 12.) reconstruct back wall where addition was removed and 13.) install new vents.

Jennifer Ricker was present for comment.

CONTINUED. Motion: Daniel / Galbraith to move continuance for 60-days on items 1.) construct new garage, 2.) construct new sidewalk with stair from front porch east to street and install handrails, that, based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-08-111, Staff Report and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds:

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 11 of 22

August 6, 2008

- That the action requested cannot be approved at this time, and
- That additional information is required from the applicant in order to determine whether the action requested is in compliance, and
- That based upon the evidence that has been presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, additional information is required from the applicant in order to determine whether the action requested is in compliance with the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Ayes: Daniel, Galbraith, Small, Holcombe, Collier, Floyd, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Absent: Tague, Taylor, Nelson, Jones.

APPROVED. Motion: Floyd / Daniel to move **approval of items 3.) remove windows, 4.) install new windows, 5.) remove doors, 6.) install new doors,** that, based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-08-111, Staff Report and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds:

- That the existing windows are missing, deteriorated beyond repair and/or not historic;
- That the proposed windows are insulated 1/1 wood windows with clear glass and no cladding;
- That the existing doors are deteriorated beyond repair;
- That the proposed doors are wood with clear glass;
- That this action is consistent with the provisions of *4250.4D(3)(4)(5)and(6)and 4250.4L(2)of the HP Historic Preservation Ordinance and Subchapter 2.1, 2.4 and 2.5 of the Preservation Guidelines and Standards;*
- That based upon the evidence presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, the action requested is in compliance, and the proposed material change in appearance would not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical or architectural significance and value of the historic property and district according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Ayes: Daniel, Galbraith, Small, Holcombe, Collier, Floyd, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Absent: Tague, Taylor, Nelson, Jones.

APPROVED. Motion: Daniel / Floyd to move **approval of items 7.) remove asphalt exterior siding, 8.) install smooth finish painted HardiPlank horizontal lap siding,** that, based upon the evidence presented in the application

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 12 of 22

August 6, 2008

of HPCA-08-111 and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds:

- That after the necessary removal of historic fabric to accommodate the rehabilitation work, there will not be enough in place historic fabric remaining to be considered contributing to the historic integrity of the district.
- That evidence has been presented to verify that the existing asphalt siding is not the historic siding;
- That the proposed smooth finish HardiPlank horizontal lap siding is acceptable material for new construction;
- That this action is consistent with the provisions of *4250.4D(3)(4)(5)and(6)of the HP Historic Preservation Ordinance and Subchapter 3.5 of the Preservation Guidelines and Standards;*
- That based upon the evidence presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, the action requested is in compliance, and the proposed material change in appearance would not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical or architectural significance and value of the historic property and district according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Ayes: Daniel, Galbraith, Small, Holcombe, Collier, Floyd, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Absent: Tague, Taylor, Nelson, Jones.

APPROVED. Motion: Daniel / Floyd to move approval of items 9.) restore front porch, 11.) install new light fixtures, 12.) reconstruct back wall where addition was removed and 13.) install new vents, that, based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-08-111, Staff Report and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds:

- That the front porch is deteriorated and the proposed reconstruction will match the historic condition;
- That the proposed light fixtures are compatible with the historic character of the property;
- That the proposed reconstruction of the back wall will match the historic condition based on the physical evidence at the site;
- That the proposed vents are compatible with the historic character of the property;
- That this action is consistent with the provisions of *4250.4D(3)(4)(5)and(6)of the HP Historic Preservation Ordinance and Subchapter 2.1 of the Preservation Guidelines and Standards;*
- That based upon the evidence presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, the action requested is in compliance, and the proposed material change in appearance would not have a substantial adverse

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 13 of 22

August 6, 2008

effect on the aesthetic, historical or architectural significance and value of the historic property and district according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

CONTINUED. Motion: Daniel / Collier to move **continuance for 60-days of item 10.) replace back porch** based upon the evidence that has been presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds that additional information is required from the applicant in order to determine whether the action requested is in compliance with Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Ayes: Daniel, Galbraith, Small, Holcombe, Collier, Floyd, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Absent: Tague, Taylor, Nelson, Jones.

- 6K. HPCA-08-112** at 2705 N Walker Ave. (Paseo), Ward 2. Consideration and possible action on application of OKC Housing Svcs Redev Corp dba Positively Paseo for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) install multi-gable composition roof, 2.) smooth finish HardiPlank horizontal lap siding, 3.) wood rafter tails, soffits, cornerboards and trim, 4.) stucco foundation, stucco partial height wall at porch and stucco/wood columns with cast stone trim, 5.) wood rails, 6.) vinyl clad, insulated, 1/1 wood windows with clear glass, 7.) wood doors with clear glass, 8.) light fixtures and 9.) medium grey brushed-concrete sidewalks and driveway.

Jennifer Ricker was present for comment.

CONTINUED. Motion: Collier / Galbraith to move **continuance for 60-days of all items,** based upon the evidence that has been presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds that additional information is required from the applicant in order to determine whether the action requested is in compliance with Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Ayes: Daniel, Galbraith, Holcombe, Collier, Floyd, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Absent: Tague, Taylor, Nelson, Jones.

Recused: Small.

- 6L. HPCA-08-086** at 3120 N Harvey Pkwy. (Edgemere Park), Ward 2.

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 14 of 22

August 6, 2008

Consideration and possible action on application of Brian & Charlotte Mitchell for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) demolish secondary structure (garage) at back of property.

Kelly Masters, representing applicant, was present for comment.

APPROVED. Motion: Daniel / Holcombe to move **approval** that, based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-08-086, Staff Report and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds:

- That a letter from a structural engineer states that the structure poses an imminent threat to public health or safety and the demolition of said structure is required to alleviate said threat.
- That this action is consistent with the provisions of *4250.4L(2) of the HP Historic Preservation Ordinance*;
- That based upon the evidence presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, the action requested is in compliance, and the proposed material change in appearance would not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical or architectural significance and value of the historic property and district according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Ayes: Daniel, Galbraith, Small, Holcombe, Collier, Floyd, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Absent: Tague, Taylor, Nelson, Jones.

- 6M. HPCA-08-080** at 532 NW 40th ST. (Crown Heights), Ward 2. Consideration and possible action on application of Mark & Denise Hole by Ryan Scamehorn for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) demolish 1-story garage, 2.) construct new 1-story garage including, 2a.) composition shingle roof, 2b.) wood horizontal lap siding above brick stem wall, 2c.) two single wood overhead garage doors at front façade and one double overhead garage door at side façade and 2d.) wood pedestrian door and 3.) modify the existing driveway to accommodate the new overhead garage doors at the front facade. Ward 2.

Mark Hole was present for comment.

Staff received comments from Crown Heights Preservation Review Committee.

APPROVED. Motion: Collier / Holcombe to move **approval of item 1.) demolish 1-story garage** that, based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-08-080, Staff Report and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds:

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 15 of 22

August 6, 2008

- That the structure poses an imminent threat to public health or safety and the demolition of said structure is required to alleviate said threat.

Ayes: Daniel, Galbraith, Small, Holcombe, Collier, Floyd, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Absent: Tague, Taylor, Nelson, Jones.

CONTINUED. Motion: Collier / Daniel to move continuance for 60-days of items 2.) construct new 1-story garage including, 2a.) composition shingle roof, 2b.) wood horizontal lap siding above brick stem wall, 2c.) two single wood overhead garage doors at front façade and one double overhead garage door at side façade and 2d.) wood pedestrian door based upon the evidence that has been presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds that additional information is required from the applicant in order to determine whether the action requested is in compliance with Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Ayes: Daniel, Galbraith, Small, Holcombe, Collier, Floyd, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Absent: Tague, Taylor, Nelson, Jones.

CONTINUED. Motion: Collier / Daniel to move continuance for 60-days of item 3.) modify the existing driveway to accommodate the new overhead garage doors at the front façade based upon the evidence that has been presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds that additional information is required from the applicant in order to determine whether the action requested is in compliance with Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Ayes: Daniel, Galbraith, Small, Holcombe, Collier, Floyd, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Absent: Tague, Taylor, Nelson, Jones.

- 6N. HPCA-08-105** at 517 NW 41st ST. (Crown Heights), Ward 2. Consideration and possible action on application of Emily Lloyd by Lisa Loven for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) remove vinyl windows at front façade and 2.) install wood true divided-light windows at front facade.

Lisa Loven was present for comment.

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 16 of 22

August 6, 2008

Staff received comments from Crown Heights Preservation Review Committee.

APPROVED. Motion: Daniel / Floyd to move **approval** that, based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-08-105, Staff Report and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds:

- That the existing windows at the front façade are not the historic windows;
- That the non-historic windows will be replaced with wood windows that match in proportion, shape, location, pattern, size, materials, details and profile;
- That the proposed windows are single glazed, true divided-light wood windows with no cladding;
- That this action is consistent with the provisions of *4250.4D(3)(4)(5)and(6) and 4250.4L(2)of the HP Historic Preservation Ordinance and Subchapter 2.5 of the Preservation Guidelines and Standards;*
- That based upon the evidence presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, the action requested is in compliance, and the proposed material change in appearance would not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical or architectural significance and value of the historic property and district according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Ayes: Daniel, Galbraith, Small, Holcombe, Collier, Floyd, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Absent: Tague, Taylor, Nelson, Jones.

- 60. HPCA-08-107** at 3712 N Lee. (Crown Heights), Ward 2. Consideration and possible action on application of Aven Brinlee for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) remove picket fence at front lawn.

Applicant was not present for comment.

Staff received comments from Crown Heights Preservation Review Committee.

APPROVED. Motion: Galbraith / Zimmer to move **approval** that, based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-08-107, Staff Report and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds:

- That the property is not a contributing resource to the historic integrity of the district and therefore, the fence is not historic;
- That the fence is deteriorated beyond repair;
- That this action is consistent with the provisions of *4250.4D(3) and*

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 17 of 22

August 6, 2008

4250.4L(2) of the HP Historic Preservation Ordinance;

- That based upon the evidence presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, the action requested is in compliance, and the proposed material change in appearance would not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical or architectural significance and value of the historic property and district according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Ayes: Daniel, Galbraith, Small, Holcombe, Collier, Floyd, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Absent: Tague, Taylor, Nelson, Jones.

- 6P. HPCA-08-110** at 1012 NW 41st ST. (Crown Heights), Ward 2. Consideration and possible action on application by Katherine A. Thurmond Archer for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) remove front door and 2.) install new wood front door.

Katherine A. Thurmond Archer was not present for comment.

APPROVED. Motion: Floyd / Collier to move **approval** that, based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-08-110, Staff Report and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds:

- That the existing door is not the historic door;
- That the proposed door is solid wood;
- That the proposed door is compatible with historic doors in the district, in proportion, shape, location, pattern, size, materials and details;
- That this action is consistent with the provisions of *4250.4D(3)(4)(5)and(6) and 4250.4L(2)of the HP Historic Preservation Ordinance and Subchapter 2.4 of the Preservation Guidelines and Standards;*
- That based upon the evidence presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, the action requested is in compliance, and the proposed material change in appearance would not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical or architectural significance and value of the historic property and district according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Ayes: Daniel, Galbraith, Small, Holcombe, Collier, Floyd, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Absent: Tague, Taylor, Nelson, Jones.

7. OTHER BUSINESS

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 18 of 22

August 6, 2008

- A. Consideration and possible action approving the amended Certified Local Government grant application, for fiscal year 2008-2009, to the Oklahoma Historical Society, State Historic Preservation Office, and authorizing the Mayor to execute any necessary documents. Amendments are to receive additional funding increasing the Federal Funds from \$11,600.00 to \$18,740; and changing the funding use from equipment purchase to hiring a consultant to conduct a survey of the Downtown historic building. **Consider and discuss.**

RECOMMEND APPROVAL. Motion: Floyd / Collier to recommend approval of the Certified Local Government Grant application and to recommend that the Mayor sign the Certified Local Government Grant application of \$18,740.00.

Ayes: Daniel, Galbraith, Small, Holcombe, Collier, Floyd, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Absent: Tague, Taylor, Nelson, Jones.

- B. Consideration and possible action approving Oklahoma City's application to become a Preserve America Community. This is a program initiated by the First Lady and facilitated by the Advisory Council on Historic Preservation. Preserve America Communities have received this special designation for their dedication to historic preservation in all areas of community development. The draft application will be forward prior to the Commission Meeting. **Consider and discuss.**

No Action.

8. COMMUNICATIONS

A. Administrative Approvals

8A1. HPCA-08-102 at 2317 NW 28TH ST. (Shepherd), Ward 2. Staff is announcing the Administrative Approval of the item on the application of Richard & Tyla Kunc by Mike Mitchell for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) install new fence.

8A2. HPCA-08-098 at 912 NW14th ST. (Heritage Hills), Ward 6. Staff is announcing the Administrative Approval of the item on the application of Patrick & Linn Moore for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) install new fence.

8A3. HPCA-08-099 at 301 NW 20TH ST. (Heritage Hills), Ward 6. Staff is announcing the Administrative Approval of the item on the application of Janelle Bretten for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) install new fence.

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 19 of 22

August 6, 2008

- 8A4. HPCA-08-101** at 314 NW 20th ST. (Heritage Hills), Ward 6. Staff is announcing the Administrative Approval of the item on the application of Jennifer and Robert McCollum for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) install new fence.
- 8A5. HPCA-08-092** at 824 NW 18th ST. (Mesta Park), Ward 6. Staff is announcing the Administrative Approval of the item on the application of Harold C Straughn Family Trust for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) install mechanical devices on roof.
- 8A6. HPCA-08-093** at 600 NW 18th ST. (Mesta Park), Ward 6. Staff is announcing the Administrative Approval of the item on the application of Greg & Angela Krempl by Randy Floyd for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) install new fence/gate and 2.) install gutters and downspouts.
- 8A7. HPCA-08-097** at 631 NW 16th ST. (Mesta Park), Ward 6. Staff is announcing the Administrative Approval of the item on the application of Stephen D. and Risa L. Powell for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) install new fence.
- 8A8. HPCA-08-100** at 440 NW 22ND ST. (Mesta Park), Ward 6. Staff is announcing the Administrative Approval of the item on the application of John and Jennifer Bullard for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) install new fence.
- 8A9. HPCA-08-103** at 701 NW 22nd Street. (Mesta Park), Ward 6. Staff is announcing the Administrative Approval of the item on the application of Lee Foster for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) install new fence.
- 8A10. HPCA-08-114** at 424 NW 30th ST. (Jefferson Park), Ward 2. Staff is announcing the Administrative Approval of the item on the application of John and Jennifer Bullard for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) install new fence.
- 8A11. HPCA-08-016** at 2509 N Hudson Ave. (Jefferson Park), Ward 2. Staff is announcing the Administrative Approval of the item on the application of Loren Capron for Certificate of Appropriateness to 5.) install storm windows.
- 8A12. HPCA-08-091** at 520 NW 40th ST. (Crown Heights), Ward 2. Staff is announcing the Administrative Approval of the item on the application of David & Ambra Gales for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) install landscape edging.

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 20 of 22

August 6, 2008

B. Withdrawals

- 8B1. HPCA-08-019** at 125 NW 15th ST. (Heritage Hills East), Ward 7. Staff is announcing the Withdrawal on June 27, 2008, of the items on the application of Downtown OKC Properties, LLC by Brandt Nashert - D&S Management / BNCI Contracting for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) remove mansard shingled roof, 2.) replace windows, 3.) replace sliding glass doors, 4.) install new denseglass sheathing and EIFS product over exterior siding, 5.) paint existing brick to coordinate with existing buildings, 7.) install new standing seam awnings, 8.) construct 2' max. parapet wall at roof to vary roofline at exterior, and 9.) replace shingles at roof on courtyard side.
- 8B2. HPCA-08-109** at 415 NW 18th ST. (Heritage Hills), Ward 2. Staff is announcing the withdrawal on July 11, 2008, of the items on the application of Mark and Penny Johnson for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) replace windows, 2.) replace shutters, and 3.) replace glass block Applicant is replacing "in-kind" therefore.
- 8B3. HPCA-08-104** at 229 NW Eubanks. (Edgemere Park), Ward 2. Staff is announcing the withdrawal on July 14, 2008, of the items on the application of Victoria Phelps for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) replace garage door, 2.) add screened enclosure to west side of garage, 3.) add one door and two windows on west wall of garage.

C. Board of Adjustment (BOA)

- 8C1. HPCA-07-150** at 314 NW 17TH ST. (Heritage Hills), Ward 6. Staff is announcing the appeal of the Historic Preservation Commissions denial of the application of Lawrence & Magdalen DeBault for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) construct new 2-story garage including 1a.) side gable composition shingle roof and standing seam metal, shed dormer roof, 1b.) brick walls and cementitious siding at dormer, 1c.) wood columns, wood upper platform, wood stair with rail, wood fascia, wood soffit and wood trim, 1d.) two wood overhead garage doors, 1e.) wood windows, 1f.) wood pedestrian doors, 1g.) upper front full-light doors, 1h.) wrought iron rail and 2.) install driveway sections to accomodate new garage door openings and 3.) extend for 6-months the previously approved garage demolition proposal. **Appeal was sustained by the Board of Adjustment with the condition that the second floor top plate will be at 8' at both the North and South of the structure and the dormer will be removed.**

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 21 of 22

August 6, 2008

8C2. HPCA-08-059 at 224 W Eubanks ST. (Edgemere Park), Ward 2. Staff is announcing the appeal of the Historic Preservation Commissions denial of the application of Zack and Jen Woods for Certificate of Appropriateness to 2.) remove sidewalk and install concrete pavers for front sidewalk. **Appeal was continued to the August 7, 2008 Board of Adjustment meeting.**

8C3. HPCA-08-091 at 520 NW 40th ST. (Crown Heights), Ward 2. Staff is announcing the appeal of the Historic Preservation Commissions denial of the application of David & Ambra Gales for a Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) cover existing concrete front porch and sidewalk with flagstone (completed work). **Appeal is scheduled to be heard at the September 4, 2008, Board of Adjustment meeting.**

D. National Trust Conference Registration.

E. Volunteers need to serve refreshments at the Overholser Mansion.

F. The next regularly scheduled meeting for the Historic Preservation Commission is Wednesday, September 3, 2008 at 2:00 p.m. at the Municipal Building, City Council Chamber. New applications and information on continued projects are to be submitted to staff by 5:00 p.m., Tuesday, August 12, 2008.

9. ADJOURNMENT (5:12 p.m.)

Motion: Collier / Daniel to adjourn the 8/6/2008, meeting of the Historic Preservation Commission.

Ayes: Daniel, Galbraith, Small, Holcombe, Collier, Floyd, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Absent: Tague, Taylor, Nelson, Jones.

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 22 of 22

August 6, 2008