

MINUTES
Regular Meeting
HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION
July 02, 2008 - 2:00 p.m.
Municipal Building, City Council Chamber

The meeting of the Oklahoma City Historic Preservation Commission was called to order in the City Council Chamber, 3rd Floor of the Municipal Building, 200 N. Walker Avenue, Oklahoma City, Oklahoma. The meeting convened at 2:03 p.m. Notice of the meeting and agenda were filed with the City Clerk's office and posted on the Council bulletin board 24 hours prior to the meeting.

1. CALL TO ORDER AND ROLL CALL

Members Present: Roland Tague, Chairman
Carolee Galbraith
Marnie Taylor
Thomas J. Daniel IV (arrived at Item 6F)
Karen Collier
Karen Nelson
Nedra Jones
Karen Zimmer

Members Absent: Thomas Small, AIA, Vice-Chairman
Jane Holcombe
Randy Floyd, AIA

Staff Present: Eva Osborne, AIA, Preservation Architect, Planning Department
Susan Miller, Planner IV, Planning Department
Analinda Lane, Planning Department
Rita Douglas-Talley, Assistant Municipal Counselor

2. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

APPROVED. Motion: Collier/Galbraith to **approve** the minutes of the June 4, 2008, Historic Preservation Commission meeting.

Ayes: Galbraith, Taylor, Collier, Tague, Nelson, Jones, Zimmer.
Nays: None.
Abstain: None.
Absent: Daniel, Small, Holcombe, Floyd.

3. CITATION REPORT

Mr. Woods, Compliance Officer, was present for comment.

4. CONTINUANCE REQUESTS

A. Staff request continuance of the following cases:

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 2 of 20

7/2/2008

- 6A. HPCA-08-080** at 532 NW 40th ST. (Crown Heights), Ward 2. To continue for 30-days the application of Mark & Denise Hole by Ryan Scamehorn for a Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) demolish 1-story garage, 2.) construct new 1-story garage including, 2a.) composition shingle roof, 2b.) wood horizontal lap siding above brick stem wall, 2c.) two single wood overhead garage doors at front façade and one double overhead garage door at side façade and 2d.) wood pedestrian door and 3.) modify the existing driveway to accommodate the new overhead garage doors at the front facade. Ward 2.

CONTINUED. Motion: Collier/Zimmer to move continuance for 30-days based upon the evidence that has been presented in the application, HPCA-08-080, Staff Report and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds:

- That the action requested cannot be approved at this time;
- That additional information is required from the applicant in order to determine whether the action requested is in compliance;
- That based upon the evidence that has been presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, additional information is required from the applicant in order to determine whether the action requested is in compliance with the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Ayes: Galbraith, Taylor, Collier, Tague, Nelson, Jones, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Abstain: None.

Absent: Daniel, Holcombe, Small, Floyd.

- B.** Other continuance requests:

None.

5. CONSENT DOCKET CASES

- 6B HPCA-08-090** at 716 NW 42nd ST. (Crown Heights), Ward 2. Consideration and possible action on application of Susan Seamans for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) remove vinyl siding and trim to expose historic wood siding and trim, and 2.) replace/reconstruct any rotten or missing pieces of wood siding and trim to match historic condition.
- 6I. HPCA-07-169** at 614 NW 16th ST. (Mesta Park), Ward 6. Consideration and possible action on application of Scott Reed & Terri White by Randy Floyd for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) request extension.

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 3 of 20

7/2/2008

APPROVED. Motion: Taylor/Jones to move approval of consent docket items with the amendment of item 6L, HPCA-07-169 to add the words “to be extended for 6-months”, based upon the evidence presented in the applications, Staff Reports and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds:

Specific Findings for HPCA-08-090:

- that the vinyl siding is not historic and it diminishes the historic integrity of the property;
- that the proposed wood siding and trim will match the historic condition based on the physical evidence at the site;
- that this action is consistent with the provisions of *4250.4D(5) and 4250.4L(2) of the HP Historic Preservation Ordinance and Subchapter 2.1 of the Preservation Guidelines and Standards*;
- that based upon the evidence presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, the action requested is in compliance, and the proposed material change in appearance would not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical or architectural significance and value of the historic property and district according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Specific Findings for HPCA-07-169:

- that this action is consistent with the provisions of *4250.4G(3) of the HP Historic Preservation Ordinance*;
- that based upon the evidence presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, the action requested is in compliance, and the proposed material change in appearance would not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical or architectural significance and value of the historic property and district according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Ayes: Galbraith, Taylor, Collier, Tague, Nelson, Jones, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Abstain: None.

Absent: Daniel, Holcombe, Small, Floyd.

6. CASES FOR INDIVIDUAL CONSIDERATION

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 4 of 20

7/2/2008

- 6A. HPCA-08-080** at 532 NW 40th ST. (Crown Heights), Ward 2. To ~~continue for 30-~~ days the application of Mark & Denise Hole by Ryan Scamehorn for a Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) demolish 1-story garage, 2.) construct new 1-story garage including, 2a.) composition shingle roof, 2b.) wood horizontal lap siding above brick stem wall, 2c.) two single wood overhead garage doors at front façade and one double overhead garage door at side façade and 2d.) wood pedestrian door and 3.) modify the existing driveway to accommodate the new overhead garage doors at the front facade. Ward 2.

The Crown Heights Preservation Review Committee submitted written comments to staff prior to the meeting.

A letter of concern from a neighbor was submitted to staff prior to the meeting.

Continued on Continuance Docket.

- 6B. HPCA-08-090** at 716 NW 42nd ST. (Crown Heights), Ward 2. Consideration and possible action on the application of Susan Seamans for a Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) remove vinyl siding and trim to expose historic wood siding and trim, and 2.) replace/reconstruct any rotten or missing pieces of wood siding and trim to match historic condition.

The Crown Heights Preservation Review Committee submitted written comments to staff prior to the meeting.

Approved on Consent Docket.

- 6C. HPCA-08-091** at 520 NW 40th ST. (Crown Heights), Ward 2. Consideration and possible action on the application of David & Ambra Gales for a Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) cover existing concrete front porch and sidewalk with flagstone (completed work), 2.) replace existing metal storm door with full-light storm door at front entry, 3.) replace wood shutters, 4.) remove the shake shingles at the house and repair/reconstruct historic wood siding including Option 4A.) painted wood horizontal lap siding or Option 4B.) painted wood board and batten vertical siding, 5.) replace existing window at the front façade second floor historic window opening next to the chimney with wood 6/1 window, 6.) replace siding on the garage with HardyPlank horizontal lap siding with wood trim, 7.) replace garage doors and 8.) extend the deadline for completion of all work items, 6-months.

David Gales and David Wood were present for comment. David Wood, former owner who presently resides across the street presented comments in support of the application.

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 5 of 20

7/2/2008

The Crown Heights Preservation Review Committee submitted written comments to staff prior to the meeting.

Two letters of support for the proposal from neighboring property owners were presented to become part of the record for this application.

DENIED WITH PREJUDICE. Motion: Taylor/Collier to deny with prejudice Item 1. cover existing concrete front porch and sidewalk with flagstone (completed work), that, based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-08-091, Staff Report and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds:

- That the flagstone was installed over the existing concrete porch and sidewalk without a Certificate of Appropriateness and therefore the Commission will consider its appropriateness in the context of the property or resource as it appeared prior to any work being undertaken;
- that the concrete sidewalk (before it was covered with flagstone) was the original sidewalk at this property;
- material at the porch (before it was covered with flagstone) is not the historic porch;
- that the flagstone material was not in-place at this location during the historic period of significance of the Crown Heights Historic District;
- covering the existing concrete front porch with flagstone would create a false historical appearance through the application of new elements;
- private sidewalks must be constructed of brush-finish concrete in medium grey tones, except where historical precedent demonstrates previous existence of brick, stone or other materials;
- that this action is consistent with the provisions of *4250.4D(3), 4250.4H and 4250.4L(2) of the Historic Preservation Ordinance and Subchapter 1.3, 2.1 and 2.2 of the Preservation Guidelines and Standards;*
- that based upon the evidence presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, the action requested is not in compliance, and the proposed material change in appearance would have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical or architectural significance and value of the historic property and district according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Ayes: Galbraith, Taylor, Collier, Tague, Nelson, Jones, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Abstain: None.

Absent: Daniel, Holcombe, Small, Floyd.

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 6 of 20

7/2/2008

APPROVED. Motion: Taylor/ Collier to move **approval of items 2 through 8** that, based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-08-091, Staff Report and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds

The following are specific findings for **item 2.)** replace existing metal storm door with full-light storm door at front entry:

- that the existing storm door (removed from opening) was not historic;
- that the proposed storm door will have a full-light with clear glass;
- that this action is consistent with the provisions of *4250.4D(5) and (6) of the Historic Preservation Ordinance and Subchapter 2.4 of the Preservation Guidelines and Standards*;
- that based upon the evidence presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, the action requested is in compliance, and the proposed material change in appearance would not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical or architectural significance and value of the historic property and district according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

:

The following are specific findings for **item 3.)** replace wood shutters:

- that based on the photograph from the National Register application, shutters were in-place at the time the district was listed on the National Register of Historic Places;
- that the proposed shutters are compatible with the historic character of the property;
- that this action is consistent with the provisions of *4250.4D(5) and (6) of the HP Historic Preservation Ordinance and Subchapter 2.5 of the Preservation Guidelines and Standards*;
- that based upon the evidence presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, the action requested is in compliance, and the proposed material change in appearance would not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical or architectural significance and value of the historic property and district according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

The following are specific findings for **item 4.)** remove the shake shingles at the house and repair/reconstruct historic wood siding including Option 4A.) painted wood horizontal lap siding or Option 4B.) painted wood board and batten vertical siding:

- that the shake shingles are not historic;

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 7 of 20

7/2/2008

- that the applicant will repair/reconstruct the historic siding based on the physical evidence;
- that this action is consistent with the provisions of *4250.4D(3)(4)(5)and(6) and 4250.4L(2)of the HP Historic Preservation Ordinance and Subchapter 2.1 and 2.10 of the Preservation Guidelines and Standards;*
- that based upon the evidence presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, the action requested is in compliance, and the proposed material change in appearance would not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical or architectural significance and value of the historic property and district according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

The following are specific findings for **item 5.)** replace existing window at the front façade second floor historic window opening next to the chimney with wood 6/1 window, **item 6.)** replace siding on the garage with HardyPlank horizontal lap siding with wood trim, **item7.)** replace garage doors and **8.)** extend the deadline for completion of all work items, 6-months:

- that the existing aluminum window is not historic;
- that the proposed window is similar to the historic windows that are typical at this property;
- that the proposed window is a wood, 6/1, true divided-light window with clear glass;
- that the siding on the garage is deteriorated;
- that the garage is not the historic garage;
- that the proposed siding at the garage is compatible with the historic character of the property;
- that the garage doors are deteriorated;
- that the proposed garage doors are consistent with the character of the property;
- that this action is consistent with the provisions of *4250.4D(3)(4)(5)and(6) and 4250.4L(2) and 4250.4E(4)(a) of the HP Historic Preservation Ordinance and Subchapter 2.1, 2.4, 3.3 and 3.5 of the Preservation Guidelines and Standards;*
- that based upon the evidence presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, the action requested is in compliance, and the proposed material change in appearance would not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical or architectural significance and value of the historic property and district according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 8 of 20

7/2/2008

Ayes: Galbraith, Taylor, Collier, Tague, Nelson, Jones, Zimmer.
Nays: None.
Abstain: None.
Absent: Daniel, Holcombe, Small, Floyd.

- 6D. HPCA-08-054** at 2209 NW 29th ST. (Shepherd), Ward 2. Consideration and possible action on the application of Kirby Kilfoy for a Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) replace front door surround.

Kirby Kilfoy and Rob Elliot were present for comment.

APPROVED. Motion: Collier/Gailbraith to move **approval** that, based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-08-054 and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds:

- that based on the applicant's testimony, the historic door surround was deteriorated beyond repair;
- that the proposed wood door surround closely replicates the historic door surround;
- that this action is consistent with the provisions of *4250.4D(3)(4)(5)and(6) and 4250.4L(2)of the HP Historic Preservation Ordinance and Subchapter 2.1 of the Preservation Guidelines and Standards;*
- that based upon the evidence presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, the action requested is in compliance, and the proposed material change in appearance would not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical or architectural significance and value of the historic property and district according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Ayes: Galbraith, Taylor, Collier, Tague, Nelson, Jones, Zimmer.
Nays: None.
Abstain: None.
Absent: Daniel, Holcombe, Small, Floyd.

- 6E. HPCA-08-089** at 2244 NW 30TH ST. (Shepherd), Ward 2. Consideration and possible action on the application of Patricia & Gene Berger by Gary Ballew, Southwest Builders for a Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) demolish sun room, 2.) construct new addition including 2a.) gable composition shingle roof, 2b.) wood horizontal lap siding with Option A to place the new west wall 2" east of flush with the historic wall or Option B to place the new west wall 1'-0" east of flush with the

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 9 of 20

7/2/2008

historic wall as illustrated by the submitted drawings, 2c.) 1/1 insulated wood windows, 2d.) pair of clear glass, wood French doors and 2e.) HVAC wall unit.

The applicant and representative were not present for comment.

APPROVED. Motion: Collier/Nelson to move approval with the right to use either Option A or Option B for item 2b.) that, based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-08-089 and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds:

- that the existing sun room is a non-historic addition;
- that the proposed addition with both options will be compatible and differentiated from the historic house;
- that the proposed addition will be compatible in size, texture, color, design, proportion and detail with other historic structures in the historic district;
- that this action is consistent with the provisions of *4250.4D(3)(4)(5)and(6) and 4250.4L(2)of the HP Historic Preservation Ordinance and Subchapter 3.2 of the Preservation Guidelines and Standards;*
- that based upon the evidence presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, the action requested is in compliance, and the proposed material change in appearance would not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical or architectural significance and value of the historic property and district according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Ayes: Galbraith, Taylor, Collier, Tague, Nelson, Jones, Zimmer.
Nays: None.
Abstain: None.
Absent: Daniel, Holcombe, Small, Floyd.

- 6F. HPCA-08-094** at 1500 N Robinson Ave. (Heritage Hills East), Ward 7. Consideration and possible action on the application of St. Lukes United Methodist Church - Phil Greenwald by David Wanzer for a Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) remove existing chain link fence and install new 8'-0" high wood fence, 2.) remove canopy, 3.) replace storefront windows and door, 4.) replace/install new doors at side facades and 5.) replace/install windows at side and back facades.

David Wanzer was present for comment.

APPROVED. Motion: Collier/Nelson to approve item 1.) remove existing chain link fence and install new 8'-0" high wood fence, that, based upon the evidence

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 10 of 20

7/2/2008

presented in the application of HPCA-08-094 and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds:

- the subject property and the neighboring property differ in that one is residential and one is commercial;
- that the proposed fence is 8'-0" high;
- that the chain link fence will be removed and the brick wall at the east property line will be retained;
- where residential properties are adjacent to commercial uses alternative fence heights may be reviewed for appropriateness;
- fences may not exceed eight feet in height at the rear property line or alley;
- that this action is consistent with the provisions of *4250.4D(3)(4)(5)and(6)*, *4250.4L(2)*, *4250.4I(2)* and *4250.4J* of the *HP Historic Preservation Ordinance and Subchapter 1.9 of the Preservation Guidelines and Standards*;
- that based upon the evidence presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, the action requested is in compliance, and the proposed material change in appearance would not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical or architectural significance and value of the historic property and district according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Ayes: Daniel, Galbraith, Collier, Tague, Nelson, Jones, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Abstain: Taylor.

Absent: Holcombe, Small, Floyd.

APPROVED. Motion: Collier/Zimmer to **approve item 2.)** remove canopy, that, based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-08-094 and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds:

- that the existing canopy is not a historic feature;
- that this action is consistent with the provisions of *4250.4L(2)of the HP Historic Preservation Ordinance*;
- that based upon the evidence presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, the action requested is in compliance, and the proposed material change in appearance would not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical or architectural significance and value of the historic property and district according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 11 of 20

7/2/2008

Ayes: Daniel, Galbraith, Collier, Tague, Nelson, Jones, Zimmer.
Nays: None.
Abstain: Taylor.
Absent: Holcombe, Small, Floyd.

APPROVED. Motion: Daniel/Collier to move **approval of item 3.) through 5.)** that, based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-08-094 and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds:

- that the proposed storefront, windows and doors are aluminum with Low E glazing;
- that unique circumstances exist because the existing (original, non-historic) storefront, windows and doors are aluminum with reflective glazing;
- that this action is consistent with the provisions of *4250.4D(3)(4)(5)and(6, 4250.4J and 4250.4L(2)of the HP Historic Preservation Ordinance and Subchapter 3.5 of the Preservation Guidelines and Standards;*
- That the action requested is not in compliance, but because of the unique circumstances the proposed material change in appearance would not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical or architectural significance and value of the historic property and district according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Ayes: Daniel, Collier, Tague, Nelson, Jones, Zimmer.
Nays: Galbraith.
Abstain: Taylor.
Absent: Holcombe, Small, Floyd.

- 6G. HPCA-07-178** at 823 NW 19th ST. (Mesta Park), Ward 6. Consideration and possible action on the application of Ryan Scamehorn for a Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) construct a new 2-story house including 1a.) composition shingle hipped and gable roof, 1b.) horizontal wood lap siding, painted wood shingle siding, brick veneer stem wall with wood cornerboards, wood fascia, bead board soffit and wood trim, 1c.) concrete porch and steps, 1d.) wood columns and railing, 1e.) wood windows, 1f.) wood doors, 2.) construct a new 1-story garage including 2a.) composition shingle gabel roof, 2b.) wood lap siding, wood shingle siding and brick veneer with wood trim, 2c.) wood panel overhead garage door, 2d.) wood panel pedestrian door, 2e.) wood windows and 3.) construct driveway and sidewalks.

Ryan Scamehorn was present for comment.

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 12 of 20

7/2/2008

The Mesta Park Preservation Review Committee submitted written comments to staff prior to the meeting.

APPROVED WITH CONDITION. Motion: Daniel/Zimmer to move **approval with condition**, based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-07-178 and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds:

- that the existing stem wall will be removed, the finished grade will be increased in elevation to match the neighbor's finished grade;
- that a new stem wall will be constructed that will accommodate a finished floor height of min. 18" above finished grade;
- that the proposed windows are 1/1, wood windows with clear glass;
- that the proposed house and garage are compatible in size, scale, proportion, spacing, texture, setbacks, height, materials, color, and detail to adjacent or nearby buildings and streetscapes;
- that this action is consistent with the provisions of *4250.4D(4)(5)and(6) of the HP Historic Preservation Ordinance and Chapter 3, Subchapter 3.1 and 3.3 of the Preservation Guidelines and Standards*;
- that based upon the evidence presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, the action requested is in compliance, and the proposed material change in appearance would not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical or architectural significance and value of the historic property and district according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

The condition of approval is that the windows will be 1/1 wood windows with clear glass.

Ayes: Daniel, Galbraith, Taylor, Collier, Tague, Nelson, Jones, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Abstain: None.

Absent: Holcombe, Small, Floyd.

- 6H. HPCA-08-093** at 600 NW 18th ST. (Mesta Park), Ward 6. Consideration and possible action on the application of Greg & Angela Krempl by Randy Floyd for a Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) construct new 1-story garage including 1a.) composition shingle hipped roof, 1b.) wood or HardyPlank horizontal lap siding 1c.) two sets of wood side-swinging garage doors and 1d.) wood panel pedestrian door, 3.) install new concrete retaining walls, 4.) install new garage approach, 5.) install new back door to house with new light fixture and 6.) install canopy over back door.

Samantha Glenn and Greg Klemp were present for comment.

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 13 of 20

7/2/2008

The Mesta Park Preservation Review Committee submitted written comments to staff prior to the meeting.

APPROVED WITH CONDITION. Motion: Daniel/Collier to **approve with condition item 1.)** construct new 1-story garage, that, based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-08-093 and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds:

- that the proposed garage is compatible in size, scale, proportion, spacing, texture, setbacks, height, materials, color and detail to the main residential building and/or relate to similar garages within the neighborhood;
- that two sets of carriage doors will be constructed of wood;
- that the proposed pedestrian door is wood with clear glass;
- that this action is consistent with the provisions of *4250.4D(4)(5)and(6)of the HP Historic Preservation Ordinance and Subchapter 3.3 of the Preservation Guidelines and Standards;*
- that based upon the evidence presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, the action requested is in compliance, and the proposed material change in appearance would not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical or architectural significance and value of the historic property and district according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

The condition of approval is that the corner boards, soffits, fascia and trim be wood.

Ayes: Daniel, Galbraith, Taylor, Collier, Tague, Nelson, Jones, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Abstain: None.

Absent: Holcombe, Small, Floyd.

APPROVED. Motion: Collier/Nelson to **approve item 3.)** install new concrete retaining walls and **approve item 4.)** install new garage approach, that, based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-08-093 and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds:

- that the existing retaining walls are historic;
- that the new approach will be medium grey brushed concrete;
- that this action is consistent with the provisions of *4250.4D(4)(5)and(6)of the HP Historic Preservation Ordinance and Subchapter 1.3 and 1.6 of the Preservation Guidelines and Standards;*

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 14 of 20

7/2/2008

- that based upon the evidence presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, the action requested is in compliance, and the proposed material change in appearance would not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical or architectural significance and value of the historic property and district according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Ayes: Daniel, Galbraith, Taylor, Collier, Tague, Nelson, Jones, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Abstain: None.

Absent: Holcombe, Small, Floyd.

APPROVED. Motion: Collier/Zimmer to **approve item 5.)** install new back door to house with new light fixture, that, based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-08-093 and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds:

- that the existing back door is not historic;
- that the proposed back door is a wood panel door;
- that the proposed light fixture is compatible with the historic character of the house;
- that this action is consistent with the provisions of *4250.4D(4)(5)and(6)of the HP Historic Preservation Ordinance and Subchapter 2.4 and 2.13 of the Preservation Guidelines and Standards;*
- that based upon the evidence presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, the action requested is in compliance, and the proposed material change in appearance would not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical or architectural significance and value of the historic property and district according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Ayes: Daniel, Galbraith, Taylor, Collier, Tague, Nelson, Jones, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Abstain: None.

Absent: Holcombe, Small, Floyd.

DENIED WITH PREJUDICE. Motion: Galbraith/Nelson to move **denial with prejudice on Item 6.)** install canopy over back door, that, based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-08-093 and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds:

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 15 of 20

7/2/2008

- that the addition where the proposed canopy would be installed in not historic;
- that there was no canopy at the proposed location during the period of historic significance of the district;
- that a canopy should not be added to a building where none historically existed;
- that this action is consistent with the provisions of *4250.4D(4)(5)and(6)of the HP Historic Preservation Ordinance and Subchapter 2.2 of the Preservation Guidelines and Standards;*
- that based upon the evidence presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, the action requested is not in compliance, and the proposed material change in appearance would have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical or architectural significance and value of the historic property and district according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Ayes: Galbraith, Taylor, Collier, Tague, Nelson, Jones

Nays: Daniel, Zimmer.

Abstain: None.

Absent: Holcombe, Small, Floyd.

- 6I. HPCA-07-169** at 614 NW 16th ST. (Mesta Park), Ward 6. Consideration and possible action on the application of Scott Reed & Terri White by Randy Floyd for a Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) request extension for 6-months.

Samantha Glenn was present for comment.

The Mesta Park Preservation Review Committee submitted written comments to staff prior to the meeting.

Approved on Consent Docket.

- 6J. HPCA-08-095** at 718 NW 22nd ST. (Mesta Park), Ward 6. Consideration and possible action on the application of Gary Davidson by Karl Call for a Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) new 1-story house including 1a.) composition shingle front gable roof, 1b.) HardyPlank Horizontal lap siding with exposed concrete foundation wall, 1c.) wood 1/1 windows with cladding, 1d.) wood and clear glass doors with cladding, 1e.) brick and wood columns at exposed concrete porch and 2.) new 1-story garage including 2a.) composition shingle roof, 2b.) HardyPlank horizontal lap siding, 2c.) wood double-overhead garage door, 2d.) wood pedestrian door and 3.) new medium grey brushed concrete sidewalks and driveway.

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 16 of 20

7/2/2008

Karl Call was present for comment.

The Mesta Park Preservation Review Committee submitted written comments to staff prior to the meeting.

APPROVED. Motion: Galbraith/Jones to move **approval** that, based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-08-095 and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds:

- that the sidewalks and driveways will be constructed of brush-finished concrete in medium grey tones with a maximum driveway width of 10'-0";
- that the house and garage will be compatible in size, scale, proportion, spacing, texture, setbacks, height, materials, color and detail to the main residential building and/or relate to similar garages within the neighborhood;
- that the house will have a front setback consistent with the neighboring houses;
- that the walls will have cementitious horizontal lap siding;
- that the windows and doors will be wood with clear glass and cladding;
- that this action is consistent with the provisions of *4250.4D(4)(5)and(6) of the Historic Preservation Ordinance and Subchapter 1.3, 3.1, 3.3 and 3.5 of the Preservation Guidelines and Standards;*
- that based upon the evidence presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, the action requested is in compliance, and the proposed material change in appearance would not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical or architectural significance and value of the historic property and district according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Ayes: Daniel, Galbraith, Taylor, Collier, Tague, Nelson, Jones, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Abstain: None.

Absent: Holcombe, Small, Floyd.

- 6K. HPCA-08-075** at 311 NW 26th ST. (Jefferson Park), Ward 2. Consideration and possible action on the application of Jefferson Park Neighborhood Assn. by Loren Capron for a Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) construct new 1-story house including 1a.) composition shingle front gable roof, 1b.) HardyPlank horizontal lap siding with exposed concrete foundation wall, 1c.) wood 1/1 windows, 1d.) wood panel doors with clear glass, 1e.) brick and wood columns at exposed concrete porch

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 17 of 20

7/2/2008

and 2.) construct new 1-story garage including 2a.) composition shingle roof, 2b.) HardyPlank horizontal lap siding, 2c.) wood single-overhead garage door, 2d.) wood pedestrian door and 3.) install new medium grey brushed concrete sidewalks and driveway and 4.) install new light fixtures.

Loren Capron was present for comment.

CONTINUED. Motion: Daniel/Galbraith to **continue for 30-days** the application, that, based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-08-075 and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds:

- that the action requested cannot be approved at this time;
- that the plans submitted have inconsistent representations of the construction proposed;
- that additional information is required from the applicant in order to determine whether the action requested is in compliance;
- that the applicant concurred in the necessity for a continuance;
- that based upon the evidence that has been presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, additional information is required from the applicant in order to determine whether the action requested is in compliance with the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Ayes: Daniel, Galbraith, Taylor, Collier, Tague, Nelson, Jones, Zimmer.

Nays: None.

Abstain: None.

Absent: Holcombe, Small, Floyd.

- 6L. HPCA-08-059** at 224 W Eubanks ST. (Edgemere Park), Ward 2. Consideration and possible action on the application of Zack and Jen Woods for a Certificate of Appropriateness to 2b.) replace porch steps with medium grey brushed concrete finish and change the surface of the porch to match the finish at steps.

Zack and Jennifer Woods were present for comment. New evidence was presented to illustrate that the historic porch was painted red. **The work item was amended** by the applicant to replace the porch steps in-kind and repaint the porch and steps with red color.

The Edgemere Park Preservation Review Committee submitted written comments to staff prior to the meeting.

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 18 of 20

7/2/2008

APPROVED. Motion: Collier/Zimmer to move **approval as amended**, that, based upon the evidence presented in the application of HPCA-08-059 and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds:

- that the porch and steps are significant historic features;
- that the historic porch and steps were painted concrete;
- that the proposed porch and steps will be painted concrete;
- that this action is consistent with the provisions of *4250.4D(3)(4)(5)and(6) of the Historic Preservation Ordinance and Subchapter 2.1 and 2.2 of the Preservation Guidelines and Standards;*
- that based upon the evidence presented in the application, Staff Report and during the public hearing, the action requested as amended is in compliance, and the proposed material change in appearance would not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical or architectural significance and value of the historic property and district according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007.

Ayes: Daniel, Galbraith, Taylor, Collier, Tague, Nelson, Jones, Zimmer.
Nays: None.
Abstain: None.
Absent: Holcombe, Small, Floyd.

7. OTHER BUSINESS

None.

8. COMMUNICATIONS

A. Administrative Approvals

8A1. HPCA-08-082 at 817 NW 40th ST. (Crown Heights), Ward 2. Staff is announcing the Administrative Approval of the items on the application of Carla Mason for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) install landscape edging at driveway and flower beds, and 2.) replace driveway.

8A2. HPCA-08-084 at 517 NW 42nd ST. (Crown Heights), Ward 2. Staff is announcing the Administrative Approval of the items on the application of Aaron Long for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) install gutters and downspouts and 2.) lighting.

8A3. HPCA-08-002 at 533 NW 42nd ST. (Crown Heights), Ward 2. Staff is announcing the Administrative Approval of the item on the application of

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 19 of 20

7/2/2008

Gregg Long for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) install fence.

- 8A4. HPCA-08-050** at 529 NW 42nd ST. (Crown Heights), Ward 2. Staff is announcing the Administrative Approval of the item on the application of Richard & Susan Wymer for Certificate of Appropriateness to 4.) install stone planting border at driveway.
- 8A5. HPCA-08-053** at 2128 NW 29th ST. (Shepherd), Ward 2. Staff is announcing the Administrative Approval of the items on the application of Michael C. Cook by Micahel O'Toole for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) install pole light fixture and 2.) install landscape edging.
- 8A6. HPCA-08-088** at 2140 NW 26th ST. (Shepherd), Ward 2. Staff is announcing the Administrative Approval of the items on the application of Shannon Richey & Dennis Lovett for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) install landscape edging, 2.) replace driveway and 3.) install fence.
- 8A7. HPCA-08-083** at 525 NW 15th ST. (Heritage Hills), Ward 6. Staff is announcing the Administrative Approval of the item on the application of Matthew McBride for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) install fence.
- 8A8. HPCA-08-085** at 515 NW 14th ST. (Heritage Hills), Ward 6. Staff is announcing the Administrative Approval of the item on the application of Anita Irwin for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) install fence.
- 8A9. HPCA-08-059** at 224 W Eubanks ST. (Edgemere Park), Ward 2. Staff is announcing the Administrative Approval of the item on the application of Zack and Jen Woods for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) install fence.
- 8A10. HPCA-08-096** at 205 NW Eubanks ST. (Edgemere Park), Ward 2. Staff is announcing the Administrative Approval of the item on the application of Stephani Farris Estate, Terri Davis by Porter Davis for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) replace fence with "dog-eared" wood fence.

B. Withdrawals

None.

C. Board of Adjustment (BOA)

- 8C1. HPCA-07-150** at 314 NW 17TH ST. (Heritage Hills), Ward 6. Staff is announcing the appeal of the Historic Preservation Commissions denial of the application of Lawrence & Magdalen DeBault for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) construct new 2-story garage including 1a.) side

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 20 of 20

7/2/2008

gable with composition shingles and standing seam metal roof, 1b.) brick walls and cementitious siding, 1c.) wood windows, 1d.) wood columns, balcony, stair, rail and wood fascia, soffit and trim, 1e.) two overhead garage doors, 1f.) wood pedestrian door and 1g.) variety of windows. **BOA on July 17, 2008.**

8C2. HPCA-08-059 at 224 W Eubanks ST. (Edgemere Park), Ward 2. Staff is announcing the appeal of the Historic Preservation Commissions denial of the application of Zack and Jen Woods for Certificate of Appropriateness to 2.) install concrete pavers for front sidewalk. **BOA on July 17, 2008**

D. National Trust Conference.

E. The next regularly scheduled meeting for the Historic Preservation Commission is Wednesday, August 6, 2008 at 2:00 p.m. at the Municipal Building, City Council Chamber. New applications and information on continued projects are to be submitted to staff by 5:00 p.m., Tuesday, July 8, 2008.

ADJOURN (4:40 p.m.)

Motion: Collier/Galbraith to adjourn the 7/2/2008, meeting of the Historic Preservation Commission.

Ayes: Daniel, Galbraith, Taylor, Collier, Tague, Nelson, Jones, Zimmer.
Nays: None.
Abstain: None
Absent: Holcombe, Small, Floyd

EO