

MINUTES
Regular Meeting
HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION
May 4, 2005 - 3:00 p.m.
Municipal Building, City Council Chamber

The meeting of the Oklahoma City Historic Preservation Commission was called to order in the City Council Chamber, 3rd Floor of the Municipal Building, 200 N. Walker Avenue, Oklahoma City, Oklahoma. The meeting convened at 3:08 p.m. Notice of the meeting and agenda were filed with the City Clerk's office and posted on the Council bulletin board 24 hours prior to the meeting.

1. CALL TO ORDER AND ROLL CALL

Members Present:

Thomas Small, AIA, Vice-Chairman
Carolee Galbraith
Gretchen Bennett
Joseph B. Couch
Marnie Taylor
Jane Holcombe
Roland Tague
Karen Collier
Randy Floyd

Members Absent: Thomas J. Daniel IV, Chairman
Shannon Kelley

Staff Present: Eva Osborne, AIA, Preservation Officer, Planning Department
Wiley Rice, Planner, Planning Department
Angela Yetter, Administrative Coordinator, Planning Department

2. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

APPROVED. Motion: Galbraith/Couch to approve the minutes of the April 6, 2005, Historic Preservation Commission meeting, as amended concerning item 6C to change the word "intended" to "stated". Ayes: Galbraith, Bennett, Couch, Taylor, Holcombe, Small, Collier, Tague, Floyd. Nays: None.

8D. STATE PRESERVATION CONFERENCE

Glen Vaughn-Roberson addressed the Commission concerning the State Preservation Conference.

3. CITATION REPORT

Mr. Wilson, Zoning Inspector, was present to comment.

4. CONTINUANCE REQUESTS

A. Staff request continuance of the following cases:

6G. HPCA-05-029 at 2121 NW 27 Street. (Shepherd HD), Ward 2. Consideration and possible action on application of Jeff Struble for Certificate of Appropriateness to 2.) install shutters.

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 2 of 8

- 7A. National Register of Historic Places nomination for Will Roger's Park Gardens and Arboretum, NW 36th St between N Grand Blvd (I-44) and N Portland Ave. Staff requests a continuance to the June 1, 2005 to allow the OKC Parks Department Board of Directors an opportunity to comment on the nomination.

APPROVED. Motion: Bennett/Collier to continue the above items as stated. Ayes: Galbraith, Bennett, Couch, Taylor, Holcombe, Small, Collier, Tague, Floyd. Nays: None.

- B. Other continuance requests:

5. CONSENT DOCKET CASES

- 5A. HPCA-04-110 at 629 NW 20 Street. (Mesta Park HD), Ward 6. Consideration and possible action on application of Christian Labadie for Certificate of Appropriateness granting a 1 year extension for the previously approved application to 1.) construct new garage.

APPROVED. Motion: Taylor/Couch to approve the above item as stated. Ayes: Galbraith, Bennett, Couch, Taylor, Holcombe, Small, Collier, Tague, Floyd. Nays: None.

6. CASES FOR INDIVIDUAL CONSIDERATION

- 6A. HPCA-05-038 at 2610 N Hudson Street. (Jefferson Park HD), Ward 2. Consideration and possible action on the application of Jerry Worster for a Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) install metal balcony rail, 2.) install cedar stair at back facade, and 3.) replace fence section.

Mr. Worster was present.

APPROVED. Motion: Bennett/Couch to approve the application HPCA-05-038, with the fence location proposal approved based on unusual circumstances as the multifamily nature of this property affords the need to provide additional privacy for the adjacent single family residences. Ayes: Galbraith, Bennett, Couch, Taylor, Holcombe, Small, Collier, Tague, Floyd. Nays: None.

- 6B. HPCA-05-025 at 425 NW 25 Street. (Jefferson Park HD), Ward 2. Consideration and possible action on the application of Willard and Ann Herring for a Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) replace missing windows and 2.) install window HVAC units.

Mr. and Mrs Herring were present.

APPROVED. Motion: Couch/ Bennett to approve Item 1 of the application HPCA-05-025 based on your assertion that all windows will have both upper and lower sashes and that the lower sashes will be raised, rather than removed, for insertion of the heat/air units. Ayes: Galbraith, Bennett, Couch, Taylor, Holcombe, Small, Collier, Tague, Floyd. Nays: None.

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 3 of 8

APPROVED. Motion: Holcombe/Galbraith to approve Item 2 of the application HPCA-05-025 based on the unique circumstances that similar HVAC units have previously occupied the center window locations. Ayes: Bennett, Couch, Taylor, Collier, Tague. Nays: Galbraith, Holcombe, Small, Floyd.

- 6C. HPCA-05-045 at 265 NW Eubanks Street. (Edgemere Park HD), Ward 2. Consideration and possible action on the application of Jann Hook for a Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) remove kitchen window and replace with pair of windows, 2.) remove existing back door and replace with French door, 3.) remove back stair and replace with larger stair including 3b.) rail to match front porch, 4.) replace basement glass with obscure glazing, 5.) brick opening in back wall, 6.) install dormer on back including 6b.) double window, and 7.) remove chimney.

Ms. Hook was present. Ms. Floyd was present as architect.

The applicant amended the back porch rail proposal to a rail similar to the front porch rail but it will be 36" high.

APPROVED. Motion: Tague/Galbraith to approve Items 1, 2, 3, 3b as amended, and 5 of the application HPCA-05-045. Ayes: Galbraith, Bennett, Couch, Taylor, Holcombe, Small, Collier, Tague. Nays: None. Abstained: Floyd.

APPROVED. Motion: Tague/Couch to approve Items 6 and 6b of the application HPCA-05-045. Ayes: Galbraith, Bennett, Couch, Taylor, Holcombe, Small, Collier, Tague. Nays: None. Abstained: Floyd.

APPROVED. Motion: Holcombe/Couch to approve Item 4 of the application HPCA-05-045 with the glass replacement of the basement windows approved based on evidence of existing "fogged" glass in those windows. New glass will match the existing "fogged" glass. Ayes: Galbraith, Bennett, Couch, Taylor, Holcombe, Small, Collier, Tague. Nays: None. Abstained: Floyd.

APPROVED. Motion: Galbraith/Couch to approve Item 7 of the application HPCA-05-045 based on the fact that this chimney is not a significant historic feature. Ayes: Galbraith, Bennett, Couch, Taylor, Holcombe, Small, Collier, Tague. Nays: None. Abstained: Floyd.

- 6D. HPCA-05-053 at 3115 N Hudson Street. (Edgemere Park HD), Ward 2. Consideration and possible action on the application of Anthony Jackson by Sam Gresham for a Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) remove non-historic metal window and replace with wood window.

Mr. Gresham was present.

APPROVED. Motion: Bennett/Couch to approve the application HPCA-05-053 as amended by the applicant and contingent upon the use of 8 over 8 windows and

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 4 of 8

new clear glass rather than old glass. Ayes: Galbraith, Bennett, Couch, Taylor, Holcombe, Small, Collier, Tague, Floyd. Nays: None.

- 6E. HPCA-05-050 at 825 NW 38 Street. (Crown Heights HD), Ward 2. Consideration and possible action on the application of Cecil Caid for a Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) replace porch steps, 2.) lower driveway app. 6" and construct 6" curb at west side of driveway.

Mr. Caid was present.

APPROVED. Motion: Collier/Couch to approve the application HPCA-05-050 contingent upon installation of the 6" curb rather than a retaining wall. Ayes: Galbraith, Bennett, Couch, Taylor, Holcombe, Small, Collier, Tague, Floyd. Nays: None.

- 6F. HPCA-05-055 at 601 NW 38 Street. (Crown Heights HD), Ward 2. Consideration and possible action on the application of Don Hager by James Witcher for a Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) construct back addition including 1a.) relocate existing steel kitchen window, 1b.) relocate existing ½ light wood door, 1c.) remove center back, first floor window, 1d.) install new ½ light wood door to match existing, 1e.) replace 3 second floor wood windows with single sash true divided-light wood windows and reduce the brick openings, 1f.) eight new 6/6 true divided-light wood windows, 1g.) painted brick walls with wood horizontal lap siding at gable and 1h.) roof to match existing and 2.) construct back porch including 2a.) concrete platform and stair with painted brick stem wall, 2b.) wood columns with Option A.) wood railing and Option B.) metal railing.

Mr. Witcher was present.

APPROVED. Motion: Tague/Holcombe to approve Item 1 and sub-items of the application HPCA-05-055. Ayes: Galbraith, Bennett, Couch, Taylor, Holcombe, Small, Collier, Tague. Nays: Floyd.

APPROVED. Motion: Tague/Floyd to approve Item 2 and sub-items of the application HPCA-05-055 with railing Option B. Ayes: Galbraith, Bennett, Couch, Taylor, Holcombe, Small, Collier, Tague, Floyd. Nays: None.

- 6G. HPCA-05-029 at 2121 NW 27 Street. (Shepherd HD), Ward 2. Consideration and possible action on the application of Jeff Struble for a Certificate of Appropriateness to (Note: staff requests continuance for this item) 2.) install shutters.

APPROVED FOR CONTINUANCE WITHOUT DISCUSSION. See motion at section 4A.

- 6H. HPCA-05-037 at 2224 NW 28 Street. (Shepherd HD), Ward 2. Consideration and possible action on the application of Jana Broaddrick for a Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) install 4 storm doors.

DENIED. Motion: Floyd/Collier to deny without prejudice the application HPCA-05-037 as the proposed storm doors do not meet the criteria for approval, full glaze,

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 5 of 8

as stated in the Guidelines. Ayes: Galbraith, Bennett, Couch, Taylor, Holcombe, Small, Collier, Floyd. Nays: None. Abstained: Tague.

- 6I. HPCA-05-052 at 136 NW 18 Street. (Heritage Hills East HD), Ward 7. Consideration and possible action on the application of John Dean Newby for a Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) construct 3 car garage including 1a.) asphalt hipped roof, 1b.) brick walls, 1c.) two wood windows, 1d.) ½ light wood pedestrian door and 1e.) one single wood panel garage door and one double wood panel garage door.

Mr. Newby was present.

PARTIALLY APPROVED; PARTIALLY CONTINUED. Motion: Tague/Floyd to approve construction for application HPCA-05-052 with 1 over 1 wood windows with brick row-lock sills, contingent upon submission of specification for the Tull wood panel garage doors with an upper row of glass panels, and to continue the pedestrian door to the June meeting, allowing applicant to submit documentation of the pedestrian door. Ayes: Galbraith, Bennett, Couch, Taylor, Holcombe, Small, Collier, Tague, Floyd. Nays: None.

- 6J. HPCA-05-051 at 1024 NW 14 Street. (Heritage Hills HD), Ward 6. Consideration and possible action on the application of John Herring for a Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) remove 3 layers of roofing material including the wood shingle roof below and 2 layers of asphalt roofing above, 2.) install high profile laminate shingles and 3.) construct back 2nd floor addition including 3a.) asphalt hipped roof with no eaves, 3b.) HardiPlank siding and 3c.) relocation of existing window.

Mr. and Mrs. Herring and son were present.

APPROVED. Motion: Bennett/Galbraith to approve Item 1 of application HPCA-05-051. Ayes: Galbraith, Bennett, Couch, Taylor, Holcombe, Small, Collier, Tague, Floyd. Nays: None.

APPROVED. Motion: Taylor/Couch to approve Item 2 of application HPCA-05-051 with Elk, Prestique 1 high definition laminate shingle in Weatherwood. Ayes: Galbraith, Bennett, Couch, Taylor, Holcombe, Small, Collier, Tague, Floyd. Nays: None.

DENIED. Motion: Galbraith/Collier to deny with prejudice Item 3 of application HPCA-05-051 the proposal is not in compliance with the Guidelines in that vertical additions should not be constructed on corner lots or where visible from the street. Ayes: Galbraith, Bennett, Couch, Taylor, Holcombe, Small, Collier, Tague, Floyd. Nays: None.

- 6K. HPCA-05-048 at 200 NW 21 Street. (Heritage Hills HD), Ward 6. Consideration and possible action on the application of Erica Walker-Lape for a Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) install copper gutters and downspouts.

Mr. and Mrs. Lape were present.

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 6 of 8

DENIED. Motion: Floyd/Couch to deny with prejudice the application HPCA-05-048 as the Guidelines do not support the proposal. Ayes: Galbraith, Bennett, Couch, Taylor, Holcombe, Small, Collier, Tague, Floyd. Nays: None.

- 6L. HPCA-05-026 at 911 NW 15 Street. (Heritage Hills HD), Ward 6. Consideration and possible action on the application of Bond Payne by Rodney Poole for a Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) install driveway gate and 2.) pedestrian gate.

Mr. Poole was present.

DENIED. Motion: Tague/Collier to deny with prejudice the application HPCA-05-026 as the location of drive gate is not supported by the Guidelines. Ayes: Bennett, Taylor, Holcombe, Small, Collier, Tague, Floyd. Nays: Couch, Galbraith.

- 6M. HPCA-05-030 at 615 NW 17 Street. (Mesta Park HD), Ward 6. Consideration and possible action on the application of Wes and Shella Roberts and Rene' Jenkins for a Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) remove front door and sidelights and replace, 3.) remove center back door including 3a.) door and door surround, 3b.) platform and stair, 3c.) shed roof with supports, 5.) remove side ventilation louvers and install windows to match the windows at the front dormer, 6.) remove paint from brick, 7.) reconfigure roof and 8.) construct dormer at back slope of roof.

Mr & Ms Roberts and Ms Jenkins were present. Ms. Pelofsky was present.

APPROVED. Motion: Taylor/Floyd to approve Item 1 of application HPCA-05-030. Ayes: Galbraith, Taylor, Holcombe, Small, Collier, Tague, Floyd. Nays: None. Not Present: Couch, Bennett.

APPROVED. Motion: Collier/Floyd to approve Item 3 of application HPCA-05-030. Ayes: Galbraith, Taylor, Holcombe, Small, Collier, Tague, Couch, Floyd. Nays: None. Not Present: Bennett.

DENIED. Motion: Collier/Couch to deny with prejudice Item 5 of application HPCA-05-030 as removal of this significant historic feature would alter the historic character of the house. Ayes: Galbraith, Taylor, Holcombe, Small, Collier, Tague, Couch, Floyd. Nays: None. Not Present: Bennett.

WITHDRAWN. Item 6 of application HPCA-05-030 was withdrawn by the applicants.

PARTIALLY DENIED AND PARTIALLY CONTINUED. Motion: Small/Taylor to deny with prejudice Items 7 and 8A of application HPCA-05-030 as this option is a vertical addition and as vertical additions are not compliant with the Guidelines for Mesta Park, and to continued Option 8B for the dormer to allow applicants additional opportunity to supply adequate documentation. Ayes: Galbraith, Taylor, Holcombe, Small, Collier, Tague, Couch, Floyd. Nays: None. Not Present: Bennett.

- 6N. HPCA-05-046 at 916 NW 18 Street. (Mesta Park HD), Ward 6. Consideration and possible action on the application of Lori Wrotenbery for a

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 7 of 8

Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) remove all fiberboard siding from garage, 2.) install lapped siding of smooth cedar, and 3.) repair trim and corner boards with appropriate wood.

APPROVED. Motion: Collier/Floyd to approve the application HPCA-05-046. Ayes: Galbraith, Taylor, Holcombe, Small, Collier, Tague, Couch, Floyd. Nays: None. Not Present: Bennett.

60. HPCA-05-047 at 719 NW 19 Street. (Mesta Park HD), Ward 6. Consideration and possible action on the application of Don McMahon for a Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) construct back stair and deck at house.

Mr. McMahon was present.

APPROVED. Motion: Collier/Couch to approve the application HPCA-05-047. Ayes: Galbraith, Taylor, Holcombe, Small, Collier, Tague, Couch, Floyd. Nays: None. Not Present: Bennett.

7. OTHER BUSINESS

- 7A. National Register of Historic Places nomination for Will Roger's Park Gardens and Arboretum, NW 36th St between N Grand Blvd (I-44) and N Portland Ave. Staff requested a continuance to the June 1, 2005 to allow the OKC Parks Department Board of Directors an opportunity to comment on the nomination.

APPROVED FOR CONTINUANCE WITHOUT DISCUSSION. See motion at section 4A.

- 7B. Resolution to Recommend to City Council that the Preservation Guidelines and Standard for Oklahoma City Historic Districts be amended under section 2.7 under Alterations to Building Fabric and Components.

CONTINUED. Motion: Collier/Couch to continue. Ayes: Galbraith, Taylor, Holcombe, Small, Collier, Tague, Couch, Floyd. Nays: None. Not Present: Bennett.

8. COMMUNICATIONS

- 8A. HPCA-05-020 at 226 NW 22 Street. (Mesta Park HD), Ward 6. J. Adrian and Karen Zimmer. Staff announced the request for appeal to the Board of Adjustment. The work item is to install a ¾ light storm door. The appeal will be heard May 19, 2005. For additional information or a copy of the staff report contact JJ Chambless at 297-2417.

- 8B. ADMINISTRATIVE APPROVAL REPORT

- 8C. HPCA-05-012 at 805 NW 16 Street. (Mesta Park HD), Ward 6. Staff announced the withdrawal of the application of Suan Grant for Certificate of Appropriateness. Ms. Grant will resubmit at a later date.

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 8 of 8

8D. STATE PRESERVATION CONFERENCE

Glen Vaughn-Roberson addressed the Commission concerning the Annual State Preservation Conference.

8E. The next regularly scheduled meeting for the Historic Preservation Commission is Wednesday, June 1, 2005 at 3:00 p.m. at the Municipal Building, City Council Chamber. New applications and information on continued projects are to be submitted to staff by 5:00 p.m., Tuesday, May 10, 2005.

9. ADJOURNMENT (7:30 p.m.)

Motion: Collier/Holcombe to adjourn the May 4, 2005 meeting of the Historic Preservation Commission. Ayes: Galbraith, Taylor, Holcombe, Small, Collier, Tague, Couch, Floyd. Nays: None. Not Present: Bennett.

EO