

MINUTES
Regular Meeting
HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION
March 05, 2008 - 2:00 p.m.
Municipal Building, City Council Chamber

The meeting of the Oklahoma City Historic Preservation Commission was called to order in the City Council Chamber, 3rd Floor of the Municipal Building, 200 N. Walker Avenue, Oklahoma City, Oklahoma. The meeting convened at 2:04 p.m. Notice of the meeting and agenda were filed with the City Clerk's office and posted on the Council bulletin board 48 hours prior to the meeting.

1. CALL TO ORDER AND ROLL CALL

Members Present: Thomas J. Daniel IV, Chairman
Carolee Galbraith
Marnie Taylor (left at item 6G)
Jane Holcombe
Roland Tague
Randy Floyd
Karen Nelson
Nedra Jones
Karen Zimmer

Members Absent: Thomas Small, AIA, Vice-Chairman
Karen Collier

Staff Present: Eva Osborne, AIA, Preservation Architect, Planning Department
Susan Miller, Planner IV, Planning Department
Paula Hurst, Planning Department
Rita Douglas-Talley, Assistant Municipal Counselor

2. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

APPROVED. Motion: Holcombe / Galbraith to approve the minutes of the February 6, 2008, Historic Preservation Commission meeting. Ayes: Daniel, Galbraith, Taylor, Holcombe, Tague, Floyd, Nelson, Jones, Zimmer. Nays: None. Absent: Small, Collier.

3. CITATION REPORT

Mr. Woods, Zoning Inspector, was present for comment. Commissioner Jones commented that Mr. Woods has been diligent in responding to violations and wanted to offer him thanks for his good work.

4. CONTINUANCE REQUESTS

A. Staff request continuance of the following cases:

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 2 of 22

3/5/2008

- 6H. HPCA-07-161** at 224 NW 30th ST. (Jefferson Park), Ward 2. To receive a second **continuance for 30-days** for the application of Haley Luna for a Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) replace windows with new vinyl window.

CONTINUED. Motion: Galbraith / Holcombe to move **continuance for 30-days** that, based upon the evidence that has been presented in the application of HPCA-07-161 and during the public hearing, the Commission finds that the action requested cannot be approved at this time, and that additional information is required from the applicant in order to determine whether the action requested is in compliance, and the proposed material change in appearance would not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical or architectural significance and value of the historic district according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007 as set forth in the Staff Report for this item and based on the facts as presented at this hearing.

Ayes: Daniel, Galbraith, Taylor, Holcombe, Tague, Floyd, Nelson, Jones, Zimmer. Nays: None. Absent: Small, Collier.

- 6L. HPCA-07-165** at 700 NW 42nd ST. (Crown Heights), Ward 2. To receive a second **continuance for 30-days** for the application of Josia and Lizzie Daniel for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) replace all windows and 2.) install storm windows.

WITHDRAWN. Applicant withdrew application on March 5, 2008.

- B.** Other continuance requests:

None.

5. CONSENT DOCKET CASES

- 5A.** HPCA-08-014 at 610 NW 16TH ST. (Mesta Park), Ward 6. Consideration and possible action on application of Kent Eldridge for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) remove wood shingles and metal ridge cover on house and garage and 2.) install new high-definition composition shingles.

Staff received comments from Mesta Park Preservation Review Committee.

Raina Pelofsky offered comments at the meeting.

Mr. Eldridge was not present for comment.

APPROVED with Condition. Motion: Floyd / Holcombe to move **approval with condition** that, based upon the evidence that has been presented in the application of HPCA-08-014 and during the public hearing, the Commission finds that although the action requested cannot be approved as presented, that in recognition of testimony from the Mesta Park Preservation Review Committee that the applicant has stated his willingness to accept the suggested modifications to his/her application, that the amended action requested is in compliance, and the proposed material change in appearance would not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical or architectural significance and value of the historic district according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007 as set forth in the Staff Report for this item and based on the facts as presented at this hearing, and direct that such specific findings will be reflected in the minutes recording the action taken on this item.

Condition of approval is that the applicant will re-install metal ridge caps. In the event that the applicant does not agree to the condition of approval, the application will be continued for 30-days.

The Commission specifically finds that the applicant has demonstrated the following:

- The existing roofing material is not historic,
- The ridge cap is a significant historic feature worthy of preservation,
- The proposed roofing material is currently typical to most of the properties within the historic district.

This approval is consistent with the provisions of **Chapter 59, 4250.4D. (5)** of the *Historic Preservation Ordinance*.

Additionally, this approval is consistent with the provisions of **Subchapter 2.7 of the Design Guidelines and Standards**.

Ayes: Daniel, Galbraith, Taylor, Holcombe, Tague, Floyd, Nelson, Jones, Zimmer.
Nays: None. Absent: Small, Collier.

6. CASES FOR INDIVIDUAL CONSIDERATION

- 6A. HPCA-08-013 at 520 NW 18TH ST. (Mesta Park), Ward 6. Consideration and possible action on application of Sam Gresham for Certificate of Appropriateness to **1.) demolish garage** and **2.) construct new 1-story garage** including 2a.) hipped roof with composition shingles, 2b.) wood wall shingles, above and HardiPlank horizontal lap siding, below, 2c.) wood fascia and trim with plywood

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 4 of 22

3/5/2008

soffits, 2d.) two wood garage doors with clear glass and 2e.) wood ½-light pedestrian door with clear glass.

Sam Gresham was not present for comment.

The Mesta Park Preservation Review Committee submitted written comments to staff prior to the meeting.

APPROVED. Motion: Floyd / Galbraith to move **approval** that, based upon the evidence presented in the application and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds the action requested is in compliance, and the proposed material change in appearance would not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical or architectural significance and value of the historic district according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007 as set forth in the Staff Report for this item and based on the facts as presented at this hearing and direct that such specific findings will be reflected in the minutes recording the action taken on this item.

The Commission specifically finds that the applicant has demonstrated the following:

- The existing garage has been inappropriately modified,
- The existing garage is deteriorated and unstable,
- The existing sliding garage doors are deteriorated beyond repair,
- The proposed garage is similar in size, scale, proportion, spacing, texture, setbacks, height, and materials to other 1-story garages in the district,
- The proposed garage has 2 wood overhead garage doors separated by a post,
- The proposed materials are compatible with the materials at the historic house.

This approval is consistent with the provisions of **Chapter 59, 4250.4D.(4)(5)(6) and 4250.4 N(2)(a)(b)** of the *Historic Preservation Ordinance*.

Additionally, this approval is consistent with the provisions of **Subchapter 3.3 of the Design Guidelines and Standards**.

Ayes: Daniel, Galbraith, Taylor, Holcombe, Tague, Floyd, Nelson, Jones, Zimmer.
Nays: None. Absent: Small, Collier.

- 6B.** HPCA-08-020 at 2215 N Walker Ave. (Mesta Park), Ward 6. Consideration and possible action on application of Oklahoma City Independent Public School District by Patrick Schoenfeldt of Studio Architecture, P.C. for Certificate of Appropriateness to amend previously approved applications HPCA-06-149 and

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 5 of 22

3/5/2008

HPCA-07-081 to 1.) reduce the size of the proposed 2-story addition and 2.) install synthetic panel in the upper section of each window.

Patrick Schoenfeldt was present for comment.

The Mesta Park Preservation Review Committee submitted written comments to staff prior to the meeting.

Raina Pelofsky offered comments at the meeting.

Leslie Batchelor offered comments at the meeting.

Tammy Greenman offered comments at the meeting.

CONTINUANCE. Motion: Floyd / Holcombe to move **continuance for 30-days** for item 1.) of application HPCA-08-020 that, based upon the evidence that has been presented in the application and during the public hearing, the Commission finds that the action requested cannot be approved at this time, and that additional information is required from the applicant in order to determine whether the action requested is in compliance, and the proposed material change in appearance would not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical or architectural significance and value of the historic district according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007, as set forth in the Staff Report for this item and based on the facts as presented at this hearing.

Ayes: Daniel, Galbraith, Taylor, Holcombe, Tague, Floyd, Nelson, Jones, Zimmer. Nays: None. Absent: Small, Collier.

APPROVED. Motion: Tague / Floyd to move **approval** for item 2.) of application HPCA-08-020 that, **based upon the special circumstance that evidence has been presented, here today, that a reduction in the size of the building and the classrooms would be made because of the limited MAPS for Kids budget and to do otherwise, by following our Design Guidelines, would impair the project,** that the Commission finds the action requested is in compliance, and the proposed material change in appearance would not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical or architectural significance and value of the historic district according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007, as set forth in the Staff Report for this item and based on the facts as presented at this hearing and direct that such specific findings will be reflected in the minutes recording the action taken on this item.

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 6 of 22

3/5/2008

The Commission specifically finds that the applicant has demonstrated the following:

- The existing metal window panels are not historic and are not consistent with the historic character of the property however a special circumstance has been presented that would allow this alteration,
- The proposed window in-fill is not clear glass however a special circumstance has been presented that would allow this alteration.

A special circumstance has been presented to support the approval of this application however, the proposal is not consistent with the provisions of **Chapter 59, 4250.4D. (4)(5)(6) of the Historic Preservation Ordinance.**

Additionally, a special circumstance has been presented to support the approval of this application however, the proposal is not consistent with the provisions of **Subchapter 3.2 and 3.5 of the Design Guidelines and Standards.**

Ayes: Daniel, Galbraith, Taylor, Holcombe, Tague, Floyd, Nelson, Jones, Zimmer.
Nays: None. Absent: Small, Collier.

- 6C.** HPCA-08-024 at 726 NW 28th ST. (Paseo), Ward 2. Consideration and possible action on application of OKC Housing Services Redevelopment Corp. by Ron Walters for Certificate of Appropriateness to **1.) construct new 2-story house** including 1a.) gable and hipped roof with composition shingles, 1b.) HardiPlank siding with wood corner boards, fascia and trim and HardiBoard soffits, 1c.) exposed concrete stem wall, 1d.) brick/wood columns and rail, 1e.) 1/1 wood windows and wood shutters, 1f.) wood doors with clear glass and **2.) concrete sidewalks, parking pad and condenser pad.**

Ron Walters, Jennifer Ricker and Leslie Batchelor were present for comment.

CONTINUED. Motion: Galbraith / Floyd to move **continuance for 60-days** that, based upon the evidence that has been presented in the application and during the public hearing, the Commission finds that the action requested cannot be approved at this time, and that additional information is required from the applicant in order to determine whether the action requested is in compliance, and the proposed material change in appearance would not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical or architectural significance and value of the historic district according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007, as set forth in the Staff Report for this item and based on the facts as presented at this hearing.

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 7 of 22

3/5/2008

Ayes: Daniel, Galbraith, Taylor, Holcombe, Tague, Floyd, Nelson, Jones, Zimmer.
Nays: None. Absent: Small, Collier.

- 6D.** HPCA-08-009 at 517 NW 27th ST. (Paseo), Ward 2. Consideration and possible action on application of Traci Aldridge by Juan S. Huaman for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) remove columns and pier at front porch, 2.) construct new columns and pier, 3.) remove front sidewalk and 4.) install new sidewalk.

Jerri Shepherd and Juan S. Huaman were present for comment.

APPROVED. Motion: Floyd / Galbraith to move **approval** for items 3.) and 4.) that based upon the evidence presented in the application and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds the action requested is in compliance, and the proposed material change in appearance would not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical or architectural significance and value of the historic district according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007 as set forth in the Staff Report for this item and based on the facts as presented at this hearing and direct that such specific findings will be reflected in the minutes recording the action taken on this item.

This approval is consistent with the provisions of **Chapter 59, 4250.4D.(6)** of the *Historic Preservation Ordinance*.

Additionally, this approval is consistent with the provisions of **Subchapter 2.1 and 1.3 of the Design Guidelines and Standards**.

Ayes: Daniel, Galbraith, Taylor, Holcombe, Tague, Floyd, Nelson, Jones, Zimmer.
Nays: None. Absent: Small, Collier.

CONTINUED. Motion: Floyd/Galbraith to move **continuance for 60-days** for items 1.) and 2.) that, based upon the evidence that has been presented in the application and during the public hearing, the Commission finds that the action requested cannot be approved at this time, and that additional information is required from the applicant in order to determine whether the action requested is in compliance, and the proposed material change in appearance would not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical or architectural significance and value of the historic district according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007 as set forth in the Staff Report for this item and based on the facts as presented at this hearing.

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 8 of 22

3/5/2008

Ayes: Daniel, Galbraith, Taylor, Holcombe, Tague, Floyd, Nelson, Jones, Zimmer.
Nays: None. Absent: Small, Collier.

- 6E.** HPCA-08-006 at 3028 N Harvey Parkway. (Jefferson Park), Ward 2. Consideration and possible action on application of Jefferson Laughlin for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) remove steel casement windows at garage/apartment, second floor, 2.) install new vinyl windows, (temporary removal of awnings to accommodate window replacement).

Laura Laughlin was present for comment.

APPROVED. Motion: Tague / Galbraith to move **approval** for item 1.) that based upon the evidence presented in the application and during the public hearing, that the windows were not historic and that the Commission finds the action requested is in compliance, and the proposed material change in appearance would not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical or architectural significance and value of the historic district according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007 as set forth in the Staff Report for this item and based on the facts as presented at this hearing and direct that such specific findings will be reflected in the minutes recording the action taken on this item.

Commission approval is based on the following facts:

- The existing garage does not match the description of the historic garage.

Ayes: Daniel, Galbraith, Taylor, Holcombe, Tague, Floyd, Nelson, Jones, Zimmer. Nays: None. Absent: Small, Collier.

CONTINUED. Motion: Tague/Galbraith to move **continuance for 60-days** for item 2.) that, based upon the evidence that has been presented in the application and during the public hearing, the Commission finds that the action requested cannot be approved at this time, and that additional information is required from the applicant in order to determine whether the action requested is in compliance, and the proposed material change in appearance would not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical or architectural significance and value of the historic district according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007 as set forth in the Staff Report for this item and based on the facts as presented at this hearing.

Ayes: Daniel, Galbraith, Taylor, Holcombe, Tague, Floyd, Nelson, Jones, Zimmer.
Nays: None. Absent: Small, Collier.

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 9 of 22

3/5/2008

- 6F.** HPCA-08-017 at 2712 N Hudson Ave. (Jefferson Park), Ward 2. Consideration and possible action on application of Elizabeth Park-Capron by Loren Capron for Certificate of Appropriateness to **1.) construct new 2-story house** including 1a.) side gable roof with composition shingles, 1b.) HardiPlank horizontal lap siding and HardiPlank shingle siding, 1c.) rock and wood columns and rail, 1d.) wood windows, 1e.) wood doors with clear glass, 1f.) wood eave brackets, trim and fascia with HardiBoard soffits 1g.) wood deck and **2.) construct new 1-story garage** including 2a.) side gabled roof with composition shingles, 2b.) HardiPlank horizontal lap siding, 2c.) Option A-wood panel garage door or Option B-metal overhead garage door and 2d.) Option A-wood panel pedestrian door or B-metal pedestrian door and **3.) medium grey brushed-concrete sidewalks and driveway**

Loren Capron was present for comment.

CONTINUED. Motion: Tague / Galbraith to move **continuance for 60-days** that, based upon the evidence that has been presented in the application and during the public hearing, the Commission finds that the action requested cannot be approved at this time, and that additional information is required from the applicant in order to determine whether the action requested is in compliance, and the proposed material change in appearance would not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical or architectural significance and value of the historic district according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007 as set forth in the Staff Report for this item and based on the facts as presented at this hearing.

Ayes: Daniel, Galbraith, Taylor, Holcombe, Tague, Floyd, Nelson, Jones, Zimmer.
Nays: None. Absent: Small, Collier.

- 6G.** HPCA-08-016 at 2509 N HUDSON AVE. (Jefferson Park), Ward 2. Consideration and possible action on application of Loren Capron for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) build new back porch and balcony, 2.) build new 2-bay 1-story garage, 3.) build new driveway, 4.) remove existing rail and install new 4'-4" high wrought iron rail along all open areas at the outside edge of the south porch.

Loren Capron was present for comment.

APPROVED with CONDITION. Motion: Floyd / Galbraith to move **approval with condition** that, based upon the evidence that has been presented in the application and during the public hearing, the Commission finds that although the action requested cannot be approved as presented, that in recognition of the applicant's willingness to accept the suggested modifications of his/her

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 10 of 22

3/5/2008

application, that the amended action requested is in compliance, and the proposed material change in appearance would not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical or architectural significance and value of the historic district according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007 as set forth in the Staff Report for this item and based on the facts as presented at this hearing, and direct that such specific findings will be reflected in the minutes recording the action taken on this item.

Condition on item 4.) is for the applicant to **retain the historic rail and the steps and to place a similar rail across the bottom step at the openings that will be flush with the top of the historic rail.**

The conditional approval is based on the following facts:

- The proposed materials are consistent with the historic materials in the historic district,
- The garage is located at the back of the lot so that the new doors will be minimally visible from the street. The garage as designed and located will not be a significant feature of the property,
- The design of the new construction (except the rail at the south east porch) is compatible with the character of the historic district,
- The rail at the southeast porch is the historic rail. It is a significant character defining feature of the property and it is not deteriorated beyond repair.

This conditional approval is consistent with the provisions of **Chapter 59, 4250.4D(4)(5)(6)** of the *Historic Preservation Ordinance*.

Additionally, this conditional approval is consistent with the provisions of **Subchapter 2.2, 2.4, 3.3 and 3.5 of the Design Guidelines and Standards**.

Ayes: Daniel, Galbraith, Holcombe, Tague, Floyd, Nelson, Jones, Zimmer. Nays: None. Absent: Small, Collier, Taylor.

- 6H.** HPCA-07-161 at 224 NW 30th ST. (Jefferson Park), Ward 2. Consideration and possible action on the application of Haley Luna for a Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) replace windows with new vinyl window.

Heard as item 4A.

- 6I.** HPCA-08-021 at 208 NW 34TH ST. (Edgemere Park), Ward 2. Consideration and possible action on application of Beau Hawkins for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) remove double window, 2.) install two full-light doors and 3.) construct wood platform and stair.

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 11 of 22

3/5/2008

Beau Hawkins was not present for comment.

The Edgemere Park Preservation Review Committee submitted written comments to staff prior to the meeting.

APPROVED. Motion: Tague / Holcombe to move **approval** of items 1.) and 2.) that, based upon the evidence presented in the application and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds the action requested is in compliance, and the proposed material change in appearance would not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical or architectural significance and value of the historic district according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007 as set forth in the Staff Report for this item and based on the facts as presented at this hearing and direct that such specific findings will be reflected in the minutes recording the action taken on this item.

The approval is based on the following facts:

- The pair of windows subject to demolition are on the back façade, not visible from the street,
- Although the existing windows subject to demolition have no divisions, the windows at more prominent locations on the house do have divisions,
- The proposed doors will be full-light, true divided-light wood doors with 15-lights,
- The brick around the window opening will remain unaltered except the brick below the existing opening,
- The proposed doors are compatible with the materials at the historic property.

This approval is consistent with the provisions of **Chapter 59, 4250.4D.(5)** of the *Historic Preservation Ordinance*.

Additionally, this approval is consistent with the provisions of **Subchapter 2.4 of the Design Guidelines and Standards**.

Ayes: Daniel, Galbraith, Holcombe, Tague, Floyd, Nelson, Jones, Zimmer. Nays: None. Absent: Small, Collier, Taylor.

CONTINUED. Motion: Tague / Holcombe to move **continuance for 30-days** of item 3.) that, based upon the evidence that has been presented in the application and during the public hearing, the Commission finds that the action requested cannot be approved at this time, and that additional information is required from the applicant in order to determine whether the action requested is in compliance,

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 12 of 22

3/5/2008

and the proposed material change in appearance would not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical or architectural significance and value of the historic district according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007 as set forth in the Staff Report for this item and based on the facts as presented at this hearing.

Ayes: Daniel, Galbraith, Holcombe, Tague, Floyd, Nelson, Jones, Zimmer. Nays: None. Absent: Small, Collier, Taylor.

- 6J.** HPCA-08-002 at 533 NW 42nd ST. (Crown Heights), Ward 2. Consideration and possible action on application of Gregg Long for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) construct addition including 1a.) composition shingle roof, 1b.) brick and stone walls, 1c.) wood windows with simulate divided-light, 1d.) three full-light wood doors with simulated divided-light, 1e.) wood fascia and trim, 1f.) concrete porch/stair with gable cover on wood columns.

Gregg Long was present for comment.

The Crown Heights Preservation Review Committee submitted written comments to staff prior to the meeting.

CONTINUED. Motion: Floyd / Nelson to move continuance for 60-days that, based upon the evidence that has been presented in the application and during the public hearing, the Commission finds that the action requested cannot be approved at this time, and that additional information is required from the applicant in order to determine whether the action requested is in compliance, and the proposed material change in appearance would not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical or architectural significance and value of the historic district according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007 as set forth in the Staff Report for this item and based on the facts as presented at this hearing.

Ayes: Daniel, Galbraith, Holcombe, Tague, Floyd, Nelson, Jones, Zimmer. Nays: None. Absent: Small, Collier, Taylor.

- 6K.** HPCA-08-018 at 801 NW 41ST ST. (Crown Heights), Ward 2. Consideration and possible action on application of Todd Corn by Jeremy Hume for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) remove front door and 2.) install new front door.

Mr. Hume was not present for comment.

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 13 of 22

3/5/2008

The Crown Heights Preservation Review Committee submitted written comments to staff prior to the meeting.

APPROVED. Motion: Tague / Floyd to move **approval** that, based upon the evidence presented in the application and during the public hearing, that the Commission find the action requested is in compliance, and the proposed material change in appearance would not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical or architectural significance and value of the historic district according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007 as set forth in the Staff Report for this item and based on the facts as presented at this hearing and direct that such specific findings will be reflected in the minutes recording the action taken on this item.

The approval is based on the following facts:

- The existing front doors are not the historic doors,
- The proposed solid wood doors are consistent with the historic character of the property and district.

This approval is consistent with the provisions of **Chapter 59, 4250.4D.(5)** of the *Historic Preservation Ordinance*.

Additionally, this approval is consistent with the provisions of **Subchapter 2.4 of the Design Guidelines and Standards**.

Ayes: Daniel, Galbraith, Holcombe, Tague, Floyd, Nelson, Jones, Zimmer. Nays: None. Absent: Small, Collier, Taylor.

- 6L.** HPCA-07-165 at 700 NW 42nd ST. (Crown Heights), Ward 2. Consideration and possible action on application of Josia and Lizzie Daniel for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) replace all windows and 2.) install storm windows.

WITHDRAWN. Applicant withdrew application on March 5, 2008.

- 6M.** HPCA-07-176 at 2209 NW 29th ST. (Shepherd), Ward 2. Consideration and possible action on application of Kirby Kilfoy for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) replace front door surround.

Mr. Kilfoy was not present for comment.

The Shepherd Preservation Review Committee did not submit written comments to staff prior to the meeting.

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 14 of 22

3/5/2008

DENIED. Motion: Floyd / Zimmer to move **denial with prejudice** that based upon the evidence presented in the application and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds the action requested is not in compliance, and the proposed material change in appearance would have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical or architectural significance and value of the historic district according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007 as set forth in the Staff Report for this item and based on the facts as presented at this hearing and direct that such specific findings will be reflected in the minutes recording the action taken on this item.

The denial is based on the following facts:

- The historic door surround as illustrated by the National Register photograph is similar in appearance to the door surround as illustrated by the applicant's photograph that was taken prior to the demolition,
- The property owner did not submit an application for the proposed work prior to the removal of the historic door surround,
- The proposed "wood or vinyl" pre-manufactured door surround as illustrated by the submitted product information does not match the historic door surround in dimension, material and detail.

This denial is consistent with the provisions of **Chapter 59, 4250.4D(4)(5)(6)** of the *Historic Preservation Ordinance*.

Additionally, this denial is consistent with the provisions of **Subchapter 2.1 and 2.2 of the Design Guidelines and Standards**.

Ayes: Daniel, Galbraith, Holcombe, Tague, Floyd, Nelson, Jones, Zimmer. Nays: None. Absent: Small, Collier, Taylor.

- 6N.** HPCA-08-008 at 2321 NW 28th ST. (Shepherd), Ward 2. Consideration and possible action on application of Mary W. Martin, MD for Certificate of Appropriateness to **1a.) remove side (east) door** and storm door and remove concrete stair to driveway, 1b.) in-fill door opening with brick, 2a.) remove window at back (north) façade and brick below window opening, **2b.) install new full-light door in window opening**, 2c.) construct wood stair with rail to accommodate egress from new door, 3.) **remove vinyl/aluminum siding** and trim and repair wood horizontal lap siding below and **4.) re-face porch columns** with wood.

Mary W. Martin, MD was not present for comment.

The Shepherd Preservation Review Committee did not submit written comments to staff prior to the meeting.

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 15 of 22

3/5/2008

DENIED. Motion: Floyd / Zimmer to move **denial with prejudice** of items 1a.), 1b.) and 2b.) based upon the evidence presented in the application and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds the action requested is not in compliance, and the proposed material change in appearance would have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical or architectural significance and value of the historic district according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007 as set forth in the Staff Report for this item and based on the facts as presented at this hearing and direct that such specific findings will be reflected in the minutes recording the action taken on this item.

This **denial** is based on the following facts:

- The side door/opening is a significant historic character defining feature of this property,
- Significant historic character defining features must be retained/repaired and if this is not possible, replaced in-kind,
- No documentation has been presented to illustrate that the side door was deteriorated beyond repair,
- The proposed door at the back façade has simulated divided-lights.

This **denial** is consistent with the provisions of **Chapter 59, 4250.4D(6) , and 4250.4L(2(a(b)))** of the *Historic Preservation Ordinance*.

Additionally, this **denial** is consistent with the provisions of **Subchapter 2.1 and 2.4 of the Design Guidelines and Standards**.

Ayes: Daniel, Galbraith, Holcombe, Tague, Floyd, Nelson, Jones, Zimmer. Nays: None. Absent: Small, Collier, Taylor.

APPROVED. Motion: Floyd / Zimmer to move **approval** of items 2a.) and 3.) based upon the evidence presented in the application and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds the action requested is in compliance and the proposed material change in appearance would not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical or architectural significance and value of the historic district according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007 as set forth in the Staff Report for this item and based on the facts as presented at this hearing and direct that such specific findings will be reflected in the minutes recording the action taken on this item.

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 16 of 22

3/5/2008

Ayes: Daniel, Galbraith, Holcombe, Tague, Floyd, Nelson, Jones, Zimmer. Nays: None. Absent: Small, Collier, Taylor.

CONTINUED. Motion: Floyd / Zimmer to move **continuance for 60-days** of items 2c.) and 4.) based upon the evidence that has been presented in the application and during the public hearing, the Commission finds that the action requested cannot be approved at this time, and that additional information is required from the applicant in order to determine whether the action requested is in compliance, and the proposed material change in appearance would not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical or architectural significance and value of the historic district according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007 as set forth in the Staff Report for this item and based on the facts as presented at this hearing.

Ayes: Daniel, Galbraith, Holcombe, Tague, Floyd, Nelson, Jones, Zimmer. Nays: None. Absent: Small, Collier, Taylor.

- 60.** HPCA-08-019 at 125 NW 15TH ST. (Heritage Hills East), Ward 7. Consideration and possible action on application of Downtown OKC Properties, LLC by Brandt Nashert of D&S Management / BNCI Contracting for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) remove mansard shingled roof, 2.) replace windows, 3.) replace sliding glass doors, 4.) install new denseglass sheathing and EIFS product over exterior siding, 5.) paint existing brick to coordinate with existing buildings, 7.) install new standing seam awnings, 8.) construct 2' max. parapet wall at roof to vary roofline at exterior, and 9.) replace shingles at roof on courtyard side.

Brandt Nashert was present for comment.

The Heritage Hills East Preservation Review Committee telephoned staff with comments to forward to the Commission.

CONTINUED. Motion: Floyd / Galbraith to move **continuance for 60-days** based upon the evidence that has been presented in the application and during the public hearing, the Commission finds that the action requested cannot be approved at this time, and that additional information is required from the applicant in order to determine whether the action requested is in compliance, and the proposed material change in appearance would not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical or architectural significance and value of the historic district according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007 as set forth in the Staff Report for this item and based on the facts as presented at this hearing.

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 17 of 22

3/5/2008

Ayes: Daniel, Galbraith, Holcombe, Tague, Floyd, Nelson, Jones, Zimmer. Nays: None. Absent: Small, Collier, Taylor.

- 6P.** HPCA-07-150 at 314 NW 17TH ST. (Heritage Hills), Ward 6. Consideration and possible action on application of Lawrence & Magdalen DeBault for Certificate of Appropriateness to **1.) construct new 2-story garage** including 1a.) side gable with composition shingles and standing seam metal roof, 1b.) brick walls and cementitious siding, 1c.) wood windows, 1d.) wood columns, balcony, stair, rail and wood fascia, soffit and trim, 1e.) two overhead garage doors, 1f.) wood pedestrian door, 1g.) variety of windows and **2.) extend for 6-months the previously approved garage demolition proposal.**

Lawrence DeBault was present for comment.

Commissioner Tague handed-out an aerial photograph of the block with lot lines super-imposed over the image.

CONTINUED. Motion: Floyd / Galbraith to move **continuance for 30-days** for **items 1a.) through 1g.)** based upon the evidence that has been presented in the application and during the public hearing, the Commission finds that the action requested cannot be approved at this time, and that additional information is required from the applicant in order to determine whether the action requested is in compliance, and the proposed material change in appearance would not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical or architectural significance and value of the historic district according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007 as set forth in the Staff Report for this item and based on the facts as presented at this hearing.

Ayes: Daniel, Galbraith, Holcombe, Tague, Floyd, Nelson, Jones, Zimmer. Nays: None. Absent: Small, Collier, Taylor.

APPROVED. Motion: Floyd / Galbraith to move **approval** of **item 2.)** based upon the evidence presented in the application and during the public hearing, that the Commission finds the action requested is in compliance, and the proposed material change in appearance would not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical or architectural significance and value of the historic district according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007 as set forth in the Staff Report for this item and based on the facts as presented at this hearing and direct that such specific findings will be reflected in the minutes recording the action taken on this item.

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 18 of 22

3/5/2008

Ayes: Daniel, Galbraith, Holcombe, Tague, Floyd, Nelson, Jones, Zimmer. Nays: None. Absent: Small, Collier, Taylor.

- 6Q.** HPCA-07-143 at 227 NW 19th ST. (Heritage Hills), Ward 6. Consideration and possible action on application of Cary & Randa Pirrong for Certificate of Appropriateness to **2.) construct new 1-story garage** including 2a.) composition hipped roof, 2b.) HardiPlank horizontal lap siding with wood corner boards, soffit, fascia and trim, 2c.) wood windows, 2d.) wood panel pedestrian door, 2e.) wood panel overhead garage door, 2f.) light fixtures, and **3.) remove and replace damaged area of rear driveway.**

Applicants were not present for comment.

APPROVED. Motion: Holcombe / Galbraith to move **approval** that, based upon the evidence presented in the application and during the public hearing, that the Commission find the action requested is in compliance, and the proposed material change in appearance would not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical or architectural significance and value of the historic district according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007 as set forth in the Staff Report for this item and based on the facts as presented at this hearing and direct that such specific findings will be reflected in the minutes recording the action taken on this item.

The approval is based on the following facts:

- The proposed garage is similar to the historic garage,
- The materials at the proposed garage are consistent with the historic character of the district,
- The proposed 1-story garage is similar to other historic garages in the district.

The approval is consistent with the provisions of **Chapter 59, 4250.4D(4)(5)(6)** of the *Historic Preservation Ordinance*.

Additionally, the approval is consistent with the provisions of **Subchapter 3.3 of the Design Guidelines and Standards**.

Ayes: Daniel, Galbraith, Holcombe, Tague, Floyd, Nelson, Jones, Zimmer. Nays: None. Absent: Small, Collier, Taylor.

- 6R.** HPCA-08-011 at 1526 Classen Drive. (Heritage Hills), Ward 6. Consideration and possible action on application of Brooks & Katherine Gumerson Altshuler by Bill Gumerson of Bill Gumerson and Associates for Certificate of

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 19 of 22

3/5/2008

Appropriateness to **1.) install decorative iron fence and gate** forward of the midpoint of the sideyard.

Mr. Altshuler was present for comment.

CONTINUED. Motion: Floyd / Nelson to move **continuance for 30-days** that, based upon the evidence that has been presented in the application and during the public hearing, the Commission finds that the action requested cannot be approved at this time, and that additional information is required from the applicant in order to determine whether the action requested is in compliance, and the proposed material change in appearance would not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical or architectural significance and value of the historic district according to the Preservation Guidelines and Standards for Oklahoma City Historic Districts for Oklahoma City, and according to the provisions of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2007 as set forth in the Staff Report for this item and based on the facts as presented at this hearing.

Ayes: Daniel, Galbraith, Holcombe, Tague, Floyd, Nelson, Jones, Zimmer. Nays: None. Absent: Small, Collier, Taylor.

7. OTHER BUSINESS

- A. HPCA-08-010** at 517 NW 22nd ST. (Mesta Park), Ward 6. To receive comments from the Historic Preservation Commission regarding the historic integrity of the garage. This item will be referred to Neighborhood Services for dilapidated structure processing.

FORWARD COMMENTS: Motion: Floyd / Tague to forward comments that the Historic Preservation Commissions finding is that the garage is historic, retains sufficient historic integrity and that the demolition would diminish the historic integrity of the Historic District.

Ayes: Daniel, Galbraith, Holcombe, Tague, Floyd, Nelson, Jones, Zimmer. Nays: None. Absent: Small, Collier, Taylor.

- B. HPCA-08-023** at 101 NW 19th ST. (Heritage Hills East), Ward 7. To receive comments from the Historic Preservation Commission regarding the historic integrity of the garage. This item will be referred to Neighborhood Services for dilapidated structure processing.

FORWARD COMMENTS: Motion: Floyd / Holcombe to forward comments that the Historic Preservation Commissions finding is that the garage is historic, retains sufficient historic integrity and that the demolition would diminish the historic integrity of the Historic District.

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 20 of 22

3/5/2008

Ayes: Daniel, Galbraith, Holcombe, Tague, Floyd, Nelson, Jones, Zimmer. Nays: None. Absent: Small, Collier, Taylor.

- C.** Putnam Heights letter to be recognized by the Historic Preservation Commission as a Preservation Review Committee.

RECOGNIZE. Motion: Tague / Holcombe to recognize the Putnam Heights Preservation Review Committee.

Ayes: Daniel, Galbraith, Holcombe, Tague, Floyd, Nelson, Jones, Zimmer. Nays: None. Absent: Small, Collier, Taylor.

- D.** Vote for Chair, Vice-Chair.

This item moved to April 2, 2008 meeting.

8. COMMUNICATIONS

A. Administrative Approvals

- 8A1. HPCA-08-007** at 3000 N Robinson Ave. (Jefferson Park), Ward 7. Staff is announcing the Administrative Approval of the item on the application of Jerry L. Carter for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) install 4' high wooden picket fence on the south side of house to enclose part of the sideyard and back yard.
- 8A2. HPCA-07-152** at 224 NW 32nd ST. (Edgemere Park), Ward 2. Staff is announcing the Administrative Approval of the item on the application of Matt Wilson for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) install 6' stockade fence in backyard.
- 8A3. HPCA-08-012** at 3110 N Harvey Parkway. (Edgemere Park), Ward 2. Staff is announcing the Administrative Approval of the item on the application of Mike Giese for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) install wind generators on the back corners of the house on second floor NE, garage, NE and back NE (see photo) and 2.) install solar panel on roof pitch for pool heating - will face SE off back of house.
- 8A4. HPCA-08-015** at 311 NW 19th ST. (Heritage Hills), Ward 6. Staff is announcing the Administrative Approval of the item on the application of Jane & Pete Holcombe for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) replace corner basement windows with custom made clear glass storm windows (storm window frames will be painted to match wood trim of windows).

*Correction: To install storm windows at corner basement windows. Applicant is not replacing basement windows.

B. Withdrawals

None.

C. Board of Adjustment (BOA)

- 8C1. HPCA-07-173** at 825 NW 17th ST. (Mesta Park), Ward 6. Staff is announcing the appeal of the Historic Preservation Commissions denial of the application of 17th Street Investments, LLC by William Robinson for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) replace all windows - **BOA on March 20, 2008.**

Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes - Page 22 of 22

3/5/2008

8C2. HPCA-06-098 at 2916 D Paseo Dr. (Paseo), Ward 6. Staff is announcing the appeal of the Historic Preservation Commissions denial of the application of Paseo Village by John Belt for Certificate of Appropriateness to 1.) install mural and fountain. - **BOA on March 20, 2008.**

D. The next regularly scheduled meeting for the Historic Preservation Commission is Wednesday, April 2, 2008 at 2:00 p.m. at the Municipal Building, City Council Chamber. New applications and information on continued projects are to be submitted to staff by 5:00 p.m., Tuesday, March 11, 2008.

9. ADJOURNMENT (7:26 p.m.)

Motion: Tague / Zimmer to adjourn the 3/5/2008, meeting of the Historic Preservation Commission.

Ayes: Daniel, Galbraith, Holcombe, Tague, Floyd, Nelson, Jones, Zimmer. Nays: None. Absent: Small, Collier, Taylor.

EO